MEDIATED CONSTRUCTION OF AN IDEAL GENDERED MANAGER AND EMPLOYEE

Jatta Jännäri
MEDIATED CONSTRUCTION OF AN IDEAL GENDERED MANAGER AND EMPLOYEE

Jatta Jännäri
This study analyzes constructions of an ideal gendered manager and employee in a mediated cultural setting. Our contemporary culture is mediated in many ways: Media is strongly embedded in our lives and has a possibility to select what issues become visible and how those issues are represented. In that way, media shapes our understandings of the world and how we make sense of it.

In this interdisciplinary work, the theoretical framework is built upon the doing gender perspective, which understands gender as something we do and as something dynamic. By adopting a poststructuralist view on gender, I understand it as socially and culturally constructed. In such an approach, the focus of the study expands from the individual level into contexts, social and cultural structures, and settings. Thus, the interest of the study is not on individual women or men as such, but rather on how they are represented and how they and their meanings are constructed (Ahl 2007; Henry et al. 2016) in different media texts.

This dissertation provides an alternative way to study constructions of gender in business studies by focusing on media texts and combining several empirical document materials with diverse analytical methods. The empirical materials comprise academic peer-reviewed journal articles, face value articles from The Economist newspaper, and job advertisements published online in Finland and Estonia. I employ methods stemming from cultural studies, such as close reading and visual analysis, which are only seldom used in business studies, and discourse analytical methods.

The compilation thesis consists of a synthesis part and four independent studies, the latter of which complete the aim by exposing the studied phenomenon from different viewpoints. The first study explores the research methods scholars have used when empirically studying doing gender thinking, and argues for the relevance of document materials. The second study examines how femininity and gendered power are enacted in The Economist, and shows that the representations of global top women managers are still relatively traditional and done in a way that does not disturb the masculine discourse of management. The third study focuses on the constructions of ideal prospective employees in job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia, and depicts how the coding of gender varies culturally. The fourth independent study discovers how the gendering of expert work takes place in job advertisements by rendering subtly gendered articulations while allowing for interpretative repertoires to appear.
I argue that the constructions of an ideal manager and employee are gendered, and that the gendering processes are complex and multifaceted, and they depend on cultural settings and prevailing social orders. Interestingly, gendering seems to happen at different levels of working life, as I have studied employees and managers in both global and local contexts. This study provides theoretical contributions by anchoring the doing gender perspective more deeply into business studies and by showing the ubiquitous and fluid nature of gender. At the societal level, this study is relevant not only in its timeliness but also in the sense that media representations and constructions of ideals have an impact on individuals and their real lives in many ways. The current thesis provides re-readings of culture and gender and offers methodologically new ways of empirically studying constructions of gender in the business context. Future studies would benefit from using doing gender as an approach and studying it empirically with more creative methods than what has been done so far.

Keywords: doing gender, mediation of culture, women manager, ideal employee, document materials
Tarkastelen väitöskirjassani ideaalin johtajan ja työntekijän sukupuolittunutta rakentumista medioituneessa kulttuurisessa ympäristössä. Kulttuurimme on medioitu monin tavoin: media on vahvasti ja yhä kasvavasti läsnä arjessaamme, ja se voi kiinnittää huomiomme joihinkin asioihin ja käsittellä näitä asioita haluamallaan tavalla. Media muokkaa maailmankuvaamme ja ymmärrystämme siitä.


Tutkielman koostuu synteesiosasta ja neljästä itseäisestä tutkimuksesta. Itseäiset osatutkimukset täydentävät kokonaisuutta lähestymällä tutkimuskohdetta erilaisista näkökulmista. Ensimmäinen tutkimus tarkastelee menetelmiä, joita tutkijat ovat käyttäneet tutkiaan sukupuolen tuottamista empirisesti ja se argumentoi dokumenttiaineistojen tärkeydestä. Toinen tutkimus tarkastelee kuinka femininisyyttä ja sukupuolittumutta valtaa käsitellään The Economist -lehdessä ja osoittaa, että kansainvälisten huippunaisjohtajien representaatiot ovat edelleen melko perinteisiä ja esitetty siten, etteivät ne häiritse johtamisen maskuliinista diskursia. Kolmas tutkimus fokusoi siihen, miten tulevia ideaalityöntekijöitä rakennetaan työpaikkailmoituksissa Suomessa ja Virossa ja näyttää millä tavoin sukupuolen koodaaminen ilmoituksiin vaihtelee kulttuurisesti. Neljännessä itseäisessä tutkimuksessa havaittiin kuinka asiantuntijatyön sukupuolittaminen artikuloidaan...
työpaikkailmoituksissa hienovaraisesti sallimalla useiden tulkintarepertuarien samanaikainen olemassaolo.


Avainsanat: sukupuolen tuottaminen, kulttuurin medioituminen, naisjohtaja, ideaali työntekijä, dokumenttiaineistot
Nyt, kun vuosien työ lukemista, kirjoittamista, pohtimista ja oivaltamista tämän projektin parissa lähestyy loppuaan, on aika lausua kiitokset kaikille, jotka ovat kulkenee rinnallani matkan aikana.


Minulla oli ilo saada työni esitarkastajaksi professori emerita Päivi Korvajärvi, jonka aiheeseen perehtyneet ja täsmälliset kommentit kehittivät työtäni huomattavasti eteenpäin. Kiitän lämpimästi professori Saara Taalasta, joka suostui vastaväittäjäksi toimimatta työni esitarkastajana.

Jag vill rikta ett varmt tack till professor Malin Tillmar för förhandsgranskning av min doktorsavhandling och för alla goda utvecklingsförslag gällande min forskning. Tack Malin också för min tid vid Linköpings universitet både i IEI företagsekonomi och HELIX VINN under hösten 2014. Ett stort tack också till professor Elisabeth Sundin; Lena, Birgitta, Olga, och alla andra. Ett speciellt tack till Eva Javefors Grauers för ett rum i hennes hus under mitt besök.

Tänän professor, dekaan Maaja Vadi Tartu Ülikooli majandusteaduskonnast, kelle huvitavate loengute tõttu valisin endale juhtimise eriala ning kellest hiljem sai ka minu uurimistöö juhendaja. Maaja tarkus, mõistev suhtumine ja inspiratsioon tekitas minus juba varakult huvi teaduse vastu.

Tutkimuksen valmistumista ovat edistäneet monet apurahat ja stipendit, joita olen työskentelyäni varten saanut. Kiitän Oskar Öflundin säätöitä, Turun kauppa korkeakoulun tukisäätiöitä, TOP-säätiöitä, Marcus Wallenbergin säätöitä, Turun kauppaopetussäätiöitä sekä Liikesivistysrahastoa. Erityisesti kiitän GRAMIS (Gra-


Åtiäni Riitta Kankaanrantaa kiitän kannustuksesta opiskeluun ja sen mahdollistaneesta monipuolisesta lapsenhoitoavuudesta. Ilman Muorin apua moni asia olisi jäänyt toteutumatta. Sisaruksiani Miinaa ja Tuukkan kiitän yhteisistä ajoistamme lapsuudenkodissamme Marikessa ja Miinaa myös useamman vuoden kestäneestä työkaverudesta yliopistolta.


Salossa, kesän koitteessa 2018

Jatta Jännäri
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### PART I: SYNTHESIS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIIVISTELMÄ</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESIPUHE</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1  INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Rationale for the study</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Key themes of the study</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Aim and research questions</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Outline of the study</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2  GENDER AS A SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Sharpening the focus: what I mean by gender</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Perspectives and conceptualizations of ‘doing gender’</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The status of ‘doing gender’ in gender research</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Considering gender as practice</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Mediation of gender</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Media representations of powerful women</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 The appreciation of femininities in management discourse</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Constructing ‘an ideal’ in recruitment</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1 Recruitment practices and gendered ideal employees</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2 Advertising for an ideal</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3  METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The constructivist approach to multiple document materials</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1 The benefits of document materials</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2 Linking several materials and methods</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Empirical materials</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Academic peer-reviewed journal articles</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Feature articles from The Economist newspaper</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Analytical methods</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 Readings: close reading and cultural close reading</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Visual analysis</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 Qualitative content analysis</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 Thematic analysis and discourse analytical research</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Thoughts of my agency and moments of pain</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4  SYNOPSIS AND DISCUSSION OF STUDIES</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Overview of the original studies</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Synopsis of the original studies</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2.1 Study I ........................................................................................................ 51
4.2.2 Study II ...................................................................................................... 52
4.2.3 Study III ................................................................................................... 53
4.2.4 Study IV ................................................................................................... 54

4.3 Discussion of findings and relevance of the original studies .......... 55

5 CONCLUSIONS ........................................................................................................ 62

5.1 The story I tell ............................................................................................... 62
5.2 Theoretical contribution of the overall study ............................................. 63
5.3 Methodological contribution of the overall study .................................... 64
5.4 Societal contribution of the overall study ................................................... 66
5.5 Towards the future ....................................................................................... 68

REFERENCES ............................................................................................................. 70

List of tables

Table 1 Empirical materials and analytical methods of the original studies .................................................................................................................. 38
Table 2 The original studies, their current statuses and publication outlets .................................................................................................................. 50
PART II: ORIGINAL STUDIES


1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Rationale for the study

The presence, importance, and power of media has grown and is growing constantly in our everyday lives, and our contemporary culture is therefore mediated in many ways. Media creates us with its ubiquitous presence conceptions of how to live and be in the world; it has a lot of power in defining what constitutes, for example, a good employee or ideal manager. These constructions and media representations are also gendered: previous studies have noticed that female managers and entrepreneurs are portrayed as a ‘deviation from the norm’ in business media (Ahl 2004; Achtenhagen & Welter 2011), while male management and entrepreneurship is the ‘norm’ in managerial and entrepreneurial discourses (e.g., Ogbor 2000; Bruni et al. 2004; Calás et al. 2009; Ahl & Nelson 2015). Management and leadership are constructed in the form of masculinity, and like entrepreneurship, it can be viewed as gender practices in which individuals of both genders approach their business practices differently (Bruni et al. 2004). In such cultural settings, studies focusing on gender and its constructions are highly needed.

It is interesting and important to study media representations and mediated constructions and their relationships to gender and gender’s position in a certain culture. So far, analyses of media representations of women managers have not gained particular interest among scholars (Lang & Rybnikova 2016). Therefore, more knowledge is needed. Like this study, constructivist studies focusing on gender are not interested in what women and men as individual, real persons are, but rather how gender categories (men and women, masculinity and femininity, etc.) are socially constructed; how power is negotiated inside the gender categories; mechanisms by which gender categories are maintained, supported, or challenged; and what effects that might have towards the social order of a certain culture (Järveluoma et al. 2003; Ahl 2006).

This study provides new understandings and openings towards the constructions of an ‘ideal’ and gender as a part of it in multicultural settings. In agreement with Hall (1988), I understand representations as having a constitutive and double-sided assignment in a culture: besides presenting something, representations and constructions also shape the culture they are in. This study contributes particularly to the discussions of gender construction and the theoretical discussions of the ‘doing gender’ approach from multiple disciplinary standpoints. As a constructivist study
with a critical tone, it enables novel understandings of the studied phenomenon and may reveal invisible assumptions and practices in society and culture.

More research is needed from the perspectives of media studies, cultural studies, and history, as Hamilton (2013) noted regarding entrepreneurship, and the need is the same in management-related studies. Studies taking contextual and historical issues (e.g., legislation and culture) into account have been called upon for entrepreneurship, management, and business studies (Ahl 2006) for a long time. Still, more sustained research is needed on the intertwined nature of gender, culture, and context in business and management in order to “increase our knowledge of the role that gender plays in management, the workforce and the economy” (Eden & Gupta 2017).

1.2 Key themes of the study

The current thesis has a constructivist approach, where the social reality is seen to arise in cultural meanings generated from the interaction of humans (Berger & Luckman 1966; Hacking 2009). The starting point for the study is that representations are social constructions of reality. The nexus of business, mediation, and gender provide an interesting starting point for focusing on constructions of ‘an ideal’ – and gender as a part of it – in both global and local contexts. Key themes of the study and discussions I address in my thesis are gender, mediated culture, and construction of an ideal.

The considerations of gender have traditionally had a limited role in management and entrepreneurship literature. Even if gender has been taken into account, it has been seen as an outside phenomenon of organizations (Aaltio & Kovalainen 2003, 175–177; Eriksson & Kovalainen 2008, 247). Decades ago, however, in her groundbreaking work Men and Women of the Corporation, Kanter’s (1977) theory about tokenism (Lewis & Simpson 2012, 141–143) already showed that gender-related issues are at the core of organizations, and Acker (1990) later claimed that organizations and jobs are gendered. Bringing gender into organizational and leadership studies as a central analytical category is as important today as ever before (Calás & Smircich 2006, 284).

Gender has been polarized into biological sex and socially constructed gender (e.g., Cameron 1996, 276). According to Ahl (2006, 597), “Gender refers to what is regarded as masculine and feminine, and is independent of a person’s biological sex”. Gender is not stable and unchanging, but living and moldable in social discourses and in time (Billing 2011, 314; Alvesson & Billing 2000). Understanding gender as fluid and changing has led to doing gender thinking in gender discussions. In doing gender thinking, gender is seen as a social dynamic (Gherardi 1994). In that perspective, there is an interest in practices that support or challenge
gendered division of labor (Klenke 2011, 14) and gendered organizational practices. My study falls under the conceptualization of doing gender; in my dissertation, the main frame of reference is the doing gender literature, which also focuses on gendered practices and power asymmetry in organizations and working life. Among a scarce number of studies focusing on gender in business media (Kelan 2012), makes this thesis a novel contribution by adding knowledge on constructions of gender as part of an ideal based upon textual media materials.

I am particularly interested in constructions of gender in media, which I will study through global high-profile (top) business leaders and managers, who also happen to be women and who are represented in the pages of the leading global business media with authoritative and powerful readership. At the local level, I am interested in the construction of ‘an ideal employee’ in the cultural contexts of Finland and Estonia, which I will investigate through job advertisements. The ‘new’ manager and ideal employee are constructed and theorized as feminine in literature (e.g., Kelan 2008; Broadbridge & Simpson 2011), and I am interested in whether it shows in job advertisements published in selected countries. Job advertisements provide descriptions of qualities that ideal candidates are requested to have. More specifically, the ideal employee is defined and mediated in job advertisements by desired attributes, which on the other hand are culturally gendered. Thus, jobs already become gendered prior to the selection of an ideal candidate. I will concentrate on two cultural contexts to get a wider perspective for the study and to capture cultural varieties in job advertising. Also, doing gender is a highly context-specific concept, and I consider its variations to be challenging and interesting.

As a representation, I consider how individuals and phenomena are portrayed in the media. Mediated culture provides places and stages for representations. Gender relevantly relates to how leaders, managers, and ideal employees are represented in a certain culture. My research differs from representation studies, made mostly in the field of psychology, which have been seen to be in the center of cultural studies, but have also been criticized (Parikka & Tiainen 2006, 3). Instead of studying media as an instrument or tool, I understand media as a stage where events happen and where important hidden conceptions and underlying assumptions are taken into consideration and studied. The embeddedness of media and the mediation of culture give a reason why the analyses of media texts are crucial when we analyze the intertwined connections between leadership and gender. It is not only about women, and not only about leadership, but about the ways in which and through which our culture also constructs – through media – the notions of efficiency, competence, and several other concepts related to leadership.

The premises of my study are interdisciplinary. Business studies constitute a starting point for my research, which I compile with references to cultural studies.
I am basing my research upon several key areas: management, leadership, entrepreneurship, organization studies, and working life studies, to which I will contribute through the perspective of doing gender. In this study, I occasionally refer to management-related studies, which include fields of management, leadership, and entrepreneurship. Thus, the study contributes to all the above-mentioned study areas.

1.3 **Aim and research questions**

The aim of the thesis is to explore and analyze the construction of an ideal gendered manager and employee in mediated cultural settings. This will be done through the analysis of more specific questions:

1. Possibilities and restrictions of the doing gender approach in key management and entrepreneurship literature. The first research question opens up methodological ways to approach the main question. This is specifically analyzed in article I.

2. Varieties of an ideal gendered ‘woman-manager’. This is explored in empirical global business media. Article II focuses on this research question.

3. Cultural varieties in an ideal gendered employee and gendering of work. This is explored in job advertisement analysis. Articles III and IV address this specific question.

I fulfil the focus of the thesis by answering the three research questions with four original sub-studies. In addition, this synthesis part of the study ties the research questions together. This study seeks to produce new understandings of constructions of ideal (women)-managers and ideal (gendered) employees in our contemporary, mediated culture.

When studying culturally how ideal managers and employees are represented and constructed in the media, my research will partially and selectively use the methods of cultural studies. There have been many studies concentrating on the aspects of gender in cultural studies, the methods of which have not been widely consolidated with leadership studies, especially in studies focusing on gender.
1.4 Outline of the study

The synthesis part of my dissertation is composed of five chapters. The remainder proceeds as follows.

Chapter 2 reviews the literature and conceptualizations of doing gender thinking and constructions and mediations of gender. It also exposes the roots of the concept of doing gender at some level and explains how it has been employed in empirical studies in the field. Then it focuses on media representations of (female) leaders and managers and the construction of an ideal employee in contemporary mediated working life and management discourse.

Chapter 3 focuses on the methodology of the study. I begin the chapter by explaining the nature of the document, naturally occurring materials (Silverman 2011; 2013a; 2013b) that I have solely employed in my study, and I argue for the importance of document materials in business studies. I continue the chapter with a detailed presentation of empirical document materials that I have used, as well as the analytical methods I have applied in the study. I finish the chapter by critically reflecting my thoughts and agency within the study.

In chapter 4, I present the four original studies that comprise part II of the thesis. First I provide overviews, current statuses, and publication outlets of the original studies, followed by summaries of the studies one by one. In addition, I discuss the key findings of the original studies in relation to the research questions posed and their contributions to the thesis in responding to the aim of the study.

Chapter 5 provides conclusions with some suggestions for future avenues of research in the field.
2 GENDER AS A SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION

2.1 Sharpening the focus: what I mean by gender

The theoretical framework of the study is built upon the *doing gender* approach (e.g. West & Zimmerman 1987), which provides a useful tool in capturing my research aim and questions. The doing gender approach represents the most topical development in gender perspective or gender theory: understanding gender as socially constructed (Berger & Luckmann 1967). It also enables to study the selected phenomenon thoroughly, deeply, and versatilely. In terms of the doing gender approach, it is possible to investigate the phenomenon with a critical view, paying attention to minor nuances that might otherwise remain unnoticed.

The doing gender approach means that “gender is created continually in ubiquitous ongoing social interactions” (Deutsch 2007, 122). In the approach, gender is “not a set of traits, nor a variable, nor a role, but the product of social doings of some sort” (West & Zimmerman 1987, 129). The doing gender perspective conceptualizes gender as a dynamic process, as emergent and shifting, as a learned action, and as a practice. The doings of gender are done quickly and unreflexively, with liminal awareness, over and over again. Due to repetition and recurrence, the doings of gender are widely institutionalized and recognized in a certain culture (Martin 2003).

2.2 Perspectives and conceptualizations of ‘doing gender’

The concept of doing gender has evolved from two different approaches (Lazar 2007; Kelan & Nentwich 2009; Kelan 2010). The first approach is informed by ethnomethodology and has been developed mostly by West and Zimmerman (1987), who consider gender as an accomplishment, a “product of social doings”, and something that is created in social situations. The founders explain that doing gender means to create differences between girls and boys, and women and men that are not “natural, essential, or biological”. Analyses focusing on the first approach of doing gender concentrate mostly on construction, creation, and enactment of gender in different situations. The starting point for the analyses is constructivist, where gender is seen as a simultaneous construction in interactions, and nonexistent as such a priori. Also, it is assumed in the first development that as
long as a stable omnipresent gender binary logic exists, the need for doing gender also exists (Kelan 2010).

The second approach of doing gender (Lazar 2007; Kelan & Nentwich 2009; Kelan 2010) derives from poststructuralism and discourse theory and is particularly based on the thinking and work of Butler (1990; 1993; 2004) and her concept of ‘performativity’. Butler views gender as a combination of identification processes, and her studies focus mainly on how discourses influence the formation of subjects (Kelan 2010) and how gender is performed in front of different audiences (Nentwich & Kelan 2014). Butler also emphasizes the material body (Martin 2003). Her performativity, which needs to be distinguished from performance, “refers to the performatative constitution of gendered conventions”, which “consists of norms which precede and guide the performance and performers” (Butler 1993, 234; cited in Järviluoma et al. 2003).

When comparing the perspectives of doing gender, the first approach seems to assume more stability in gender construction than the second approach, where fluidity and the paradox of the concept are highlighted more (Nentwich & Kelan 2014). As stated by Poutanen and Kovalainen (2013, 258), the discussions of gender have moved towards the Butlerian understandings of doing gender more recently. However, even though the concept of doing gender has multiple roots, there is much in common within the traditions, too. After all, classifications are also constructions made by researchers to theorize and clarify the field.

Particularly the latter perspective of doing gender has been critiqued for emphasizing too much of the discourse aspect, while leaving others (e.g., experiential and material aspects) for minor attention, and it has also been critiqued for considering discourse as “wholly constitutive of the social” (Lazar 2007). In addition, Butler has been criticized by the original authors of the concept of doing gender for playing with the words (doing and undoing gender) and not acknowledging the original source of the concept (West & Zimmerman 2009). In addition, Calàs and Smircich (2006) have claimed that the performative gender theory is, notwithstanding its wide citing, also commonly misunderstood. They argue that the focus of performativity is actually not in doings of gender, but “rather it is an analytical approach for problematizing such ‘doing’ and its consequences”.

The concept of doing gender is complex and therefore difficult to understand and use as a theoretical lens in research. The concept of doing gender is sometimes unclear to researchers, too, and when reading studies of doing gender, it is not always possible to comprehend which aspects of doing gender thinking are being specifically referred to (Nentwich & Kelan 2014). However, referring to one particular aspect of doing gender is not always possible or even meaningful in empirical studies due to the complexity of empirical phenomena. Besides, the concept of doing gender has been frequently analyzed in empirical studies as a static construct as an attribute of individual or as a structural element (Ibid.). However, the
concept of doing gender is not a static binocular always used in the same way, but flexible and manifold, enabling us to study a wide range of issues from many perspectives. That versatility offers a potential advantage for the concept, and more generally for research as a whole.

Studies on doing gender in the organizational context have mostly focused on how gender differentiation, hierarchy, and asymmetry are done and maintained through the enactment of gender (Kelan & Nentwich 2009, 140). The enactment of gender is a key focus in my research, too.

2.3 The status of ‘doing gender’ in gender research

Few authors have mapped the field of gender-focused research in the field of management-related studies.

In their review of gender and management research, Broadbridge and Simpson (2011) map the gender-focused research published in the British Journal of Management (BJM) during the past 25 years. In their overview of the journal, they identify four developments in the literature: women’s voice, gendered organizational cultures, masculinity and re-masculinity of management, and gender as a process. The first development, women’s voice, has also been called the women-in-management perspective (e.g. Calás & Smircich 2006; 2009). The last development in Broadbridge and Simpson’s review represents the doing gender approach, which they believe concentrates on issues such as difference, intersectionality, and gender identities. In the process perspective, subjectivity and individuality are understood as flexible and multiple, and they are constructed discursively, historically, and politically (Calás & Smircich 2009).

Broadbridge and Simpson’s review discusses only one journal, the BJM, but it is essential and well established in the field of management-related studies. Alongside that, the authors used a lengthy time frame in their study to capture the development of the field. Similar overviews are lacking in other managerial journals publishing gender research; the only exception is the review by Joshi et al. (2015), which was published in the Academy of Management Journal (AMJ) over the last five decades. The reviews provide a cross-section of gender research that is published in the UK- (Broadbridge & Simpson) and US-based (Joshi et al.) managerial journals.

The research published in the AMJ has focused on the women-in-management perspective in particular, and has mostly been located in North America. Authors of the review notice that there was a culmination point of publications in gender research in the AMJ in the 1980s, when the amount of published gender research articles was at its highest. Authors conclude that the following decline in the frequency of gender articles published in the AMJ may be because of the marginal
position of gender research in business schools and that it may have not been currently seen as an attractive subject to study. In my understanding, the decline in gender studies published in the AMJ may also be a consequence of the fact that discussions of gender have not moved forward towards processual and constructionist understandings of gender as in research published in the BJM. It may have reduced the business school researchers’ interests in gender in North America. The research tradition in North America generally rests more on pragmatism and positivism, which lead to different understandings of gender than the European research tradition, where the research of gender is more constructivist. Thus, studies published in North America and Europe may not speak about gender with similar meanings.

Another way to divide the evolvement of gender perspective is to do it based on its epistemological considerations. Gender development began with considering gender as a variable and relating it to a biological sex. Next, evolvement focused on feminist standpoints, arguing that women and men are essentially different. Finally, the poststructuralist perspective understands gender as a social and cultural construct (Ahl 2002; 2006; Henry et al. 2016). I relate the poststructuralist perspective more with Butler’s doing gender thinking.

Nentwich and Kelan (2014) conducted a literature review concentrating on the development of doing gender thinking by including a variety of works from academic journals to their analyses. In their typology, they acknowledged five themes in empirical research of doing gender: structures, hierarchies, identity, flexibility, and context specificity. ‘Structures’ can be interpreted as functioning similarly to Broadbridge and Simpson’s (2011) identified development, ‘gendered organizational cultures’. Both identifications enable and influence the construction of gender identity. ‘Hierarchies’ comes close to the structures and gendered organizational cultures, but according to the authors, within the hierarchies, the discussions of gender asymmetry becomes central. ‘Identity’ examines how professional identities are constructed in relation to the working identities, and ‘flexible’ and ‘context-specific’ doings of gender illustrate how dependent the concept of doing gender is on contexts: i.e., what we consider as masculine or feminine differs between time and space, while similar activities are gendered differently depending on who performs them and when and where they are performed.

Despite Kelan and Nentwich’s (2014) attempt to summarize the doing gender field, the literature stays diverse and scattered overall, and there is a relevant research gap to systematize the field. This study is taking steps towards filling the gap.
2.4  Considering gender as practice

Gherardi (1994) was among the first to theorize gender as a social dynamic, which means gender as a social practice. She uses the perspective of organizational culture in her (early) works and shows how gender was done in the organizational context. Studying gendered practices in organizations means concentrating on how organizational members “acquire, produce and re-produce symbols, beliefs, and patterns of behavior connected with gender membership” and also on a symbolic gender order in organizations (Gherardi & Poggio 2001, 247).

Gherardi (1994) divided the gendering practices – the doing gender – of organizations into ceremonial work and remedial work. By ceremonial work, she means actions through which we maintain the symbolic gender order in organizations, such as etiquette, customs, and rituals. It means that we behave in a way that is expected of the gender we represent and that we expect others to behave accordingly. Instead, we use remedial work to repair the inequality of gender relationships in organizations. Remedial work is needed when the symbolic gender order is broken down for some reason, for instance when a woman performs a male-dominant job. The breakdown in gender order can be repaired by remedial work, for example when a woman underlines her femininity (Gherardi & Poggio 2001), which means that she is not disturbing the (masculine) gender order.

In addition, Gherardi (1994) distinguished the ‘gender we do’ in our everyday lives from the ‘gender we think’, which she refers to as ‘deep social structures’ in our societies, where the understandings of gender are more stable and unchanging than at the ‘doing’ level. Later, Gherardi (2015) among others argued that knowing (as a whole) is embedded in practices, and knowing can be studied as a social process in which doing and knowing can be considered the same.

Martin (2003; 2006) highlights the dualistic nature of doing gender. In her widely recognized theory, she builds on the work of Butler (1993) and Connell (1995) and makes a distinction between gendering practices and practicing gender. Gendering practices are those that we have learned and adopted since childhood, and those that we have (and have seen) repeated frequently during the course of our lives. They are actions that have become institutions in the culture we are living in, and they are simultaneously available for all of us living in that culture. Gendering practices are temporal and directional and include the dressing, interests, demeanor, language, and expressions through which gender is done in a culture. Practicing gender is the more dynamic side of the duality – how individuals practice femininities and masculinities. The gender order (e.g., at work) is constituted via practicing gender, which is constituted through interaction. Finally, to make the distinction between the concepts clear, Martin (2006) describes practices as nouns and practicing as verbs and actions.
Gendered practices are informed by asymmetry of power (Acker 1990; Kark 2004). The asymmetry of power, which is also an important aspect in my thesis, constructs genders in hierarchical orders, typically femininity as subordinate to masculinity (West & Zimmerman 1987; Rhoton 2011). In all, within gender asymmetry, the concept of intersectionality becomes important because the other sources of divergence, like race or ethnic backgrounds, intertwine with gender and may produce power asymmetry in organizations and working life.

Finally, it should be noted that not all doing gender studies focus on practices, but rather concentrate, e.g., on contextual situations where gender is done. I agree with the notion that some researchers (e.g., Järviuluoma et al. 2003; Achtenhagen & Tillmar 2013) have posited that contextualization needs to be done carefully while studying gender, and particularly while doing gender, since the latter is a relational concept. Gender is always done in relation to something. The importance of understanding the context of where things happen is highlighted elsewhere, too, as Klenke (2011) and others have proposed in leadership studies, and Welter (2011) in entrepreneurship.

### 2.5 Mediation of gender

Gendered practices are also related to how gender, femininities and masculinities, and women and men are represented in media texts and images. Thus, media representations can be considered as gendered practices, too. When viewing media representations as gendered practices and employing the doing gender perspective through a theoretical lens, new insights and openings may emerge. Accordingly, as highlighted earlier, the doing gender approach is a useful and timely perspective for studying how certain issues and phenomena are constructed and represented in the media.

The mediation of our current society and economy is notable. Mediation means that (mass) media is producing media images in a powerful, pervasive, manifold, and dialectic process: it is socially shaped, but simultaneously shapes our understandings of the world and how we make sense of it. Media, with its embedded presence in our mundane lives, has the power to praise and make some issues visible, while marginalizing and excluding other issues (Fairclough 1995; 2003). When media is of concern, the question of media representations becomes topical. By media representation, I mean how something or somebody is presented or portrayed in the pages or broadcastings of media.

The meaning of representation includes both presenting something and being representative of something. Representations are interpretative and functional, and in them, the meanings of language and culture fit together. In constructivism, representations are understood to be a part of the reality: comprising representations
as building and constructing the reality (Rossi 2010). Representations have both a descriptive and a normative role: besides telling us how things are, they also tell us how things should be and how we should live and behave (Radu & Redien-Collot 2008). Therefore, representations are always somehow political in nature (Rossi 2010). To summarize, representations not only express the reality, but they also construct the reality. Besides constructing the reality, representations also construct subject-positions, among other things. Representations can be parallel, representing the same phenomenon simultaneously, and are used when exercising power. Also, the meanings of representations depend on the context (Törrönen 2010).

Ridgeway (2009) emphasizes the ‘rules of gender’, which she calls the culturally hegemonic beliefs of gender stereotypes. According to her, media representations institutionalize the rules of gender along with laws and governmental policies and everyday organizational practices. Ridgeway also notices, conversely, that cultural beliefs mostly represent the society’s dominant group’s understandings of gender. Therefore, studying media representations is very important, as they have a lot of power in societies when institutionalizing gender and the rules of gender.

2.5.1 Media representations of powerful women

Interest in media representations of business and political leaders, managers, and entrepreneurs, particularly those who happen to be women, is increasing among business studies. Thus far, studies have focused on the following: Finnish business media (Lämsä & Tiensuu 2002), Polish business press (Kostera 2003), Norwegian business media (Ljunggren & Alsos 2007), French press (Radu & Redien-Collot 2008), German newspapers (Achtenhagen & Welter 2011; Lang & Rybnikova 2016), Spanish press (Bengoechea 2011), US and UK news reports and autobiographies (Townsend 2012), UK business media (Kelan 2012), women’s magazines (Eikhof et al. 2013), and newspaper (Nadin 2016), Canadian broadcast news (Cukier et al. 2016), and Nigerian press (Tijani-Adenle 2016). Each being an important contribution to the field, every above-mentioned work has limited the analysis on textual representations, delimiting visual analysis outside the focus. Hopefully, future research will put more effort toward visuals when analyzing media representations.

Townsend (2012) investigated women leaders’ characterizations in public discourse in her dissertation. She studied Hillary Clinton’s portrayals in the political domain and Nicola Horlick’s portrayals in the business domain by focusing on news reports and autobiographies. Townsend found that media characterizations of the two women leaders depended on the situational context, and the characterizations were closely connected to newsworthiness. She argued that the women
were represented in ‘entertaining’ or ‘interest waking’ ways in media texts. Townsend also found that Clinton and Horlick use and utilize gender and gender stereotypes when creating their own media representations in a way that makes the story sound good (e.g., representing themselves as working women, as a working mother, or as a victim). Gender stereotypes were used in non-ordinary ways too, which thus aids in formulating new meanings of gender and shows that gender and gender stereotypes are not stable but changeable.

Kelan (2012) notices that audiences and their perceptions of media images of gender in business media have only rarely focused on business studies. The postmodernist view has recognized the importance of the co-construction of media meanings, and has accordingly highlighted the importance of audiences as media consumers. Thus, Kelan employs Master of Business Administration students, the future business leaders, as an audience of business media in her study (2012), in which she interviewed the students about their responses and reflections on two striking media images of women business leaders. Kelan shows that business students position themselves relative to media representations of business women and interpret the appearance of business women in terms of how they are supposed to look. In doing so, the audience (business students), leaned on a (dominant) heteronormative understanding of gender. However, while participating in the study, students reported that it had an impact on their own identities, as they viewed and discussed the media images of women business leaders. Even though the audience is not the immediate focus of my thesis, Kelan’s work aptly shows how major the role of media images really is in our society. Seeing a striking media image and discussing it may leave a mark in our memory and identity, even in a short time.

The influential power of media images was also noticed by Radu and Redien-Collot (2008), Achtenhagen and Welter (2011), and Eikhof et al. (2013), who pointed out that media representations impact the reality and the real lives of individuals. In the field of entrepreneurship and management, media representations can portray entrepreneurship and management as desirable and feasible paths of professional lives or not for the audience. Eikhof et al. (2013) also comment that media representations may affect the relationships among women on top and their key business partners, resulting e.g. in their trade agreements and loan terms and conditions. This is among the reasons why it is important to study media representations of women (and men) in prominent and visible positions in society. In my consideration, the role that gender plays in the construction of media representations is also interesting.

Similar to women managers and leaders, women entrepreneurs have been, despite a little upturn, considerably underrepresented in the public discourse (Ljunggren & Alsos 2007; Achtenhagen & Welter 2011; Hamilton 2013). The tone and style used are important in media representations. As shown by Eikhof et al. (2013), media representations of female entrepreneurs in a women’s magazine
published in the UK portrayed female entrepreneurship as concentrating on traditionally female skills and activities. Accordingly, women’s entrepreneurship is portrayed as less valuable, particularly when working at home, even though being an entrepreneur is portrayed as a liberation and an escape from ‘wearing working life’ (Eikhof et al. 2013). More generally, the representations of women entrepreneurs are often linked to domestic concerns and to their interface of private and public spheres of life (Hamilton 2013).

Additionally, and more generally in the field of entrepreneurship, research has shown that women entrepreneurs have been portrayed as less purposeful, less professional, and less successful than their male counterparts in business media, newspapers, and research publications (Ahl 2002; 2007; Achtenhagen & Welter 2011), and it seems that the patriarchal ideology still continues to be the norm in contemporary media (Klenke 2011, 128). In policymaking, the whole phenomenon of ‘women entrepreneurship’ has been portrayed as a ‘problem’ since women’s entrepreneurship seems to be in sectors that are not the most productive, most employing, or fastest growing, but rather in need of ‘support and help’ (Blomberg et al. 2011, 31–32; cited in Achtenhagen & Tillmar 2013, 6).

In contrast, the findings of Nadin’s (2016) work suggest that women entrepreneurs have recently started to present as ‘serious business leaders’ in ‘serious business press’. She studied women entrepreneurs’ media images in the Times newspaper between the years 2010 and 2016. The selected time frame epitomizes the post-recession period in the UK (where the Times is published) and in the global economy as well. During the studied years, the amount of articles focusing on women entrepreneurs increased every year. Moreover, women entrepreneurs were represented as role models in articles, highlighting their business success and their ability to multitask. Multitasking is needed to combine the various roles these women have; besides being successful business women, they are also highly educated, wives and mothers, with a glamorous life-style and stylish appearance. The business success of these women entrepreneurs is portrayed with wealth and business growth. On the other hand, however, the representations of these talented women still rely on traditional family roles and fall to spotlighting the appearances and lifestyles of these women.

I agree with Nadin that although these kinds of media representations are positive, encouraging, and sometimes even necessary, they may also have a very narrow perception of women entrepreneurship and women in business. The message of the newspaper and policymaking is that we need more women in business and entrepreneurship, but the reality might not be as rosy and glorious to women in business as the images of women entrepreneurs presented in the Times suggests. This strongly agrees with the neoliberal ideology, which I am discussing later in this paper. Again, media representations have an influential role in societies by giving hints of what an ideal (woman) manager or entrepreneur should or should
not be like. When the space to be successful in business and other spheres of life is narrow, the general understandings of available forms of being will narrow, too. Finally, the ‘narrowed understandings’ will move towards the norm of status in a certain place and space.

Consequently, by concentrating on the aspects of ‘growth’, ‘individualistic orientation’, and ‘objectivist stance’ in women’s entrepreneurship literature, other interesting research questions and new research directions (e.g., the context) will remain in a minor interest in the field of women’s entrepreneurship (Hughes et al. 2012; cited in Achtenhagen & Tillmar 2013, 8–9). That brings about the question of what is missing in the media texts.

2.5.2 The appreciation of femininities in management discourse

The overview of Broadbridge and Simpson (2011), which was discussed at the beginning of this chapter, ends with their views of the future directions of gender in management research. They highlight that nowadays, and particularly in the future, feminine skills are and will be appreciated. Studies indicate that ‘the future will belong to the female’ since women seem to have the right capabilities and mindset for future jobs and the business world, which seems to praise those feminine qualities. It seems that in future working life, flat hierarchies, customer focus, and interpersonal skills are appreciated to an increasing extent.

Kelan (2008) studied how the so-called ‘new worker’ is portrayed in the discourse of management. She used discourse analysis to analyze textual representations of gender in contemporary management literature, i.e., in six classical management textbooks published between 1994 and 2002. Although the discourse of management has been masculine and male-oriented through the ages (e.g., Tienari et al. 2009; Heilman 2012), Kelan (2008) notes that women have gained visibility and are present in the management discourse at the moment, as remarked also by Nadin (2016) in her research previously discussed.

In addition, the new ideal includes qualities that are culturally associated as feminine, such as empathy, care, and the ability to listen. Therefore, the new ideal manager is constructed as feminine. However, there are still some problems, since according to Kelan (2008), new subjectivities created for women are based on and will legitimize the old patriarchal gender ideology and gender roles. As an example, she offers the concept of ‘mompreneurs’, which labels women entrepreneurs with a family as ‘mom’ entrepreneurs, highlighting the traditional role of nurturer and housekeeper, which have been devolved to women. Interestingly, the potential parallel concept of ‘dadpreneurs’ has not been used thus far.

Meanwhile, the contemporary neoliberal ideology suggests that if women do not perform better in the economy, their performance could be considered as their
own personal failure and not as a structural problem in the economy (Kelan 2008). In the neoliberal ideology, a success or failure is seen as a consequence of an individual’s capacity and choices. In so doing, the neoliberal ideology will put pressure on ordinal people besides entrepreneurs and managers, with the high standards of living and making a career. In the era of the ‘new economy’, which is grounded on neoliberal ideology, individuals are expected to have qualities that emphasize individual agency, such as entrepreneurialism, innovativeness, flexibleness, and risk-taking (Kelan 2008), but also emotional sensitivity (Varje et al. 2013). In addition, concepts like ‘innovativeness’ are expected to have a certain kind of content, too.

In the field of management, the prevailing discourse of transformational leadership (see, e.g., Bass 1998; Kark 2004) emphasizes those kinds of qualities and personal traits of leaders and managers that are culturally associated as feminine. However, Parry and Bryman (2006) among others underline that the evidence is somewhat weak. Studies that disclose and compare personal traits are still valid and legitimate among some branches of management studies. The problem in those kinds of positivistic styles of research is that they do not draw conclusions as such and are – at least in my eyes – somehow outdated.

Fletcher (2004), among others, refers to the new discourse of management as ‘post-heroic’ leadership. She notices three characteristics that distinguish post-heroic leadership from ‘more traditional’ models of management: a) leadership is considered a shared practice between leaders and followers, b) leadership is understood as a social process, and c) leadership is viewed as an outcome of learning. In this way, the core of leadership has moved from ‘power over’ to ‘power with’ towards shared leadership instead of individual competence (Berg et al. 2012, 403). She argues further that the concepts of doing gender, doing power, and doing leadership are strongly intertwined, and because of that, the concept of post-heroic leadership is not neutral as expected.

The concept of the third spirit of capitalism (see, e.g., Boltanski & Chiapello 1999; 2005; Kulovaara 2014) has opened up a new perspective to analyze features traditionally and culturally associated as gendered. The kinds of characteristics that are culturally associated as feminine, such as teamwork, emotionality, flexibility, and shared leadership, have received new importance from this perspective. Still, skills associated with femininity are not recognized as such in organizations since those are considered natural and normal for women (Fletcher 2004; Kelan & Nentwich 2009). In addition, despite the appreciation of feminine qualities, there has not been any change in the larger representation of women in positions of senior management (Kelan & Nentwich 2009; Poutanen & Kovalainen 2017).

Appreciated femininities are also culturally dependent. Phillips and Knowles (2012) demonstrated how fiction novels do and undo gender by putting successful
women business owners in culturally accepted norms of femininity, but representing them as others. In more detail, the authors’ analyses were based on Butlerian understandings of performativity about how entrepreneurship and gender are co-constructed in three contemporary fiction novels (Chocolat, The Shipping News, and Back When We Were Grownups), each with a protagonist or an important secondary character as a woman entrepreneur, and each as examples of realist texts (realism). The analysis showed that in all fiction novels, protagonists have accessed to the territory of (masculine) entrepreneurship as if by accident. In addition, the branches they operated were those that are traditionally considered feminine and as women’s assignments with low value: sewing, cooking, and organizing social ceremonies. Women protagonists were constructed differently than other female characters in the texts, e.g., by their independence, their absence of motherliness, and their disorganized appearance. Besides that, they were also constructed differently than male characters in the texts: women entrepreneur protagonists were constructed outside of the norms. Fiction novels can help the readers look at things in novel ways, possibly giving them new manners of doing gender and doing business (Ibid.).

The ideal is manifested in widely studied practices, but on the other hand, it gives a situational presentation of the studied phenomenon. Instead, it is only scarcely studied how manifestations are mediated in a culture in a more broad sense. Those manifestations can be accessed through investigating job advertisements, whose purpose is to not only advertise a vacant position but also to mediate the brand and practices of an organization to a wider community of consumers. Therefore, the job advertisements are mediating the (organizational) culture they represent. Aspects of gender can be obtained in job advertisements, which can be seen as exploring a diffuse gender that cannot be reached only by interviewing the informants. The constructions of gender, which are manifested to a wider audience, is a nexus to which this study contributes. The following chapter discusses how the certain kind of ‘ideal’ is constructed in recruitment, more specifically in job advertisements.

2.6 Constructing ‘an ideal’ in recruitment

2.6.1 Recruitment practices and gendered ideal employees

Recent studies show that gender, among other things, plays an important role in recruitment processes, too (e.g., Van den Brink & Benschop 2012; Tienari et al. 2013; Hytti 2015; Koivunen et al. 2015; Meriläinen et al. 2015). Also, in recruitment, gender asymmetry and gender inequality practices exist, meaning there is “a
hierarchical distinction in which either women and femininity or men and masculinity are valued over the other” (Van den Brink & Benschop 2012). In recruitment and selection, recruiters act as ‘gatekeepers’ when deciding on the best candidate for a job, and more generally when deciding who should have access to the labor markets (Koivunen et al. 2015). This way, the ‘ideal’ candidate for a certain kind of job is defined, forwarded, and finally established, and becomes the ‘norm’ for an ideal employee or manager in a certain position, organization, or culture, and for a certain time.

In their study of academic recruitment practices in the Netherlands, Van den Brink and Benschop (2012) point out that talented women are ‘systemically overlooked’ in appointments to full professorships for many reasons. The authors concentrated on three different disciplines in their study and showed that gendering appointment practices were present in all studied disciplines, although they varied in different fields of science. Gendered practices may take place, for instance, when men are dominating key positions in academic selection processes, which may end with a situation where women are not encouraged to apply for the positions, they may not gain all (inside) information, and finally, if applying, they may be evaluated against the unspoken male norm (see also Benschop & Brouns 2003; Ahl 2006; Van den Brink & Stobbe 2009; Phillips & Knowles 2012). Van den Brink and Benschop (2012) also argue that because of paternalistic views (of the masculine appointment committees), women do not correspond to the image of an ideal manager in academic selection. Paternalistic views may also, according to them, lead to a situation where women are not nominated because they are ‘protected from the heavy workload’ by the committee.

Likewise, as in academia, the executive search in business is gendered. In their study of outsourced executive searches in Austria, Finland, and Sweden, Tienari et al. (2013) found that gendering practices take place and are reiterated in recruitment processes, and that the ‘ideal candidate’ is typically defined as male (see also Brumley 2014; Broadbridge & Fielden 2015). At the same time, women candidates are lacking from the applicant list. By othering women, women candidates are only seldom taken into consideration when selecting the best candidate for the position, and when the attributes of an ideal candidate are reproduced. However, the exclusion of women in an executive search may not be a discrimination of women as such, but rather an active inclusion of a particular kind of man: the right age with the right track record, bodily characteristics, and lifestyle (Holgersson & Tienari 2015).

Meriläinen et al. (2015) extend the discussion of an ideal candidate to the discussion of an ‘ideal executive body’ by studying how certain understandings of the latter is produced by headhunters in the executive search process in Finland. In the talks of headhunters, the ideal executive is white, athletic, male, early to late forties, and with an emphatic voice. In addition, the study insinuates that the ideal
executive body comes close to the headhunters’ own appearances, referring to *homo*sociality (Holgersson 2013) and narrowing the general understandings of attributes suitable for individuals at the executive level. Thus, the restricted assumptions exclude and disadvantage not only women but also men who do not fit into the narrow form of the ideal. By doing so, executive search consultants have a remarkable role in defining what constitutes as an ideal executive or executive body and what does not.

What is common in the studies of Van den Brink and Benschop (2012) and Tienari et al. (2013) is that both focused on multiple contexts (academic fields and sociocultural settings), that gendering practices occur in all contexts that were studied, and that the gendering practices were done differently in different contexts. As shown already in the study of Tienari et al. (2002), the ideal worker is not a universal or static category, but is variable across different societal contexts, evolving and changing over time. Similarly, in different contexts, the elements of an ideal employee or manager are emphasized differently. However, the prevailing gender order penetrates our understandings of an ideal worker, employee, and manager (Ibid.) and also to ideal gender. But, in all, masculinity, femininity, and job descriptions are all social constructions (Billing, 2011).

What, then, unites the studies discussed above (Van den Brink & Benschop (2012); Tienari et al. (2013); Holgersson & Tienari (2015); Meriläinen et al. (2015)) from the methodological aspect? All works investigated the studied phenomenon by using interviews as a method or way to collect the materials. Interviewing is widely used in qualitative research, but can be considered not only as an advantage but also as a shortcoming. By employing a wider variety of methods than simply interviewing recruiters, it is possible to gain more interesting results of gendered recruitment practices, as stated also by Hytti (2015). She focused her study on applications and résumés, which were discussed and evaluated by two different focus groups (recruitment professionals and unemployed professionals seeking to find employment). Gender was not a focus of her work a priori, but it evolved as an important aspect during the analysis. Hytti’s findings also indicate that experiences not immediately related to work, like (professional) sports and other hobbies, may count when constructing and evaluating an ideal candidate for a certain position. In addition, activities with a masculine association were evaluated higher than activities with a feminine connotation.

### 2.6.2 Advertising for an ideal

One particularly interesting point of departure in studying how an ideal employee or candidate is constructed is to focus on job advertisements. Job advertisements
are much used in early phases of recruitment and thus widely mediated. Job advertisements describe and promote qualifications that are required from an ideal candidate, the forthcoming ideal employee. By studying job advertisements, it is possible to find out what kinds of understandings employers and recruitment professionals have about an ideal candidate in certain cultural settings.

Few studies have used job advertisements as empirical materials in the nexus of business studies and gender. It is worth noting that job advertising is not the only way to recruit a candidate, but due to the relevance, visibility, and established position of job advertisements in recruitment, they also serve as an important information source in research. Previous research shows that job advertisements are largely gender biased, and that the attributes desired from an ideal candidate are seemingly masculine, particularly when advertising management positions. The masculine discourse in job advertisements may have consequences for women candidates who do not recognize themselves among the masculine portrayals of an ideal candidate, which may prevent them from pursuing the (top) managerial positions (Askehave 2010; Askehave & Zethsen 2014).

The recent study of language use in top executive job advertisements in Denmark renews the suggestion that job advertisements are gender biased, and emphasize leadership traits and attributes that are considered as masculine, such as analytical and strategic competence, clout, decision-making skills, and result-orientation (Askehave & Zethsen 2014). Interestingly, the authors recognized different themes in their materials, of which they considered only one to have a feminine sound, emphasizing co-operation and communicative abilities like empathy and supportiveness. Also, the traits considered as feminine were typically positioned at the end of job advertisements, as a minor note in a list of requirements.

Generally, Askehave and Zethsen (2014) noticed that advertisements tend to highlight qualifications associated with transactional leadership traits considered as ‘one-sided management’ with a deep masculine connotation. Advertisements were not showing any ‘de-masculinization of leadership’ (Fletcher 2004; Billing 2011), which relates to the transformational leadership trait with a feminine connotation and puts emphasis on lower organizational hierarchies, team orientation, flexibility, and participation, among other things (Kark 2004).

The study of Den Hartog et al. (2007) noticed that transformational, people-oriented terms were used more than transactional, task-oriented terms at director-level positions than at CEO-level positions in leadership advertisements published in the UK in the Times. The results suggest that the feminization of leadership has spread to mid-level managerial positions, but not yet to the senior-level positions.

In the Finnish context, Kuokkanen et al. (2013) and Varje et al. (2013) studied the formulation of an ideal employee in Finnish job advertising at Helsingin Sanomat. Kuokkanen et al. examined the Finnish employee ideal building upon job advertisements published in a 50-year period, and they argue that the requirements
for an ideal white-collar employee and blue-collar worker have transformed during the decades towards more demanding and diverse qualifications, particularly with white-collar employees. Hence, the contemporary ideal employee needs to be multi-competent, flexible, and enterprising.

Kuokkanen et al. did not focus on advertisements for managerial positions, but Varje et al. studied them in their study of the Finnish ideal manager, with a similar time perspective. Both studies suggest that the request for emotional skills was growing during the studied time period: it was uncommon at first in post-war times, but it became a key characteristic at the end of the last century. Varje et al. argued that the feminine and democratic management ideal emerged in the 1960s, but was replaced with the masculine rational management ideal from the 1970s onward. The ideal manager of the 1990s and the 2000s has both feminine and masculine qualifications: the ideal needs to be emotional and sensitive, but simultaneously oriented towards results and achievements. The preferences in management ideals were considerably in line with cultural and economic conditions that were present at a certain time in society.

Neither Kuokkanen et al. nor Varje et al. focused particularly on the aspect of gender in their studies, yet they approached it, leaving a research gap in the field to investigate the formulation of an ideal employee and manager from a gender perspective in the Nordic context. In addition, as far as I am concerned, a similar kind of research has not been done in the Baltic context. This thesis contributes to the literature by exploring varieties of constructions of an ideal in Finnish and Estonian job advertisements.
3 METHODOLOGY

3.1 The constructivist approach to multiple document materials

My thesis draws from constructivist epistemology (Berger & Luckmann 1967), which in turn is influenced by interpretative understandings of social sciences. The interpretative paradigm (Burrell & Morgan 1979) is informed by a subjectivist approach that aims to understand the social reality at the level of subjective experience. It sees social reality as created by individuals, whereas the social reality appears to be different for everyone, depending on his or her understandings, experiences, and inter-subjectively shared meanings. The interpretative paradigm is founded on the German idealist tradition, specifically on the thinking of Kant. Afterwards, Dilthey, Weber, and Husserl contributed to moving the thinking of Kant forward. The key concept of the German idealist tradition was understanding (verstehen), the everyday world (Burrell & Morgan 1979).

In social constructionism, the role of language is crucial. In the constructionist perspective, language and images are seen as constructing the reality and phenomena, not just representing or reflecting it (Phillips & Hardy 2002; Alvesson & Kärreman 2011). The shared meanings of individuals in a certain culture are mediated through language and different kinds of texts. Recently, the importance of visuals has also increased.

Taking a poststructuralist view on gender, I understand it as socially and culturally constituted (Ahl 2007). In such an approach, the focus of the study expands from the individual level into contexts, social and cultural structures, and settings. Thus, the interest of the study is not in individual women or men as such, but rather on how they are represented and how they and their meanings are constructed. The interest is directed towards social orders and cultural settings, how they are gendered, and how they may affect the individuals, both women and men, living in a certain culture (Henry et al. 2016). Each culture has certain kinds of social orders and norms that give instructions about what is e.g. proper gender behavior. By doing so, norms have social effects (Ahl 2006).

My study also has critical features in it. However, the distinction between critical and non-critical research is not always clear-cut. Often, what is considered critical and what is not, and how criticality is understood varies between scholars. Generally, critical studies seek to challenge the conventional understandings of hegemonic discourses and theories, and prevalent assumptions that are considered ‘truths’ in certain cultural settings. For example, poststructuralist feminists aim to
challenge the prevalent gender order (Kelemen & Rumens 2008). Acknowledging gender as a practice and a process instead of a variable suggests a critical starting point for my thesis. Comparing mainstream management and entrepreneurship research with a gender focus is known as the ‘gender-in-management’ perspective, where gender is understood as a variable of an individual (equivalent to their biological sex), and where women and men need to be managers or hold some other kind of prestigious and authoritative position in society in order to be involved in studies. My thesis takes a critical view towards this perspective. What is more, my study contributes to challenging the prevalent assumptions of gender order by showing how ‘ideal gender’ is constructed in different cultural settings. The study also advances the field by using methodological repertoires rarely used in business studies.

3.1.1 The benefits of document materials

I employ document materials in my thesis, which are seldom used as empirical materials, though they contain a lot of potential to be utilized more in business studies. The document materials can be seen as ‘naturally occurring’ (e.g., Silverman 2011; 2013a; 2013b), existing a priori, and non-producing for the research purposes. By naturally occurring materials, Silverman refers to materials that exist or are emerging independently, that are culturally available to us, and that are ready to be utilized in studies. Naturally occurring materials exist without any actions, stimulus, or interventions by the researcher, and are free to use by anyone interested in them, either once or repeatedly.

Silverman positions naturally occurring materials as opposite to interviews and focus groups, which he calls manufactured research materials. By ‘manufactured’, he means that research materials are produced by researchers for the purpose of the research. Despite the opposing positions of naturally occurring and manufactured materials, Silverman advises not to take the opposition too far. Several kinds of documents are comprised of naturally occurring materials: texts, audiotapes, and visual images (e.g., photographs, advertisements, annual reports, soap operas, movies, cartoons, etc.). By studying naturally occurring materials, it is possible to analyze how people are actually constructing the social world together (Silverman 2011).

Silverman (2013a) also states the importance of mundane situations; by studying them, analysts can take hold of situations and practices that may otherwise be taken for granted or even invisible. Phillips and Di Domenico (2009) suggest that naturally occurring texts that appear in research subjects’ normal day-to-day activities are particularly suitable sources of empirical materials for discourse-related textual analysis.
Manufactured materials, particularly interviews, dominate the field of contemporary qualitative research (Bryman 2004; Peräkylä & Ruusuvuori 2011), while document, naturally occurring materials are used only scarcely in business studies as a sole data source (Silverman 2011; 2013a; 2013b). In all, regardless of the source of empirical materials, rigorous analysis is the most important part of the qualitative inquiry (Silverman 2013b; Eriksson & Kovalainen 2016).

In my consideration, I parallel naturally occurring data with document materials, which is my preferred term to use. Moreover, different uses of the terms ‘empirical material’ and ‘data’ exist. Following Alvesson and Sandberg (2013, 145) and Alvesson and Kärreman (2011), I prefer to employ the term ‘material’ in my thesis. In qualitative inquiry, document materials are considered as artefacts and analyzed as cultural products, which is also the way I am employing document materials in my study.

However, constructivism does not suppose or support any existence of ‘pure’, naturally occurring materials. In constructivism, the empirical materials gathered and employed are considered to be constructions, too. In the process of planning, selecting, gathering, or producing the empirical materials, the subjectivity of the researcher(s) is always somehow present, affecting the outcome of a set of materials in one way or another. Accordingly, distinct empirical materials are calling for different ways of organizing and for a variety of analytical methods.

Document empirical materials provide many advantages for qualitative business research. The relevance of document materials culminates with the idea of transparency (Eriksson & Kovalainen 2016, 85), which means that individuals trust in documents and their ability to tell about the issues they represent. However, the poststructuralist view rejects the idea of transparency and treats texts as ‘artefacts of their own right’ (Ibid), divesting from their writers and representatives and by appearing differently to different readers with many possible interpretations.

3.1.2 Linking several materials and methods

In a methodological part of the thesis, I particularly draw from culturally oriented and discourse analytical methods. Discourses consist of language use and other processes of meaning-making, like pictures and symbols. In that way, discourses construct social reality and ‘truths’ according to what is commonly shared in certain societies (Vaara & Laine 2006). According to Fairclough (1995), critical discourse analysis (CDA) views discourse as a social practice, a socially and historically situated mode of action that is socially shaped and shaping. In discourse analytical research, social practices are those under investigation. Therefore the analysis is not focused on individuals or their intentions, but on the meanings that individuals produce with their behaviors (Jokinen et al. 2016).
The distinction between discourse analysis and CDA is that the term ‘critical’ notices that our use of language, and our social practices in general, are interfacing with causes and effects that may not be ordinarily even recognized (Fairclough 1995; Bourdieu 1977). Moreover, epistemological differences between traditions lie in their understandings of the relationship between language and society, as one focuses merely on language while the other considers language as a part of social practice (Vaara et al. 2006). Discourse analytical research is particularly relevant in times of social change, while the current social change is called ‘new capitalism’ by Fairclough (2003). Through discourse analysis, it is also possible to study, for example, the cultural processes that produce influence when constructing national contexts (Koskinen et al. 2005, 208).

Visual analysis has traditionally been underused and distinguished in management, organization, and entrepreneurship studies (Ray & Smith 2012; Styhre 2010). As the importance of visual elements has risen in our contemporary society, the awareness of the importance of visual analysis in research has also increased. Bell and Davidson (2013) brought the phenomenon forward in their review of visual management studies, and highlighted the importance of visual analysis in business research. As the importance of visuals has expanded rapidly in management studies, they consider a nascent visual turn in management as a counterweight to a previously dominant linguistic turn in management. Still, studies employing visual analysis face obstacles when publishing in top business journals.

Despite the difficulties in publishing, the analysis of visual materials can provide new ways of understanding the business life. In culturally oriented business studies, visual images can be used not only as empirical materials (factual evidence) but also as meanings of visual culture, constructions of meaning of a certain culture investigated (Eriksson & Kovalainen 2008; 2016).

But what does it mean to combine several empirical materials and analytical methods in a study? As pointed out by Peräkylä and Ruusuvuori (2011), studies that use solely textual materials may benefit from using different analytical procedures. By linking diverse empirical materials and analytical procedures together, it is possible to gain extra value. Distinct methods and materials produce extensive and various kinds of information, and different viewpoints need multiple methods. Linking materials and methods together enables the investigation of the phenomenon of interest from several points of view to gain a holistic picture. While different materials and methods shed light on the studied phenomenon, it also enables new insights into discussions. Also, if triangulation is an object of the study, it can be gained via combining.

In my study, I combined several materials and methods to provide diversity and depth for the studied phenomenon. In addition, I employ various materials to answer the different research questions and ensure various perspectives in the study, and I will discuss these more thoroughly in the following.
3.2 Empirical materials

I use in my compilation thesis the following types of empirical document materials: academic- and business-oriented articles and job advertisements, which are collected from academic peer-reviewed journals, *The Economist* newspaper, and e-recruitment portals in Finland and Estonia. Table 1 provides an overview of selected materials and analytical methods employed in original studies.

Table 1. Empirical materials and analytical methods of the original studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Material type</th>
<th>Material source(s)</th>
<th>Collection period</th>
<th>Corpus</th>
<th>Analysis method(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Peer-reviewed journal articles</td>
<td>Academic journals GWO, BJM and IJGE</td>
<td>2010–2013</td>
<td>N = 230, focused on 77</td>
<td>Close reading and qualitative content analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Feature articles</td>
<td><em>The Economist</em> newspaper</td>
<td>2006–2013</td>
<td>N = 254, focused on 23</td>
<td>Thematic classification and CDA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Job advertisements</td>
<td>E-recruitment portals Monster and CV Online</td>
<td>July–August 2015</td>
<td>N = 437, focused on 12</td>
<td>Cultural close reading and visual analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Job advertisements</td>
<td>E-recruitment portals Monster and CV Online</td>
<td>July–August 2015</td>
<td>N = 437</td>
<td>Qualitative content analysis, thematic analysis and visual analysis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In what follows, I introduce and explain the selection of materials and analytical methods and my motivation in doing so. More detailed descriptions of the empirical materials and analytical methods are provided in the original studies in part II of the thesis.
3.2.1 Academic peer-reviewed journal articles

The empirical materials from academic peer-reviewed journal articles were co-collected with Professor Anne Kovalainen. The field of doing gender thinking, which I had to familiarize myself with in the beginning of my work, felt fragmented and un-systematized to me. Therefore, I noticed a research gap in summarizing the field. Thus, we set our research aim to map and systematize the disperse research field of doing gender thinking. More specifically, our particular interest is laid in methodological aspects – what types of methods have been used when analyzing doing gender thinking in empirical academic research. For our purposes, journal articles published in well-recognized academic peer-reviewed journals offered the most suitable source of materials to study the phenomenon empirically.

In order to collect a diverse and extensive set of journal articles as research materials, we screened a wide range of academic journals followed by a selection of three subsequent journals, all of which have different agendas and academic audiences. Despite the differences, the selected journals share a good reputation in the field, as well as in the European context, which can be distinguished from the US research tradition. The journals we selected for the study are Gender, Work and Organization (GWO), the British Journal of Management (BJM), and the International Journal of Gender and Entrepreneurship (IJGE).

GWO, established in 1994, is a pioneering journal concentrating on gender issues in the context of organizations and working life. It publishes high-quality and highly developed articles engaged with sociology and gender theory (Wiley Online Library 2016b), and it has gained a well-respected position among scholars in the field. The BJM, launched in 1986, is published on behalf of the British Academy of Management and focuses on management-oriented views and theory. It welcomes multidisciplinary research on a global level (Wiley Online Library 2016a). The IJGE is more practical in its orientation and was established later than the other two journals, in 2009. It publishes high-quality research, mostly in the field of gender and entrepreneurship (Emerald Insight 2016).

The time frame for our material collection from the above-mentioned journals proceeded from 2010 to 2013. The period of four consecutive years enables us to formulate a rich set of materials, and during the time the study was conducted, the selected years represented the newest literature published. In total, we retrieved 230 articles from journals, of which 154 were from GWO, 10 from the BJM, and 66 from the IJGE. We used different criteria to select the articles (e.g., empirical materials used, focus on gender, etc.; see more specifically in study 1), including the 77 of 230 articles for a deeper analysis.

By using academic journal articles as research materials, it allows us to study how researchers themselves have employed and studied the doings of gender em-
pirically in their studies. Published articles represent researchers’ own understand-
ings of possibilities of doing gender, shared perceptions of it in academic commu-
nities, and the methodological repertoires scholars have considered as suitable
when studying gender doings empirically. Thus, we consider academic articles as
particularly useful for our research purposes.

3.2.2 Feature articles from The Economist newspaper

The face-value articles originating from *The Economist* newspaper were collected
within the Academy of Finland’s funded research project, *Sukupuolittunut talous
tasa-arvon maassa?*, supervised by Academy Professor Anne Kovalainen. I had
an opportunity to work on the project as a researcher for one and a half years during
my doctoral work. Hence, the empirical materials collected within the project were
also available to me for my research. The materials collected from *The Economist*
are employed as research materials in study II, co-authored with Seppo Poutanen
and Anne Kovalainen.

*The Economist* was selected as a material source because it is one of the leading
global weekly business and financial media sources with a wide and authoritative
readership: the global business and the political elite. *The Economist*, first pub-
lished in 1843, is now owned by the *Financial Times* and independent shareholders
(*The Economist* 2016). *The Economist* publishes articles related to business and
politics in both print and online editions weekly. Online, it publishes the electronic
version of the newspaper as well as news articles, blogs, debates, and video pro-
grams (*The Economist* 2016).

Online publications have a different kind of readership than their print versions,
and for this reason we chose the print version to be our material source. The print
version enjoys a powerful readership, and it allows us to use the digital online
archive of issues published, too. A special characteristic of *The Economist* is that
it is anonymously written with only a few exceptions, so it is not always possible
to see who has written a particular article. The anonymity of writers aligns with
my poststructuralist view of the texts, where the importance of the writer is dis-
posed.

However, despite the powerful global readership, and the recognition it enjoys,
*The Economist* so far has been surprisingly scarcely studied, except, e.g., Moore
(2002).

The material collection from *The Economist* started within the project by collect-
ning feature/face value articles of powerful female business leaders. Five suc-
cessive years was used initially as a search period for the articles, from 2006 until
2010, and it was lengthened later, from 2011 to 2013. That particular period of
time was chosen as our time frame since it represents both the period of downturn and regression in the global economy and the time after those.

The feature articles were collected from the EBSCO and ProQuest databases using different combinations of keywords, e.g., keyword combinations woman/women + powerful + manager, female + powerful + leader, and ms/mrs + boss + business were used to identify all potential references. Based on the different combinations of keywords, a total of 254 articles was collected with a reference to a female manager or female gender. The articles consisted regularly of both text and photography, but we concentrated solely on texts. Analyzing photos would also have been an interesting task, but we limited it beyond the scope of our interests since the pictures used in *The Economist* are typically very factual and similar, which is not useful for research purposes.

The face value articles were classified into two categories: female business managers and female political managers, of which we concentrated on female business managers. The distinction between the two groups was not always obvious since some female leaders operated in both fields or switched between the fields. Our criterion was that the leader needed to be somewhat active in the business sphere to be included in our analysis. Based on that, our classification yielded 63 articles focusing on female business managers. After re-reading the articles, we excluded those in which a) female leaders were not protagonists or essential secondary characters of an article, and b) only minor or very general references were made to women in leadership or to the female gender. After that, 23 feature articles of powerful female managers were selected for deeper analysis; some of the articles were obituaries.

### 3.2.3 Job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia

The selection of job advertisements is my independent and self-collected set, which I have used as empirical materials in manuscripts III and IV. The empirical materials of job advertisements move the context of the study from global to relatively local, to Finland and Estonia. I have used my cultural sensitivity and understanding when collecting the materials. I can speak and understand both languages, being native in Finnish and having lived and studied for five years in Estonia. Hence, I was able to collect job advertisements published in both countries in their original languages.

I collected the job advertisements from e-recruitment portals, which are currently widely used in recruitments providing up-to-date announcements of vacant job positions. I gathered the Finnish materials from the Monster network, a well-known recruitment portal operating in over 60 countries worldwide (Monster 2016). I collected the Estonian materials from CV Online, which is a partner of
Monster operating in Estonia (Monster 2016) and a market leader of internet recruitment companies in Baltic countries (CV Online 2016). The advertisements had to meet the following criteria before selection: a) the positions had to be for specialists, experts, and superintendents, i.e., so-called ‘white-collar’ employees, and b) the jobs had to be in the areas of management, consultancy, IT, and research. White-collar job advertisements typically require more attributes from their ideal candidates than so-called ‘blue-collar’ job advertisements, and therefore white-collar advertisements provided a more suitable alternative to my study than blue-collar advertisements. Furthermore, my interest lies in the construction of the ideal employee in more demanding jobs.

I collected the empirical materials from July 2015 to August 2015. The entire set of materials consisted of 437 job advertisements, 236 (54%) from Finland and 201 (46%) from Estonia, and altogether 154 (35%) from July and 283 (65%) from August. July is a usual vacation period, particularly in Finland, and those effects can also be seen in a variety of job advertisements collected. Regardless, I chose my collection period because on vacation, employees have more free time to keep track of job advertising than they do during the hectic working periods of the year.

Of the advertisements, 156 (66%) published in Finland were written in Finnish, 79 (33%) in English, and 1 (1%) in Swedish. In Estonia, 149 (74%) advertisements were written in Estonian, and 52 (26%) in English. I excluded advertisements published in Estonia in Russian from the corpus since my skills in the Russian language are limited.

Job advertisements have been used only scarcely as research materials (Kuokkanen 2015), particularly in business studies. Job advertisements are publicly available to a wide audience and are therefore widely read, so they can guide us to produce and define a particular kind of ideal employee and employer.

3.3 Analytical methods

The document empirical research materials can be analyzed in many ways. I have also applied several analytical methods: (cultural) close reading, visual analysis, qualitative content analysis, thematic analysis, and (critical) discourse analysis in my thesis. When analyzing the document materials, the path I have followed has been to seek to unveil the underlying themes, perceptions, and meanings of the texts by concentrating on the information presented by asking the questions what and how (Bryman 2004; Eikhof et al. 2013). When combining several materials, the level of analysis is also variable. The variety of the level of analysis may range from conceptualizations of large entities to meticulous scrutiny, as is also the case in my study.
Generally, when I have worked as part of a research group, we have had constant discussions about the analyses with the members of the research group. Each author has also separately done some parts of the categorization of materials and analysis in parallel to verify the conformity, coherence, and trustworthiness of the analysis. Similarly, while I was working mostly independently to analyze the job advertisements, I kept several discussions going during the process with my supervisors (i.e., the research group). I also kept research diaries during the work to record my thoughts, considerations, and ideas while working, particularly when working with material collections, categorizations, and analyses. Next I present the analytical methods I have used in original studies.

3.3.1 **Readings: close reading and cultural close reading**

I have employed close reading as an analytical method in study I, and a particular type of close reading – which I label ‘cultural close reading’ – as an analytical method in study III. Close reading, or “literally reading” (Duck 2018), is a widely used method in cultural studies, but so far it has only rarely been used in business studies. Hence, close reading as an analytical method is not widely discussed in business studies’ method books, either, which hindered my work at some level. The idea of close reading is to look closely, slowly and deeply, to the text under investigation by providing a microscopic view to the texts (Jin 2017). When conducting the analyses, I used some guiding texts from cultural studies and my personal intuition as a precept. Close reading is typically an iterative and hermeneutic process where readings are followed with repetitious re-readings. I also followed the hermeneutic logic of reading during my analyses: I refer to the so-called “hermeneutic circle,” meaning that we cannot understand the wholeness if we do not understand the meanings of its parts, and vice versa, and that the understanding develops during the iterative rounds in the imaginary circle (Burrell & Morgan 1979, 237).

In study I, close reading was a preliminary phase of the analysis, followed by qualitative content analysis. In that case, close reading was a way to familiarize myself with the materials (academic journal articles) and to zoom in on the important parts of the texts, that is, to find out whether articles were using doing gender thinking as a theoretical standpoint or not. During the readings, it was not always easy to distinguish which articles should be included in the analysis due to the fluidity and challenge of the concept of doing gender thinking. As such, close reading provided a useful tool to dig deep into the texts of journal articles.

In study III, I employed close reading as a primary research method, which I combined with visual analysis when analyzing pictures, colors, and fonts used in the job advertisements. As the analysis proceeded, I decided to focus on 12 job
advertisements, which I analyzed at depth in order to gain a strong understanding of the materials. While performing the analysis, I used my cultural capital in making sense of the perceptions and meanings of the texts and pictures, and therefore labelled the method as cultural close reading. I was seeking reflexive and interpretative understandings of the materials to answer the research question. In cases where the researcher is self-reflective and uses her own capability to interpret the materials, the texts are considered to be subjective and the role of the researcher is as an insider (Eriksson & Kovalainen 2008; 2016).

### 3.3.2 Visual analysis

Cultural theory has lowered the threshold between “art” and everyday life, which are manifested in business and popular culture and have shown that those are worth studying from different perspectives. The everyday, as a concept, has been prominent in cultural studies for a long time, and it has started to gain a foothold in business studies also (Davison 2010). In this study, job advertisements represent the cultural artefacts of organizational everyday life.

Photographs and other kinds of visual images are typically analyzed either by content analysis, thematic analysis, or hybrid analysis. The analysis typically begins content analysis style, with a scrutiny of details in the picture in relation to its contexts. The analysis may continue to the thematic level, where the analyst’s attention goes beyond the technical details of the picture and towards more latent issues. The hybrid analysis includes different analytical methods (Ray & Smith 2011). Visual images are complex, fluid, and inter-linking, and their meanings may often be multiple and elusive (Bell & Davison 2013; Davison 2014). Constructivist researchers regard visual images as social constructions and account for their socially embedded nature and framings in cultural contexts. Thus, the meanings of the images depend a lot on who is looking at them (Bell & Davison 2013).

As mentioned earlier, I have conducted visual analysis in study III, where we focused on 12 job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia. The role of visual analysis was in the beginning of the analysis minor, as complementary and supportive to textual analysis, but during the iterative analyzing process, the role of visual analysis increased and finally became an essential part of the analysis. In study IV, we used visual materials in a confirmatory sense when formulating the integrated themes from the materials. In job advertisements, like any other advertisements, the viewer’s attention goes first to visual images: pictures, colors, and other visual elements used. The visual elements’ impact on advertisements’ impressiveness is vast, and often carefully crafted. I also noticed that the visual elements of the job advertisements caught my interest and were an important factor when I was selecting the advertisements to focus on more deeply. Hence, visual
images’ impressiveness also guided my choices in the selection period. It has been argued that visual media communicates differently than verbal language, and that the meaning-making processes of those are dissimilar (Pink 2001; Rose 2012; Bell & Davison 2013; Eriksson & Kovalainen 2016).

When analyzing the visual elements of job advertisements, I was similarly able to use my own biographical experience of both cultures to interpret the materials, as I was while analyzing the linguistic elements of the job advertisements. My visual analysis was also done through cultural close reading, which means cultural interpretation and analysis of visual elements (Eriksson & Kovalainen 2016).

3.3.3 Qualitative content analysis

The use of content analysis has been growing in business studies recently (Duriau et al. 2007). Qualitative content analysis, which differs from quantitative content analysis, goes beyond the counting of frequencies, typically characterized by traditional content analysis (Welch et al. 2013). Qualitative content analysis provides the possibility to gain a holistic description (categorization) of the phenomenon studied, or a detailed and rich interpretation of the contextual meanings of the empirical materials (Eriksson & Kovalainen 2016). It can show what has been given priority or salience and what has not. It can also show who or what has the publicity and visibility, who or what does not, and which issues are connected with each other (Bell 2011). Content analysis assumes that different word combinations “reveal underlying themes” in texts and other kinds of documents (Duriau et al. 2007).

I have conducted qualitative content analysis in studies I and IV. In both studies, where I employed qualitative content analysis, the aim of the analysis was to compact a large amount of information together. In study I, qualitative content analysis enabled me to classify the materials into diverse categories: different methods used in empirical studies. The approach was close to interpretive analysis, and the purpose of the analysis was to understand and make sense of the materials’ meanings.

In study IV, qualitative content analysis was primarily a tool to organize and categorize the materials followed by thematic analysis. For that, coding was a key part of the analysis. In study IV, I analyzed the textual parts of the advertisements, and I concentrated on the whole corpus of job advertisements. In analysis, I concentrated on the attributes the ideal candidates were required to have based on the texts in the advertisements. I manually coded the requirements by using words and sentences as coding units, and by using Excel as a working platform. When the coding process was completed, I had more than 2,300 Excel rows with a list of requirements.
I continued the study by analyzing the most commonly used terms in both countries in question. Word clouds aided in visualizing and perceiving the terms used most often in advertisements. After this, thematic analysis was used.

3.3.4 Thematic analysis and discourse analytical research

The field of discourse analytical research is broad, and analyses conducted in the current thesis can be situated under its broad umbrella. Thematic analysis, influenced by critical discourse analysis, is conducted in study II, and thematic analysis is employed in study IV.

The software used in study II was NVivo 10.0, a program for qualitative analysis that enables coding large amounts of data into different codes called nodes. Coding in nodes was used as a first step of the analysis to categorize the data. Along with coding, study II also utilized keyword analysis, and features of content analysis were applied. For critical discourse analysis, we conducted a thematic analysis by connecting the codes with the theories that framed the research, following and modifying the propositions by Fairclough (2001; 2010) and Wodak (2001). Our method of conducting critical discourse analysis was theoretical, since our aim was to search for (gendered) discursive framings and repertoires from the materials (Wetherell & Potter 1988).

In study IV, thematic analysis followed qualitative content analysis. In thematic analysis, I read the textual materials (job advertisements) and used different colors to point out the themes that I was able to identify from the materials. The themes were either theoretically or empirically driven. I identified a total of 43 themes within the course of analysis. In the following phase of analysis, I concentrated on the relationships among the themes in order to join the themes into more coherent categories.

3.4 Thoughts of my agency and moments of pain

As I situate my work under the interpretative paradigm, I have welcomed my personality and subjectivity into the study. The presence of my subjectivity has increased and become more important as the research has continued. I started the study with rather objective viewing, where my backgrounds in positivistic tradition influenced my work, at least unconsciously. My ‘own voice’ started to emerge when I began to work with studies III and IV, where I was able to use my biographical capital in collecting and analyzing the research materials from Finland and Estonia. Later, working with the synthesis part of the study confirmed my subjectivity to be even more openly present.
I am a native Finn, so I have always been immersed in Finnish language and culture. I have also lived and studied for five years in Estonia, which has improved my comprehension of Estonian language and culture. Having the possibility to bring my own voice and cultural knowledge of both cultures more deeply to the study has been a great opportunity and a place of reasoning and learning. Allowing my subjectivity to be present has made the study stronger and more meaningful, both to myself and to the readers.

When critically reflecting upon this study and its creation, I recognize that there are some limitations of the study, too, which are, to the greatest extent, related to the moments of pain experienced during the work.

I acknowledge that my subjectivity, even if I have welcomed its presence in the study, may have affected the research process in several ways. I have claimed that the materials employed here occurred naturally without my special input and that they still exist as such even if I had not selected them in the study, but of course my subjectivity and my thinking have guided how I have found and worked with them. I mostly agree with Alvesson and Kärreman (2011) that all phenomena and knowledge are constructions of actors, including materials, theories, etc., and that “the vocabulary that is used in perception, description, analysis and writing in research will determine the results. Sensitivity to language is vital in order to make construction work productive and thoughtful” (p. 29).

In relation, the biggest challenge I have faced during the project has been working in a foreign language. When working with one’s own voice, the role of language becomes essential. English is not my mother tongue; even though I have experience working with foreign languages, it has been difficult for me. I have found linguistic barriers along with writing when I was translating the research materials into English, particularly, when translating the Estonian materials, during which time there were two rounds of translations; I was afraid of losing the original meaning of the expressions or changing the meaning unintentionally. The role of language is crucial, especially in constructionist studies, and I hope that I have managed to transform the original meanings into English.

I have also struggled on some level with the selections of empirical materials. In study I, we limited the material collection to three academic journals since our aim was not to conduct an all-encompassing literature review of the state-of-the-art of doing gender thinking, but rather to focus on methods used in studies published in key journals of the field for economic reasons. The amount of journals or the time period for material collection could have been more extensive, but in my consideration, the different natures and focuses of the journals will complement the low quantity, and it was possible to collect a comprehensive set of materials from selected academic journals. In addition, the period of collecting job advertisements lasted for two summer months, partly overlapping with the vacation pe-
When starting the material collection, I was prepared to continue the collection until the end of 2015. However, after collecting materials for two months, I recognized that the set of advertisements was suddenly already comprehensive, rich, and multiple. Therefore, I ended the collection after two months, and that period formulated the decisive time frame for material collection for studies III and IV.
4 SYNOPSIS AND DISCUSSION OF STUDIES

4.1 Overview of the original studies

This chapter presents the empirical findings of the four original studies in relation to the research questions, and it discusses the relevance of the findings and suggests how the independent studies contribute to the overall thesis. I begin this chapter with an overview of the original articles and their current statuses, and then I provide a summary of each study separately vis-à-vis the research questions. I finish this chapter with a discussion section that includes the most important findings and their relevance.

I have summarized all the information from the current states of the sub-studies in Table 2 below. Table 2 provides titles, authors, current statuses, publication outlets of the studies, and serial numbers of the research questions (RQ) they answer.
Table 2. The original studies, their current statuses and publication outlets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>RQ</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Publication outlet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>The research methods used in ‘doing gender’ literature</td>
<td>Jännäri, Jatta &amp; Anne Kovalainen</td>
<td>Published</td>
<td><em>International Journal of Gender and Entrepreneurship</em> 7 (2), 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>‘Bright-eyed assistant’ and ‘presentable clerk’: the gendering of expert jobs in job advertisements</td>
<td>Jännäri, Jatta, Seppo Poutanen &amp; Anne Kovalainen</td>
<td>Manuscript under review</td>
<td><em>Culture and Organization</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Gendering expert work an ideal candidacy in Finnish and Estonian job advertisements</td>
<td>Jännäri, Jatta, Seppo Poutanen &amp; Anne Kovalainen</td>
<td>Manuscript accepted for publication</td>
<td><em>Gender in Management: an International Journal</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Within this dissertation thesis, I answer the proposed research questions via four original studies. Every independent work will cover at least one research question, and at the same time, all research questions are covered by the original studies. While the studies are independent in nature, together they formulate a coherent wholeness.

At present, two first articles are published in academic peer-reviewed journals: the *International Journal of Gender and Entrepreneurship* and the *International...*
Journal of Media and Cultural Politics. Two other manuscripts have been submitted to two other academic peer-reviewed journals: *Culture and Organization* and *Gender in Management: an International Journal*. All of the selected journals have different focuses and research fields, which supports my interdisciplinary research interest. In addition, all of the selected journals are relevant, of high quality, and well-recognized among scholars, which was the initial purpose when selecting them.

4.2 Synopsis of the original studies

4.2.1 Study I


The first study, *The research methods used in ‘doing gender’ literature*, co-authored with Anne Kovalainen, examines what kinds of methods have been used when studying doing gender thinking empirically. The first article is related to the first research question: *possibilities and restrictions of the doing gender approach in key management and entrepreneurship literature*. The first research question opens up methodological avenues to contribute to the main research question of the thesis. The first article was published in issue 2 of the *International Journal of Gender and Entrepreneurship* in 2015.

The theoretical framework of the article is built around the doing gender literature. The literature of doing gender is rich, but was, and to some extent still is, unsystemized, and therefore there was a distinct research gap in systematizing the field. While working with the article, some other studies were also published in order to systematize the scattering field (e.g., Nentwich & Kelan 2014). Besides, there was still a lack of research in systematizing the field, and particularly in focusing on methods used when analyzing doing gender thinking empirically. Our study endeavored to fill the gap in the field.

When analyzing the articles retrieved from academic peer-reviewed journals, we had a working proposal that methods used in empirical studies would be various because of the fluidity and multifarious roots of the concept of doing gender. However, based on our analysis, we found that interviews composed the main methodological tool, both as an approach and as a material collection tool in doing gender literature. Studies employing naturally occurring document materials and methods that relate to these types of materials were in the minority. There is a
similar trend in qualitative research more generally, too, that interviews and manufactured data dominate as a main methodological tool (Silverman 2013a; 2013b). We argue that the strong domination of manufactured materials, and the primary use of interviews in empirical research, may influence the concept of doing gender. We propose that aspect for further inquiries in our article.

4.2.2 Study II


The second article, *Construction of the female global top manager in The Economist*, co-authored with Seppo Poutanen and Anne Kovalainen, was published in issue 2 of the *International Journal of Media and Cultural Politics* in 2016. The second study is related to the second research question: *varieties of an ideal gendered ’woman-manager’*. The second study is interested not only in the enactment of gender and femininity but also in the enactment of gendered power.

In the second study, we built the theoretical framework around the idea of the ‘third spirit of capitalism’ (see e.g., Boltanski & Chiapello 1999; 2005), which is close to neoliberalism and holds inside a paradox. Among other things, the new spirit of capitalism has revised the requirements for employees and managers by favoring the kinds of characteristics that are culturally connected and stereotypically associated with femininity and women. Still, so far the gendered asymmetries of power have not vanished or shown any far-reaching changes in the global economy.

In an empirical part of the study, we analyzed feature articles of powerful female global top managers collected from *The Economist*. Building upon our discourse analytical analysis, we recognized four different discourses from the materials, all of which had connections to the gender asymmetry. The discourses are a) *traditional feminine discourse*, b) *competence discourse*, c) *business continuity discourse*, and d) *problems discourse*. In the first discourse, the gender of a woman-manager is constructed in a traditional way, through appearance (e.g., beauty, age, clothes) and family ties (e.g., presenting the woman-manager as a daughter or sister). The second discourse, highlighting competence, constructs women-managers through professional qualities (competences, achievements, etc.). In the third, continuity discourse, women-managers are represented as part of the flow of business continuity, alongside their predecessors and successors, or as part of a family that owns the business. The fourth, problems discourse, portrays women-managers
through problematic situations in their professional or personal lives, or in the company she is or will be working in.

Generally, some kinds of fragments and problems were strongly present in the materials. There was speculation about women-managers, their competence, ethics, or the situation they or their companies were in. In *The Economist*, the women-managers become accepted by the different positioning of genders, that is, when praising women-managers as managers, they were simultaneously enacted with feminine characterizations that do not threaten the masculine norm of management. Also, the discursive repertoires we found showed that women-managers are still represented as dependent (on family, kin, and business continuity) in the pages of an authoritative business media, which confirms and renews the sticky gendered agency positions (Poutanen & Kovalainen 2013) in a global business culture.

### 4.2.3 Study III


The third study, ‘*Bright-eyed assistant*’ and ‘*presentable clerk*: the gendering of expert jobs in job advertisements, is under review for consideration of publication in *Culture and Organization*. The third study enabled me to accomplish my knowledge of Estonian language and culture. It responds to the third research question: *cultural varieties in an ideal gendered employee and gendering of work*, which aids in contributing to the general aim of the thesis from the viewpoint of constructing an ideal employee.

In study III, we interpretatively and visually analyze how gendered expert jobs, and thus the prospective ideal candidates for the jobs, are constructed in job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia.

The study draws its context from the equality legislations of both countries in question. The small but relevant difference between Finnish and Estonian legislation is that the Finnish legislation prohibits discrimination in job advertisement, while Estonian legislation prohibits discrimination in recruitment only on a general level. Because of that we presumed that Estonian employers may have more freedom when advertising jobs than what Finnish legislation promises to Finnish employers. In the study, we consider the legal framework to be a boundary object. The second theoretical concept we use is boundary work. The concepts of boundary object and boundary work help us to analyze the gendering of expert white-collar jobs in two countries. Boundary work represents how the gendering of ex-
pert jobs is done in advertisements in both cultures. We take the position that gendering of jobs is already done before the actual hiring. Particularly, our interest is directed toward the gendering of expert jobs and how it becomes articulated and visualized in job advertisements.

In an empirical part of the study, we focused on 12 advertisements in depth, which I selected from the corpus of 437 white-collar job advertisements. We analyzed the selected advertisements interpretatively, relying on my knowledge of both cultures. We identified four ideal constructions of expert works: a natural leader, a presentable person in her most beautiful blooming, a committed future big gun, and a presentable nurturer and competent expert, all of which were attuned in a feminine or masculine way.

As predicted, the study shows that job advertisements published in Estonia tend to be less neutral and more direct in their appeals than those published in Finland. When referring to an ideal candidate’s appearance (and age), for example, a Finnish advertisement requested that candidates attach a picture to the application, while an Estonian advertisement explicitly requested ‘a presentable appearance’ in their requirements for an ideal candidate. Generally, advertisements attuned with feminine characteristics were more colorful and illustrative than those with masculine descriptions. The boundary work manifests in culturally laden codes that are used in advertisements and that are coded into a specific gender in a certain culture. Visual elements play an important role in advertisements, and they give strong hints, e.g., of the ideal candidates’ gender, age, and professional age.

4.2.4 Study IV


The fourth study, Gendering expert work and ideal candidacy in Finnish and Estonian job advertisements, is currently under second review for Gender in Management: an International Journal, and is co-authored with Seppo Poutanen and Anne Kovalainen. The fourth study is also connected to the third research question: cultural varieties in an ideal gendered employee and gendering of work, which argues for the general aim from a vantage point of constructing an ideal candidate for prospective expert work by analyzing gendered themes and how the gendered candidacy was constructed in the advertisements from two cultural contexts.

Our premise in study IV is to investigate how the ideal candidate is constructed in expert job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia, and how the ideal is gendered. Moreover, we aim to analyze how job advertisements gender label
prospective expert jobs. The theoretical premise for the study is built around the theory of doing gender and gendered practices (e.g., Gherardi & Poggio 2001), which are scarcely studied in job advertisements, particularly in the contexts of two cultural contexts. Thus, our working hypothesis suggested the presence of dualistic gendering in our empirical materials.

In the fourth study, we analyzed the whole set of 437 job advertisements (236 from Finland, and 201 from Estonia). The study shows that job advertising is relatively unified in both countries. Language skills are the most desired qualification required in the materials from both countries. However, after removing language skills from the analysis, the differences between the countries started to emerge. In the Finnish materials, the ideal is constructed as a team-player who is capable of co-operating and developing. In Estonia, the focus is the opposite of that in Finland, shifting from the team to the individual. The ideal is constructed in Estonian materials as a free actor who needs to be capable of communication. Also, concerns about experience varied between the countries: in the Finnish context, experience is highlighted, but not to that extent in Estonia. In addition, requirements for ideal employees are demanding and are described with superlatives in advertisements in both countries. The analyses show that the gendering of expert work takes place in job advertisements by rendering subtly gendered articulations, yet allowing for interpretative repertoires.

When analyzing the whole corpus of job advertisements, we were able to identify five categories of themes from the materials: a) communication and teamwork, b) independence and responsibility, c) renewal, d) business and entrepreneurship, and e) analytical skills. All the themes were present in the materials from both cultures. Surprisingly, the findings of study IV did not construct an evidently gendered portrayal of an ideal employee. Our working hypothesis assumed the robust gendering that exists in our empirical materials, but our analysis did not reveal it robustly, so to speak. Even though theories relate feminine qualifications to the new ideal leaders and employees of the era, it did not come out remarkably in the job advertisements studied, offering possibilities for re-readings of gender, where gender is not done in a stereotypically constant and static way, but is more fluid and flexible.

### 4.3 Discussion of findings and relevance of the original studies

This compilation thesis has explored and analyzed the construction of an ideal gendered manager and employee through three research questions in four original studies. Next, I summarize and discuss the key findings of the original studies and their contributions to the overall thesis and answer the research questions.
The first study, which is related to the first research question, opens up methodological ways to contribute to the main research question of the thesis by highlighting the possibilities and restrictions of doing gender thinking and the necessity of naturally occurring document data in management and entrepreneurship studies.

The importance of the first study to the overall thesis is at least twofold. First, it has contributed to creating the theoretical framework of the study. While working with the first study, I familiarized myself comprehensively with the literature and discussions of doing gender thinking, and simultaneously created a foundation for the theoretical framework of the overall thesis. Study I provides backgrounds for the approach of doing gender, too. In addition, study I offers a theoretical contribution by providing one of the first novel systematizations done in business studies so far in the scattered research field of doing gender. As mentioned in the literature review, as a complicated concept to grasp (Gherardi 1994) and even challenging to understand, doing gender has been used in various ways in empirical studies. By providing a structuring of the field, study I contributes toward deeper understandings of doing gender thinking, and hopefully also guides future research in advancing the field toward a more focused and sophisticated use of the concept.

When relating study I to other studies aiming to systematize the doing gender approach (e.g., Nentwich & Kelan 2014), it seems to be the only one that focuses on methodological issues employed in empirical studies. Hence, study I enables a methodological contribution to the thesis by investigating the methodological repertoire used in empirical studies focusing on doing gender, and by noticing that the methods relating to manufactured materials dominate the field. The dominance of manufactured materials can certainly be considered a restriction in the field, which might also produce certain kinds of understandings, interpretations, and ‘truths’ of doing gender. Despite its relatively scant use, the doing gender approach is recognized both in management-related studies and in entrepreneurship, and thus the influence and consequences of using manufactured data in empirical studies focusing on doing gender is prevalent in both fields. Methodological tools, which go beyond the ‘natural choices’ and the conventional ones, would benefit and offer new possibilities for the fields. Novel methods of material collection and analysis are thus needed and welcomed when studying doings and constructions of gender empirically.

To conclude, when viewing the doing gender approach from the methodological point of view, it seems that the restrictions of the approach come mainly from the un-systematized employment of the concept itself, and from the limited use of methodological repertoires when studying it empirically. In turn, a more systematized use of the concept and employment of a wider repertoire of research methodologies and tools would allow for more sophisticated and nuanced insights into the approach and field.
Methodologically speaking, the findings in study I paved my way further in studies II, III, and IV, and argued for the employment of document materials in this thesis.

The second study, through which I answer the second research question, explores varieties of an ideal gendered woman-manager. The contribution that study II provides to the thesis is to show how gender, femininities, and power are constructed in the example of top managers in leading global business media with authoritative readership. Traditionally, most business media exposure is covered by men and masculinities, and women have only seldom been referred to, thus leaving women(-managers) almost invisible in business media (Ljunggren & Alsos 2007). However, to an increasing extent in recent years, women-managers and politicians have managed to enter into the pages of financial and business media, and women’s portrayals in media can no longer be regarded as exceptional or token. Still, it is important how women’s being visible is discussed and represented in the media. Managers represented in the pages of The Economist are the most powerful and influential leaders of the world: they are highly positioned and powered, and can therefore be considered elites.

The findings of study II showed that representations of top women-managers in The Economist were surprisingly traditional: the women were portrayed as managers and leaders, and were acknowledged as such, but according to the prevailing gender order, they were represented as ‘women’, or feminine characters. Regardless of the fact that they were in a global top managerial position, the women enacted with feminine characterizations, and also as dependents. The feminine characterizations included remarks on their bodily appearances, age, and style. The dependence was constructed, e.g., on their family (childhood family or relationship), kin, mentor, or protector. Thus, the women-managers were represented as not standing alone on their own abilities and merits, but rather as dependents on something. In that way, the top women-managers were represented through their vulnerability and need for support. In addition, apart from the obituaries, their portrayals were fragmented in many ways. Because of this fragmentation, the presence of women-managers in the global business media did not disturb the masculine management norm.

To critically discuss the construction of study II, I acknowledge that it is limited by the absence of visual elements and visual analysis of the women-managers, similar to previous studies that focus on the media representations of powerful women, which were discussed in the literature review. While working with the material collection and analyses, we considered including pictures of women-managers in the study. However, the portraits were restricted to typical facial photos, which were rather identical in nature. We considered that any extra value brought by including photos into the analysis would be rather modest after all. Notwithstanding, we decided to put profound effort into the textual analysis respectively.
The varieties of gendered representations of women-managers came about through the discourses identified in the study: traditional feminine manager, omnipotent competence, care and continuity, and problems. While identified as different discourses, they all constructed women-managers slightly differently. However, discourses were also connected to each other, showing ‘intertextuality’, which means that the texts are related to each other, and thus “the analyst is more dependent upon social and cultural understanding” (Fairclough 1995). In all, the study claimed that women-managers become accepted by different gender positioning. To be accepted as managers in the pages of The Economist, women-managers also needed to be feminine in their beings, so that the gendered power and the conventional gender order was not threatened. A different positioning of gender that often seems to be repeated, even in the highly respected world-leading media, stuck the statuses of gender into certain kinds of convenient and “suitable” positions, which will be legitimimized at the end. Afterward, those stagnant, convenient positions may be hard to question, challenge, and change.

One significance of study II is that it also depicts gender asymmetry as governing the global top management and business elite. It is a phenomenon that can be encountered throughout the working life in all of its sectors and levels, and it affects us all.

The third and fourth study contribute to the thesis via the third research question by showing cultural varieties in the construction of an ideal gendered employee and gendered work in job advertisements published in Finland and Estonia. Studies III and IV widen the context of the thesis. While study II focuses on top managers at the global level, studies III and IV move the discussion towards the local context, from elites to ordinary white-collar employees. Hence, studies II, III, and IV emphasize different contexts and societal levels, thus shedding light on constructions of an ideal from both sides of the coin.

Study III shows that gendering in the construction of an ideal employee (more specifically, expert job) in job advertisements happens in many ways. Legislation determines the bounds for what constitutes as befitting job advertising and acts as a boundary object in the study. Even though the legislation is harmonized on a general level between member countries of the EU, it is defined slightly differently in both studied countries, leaving room for maneuvering. Due to legislation in the Estonian context, the latitude was wider than that in Finland. Thus, also maneuvering was present particularly in the Estonian materials, where gender and age was done in more various ways than in the more neutral Finnish materials.

In job advertisements, the ideal candidate and expert job is described with characters that we consider as feminine or masculine in certain cultural contexts. Though our aim was not to make comparisons as such between countries, understandings of femininity and masculinity were consistent in both cultures – at least
our cultural competence interpreted them as consistent; but the ways in which femininity and masculinity, and thus also gender, become visible in advertisements varied culturally. Besides textual elements (e.g., phrases, word choices, tones, and emphases), visual materials (e.g., pictures, colors, letters, styles, and layout) applied in advertisements also played an important role when culturally coding gender into ads to attract suitable candidates.

In the empirical study, we identified four ideal constructions of expert jobs. The first emphasized performance features such as being “a natural leader”, which was obviously attuned as masculine and epitomized the old saying of “think manager – think male” (e.g., Schein et al. 1996; Gherardi & Murgia 2014). The second construction of expert jobs was directed toward women by calling for an expert in “her most beautiful bloom.” That metaphor of gender strongly mediates that the ideal feminine person for the position is neither too young nor too old, but is presentable regardless. In the third expert job construction of “a committed future big gun”, we interpreted the ideal as an unencumbered masculine behavior (Acker 2012, 218), where an ideal candidate would not endure with family and other kinds of outside-of-work responsibilities. Finally, the fourth category of expert jobs involves an ideal who is a competent expert, but also a nurturer. This kind of “nurture” refers to the feminine gender by emphasizing care and emotional work (e.g., Billing & Alvesson 2000).

As often, there would probably have been many alternative explanations for the findings. Above, we discussed those that we identified from the empirical materials based on our readings and cultural awareness. Those findings are culturally and temporally dependent, but they also possess a fineness and strength. The findings draw a picture of this current moment, simultaneously showing that gender is fluid and on the move, but at the same time is also somehow traditional and even stereotypical to some extent (e.g., men are unencumbered and women take care). It depicts the gender positions to be culturally deep-rooted, and any changes are most often slow.

By focusing on boundaries outside the organizational settings, legislation in study III goes beyond previous studies conducted in gendered recruitment practices (e.g., Van den Brink & Benschop 2012; Tienari et al. 2013; Meriläinen et al. 2015). In addition, study III offers a methodological contribution to the thesis by employing a visual analysis. According to Davison (2010), visual images saturate our current society and operate between representations and constructions in a theoretical and empirical sense. In that way, visual analysis provides a tool to produce new knowledge in the field. The relevance of study III comes from a nuanced analysis, through which it was possible to show how a lot can be expressed with relatively small things. Study III contributes as well by enabling me to learn to bring my subjectivity more holistically into the research and by teaching me to look more deeply and rigorously into visual elements and see things that earlier would have
gone unnoticed. The study aligns with previous literature, acknowledging that gender is accomplished differently among different cultures, subcultures, and times (Deutsch 2007). Also, interpretations of gender are culturally dependent, and thus my interpretations are somehow influenced by my cultural knowledge and readings.

Study IV contributes to the thesis as well by investigating the gendered constructions of an ideal employee and expert jobs, but from a different point of view than study III. Instead of focusing on selected ads in depth as done in study III, Study IV examines the whole set of materials. Study IV investigates whether expert jobs are gendered prior to candidate selection, and if so, how is doing gender present in the process? Linking doing gender thinking into articulations used in expert job advertisements targeted for prospective employees is a novel and thus far unused approach.

In study IV, opposite of the expectation, gendering was not strongly present in the studied job advertisements. Rather, gender was simultaneously present and absent, meaning that it was often present indirectly, which we found highly interesting. Similarly, we found that the gendering of expert jobs is not exclusively based on masculine or feminine meanings and framings (Ridgeway 2009), and we could not see any fixed point where the job is determined as masculine or feminine. Thus, we claimed that the gendering of expertise and expert jobs is a process in which the pre-recruitment actions become the most crucial, since nowadays expert jobs require the kinds of skills and talents that are no longer possible to categorize.

The present findings are significant in at least two major respects. Firstly, the findings of study IV offer possibilities for re-readings of gender, where gender is done in a flexible manner instead of ossified or stereotyped ways; secondly, this also illustrates the fluid nature of the doing gender concept. As highlighted earlier, doing gender is a challenging concept to study due to its complex, sensitive, changing, fickle, and context-specific nature. Consequently, the meanings of doing gender may vary in different contexts (Kelan & Nentwich 2009), which also holds true in this study. In that way, contexts become a major influencer in both studies focusing on Finland and Estonia.

Taken together in the discussion, context has a particular meaning for the doings and constructions of gender and for how it is mediated into the wider audiences. It is obvious that certain kinds of cultural understandings of gender, power, and business dominate the field in a certain time and place, but is does not mean that those would be stable, and could not been questioned or chanced. The findings of the above studies show how an ideal and gender as part of it are constructed in top managerial-, or ‘elite’-level business media and in job advertisements published in the two comparable cultural contexts of Finland and Estonia. As the studies show, the diverse use of contexts provides new knowledge about the constructions of
gender in different cultural settings and how they are manifested and mediated culturally.
5 CONCLUSIONS

5.1 The story I tell

This interdisciplinary study, my story, has discussed and extended our knowledge of the constructions of an ideal gendered manager and employee in different contexts. This final chapter elaborates on the findings of the study towards a more general level, highlights the most significant contributions that this thesis provides, and also recommends some possible directions for future works.

Based on my readings and on my empirical research, I argue that the constructions of ideal managers and employees are gendered, and that the gendering processes are complex, fluid, multifaceted, and depend on cultural settings and prevailing social orders. Expertise and expert work are gendered, and the gendering happens in all levels of working life, which focuses here on managerial and employee levels. Furthermore, this study has explored that gendering happens in different cultural contexts as well, since I have studied both local and global contexts. My results – as I understand them – mean that the gendering processes are ubiquitous, and in some way, they impact us all.

This thesis makes several contributions to the field by responding to calls to explore more critically and in more detail how gender, culture, and context in business and management are connected (e.g., Eden & Gupta 2017; Wheadon & Duval-Couetil 2017). The current study focuses on questions that have not yet been widely studied, and by doing so, it offers new knowledge in the field, drawing from the doing gender perspective and by studying it empirically in different contexts. The findings of this study revealed that constructions and doings of gender are complex, nuanced, and multifaceted processes that have different outcomes in different contexts. My understanding on doing gender is that it may sometimes be obvious, but may also simultaneously be something that is hard to recognize, capture, and track. As noticed earlier, it happens in many ways and on many levels. Accordingly, with previous research, my study has shown that doing gender thinking is a complex and demanding topic, but at the same time it is intriguing to focus on.

To develop my arguments and contributions, I have divided the contribution of the overall study into theoretical, methodological and societal parts, which I will discuss in more detail and elaborate on below.
5.2 Theoretical contribution of the overall study

The overall theoretical contribution of this study is to anchor the doing gender thinking more deeply into the field of management and entrepreneurship studies by using the doing gender approach as a theoretical perspective. More specifically, this study contributes theoretically by analyzing and synthesizing the approach of doing gender and the methods used when empirically studying it. It further empirically identifies how the ideal and gender as a part of it is constructed in different cultural settings from the perspective of doing gender. As emphasized earlier and as shown in this study, the concepts of doing gender, doing power, and doing leadership are embedded (Fletcher 2004), mediated, and context-specific. This study opens up new and important ways of understanding their contemporaneous constructions.

I refer to Aaltio and Kovalainen (2003, 184), who have stated that it is difficult to study gender without the concept of culture, and Meyer et al. (2017), who have argued that noticing the cultural context is particularly important in studies such as entrepreneurship. Here, the culture is analyzed at the local level by focusing on Finnish and Estonian job advertisements. A cross-cultural contextualization between Finland and Estonia enables researchers to bridge different contexts (Welter 2011, 175), which makes the contribution more substantive. In addition, the contexts used in this study are unique since both global and local contexts are used, and studies focusing on Finland and Estonia are rare. I regard the global context by analyzing media representations in a global business media. My findings are significant because they provide timely and nuanced examples of gender constructions in a variety of uncommon contexts.

Femininity and masculinity are discursive constructs, which are neither universal nor eternal categories; the meanings enacted to femininity and masculinity are also not shared by all (Barker & Jane 2016). In addition, femininity, masculinity, and the concept of gender as a whole are not static concepts, but their meanings change over time and place and over the lifetimes of individuals (Billing & Alvesson 2000). As we have noticed recently, old and established concepts that we are used to using in some particular meaning have gained new and sometimes even unsuspected meanings. The meaning constructions have changed and are constantly changing, and hence the concepts are also fluid and moving (e.g., if we look at the concepts of “work” and “worker,” their meanings have changed a lot over the years).

In this study, I have also recognized and demonstrated that doing gender is a fluid, dynamic, and multifaceted concept rather than a static entity. Previously, scholars focusing on doing gender thinking have been critiqued for analyzing doing gender as a static construct, as an attribute of an individual, or as a structural element (Nentwich & Kelan 2014), which I brought into conversation earlier in
this study, and for “treating working life and work organizations as something natural and stable, as a background or coulisse to where gender is done” (Abrahamsson 2014, 118). That also enables the construction of concepts, including gender, differently than in a traditional way. Abrahamsson (2014) challenges gender researchers to see gender doings as both stable and changing and to study those at different levels of society.

When relating the knowledge gained here briefly to a recent research of gendered media representations and gendering of expert work, it seems that they tell the same story. Cukier et al. (2016) illustrated in their study of Canadian broadcast news that women are underrepresented in business media and are still less likely to be framed as leaders or experts in media than men. They claimed that broadcast media may be “easier” for women than print media, but the conceptual study of De Anca and Gabaldon (2014) shows that the situation of women, in their case board members, is not prodigious in print media either, and the asymmetry of power seems to remain. Kelan (2018, 545–546) highlights that gender is not present and relevant in the same way in every situation; sometimes it is “actually in the background rather than in the foreground.” Similarly, even the presence of gender is ubiquitous and is not always as obvious as on some other occasions.

5.3 Methodological contribution of the overall study

This study provides a methodological contribution by showing an alternative way to study the constructions of gender in management and entrepreneurship studies by focusing on media documents and by linking diverse document empirical materials and several analytical methods. As thoroughly highlighted earlier in this thesis, in qualitative business research interviews, both as a method and as a material collection tool, other kinds of manufactured materials dominate the field of qualitative studies so far (Bryman 2004; Peräkylä & Ruusuvuori 2011; Silverman 2013a; 2013b), which is also the state-of-the-art in empirical studies emphasizing the doing gender approach. This thesis makes a methodological contribution to the field by highlighting the importance and relevance of document materials in management and entrepreneurship research, and also by employing those as empirical materials and analyzing those with different kinds of analytical methods.

The study also contributes methodologically by drawing from methods previously used in cultural studies and introducing them to the field of business studies. This thesis employs methods like close readings and visual analysis, thus far only scarcely utilized in business studies. Kovalainen (2018) argues in her recently published book chapter that methods stemming from cultural studies are currently the “cool methods” alongside big data, which she calls “hot data” in current and future
business research. Generally, visualizations and interest in visuals have grown constantly and significantly in recent times (Warren 2005; Davison 2010; 2014), and we have also witnessed a nascent but strengthening visual turn in management-related studies (Bell & Davison 2013) and a limited but growing use of art-based methods in management, entrepreneurship and organizational studies (Parush & Koivunen 2014).

Kovalainen (2018) notices further visual analysis as one of the most promising methods that have expanded from cultural studies into business studies. The enchantment of visual images, as Warren (2015) has also noticed, is that their meanings are different to different people according to their cultural context and their familiarity on visual culture. Multiple meanings also enable a multiplicity of voices (Warren 2005) to occur, which can be considered a strength in the postmodern days we are living in. Through visual analysis and other culturally originating methods, it is possible to provide novel re-readings of culture and to cross disciplinary boundaries (Kovalainen 2018) rather than hold on to them. Based on my analysis, I argue that by allowing space for different methodologies and theoretical perspectives, new and interesting understandings can be obtained, which can, on the other hand, also aid in promoting the concept of doing gender further.

New methodological openings require new approaches as well. Accordingly, Henry et al. (2016) notice that in the field of entrepreneurship, there is a need for an epistemological shift towards more poststructuralist feminist approaches and more innovative and confident solutions in research than what has been used so far (see also Poutanen 2015). That has also been somewhat assigned in this study. By advancing a social constructionist ontology, poststructuralist theorists do not assume binary and essentialist notions of women and men, but rather focus on looking at relations of gender, which enables them to analyze the “cultural production of their subjectivities and the material production of their social lives” (Calás et al. 2009, 555). This means moving forward from “body-counting,” as proposed by Alvesson and Billing (2000) at least a decade ago, toward a more interesting and complex research agenda. In poststructuralist analysis, the object is about how knowledge is textualized and situated in language and other forms of significations, including conventions to decide how and what to represent and what not to represent (Calás et al. 2009, 562; Kovalainen 2018). By employing a poststructuralist approach, it is possible to study gender as a process and as a performative concept (Henry et al. 2016).

This study has invited the researcher to let their subjectivity and voice be present in the study, and even more so when the study has proceeded. Following the idea of Alvesson and Kärreman (2011, 35), who stated that “the knowledge and the person doing the knowledge work can’t be separated,” I have learned to emphasize my personal presence in the pages of this thesis.
5.4 Societal contribution of the overall study

Since our culture is strongly mediated and the presence of media is constantly growing in our everyday lives, the media have a multifaceted influence on us and on our understandings. Besides constructing individuals and phenomena, media also have the power to decide which issues are brought into the limelight and which are left with minor attention or silenced into invisibility. Thus, media representations and constructions of gendered managers and ideal employees shape our understandings of what constitutes a manager or entrepreneur, how they should behave, and how they should look. Given these requirements, the representations also have a social implication, e.g., either helping or hindering the advancement of women into senior positions, and by perceiving the legitimacy of their presence in those top positions (Cukier et al. 2016). That way, my thesis can provide a societal contribution by showing interpretations of how the ideal has been constructed and represented in media texts.

Advertisements and newspaper articles mediate the culture they represent. I have considered job advertisements and media texts as cultural mediators of ideal managers and employees. Having a sense of criticality, from its multidisciplinary standpoint, this thesis has opened up new ways of thinking about media representations of powerful managers and ideal employees through the perspective of doing gender. The constructions of elite women managers and ideal candidates for certain positions represent some kind of ideals at a given time and at a particular location. However, images of ideals are not always merely positive. There are simultaneous fractures present, too, as my analysis has also revealed. Criticality makes it possible to obtain new and unexpected insights into this area of research and expose the unseen assumptions and practices in society and culture. Those can therefore help us to better understand the constructions of an ideal in respect to gender in more open ways.

This study has empirically focused both on ideal managers and ideal employees, which is a combination rarely used in business studies. This kind of scarcely studied combination of two analytical levels strengthens its contribution by offering new insights about the constructions of an ideal in two groups of actors in working life that have much in common, but also some prominent differences. Overall, media representations of powerful leaders can be considered as possible ways of being something to follow in life, whereas ideal candidates portrayed in job advertisements can be considered as coming closer to ordinary people in working life, and thus also more “available” to them. In that respect, it is important to study and show how ideality and gender are constructed in both groups of working life actors, in employees, and in managers.

More specifically, media representations have an impact on the reality and real lives of individuals, and on their daily lives (e.g., Radu & Redien-Collot 2008;
Achtenhagen & Welter 2011; Eikhof et al. 2013). Representations of an ideal employee in job advertisements affect our understanding of what constitutes as an ideal for a certain kind of position. As noticed in one of the independent studies of this compilation thesis, we claimed that we are not saying that job advertisements fully reflect working life; direct job ads still encourage prospective candidates to apply or to not apply for the jobs advertised. In that way, job ads and ideal candidates portrayed in them act as gatekeepers to open positions and career advancements.

Also, contextual factors and linguistic forms might influence an individual’s perceived suitability for job positions. It has been thoroughly explored elsewhere that the self-views of individuals, particularly those low in agency, affect their perceptions of their suitability for advertised job positions, and possibly for their prospective managerial roles in the future. That, in turn may influence their career choices and underrepresentation in certain positions in society (Bosak & Sczesny 2008; Horvath & Sczesny 2016). This is especially connected with women, since women tend to describe themselves as less suitable for managerial positions than men do (Bosak & Sczesny 2008), even if they are equally competent, particularly in high-status positions (Horvath & Sczesny 2016). Media texts – including job advertisements – with pictures, colors, and word choices depicted in them, have a great impact on whether individuals regard the ideals as reachable, and whether they consider themselves suitable for positions under presentation and call, and that is one of the values that this study can offer in a practical sense.

Again, at the societal level, the masculine subtext of management and the construction of an ideal employee have not changed thus far (e.g., Kelan 2008; Gherardi & Murgia 2014), even though the world around has changed so much. Accordingly, the characteristics attributed to women and men will lead to the gendering of jobs, which in turn affects people’s aspirations toward such jobs (Gupta et al. 2009). When jobs become gendered, the differentiations are institutionalized over time by deeply rooting the characterizations in social structures, which is a process that Ridgeway (2009) calls the “rules of gender”. Simultaneously, the gendering of jobs will affect individuals’ intentions in their working lives, and I would say also in their career possibilities.

In sum, the knowledge provided here and in previous studies related to this issue is highly important, especially for those who are currently acting in working life, whether as an employee, entrepreneur, job seeker, manager, employer, or recruitment professional, or as someone who is just about to enter into or is planning new moves within their working life.
5.5 Towards the future

In a methodological sense, research is produced with methods, while distinct methods produce the object of the research differently (Järviluoma et al. 2003). Thus, and based on my study, I would suggest that future research put more emphasis on document, naturally occurring empirical materials, methods suitable for analyzing them, and a diverse combination of materials and analytical methods, which could also be more creative in nature, and on new, more innovative ways to present the academic research. It has been noted elsewhere that methods like shadowing, participant observation (Poggio 2006), fiction novels and films (Czarniawska 2006; Phillips & Knowles 2012), heuristics (Aaltio et al. 2011), and play (Berglund & Tillmar 2015) are useful in studying the processes of gendering and constructions of management and entrepreneurship. It has also proposed elsewhere that photographs (Ray & Smith 2012; Pritchard & Whiting 2015), other visual images such as architecture (Bell & Davison 2013), drawings and arts (Broussine 2008), stories (Simpson 2008), poetry (Grisoni 2008; Biehl-Missal 2015), theatre (Kirk & French 2008), conducting a choir (Parush & Koivunen 2014), and dance (Biehl-Missal 2015; Satama 2016) would benefit the field of management and organizational research. Assuredly, new methods and methodologies would also aid in going forward from the prevailing, so-called “interview society” (Gubrium & Holstein 2003; Butera 2006; Kovalainen 2018), where almost all of the information is produced through interviews.

The approach of doing gender is still scattered: more knowledge is needed to further systematize the field and study gendering processes empirically. Both theoretical and empirical openings would be welcome.

Coming back closer to the currently studied subject, we noticed in our research group, that it would be an interesting task to study how powerful men managers and masculinities are constructed in the same pages of globally leading business media, similar to what we had done with powerful women managers. It is interesting whether the constructions of women and men managers are similar or different, and how the concepts are related to each other. Studying this topic further can serve as a fruitful research task, and we have already taken steps in this direction as a future work.

Also, an interesting prospective research task would be to analyze visuals used in job advertisements more holistically than has been done in this study, by concentrating solely on them as Davison (2010, 2014) has done in the field of accounting by studying visuals’ rhetoric in annual reports. Pritchard and Whiting (2015) also focused squarely on stock photos, showing how visual constructions of gendered age are impacted in the media. I have also taken tentative steps in this direction.
In all, I suggest that doing gender thinking provides a useful approach for forthcoming research to extend our knowledge of the intertwined relationships of gender, power, leadership, and entrepreneurship. Future research might, hopefully, critically explore the constructions of gender in different and innovative contexts with creative methods. I hope that it would be an inspiring and insightful path for future research to follow and to put effort into.


