# Bona docere et mala dedocere – inquisition of heresy and communication with the lay population

Reima Välimäki

In late January or early February 1401, inquisitor of heresy and provincial of the Celestine order in the German lands, Peter Zwicker, preached against the Waldensian heresy in the Styrian town of Hartberg. Zwicker was accompanied by Martin, priest of St. Mary at Týn in Prague, in leading the inquisition of heresy against local Waldensians by the order of Gregor, Archbishop of Salzburg and papal legate. After the sermon a woman called Peters, the wife of Frideric Reat de Stangendorff, declared on several different occasions, and in the presence of several witnesses, that the inquisitor's sermon had converted her from heresy to the Catholic faith. Stories about conversions, including conversions of Jews and heretics, are often attributed to medieval preachers. However, in Peters' case the conversion, or rather its performance, may have been the last attempt to save her self from the punishment being prepared for her by the inquisitors. This confrontation offers us a unique glance into the effect of inquisitors' preaching on the laity.

The story is recounted in the final sentence pronounced over three relapsed heretics at the end of February 1401, and it is preserved in a fifteenth-century formulary based on Peter Zwicker's sentences.<sup>2</sup> In February 1401 Peters was cited for the second time to appear at court. She had already confessed and abjured heresy on January 24 of the same year. In the course of the trial Zwicker had discovered that in her initial interrogation Peters had given a false name, calling herself "Els". Moreover, she also undermined the work of the *officium inquisitionis*, by encouraging her servant Endel also to give a false name, Margaretha, at her trial. Peters had also lied about the time of her last confession to a heresiarch,

<sup>1</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The miracles of Berthold von Regensburg, told by later Franciscan chronicles, include among others conversion of a robber baron and a prostitute, see Ariane Czerwon, *Predigt gegen Ketzer: Studien zu den lateinischen Sermones Bertholds von Regensburg*, Tübingen, Mohr Siebeck, 2011, pp. 26–28; Vincent Ferrer is told to have forced the Jews to attend his sermon in Perpignan in 1415. See Roberto Rusconi, "Anti-Jewish Preaching in the Fifteenth Century and Images of Preachers in Italian Renaissance Art", in *Friars and Jews in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, ed. by Steven J. McMichael and Susan E. Myers, The Medieval Franciscans 2, Leiden, Brill, 2004, pp. 231–234; The story is recorded in the *Vita* of Vincent written by Petrus Ranzanus. See Petrus Ranzanus, "Vita S. Vincentii Ferrerii", in *Acta Sanctorum; Aprilis, I*, Antwerp, 1675, p. 506E, nr. 41.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Würzburg, Universitätbibliotek, M. Ch. f. 51, fols. 25v–27r. The document is edited in Herman Haupt, "Waldenserthum und Inquisition im südöstlichen Deutschland seit der Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts", *Deutsche Zeitschrift für Geschichtswissenschaft*, 3 (1890), pp. 337–411: 408–411. On Zwicker's formularies, question lists and other parts of an inquisitors' manual, see Reima Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany. The Inquisitor Petrus Zwicker and the Waldensians*, York, York Medieval Press, 2019, pp. 104–170.

a fact that was revealed when the inquisitor cross-interrogated her husband Frideric. In Peters' sentence it is explicitly stated that 'worse and more damnable than all other things' was that she had on several occasions told other suspects that they need not to appear in court unless they were captured. Having learned this from several witness accounts, Zwicker had them testify under oath in front of twenty notable members of the community, and when they concurred, he deemed Peters to be a relapsed heretic.<sup>3</sup>

Inquisitors habitually preached in the course of trials against heresy, and these communications were not only formal parts of the process, but occasions to engage the laity. Peters' trial serves as a clue to occasions where the inquisitor's – in this case Peter Zwicker's – views of true faith and heresy were publicly communicated to lay men and women. In addition to sermons, the public citations to appear in court, as well as the performance of sentencing, were highly effective performances. Communication between the inquisitor and the local community was crucial to the inquisition's success. The communication network of citations, sermons and public penances transformed the lands of heretics into landscapes of contrition, penitence and reform, thus enforcing the proper Christian *modus vivendi* on the suspect population.

The laity was a group that in Austria at the turn of the fifteenth century included people with both orthodox and heterodox sympathies. It was also a group that was increasingly addressed in theological and devotional discourse, though it is perhaps more accurate to say that there was a notable rapprochement between laity and *religiosi*. Preaching inquisitors habitually addressed a mixed audience of clergy and laity, who had varying degrees of theological knowledge, but who were all used to public discussions of doctrinal matters. Some were suspicious of the inquisitors, others supported them, and the positions of the laity and the clergy were not always what one would expect. Zwicker's formulary for the diocese of Passau, hitherto hardly commented on in the scholarship, includes formulas for excommunication of a vicar or rector who opposed an inquisitor's orders, as well as a copy of a contumacious priest's absolution by an episcopal commissary. Unfortunately, the names and other

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Haupt, "Waldenserthum und Inquisition", pp. 410–411.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Stephen Mossman, *Marquard von Lindau and the Challenges of Religious Life in Late Medieval Germany: The Passion, the Eucharist, the Virgin Mary*, Oxford; New York, Oxford University Press, 2010, pp. 27–30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> St Florian, XI 234, fols. 89va–90ra, 90rb–va. The existence of unedited material connected to Zwicker in this manuscript has been noted already in the 1970s, but not the exact nature and contents of these texts, see. Peter Biller, "Aspects of the Waldenses in the Fourteenth Century, Including an Edition of Their Correspondence", PhD Thesis, University of Oxford, 1974, pp. 354–355; Alexander Patschovsky, ed., *Quellen zur böhmischen Inquisition im 14. Jahrhundert*, MGH Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters 11, Weimar, Hermann Böhlaus, 1979, p. 92, n. 304. On the manuscript tradition of these formulas, see Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 164–

details are not preserved in this later copy, but it nevertheless suggests that not all priests were happy to comply with the mission of an outside inquisitor. The opposition was not necessarily due to dissident sympathies, it may simply have been a reaction to the heavy obligations the inquisitor delegated to the parish clergy.

Some lay people eagerly participated in the persecution of heretics. In the papal penitentiary there are two petitions by Benedictine monks of Melk Abbey – also in the diocese of Passau – from 1451. As young boys these monks had participated in the burning of heretics during the early Hussite revolt. One was only ten years old when he carried wood for the pyre. As adult monks they were never quite sure whether these acts of violence constituted obstacles to their ecclesiastical advancement, hence the petition for papal dispensation. Inquisitors of heresy operated amongst both sceptics and zealots, and probably a majority of indifferent folk it between. When interacting with the local community the inquisitor attempted to overcome opposition, convince the indifferent of the danger of heresy, and to channel the anti-heretical zeal towards objective they considered appropriate and productive.

#### Citations as a means to communication

Peters and other suspects of heresy were already subjects of the inquisitor's propaganda even before they appeared at their first hearing. Citations to court opened the inquisitorial process, and were channels of communication that reached a wide audience, including those who did not intentionally come to see the proclamation of sentences for heretics or hear the inquisitor's preaching. The inquisitor's opening sermon marked the beginning of a local inquisitorial process, and it was usually followed by the declaration of a period of grace (*tempus gratie/tempus indulgentie/tempus misericordie*), during which the suspects of heresy and their associates could confess without fear of the worst punishments.<sup>7</sup> Another form of general citations were those read in parish churches or in other public places, urging all those conceivably involved in heresy to present themselves to the inquisitor. Finally, as the trials progressed and the time for voluntary confessions passed, persons with heretical

<sup>167;</sup> on the episcopal officals involved, see Reima Välimäki, "Bishops and the Inquisition of Heresy in Late Medieval Germany", in *Dominus Episcopus. Medieval Bishops between Diocese and Court*, ed. by Anthony John Lappin and Elena Balzamo, KVHAA Konferenser 95, Stockholm, Kungl. Vitterhets Historie och Antikvitetsakademien, 2018, pp. 199–200.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Filippo Tamburini and Ludwig Schmugge, eds., *Häresie und Luthertum*, Quellen und Forschungen aus dem Gebiet der Geschichte (Görresgesellschaft), Neue Folge 19, Paderborn, Schöningh, 2000, pp. 47–51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The period of grace was more based on custom than on law, though it was deemed as legal action, see Vasil Bivolarov, *Inquisitoren-Handbücher*. *Papsturkunden und juristische Gutachten aus dem 13. Jahrhundert mit Edition des Consilium von Guido Fulcodii*, MGH Studien und Texte 56, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz, 2014, p. 293.

fama were personally cited to appear in court at an assigned time, and if need be repeatedly, under the threat of excommunication.<sup>8</sup> The citations were, according to Ian Forrest, a hybrid media, which involved writing and speech, with presentations both at the homes of the accused and in their parish churches. Officials took care that the content of the citations was read aloud carefully and in vernacular.<sup>9</sup>

Peter Zwicker's practice of citing suspects has hitherto been studied through the reconstruction of the protocols of the Stettin inquisitions of 1392–1394. <sup>10</sup> The accused were cited either publicly in their parish churches, individually by written note, or by a messenger. Some arrived of their own accord (*spontanea voluntate*), and one suspect, Katherina, wife of Henningh Wideman, explained that she had beem instructed by a certain priest and ordered by her secular or current lords (*ex iussu dominorum temporalium*) to follow the citation. The arrival of the citations, at least when specific persons were named, could cause conflict to break out. When Zwicker cited the suspects from the village of Klein-Wubiser, a local hot-spot of Waldensians, he used a man called Fikke from the neighbouring village Gross-Wubiser to deliver the list of names to the local parish priests. The messenger was seized and put under custody by local Waldensians, with the approval of the village magistrate Jacob Hokman, who later had to answer for these actions to the inquisitor himself. Finally, the second letter of citation was carried by the priest of Gross-Wubiser; Jacob grudgingly allowed it to be read, although he knew that it included "bad words" (*mala verba*) of his relatives and neighbours. <sup>11</sup> These letters sent to Klein-Wubiser were personal and condemnatory citations.

Models for Zwicker's citations have been preserved in the manual of St. Florian XI 234, including formulas made or revised from earlier manuals for the inquisition in the diocese of Passau in the mid-

<sup>8</sup> The fourteenth-century Bohemian manual includes several formularies for citations, including four personal, peremptory citations, see Alexander Patschovsky, *Die Anfänge einer ständigen Inquisition in Böhmen. Ein Prager Inquisitoren-Handbuch aus der ersten Hälfte des 14. Jahrhunderts*, Berlin; New York, de Gruyter, 1975, nr. 49–63, pp. 152–161.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Ian Forrest, *The Detection of Heresy in Late Medieval England*, Oxford; New York, Oxford University Press, 2005, pp. 125–130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Wilhelm Wattenbach, "Über die Inquisition gegen die Waldenser in Pommern und der Mark Brandenburg", *Abhandlungen der königl. Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, Phil.-hist. Kl,* 3 (1886), pp. 1–102: 24–26; Dietrich Kurze, "Zur Ketzergeschichte der Mark Brandenburg und Pommerns vornehmlich im 14. Jahrhundert: Luziferianer, Putzkeller und Waldenser", *Jahrbuch für die Geschichte Mittel- und Ostdeutschlands*, 16/17 (1968), pp. 50–94: 74; for Katherina's deposition, see *Quellen zur Ketzergeschichte Brandenburgs und Pommerns*, ed. by Dietrich Kurze, Berlin, de Gruyter, 1975, p. 227. On Zwicker's practice of citations, see also Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 185–190.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The complete protocol is edited in Kurze, ed., *Quellen zur Ketzergeschichte Brandenburgs und Pommerns*, pp. 233–235; See also Euan Cameron, *Waldenses: Rejections of Holy Church in Medieval Europe*, Oxford, Blackwell Publishers, 2000, p. 141.

1390s.<sup>12</sup> There are three formulas for citations. The first is a general citation for all who have had dealings with heretics to appear voluntarily in front of the inquisitor; the second, a *citatio specialis* aimed at named persons; and finally, a citation for those who have already confessed to the inquisitor to arrive on a certain day to receive their penance. These formulas not only complement our understanding of Zwicker's inquisitorial practice, but also shed light no how an inquisitor could mobilize the parish clergy and so have his message be heard, at least in theory, in every village church.

The general citation is addressed to all parish priests, or their vicars, in the diocese of Passau. Zwicker commanded in the name of the episcopal authority granted to him "in the cause of Catholic faith", and under the threat of excommunication, should the recipient not comply, that the citation be read on every Sunday and feast day during the mass, when the largest number of parishioners was present, from the day when the letter arrived to the following Easter Sunday. Zwicker underlined that the citation should be "proclaimed in a clear and fully intelligible voice." The inquisitor commanded the priest warn every person, "who has ever in their life belonged to the sect of the Waldensian heretics – who in the vernacular and among themselves are called 'the known', that is *di kunden lawt*," against receiving the communion unless they first confessed to the inquisitor and were taken back to the unity of the Church. Should someone be caught, he or she would be punished according to the strictest decree of the law.<sup>13</sup>

The core of the citation is typical of such pronouncements: a general call to all those involved in heresy to come voluntarily to seek absolution in order to avoid more severe penance and punishment. At the same time, it displays an unusual sense of timing and familiarity with Waldensian practices. The citation was read until Easter Sunday, thus it was issued during Lent, a time of self examination and repentance, of confession in preparation for annual communion by every Christian. The admonition not to take communion in a heretical state was intended to counter the common late medieval Waldensian practice of double confession to both heresiarchs and priests. The late-fourteenth-century descriptions of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See the manuscript description in Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 286–289.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> St Florian, XI 234, fol. 88vb: "quatenus omnibus diebus dominicis et festiuis a die qua presentes presentate vobis fuerint littere [sic] vsque in diem resurreccionis dominice proxime futurum inclusiue in vestris ecclesiis infra missarum solempnia quando maior populi multitudo ad diuina aderit congregata, viua expressa et plenariter intelligibili voce de vestris ambonibus proclametis ac proclamari per vestros vicarios faciatis, quod omnes et singuli sexus utriusque cuiuscumque status seu condicionis fuerint, qui umquam in tota vita sua fuerunt de secta waldensium hereticorum qui wlgariter noti i.e. di kunden låwt inter se nominati sunt, quorum proch dolor nimia multitudo a plurimis annis in hiis partibus dilituit [r. dilatuit] in medio fidelis populi katholici tanto periculosus [sic] quanto fraudulencius occultata; ad venerabile sacramentum corporis dominici accede aut ipsum sumere nullatenus audeant et presumant nisi prius omnes et singuli ad nostram perueniant presenciam et coram nobis iudicialiter et solempniter ad*iurans* ecclesie katholice redeant vnitatem. Si quis uero repertus fuerit ille uel illa per nostram diffinitivam [sententiam?] pena grauissima iuxta rigorem iuris durissime punietur."

German Waldensianism attest that Waldensian followers confessed their sins to the parish priests in order to have communion at Easter – without mentioning their dissenting beliefs. <sup>14</sup> This was, of course, well known to the inquisitors. A list of errors circulating with Zwicker's formularies, the *Articuli Waldensium*, claims that the practice was recommended by the Waldensian brethren to their followers. <sup>15</sup> Zwicker inquired into this practice in Stettin, <sup>16</sup> and received confirmatory depositions. <sup>17</sup> The citation from Upper Austria speaks directly to those Waldensians who Zwicker expected to frequent their parish churches during Lent. He addressed them knowing that "their great multitude, God forbid, has for several years hidden in the middle of Catholic people all the more dangerous that it is deceitfully secret." <sup>18</sup> Reading the citations aloud was more than merely a judicial act. It was a way of propagating the orthodox view that receiving communion in a state of mortal sin or when excommunicated only led to damnation. This was the very message that the Dominican Vincent Ferrer declared in his Lenten sermons in the Waldensian areas of Switzerland in 1404. <sup>19</sup>

Another singular feature in Zwicker's citation is his address to the Waldensians as to *di kunden lawt*, "the known people", the name the group used for itself. He takes this address a step further in the summons to receive penance. This too was to be read publicly during the mass. Now Zwicker stresses further the importance of careful repetition of the citation: "You are to declare and have it declared thus, precisely, exactly and clearly in your vernacular idiom." The message intended for the penitent converts was this:

Beloved children, Peter the Monk, inquisitor and hearer (auditor) of the kundenlauten sends this command to you, through me, by virtue of the present letter, sealed with his seal, under the punishment of excommunication and perjury, that all of those in Enns or in Steyr who – in relation to him – this year or the previous year have letters from him regarding faith, or those

<sup>14</sup> See esp. Biller, "Aspects", pp. 100–101, 112–117; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 132; Georg Modestin, *Ketzer in der Stadt: der Prozess gegen die Strassburger Waldenser von 1400*, MGH Studien und Texte 41, Hannover, Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2007, pp. 132–134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Quoted from Biblioteca Apostolica, Vat. Pal. lat. 677, fol. 49v: "Item swadent credentibus suis ire ad communionem ecclesie solum tempore paschali et sic colorant se quasi sint eciam christiani." Cf. ed. in E. Werner, "Nachrichten über spätmittelalterliche Ketzer aus tschechoslowakischen Archiven und Bibliotheken", Wissenschaftliche Zeitschrift der Karl-Marx-Universität Leipzig. Gesellschafts- und sprachwissenschaftliche Reihe, 12 (1963), pp. 215–284: 269.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> "Es eciam confessus presbiteris ecclesiae? Sumpsisti corpus domini? Revelasti ipsis sectam? Fuisti prohibitus revelare sectam an non?", Kurze, ed., *Quellen zur Ketzergeschichte Brandenburgs und Pommerns*, p. 74. <sup>17</sup> Ibid., pp. 80, 89, 113, 119, 130, 199, 205, 253, 258, 260.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> St Florian, XI 234, fol. 88vb: "quorum proch dolor nimia multitudo a plurimis annis in hiis partibus dilituit [r. dilatuit] in medio fidelis populi katholici tanto periculosus [sic] quanto fraudulencius occultata."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Vincent Ferrier, *Sermones de cuaresma en Suiza: 1404 : Couvent des Cordeliers, ms 62*, ed. by Francisco M Gimeno Blay and María Luz Mandingorra Llavata, trans. by Daniel Gozalbo Gimeno, Valencia, Ajuntament de Valencia, 2009, pp. 77, 116–117, 145.

who do not have [letters], and particularly and especially those who did not come to him on the most recent past summonses, or if they did come and by his command received a later date, such as the next weekday at such and such an hour: they should come without delay to such and such a place to receive the gracious penance which he promises to all those who come voluntarily and with good will, comporting themselves humbly and devoutly. If however any of the rest of the aforesaid do not come, or contumaciously disdain coming, he will adjudge them publicly to be perjurers: and, as the crime demands, he will without fail or doubt subject them to the harshest penance.<sup>20</sup>

The title "Petrus monachus Inquisitor et auditor der kundenlauten" is striking. It is not the formal inquisitorial title used in the sentences or protocols, which listed the mandate and ecclesiastic rank of the inquisitor. Instead, Zwicker is using completely different register when addressing the heretics, presenting himself particularly as judge of the *kundenlauten*, the Waldensian people. Another peculiarity is the attribute "monk", by no means a formal ecclesiastic title. This is not the only instance where Zwicker is called so. In the Stettin protocols he is twice called "monk", just as the Waldensians referred to the inquisitor among themselves. It is difficult to tell if Zwicker used the same formulas already in Stettin and the Waldensians picked up the name from the citations, or if Zwicker adopted and re-defined the attribute given to him by his opponents.

The citation formulas were not a routine part of the judicial summons, but rather a considered part of the apparatus of propagating the faith, which stretched far beyond the inquisitor himself and his immediate assistants. Peters must have come to court following such a general citation issued by Zwicker and read out in local churches, including her own. Appearing under a false name suggests that she was had not been cited by name – though it is difficult to see what she hoped to achieve by following a general citation and then giving a false name and feigning her conversion. In the end, all she achieved was Zwicker's undivided attention. After she had abjured and received absolution under the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> St Florian, XI 234, fol. 89ra—rb: "taliter expresse fideliter et intelligibiliter ydeomate vestro wlgari pronunccietis et pronuncciari faciatis: dilecti pueri, Petrus monachus Inquisitor et auditor der kundenlauten mandat uobis per me uirtute presentis littere suo sigillo sigillatis sub pena excommunicacionis et periurii, quod omnes illi qui siue in aneso siue in Stira apud ipsum illo anno uel preterito ex parte fidei siue litteras eius habeant siue non habeant et signanter ac specialiter illi qui proximis preteritis suis vocacionibus ad ipsum non venierint [sic] uel si uenerent et suo mandato ulteriorem terminum receperunt ut proxima feria [ms: versi?] hora tali ad ipsum veniant indilate ad locum talem ad suscipiendam gratiosam penitentiam quam ipse promittit omnibus volumptarie et beneuole venientibus humiliterque se disponentibus et deuote; si uero aliqui de predictis residius non uenirent seu contumaciter venire contempserint, illos periuros publice iudicabit et durissima secundum exigenciam delicti penitentia subiciet sine fallo uel dubio."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> See e.g. Haupt, "Waldenserthum und Inquisition", p. 404.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Kurze, ed., *Quellen zur Ketzergeschichte Brandenburgs und Pommerns*, pp. 144, 168. See also Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, p. 189.

false name, she came to hear Zwicker's sermon, another medium inquisitors used to proclaim their message against heresy.

## Occasions for preaching by Inquisitors

While anti-heretical preaching was part of campaigns against heresy, <sup>23</sup> the practice of preaching by inquisitors is less well known and understood. Normative sources such as manuals and formularies usually describe the sermons at the beginning and end of the inquisitorial trial: the opening sermon and the installation of the period of grace as well as the *sermo generalis* when sentences were declared. Consequently, some scholars have stressed the performative aspects of the *sermo generalis* over the sermon's contents.<sup>24</sup> Humbert of Romans (c. 1200-1277), the fifth Master of the Order of the Preachers, provides in his collection of model sermons advice for the opening sermon, and the *sermo generalis*. At first, the populace should be warned of the existence of false Christians and pseudo-prophets and exhorted to assist the inquisitor. Next, when declaring the sentences, the inquisitor should explain to the laity possibly sympathetic towards the heretics, why heresy is so carefully examined and so severely punished: "therefore all (heretics) are punished hard and publicly, that in every soul would be installed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Beverly Mayne Kienzle, Cistercians, Heresy, and Crusade in Occitania, 1145-1229: Preaching in the Lord's Vineyard, York, York Medieval Press, 2001; Forrest, The Detection of Heresy in Late Medieval England, pp. 113-122; Christine Caldwell Ames, Righteous Persecution: Inquisition, Dominicans, and Christianity in the Middle Ages, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009, pp. 35–49; Czerwon, Predigt gegen Ketzer, pp. 65–170; Quellen zur Geschichte der Waldenser von Strassburg (1400-1401), ed. by Georg Modestin, MGH Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters 22, Hannover, Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2007, pp. 58–63; Modestin, Ketzer in der Stadt, pp. 12-13; Georg Modestin, "Der Augsburger Waldenserprozess und sein Straßburger Nachspiel (1393-1400)", Zeitschrift des Historischen Vereins für Schwaben, 103 (2011), pp. 43–68: 51–53, 66–67; Kathrin Utz Tremp, "Ein Dominikaner im Franziskanerkloster : der Wanderprediger Vinzenz Ferrer und die Freiburger Waldenser (1404): zu Codex 62 der Franziskanerbibliothek", in Zur geistigen Welt der Franziskaner im 14. und 15. Jahrhundert: die Bibliothek des Franziskanerklosters in Freiburg, Schweiz: Akten der Tagung des Mediävistischen Instituts der Universität Freiburg vom 15. Oktober 1993, ed. by Ruedi Imbach and Ernst Tremp, Freiburg, Universitätsverlag, 1995; Kathrin Utz Tremp, "Predigt und Inquisition. Der Kampf gegen die Häresie in der Stadt Freiburg (erste Hälfte des 15. Jahrhunderts)", in Mirificus praedicator: à l'occasion du sixième centenaire du passage de Saint Vincent Ferrier en pays romand : actes du colloque d'Estavayer-le-Lac, 7-9 octobre 2004, ed. by Paul-Bernard Hodel and Franco Morenzoni, Roma, Istituto storico domenicano, 2006, pp. 205–232. <sup>24</sup> James B. Given, *Inquisition and Medieval Society: Power, Discipline, and Resistance in Languedoc*, Ithaca, Cornell University Press, 2001, pp. 73–78, esp. p. 73; Thomas Scharff, "Die Inquisitoren und die Macht der Zeichen. Symbolische Kommunikation in der Praxis der mitteralterlichen dominikanischen Inquisition", in Praedicatores, inquisitores I. The Dominicans and the Medieval Inquisition. Acts of the 1st International Seminar on the Dominicans and the Inquisition 23-25. February 2002, Rome, Instituto Storico Domenicano Roma, 2004, p. 124; for the opposite view, see Grado G. Merlo, *Inquisitori e inquisizione del Medioevo*, Bologna, Il mulino, 2008, chap. 5.2; Ames, Righteous Persecution, p. 40–46.

the fear of similar transgressions."<sup>25</sup> Whole parishes could be ordered to attend such occasions, as it is attested in inquisitor Colda's formula for "calling together the clergy and the people for a sermon" in a Bohemian inquisitor's manual.<sup>26</sup>

Compared to the dramatic performance of sentencing the obstinate heretics, such ordinary homilies on faith by inquisitors are little known. We have only passing references to the formal requirements of inquisitors to be competent preachers.<sup>27</sup> Hence the evidence of Peters' sentence is of particular interest, for it shows that Zwicker delivered public sermons between the interrogations:

And this you have clearly said from your own mouth many times and in front of many people after our sermon, saying this: if I had not heard that sermon I would have never become Christian, I would have never converted. From these words it is evident and clear as day that your abjuration and conversion which we deemed to be genuine, was inwardly false and deceitful. For if by the will of God we would have died before this sermon you would have remained a complete heretic as before, not hindered by your oath.<sup>28</sup>

The sermon initiating the conversion could not have been the opening-sermon of the inquisition in Hartberg. Peters had heard the sermon after she had already confessed under the false name Els on January 24, thus it must have taken place during the period of the trial. The sermon was public and intended for the laity, though we cannot discern why Peters risked being caught by attending the sermon.<sup>29</sup> Perhaps it was part of her penance; already the thirteenth-century guidelines for inquisitors required the presence of the penitent converts at the *sermo generalis*.<sup>30</sup> Peter Zwicker, who by the time he was leading trials in Steiermark had at least a decade's experience of inquisition into heresy, paid more than just formal attention to the conduct of his converts after their repentance and abjuration. He betrays this interest, and his disappointment, in the *Cum dormirent homines*, a polemical treatise he

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Humbertus de Romanis, "De eruditione predicatorum", ed. by Marguerin La Bigne, Maxima Bibliotheca Veterum Patrum, Et Antiquorum Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum, vol. 25, Lvgdvni, Anissonios, 1677, pp. 554–555; see also Ames, *Righteous Persecution*, pp. 41–44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Patschovsky, *Die Anfänge*, p. 205, nr. 124.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Bivolarov, *Inquisitoren-Handbücher*, p. 262; Michael M. Tavuzzi, *Renaissance Inquisitors: Dominican Inquisitors and Inquisitorial Districts in Northern Italy, 1474-1527*, Studies in the History of Christian Traditions 134, Leiden, Brill. 2007. p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ed. in Haupt, "Waldenserthum und Inquisition", pp. 409–411, cit. at p. 410. See also pp. 378–379.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Of course it may have been simple curiosity. People do and did strange things. The only well-known heretic of the medieval Sweden, Botulf of Gottröra, was captured when he came to see a visitation by Archbishop Nicolaus Catilli of Uppsala, whose citations Botulf was at the same time trying to escape. See Reima Välimäki, "'Hereticum iudicamus'. Kättardomen över Botulf vid rättegången i Uppsala ärkestift 1310–1311", *Historisk Tidskrift för Finland*, 96 (2011), pp. 110–130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> See e.g. *Ordo processus Narbonensis,* in *Texte zur Inquisition*, ed. by Kurt-Victor Selge, Texte zur Kirchen- und Theologiegeschichte 4, Gütersloh, Mohn, 1967, p. 60; see also Merlo, *Inquisitori e inquisizione del Medioevo*, chap. 5.4.

wrote in 1395, at the beginning of his inquisitorial campaign against the Austrian Waldensians. Discussing the veneration of images, Zwicker blames the former heretics of reluctance to learn the proper ways of good Christians:

The images are thus books for the laity, who, not knowing the scriptures, sometimes achieve greater devotion and grace than a great scholar from the study of the books. But let God be my witness that I do not lie; seeing I have seen many converts from the Waldensian sect to enter a church in no other way but blind, mute, deaf and obstinate, as irrational asses. But it is no wonder, for what a new cup takes in, so does the old one taste.<sup>31</sup>

This may be the expression of an inquisitor's pessimism over the possibility of sincere conversion of heretics. At the same time, it is revealing in terms of the theme pursued by the essays in this book: the laity and reform. Towards the end of the fourteenth century, a formal, outer conversion of the laity was not the sole desired outcome. Instead, Peter Zwicker hoped to achieve a true conversion and inner acceptance of Catholic devotional practices. Towards this goal he aimed his preaching and other forms of communication.

The contents of the sermon probably addressed the Waldensian heresy and defended the Catholic faith and its practices. Zwicker's homiletic material was worked into his anti-Waldensian treatise, the *Cum dormirent homines*. Several passages in this polemical treatise have a clear homiletic and pastoral character.<sup>32</sup> In addition to well-known exempla, in several passages the language and argumentation of the *Cum dormirent homines* incorporate comparisons, metaphors, and remarks that resemble the homiletic style.<sup>33</sup>

The line distinguishing between treatise and sermon is not always clear, and the appearance of oral features, such as apostrophes, in the written text is not necessarily a mark of their oral delivery. In sermons oral markers were a conscious literary device in support of a more familiar, even intimate, type

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Petrus Zwicker, "Pseudo]-Petri de Pilichdorf contra Haeresin Waldensium Tractatus [Cum dormirent homines]", in *Lucae tvdensis episcopi, Scriptores aliqvot svccedanei contra sectam waldensivm*, ed. by Jacob Gretser, Maxima Bibliotheca Veterum Patrum, Et Antiquorum Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum, vol. 25, Lvgdvni, Anissonios, 1677, pp. 2978–C.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Peter Biller, "The Waldenses in German-Speaking Areas in the Later Fourteenth Century: The View of an Inquisitor", in *The Waldenses, 1170-1530: Between a Religious Order and a Church*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2001, p. 273; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 143; Eugene Smelyansky, "Self-Styled Inquisitors: Heresy, Mobility, and Anti-Waldensian Persecutions in Germany, 1390-1404", PhD Thesis, University of California, Irvine, 2015, p. 166; and most recently Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 176–178.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> See e.g. Zwicker, "Cum dormirent homines", p. 282F. Quotation from Luke 15:7 "there shall be joy for the angels of God upon one sinner that doth penance" is followed by an example stating that one must be aware of the possibility that one's brother could be crowned king in order to rejoice over it. The intention is to make the bible verse understandable and memorable, much in the style of late medieval sermons.

of homily, often within works meant for private study.<sup>34</sup> Yet it is difficult to see a need for such a literary device in a Latin polemic whose audience was the clergy combatting heresy. A more likely explanation for the text's purpose and style is that the *exempla* and other homiletic elements were included in order to provide material for those composing sermons against heresy.<sup>35</sup> It is remarkable how the parables and exempla in *Cum dormirent homines* are situated so as to best clarify difficult theological questions on religious practices such as the invocation of saints, purgatory, and death-bed penance, as well as on administration of the sacraments.<sup>36</sup> Correspondingly, it is probable that Zwicker's own sermons were doctrinal and pastoral, rather than admonishing,<sup>37</sup> aimed at the conversion of heretics and the strengthening of wavering and vacillating individuals. It seems that Peters tried to exploit the inquisitor's ambition to reach and save her.

## The shared performance of conversion

Conversion and reform of the self were the very purpose of every medieval sermon.<sup>38</sup> Sermons aimed to encourage lay men and women towards greater effort and commitment to a Christian life within the Church. The goal was to lead heretics through preaching to abandon heretical opinions and return to

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Hans-Jochen Schiewer, "Spuren von Mündlichkeit in der mittelalterlichen Predigtüberlieferung: Ein Plädoyer für exemplarisches und beschreibend-interpretierendes Edieren", *Editio. Internationales Jahrbuch für Editionswissenschaft*, 6 (1992) pp. 64–79: 65; See also Kurt Ruh, "Deutsche Predigtbücher des Mittelalters", in *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Predigt: Vorträge und Abhandlungen*, ed. by Heimo Reinitzer, Hamburg, F. Wittig, 1981, pp. 11–30; Volker Mertens, "Predigt oder Traktat? Thesen zur Textdynamik mittelhochdeutscher geistlicher Prosa", *Jahrbuch für internationale Germanistik*, 24 (1992), pp. 41–43; Czerwon, *Predigt gegen Ketzer*, pp. 164–165. For the opposing view that sermon genre was essentially oral, cf. Beverly Mayne Kienzle, "Medieval Sermons and their Performance: Theory and Record', in *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages*, ed. by Carolyn Muessig, Leiden; Boston; Köln, Brill, 2002, p. 89 *et passim*, see also Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, p. 178.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> On antiheretical texts used to compose sermons, see L. J. Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century: The Textual Representations*, York, York Medieval Press, 2011, pp. 41–75; on the other hand, a polemical treatise could be based on already delivered anti-heretical sermons. An example is *Tractatus exhortatorius pro cruce signatis contra Hussitas et alios inimicos fidei* by the Augustinian Friar Oswald Reinlein, see Pavel Soukup, "Augustinian Prior Oswald Reinlein: A Biography of an Anti-Hussite Preacher", in *The Bohemian Reformation and Religious Practice 9*, ed. by Zdeněk V. David and David R. Holeton, Praha, Filosofia, 2014, pp. 104–106.

<sup>36</sup> Zwicker, "Cum dormirent homines", pp. 282A–B, F; 286G–287A, 288C.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> On demonising heresy sermon, see Franco Mormando, *The Preacher's Demons: Bernardino of Siena and the Social Underworld of Early Renaissance Italy*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1999, p. 86; Bernardino da Siena, *Prediche volgari: sul campo di Siena 1427*, ed. by Carlo Delcorno, Milano, Rusconi, 1989, pp. 793–794. Also the preachers against Lollards concentrated on sneering at the heretics through analogies of disease and debauchery and avoided difficult theological questions, see Forrest, *The Detection of Heresy in Late Medieval England*, pp. 147–148, 150–157.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Kienzle, "Medieval Sermons and Their Performance", p. 115; Humbertus de Romanis, "De eruditione predicatorum", p. 445.

the arms of Mother Church. Conversion of heretics was at the core of Zwicker's understanding of the inquisitor's mission. Zwicker never spoke of the destruction of heretics, unlike many other inquisitors and polemicists.<sup>39</sup> Even in his most heated proclamations, such as his the letter to the Austrian dukes in 1395 to seek help against heretics, a letter which described arson attempts by local Waldensians, the pronounced goal is still to convert and reconcile:

Therefore all Catholics should pay attention and feel pain in their heart, and pursue to work hard so that all wicked heretics and arsonists, who threaten with murders, would be captured, examined, given penance and called back to the unity of Catholic faith.<sup>40</sup>

Zwicker's logic in pursuing Peters' trial is not entirely clear. Rather than being satisfied with her claim of conversion and thus saving a soul, he drew the opposite conclusion from her reassurances. Because the sermon had taken place after the first trial and subsequent abjuration, the conversion and penance were deemed false. So Peters was delivered to the secular arm for execution. This cast a shadow on the whole concept of preaching against heresy: if so obvious a victory as conversion of an obstinate heretic through the sermon of an inquisitor was thrown away by sentencing the convert to death, why preach at all? Zwicker did not even try to find out whether Peters had truly converted as a result of his sermon, an achievement he surely would have welcomed in other situations. In his inquisitor's eyes Peters was beyond salvation so her words and assurances were not to be belived. Zwicker stated that he trusted more the confession of Peters' husband than her continuous lies.<sup>41</sup>

More revealing than the inquisitor's reaction is Peters' attempt to save herself. It must have been clear to her by the second trial that Zwicker had gathered further aggravating evidence. It seems that Peters tried to play by the rules of the inquisitors and give them what she expected they wanted: a penitent

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Cf. e.g. Bernard Gui citing an earlier, widespread manual *De auctoritate et forma inquisitionis* in Bernard Gui, *Practica inquisitionis heretice pravitatis*, ed. by Célestin Douais, Paris, A. Picard, 1886, pp. 217–218; on *De auctoritate* manual, see Riccardo Parmeggiani, *Explicatio super officio inquisitionis: origini e sviluppi della manualistica inquisitoriale tra Due e Trecento*, Temi e testi 112, Roma, Edizioni di storia e letteratura, 2012, pp. LVII–LIX; L. J. Sackville, "The Inquisitor's Manual at Work", *Viator*, 44 (2013), pp. 201–216: 213. Zwicker knew this manual, it was copied into the Bohemian compilation manual for inquisitors that once belonged to Zwicker, Linz, Oberösterreichische Landesbibliothek, MS 177, fols. 77v–83r; on the wish to destroy the heretics in a postil by Jacques Fournier, see Irene Bueno, "False Prophets and Ravening Wolves: Biblical Exegesis as a Tool against Heretics in Jacques Fournier's Postilla on Matthew", *Speculum*, 89 (2014), pp. 35–65: 61–64; of course, despite the violent rhetoric, most inquisitors saw the conversion of heretics as their mission, see e.g. Christine Caldwell Ames, "The Spiritual Foundations of Christian Heresy Inquisitions", in *A Companion to Heresy Inquisitions*, ed. by Donald Prudlo, Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition 85, Leiden, Brill, 2019, p. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Wilhelm Preger, *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Waldesier im Mittelalter*, München: Verlag der k. Akadamie der Wissenschaften, 1877, p. 250.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Haupt, "Waldenserthum und Inquisition", p. 410.

convert. <sup>42</sup> Her conversion was public and Peters recounted it "several times and in front of several different people after our [Zwicker's] sermon", in attempts to fashion for herself the persona of a pious convert. Whether Peters' conversion was genuine or not, the crucial feature is that she acted under certain expectations: that tales of conversion were sought by inquisitors and anti-heretical preachers in order to convince others. Unlucky Peters had, however, stepped beyond the point of no return, at least from one inquisitor's point of view.

#### Performance of the sentence

Together with other relapsed heretics, Peters became part of the anti-heretical performance. When a person was sentenced for heresy, an impressive religious drama unfolded, where gestures, liturgy and penance were imposed on penitent converts or on obstinate heretics, aimed at reconciliation.<sup>43</sup> These performances extended the rigours of monastic corporal discipline of penance to lay people.<sup>44</sup> A penitential psalm was sung and the heretic kneeled in prostration to receive the strokes of a rod from the absolving cleric. This was sometimes preceded by a penitential procession followed by a ritual of humiliation whereby the heretic was prostrated in front of the church doors and trodden under the feet of the parishioners entering the church.<sup>45</sup>

When punishing impenitent or relapsed heretics, the goal was purgation of the Christian community. The anathema or major excommunication, as described in the much-used pontifical of Guillaume Durand of Mende (c. 1230–1296), cut the offending member from the body of the Church. <sup>46</sup> Church bells were rung and candles extinguished "for the sign of eternal damnation", as Peter Zwicker

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> On the active role of the deponents and their attempts to manipulate the interrogation, see Caterina Bruschi, *The Wandering Heretics of Languedoc*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2009, pp. 45–46 *et passim*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> See Grado G. Merlo, "Il sermo generalis dell'inquisitore: una sacra rappresentazione anomala", in *Vite di eretici e storie di frati*, ed. by Maria Benedetti, Grado G. Merlo and Andrea Piazza, Milano, 1998, pp. 203–20; I have used the revised version of the article published in Merlo, *Inquisitori e inquisizione del Medioevo*, chap. 5; See also Scharff, "Die Inquisitoren und die Macht der Zeichen"; Given, *Inquisition and Medieval Society*, p, 73; Ames, "The Spiritual Foundations", pp. 35–36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Ames, *Righteous Persecution*, pp. 172–177.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Zwicker used this kind of punishment, see below. On similar practice in Languedoc, see Ames, *Righteous Persecution*, pp. 173–174.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Michel Andrieu, *Le pontifical romain au Moyen-Âge. Tome III. Le pontifical de Guillaume Durand*, Studi e testi 88, Città del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1940, pp. 613–614, VIII:14.

instructed the parish priests of the diocese of Passau to do in the case of contumacious heretics, who refused to appear in front of the inquisitor.<sup>47</sup>

The penance imposed upon converts was not merely an act of social control, marginalisation and exclusion. As Penance was both satisfaction, and an act of inversion of the heretics' errors. This was so obvious to contemporaries that it was left unsaid, but a fifteenth-century revision of Zwicker's formulary from the diocese of Passau makes this understanding explicit. According to a formula for assignment of penitential crosses, the punishment could be modified "by adding, if it is deemed profitable, a pilgrimage to Saint Peter's in Rome, to be completed within a year, and thereby [bringing about the converts'] instruction in the things that are the opposite of the those matters in which they erred. The satisfaction was thus made by completing a long pilgrimage to the very place whose sanctity Waldensians rejected: the pope's Rome from which indulgences were dispensed, where churches were decorated and where sumptuous liturgy unfolded. It was both personal satisfaction and communal edification.

The inquisitorial system of punishment and penance was in transition between earlier public solemn penance, intended to purify the community, and more individual and internal conversion. The penance for heresy and its inherent symbolism not only marked the distinction between good and evil, setting the heretic outside the community, but from the thirteenth century onwards also represented different grades of transgression: more lenient penances were reserved for the repentant first-timers, hardened heretics were convicted to life-time penitence, and relapsed faced the death by burning at the stake. Heresy no longer meant only diabolic teaching of the heresiarchs, but through the introduction of category of "believers" (*credentes*) of the heretics' doctrine, also minor lapses from faith became heresy: laymen and women who were no longer be sure of their orthodoxy. The performance of penance led them to reflect upon their own possible transgressions instead of the radical otherness of the heretic. The latter function was certainly more dominant in Zwicker's system of penance. The goal was reintegration of an erring soul to the body of the faithful. Penance operated together with sermons

Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001, pp. 62–63, 72–73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> St Florian, XI 234, fol. 89rb-va: "quatenus predictos sic ut premittitur excommunicatos et eorum quemlibet utriusque sexus singulis diebus dominicis et festiuis in ambonibus ecclesiarum vestrarum quando maior populus ad diuina congregatus fuerit publice pulsatis campanis accensis candelis et demum extinctis et in terra proiectis in signum eterne malediccionis denunccietis." See also Andrieu, *Le pontifical de Guillaume Durand*, p. 614.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> For the opposing view, see esp. Given, *Inquisition and Medieval Society*, pp. 66, 84–90.
 <sup>49</sup> Augsburg, Universitätsbibliothek, MS II. 1. 2° 129, fol. 151r: "addendo prout videtur expedire ad sanctum petrum peregrinacionem romam infra annum faciendam, et sic precipere contraria horum in quibus errauerunt."
 <sup>50</sup> John H. Arnold, *Inquisition and Power: Catharism and the Confessing Subject in Medieval Languedoc*,

and citations in transforming the localities where the true faith and authority of the Church had been undermined into spaces of contrition and penance, visible to and involving the local parishioners. To understand this, we have to look beyond the *sermo generalis*, to the performance of penance as executed in the parish churches, with its local lay audience.

In the formularies based on Zwicker's sentences in Austria and Hungary some of the heaviest sentences were recorded. The public penance took place in the local parish churches. In early 1398 Jans von Pewg from the parish of Garsten was sentenced to wear a hat with an image of a perjuring peasant, whose tongue is drawn out by a devil, sitting on ladders, while sitting in front of the congregation on seven Sundays or feast days in the church of St. Giles of Steyr near Linz. 51 He was sentenced not only for heresy, but also for perjury, hence the mocking hat. From a individual's point of view the sentence was no doubt humiliating and degrading, but the more substantial impact must have been at the communal level: Steyr was the main urban centre of the Upper-Austrian Waldensian area and St. Giles its major church. There both heresy and contrition and satisfaction were made visible for several weeks. Some penances even required the congregation's participation, such as the one imposed by Zwicker on Els Fewr, an old Waldensian widow from Garsten. She had once before relapsed into heresy and as a consequence was sentenced to wear crosses for the rest of her life. In addition, and "for the greater grace to follow from your conversion", Zwicker ordered her to do public penance at her parish Church in Garsten on seven Sundays. She was to walk around the church in front of a priest who beat her with branches (virgis). When she entered the church she was to lay in front of the doors prostrated, trodden over by the entering parishioners until told by the parish priest to stand up. On the same occasion similar public penances were imposed on two other Waldensians.<sup>52</sup> In addition to participating in the public penance of the convert, the local priests were obliged to explain the reasons for such punishments to their congregation in their sermons. The parish clergy had also the responsibility to supervise that the converts carried in their clothes the penitential crosses assigned to them, and finally they had to give a written testimony to the inquisitor about the completion of the penances. Should the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> The sentence is edited in J. J. I. von Döllinger, *Beiträge zur Sektengeschichte des Mittelalters. Zweiter theil. Dokumente vornehmlich zur Geschichte der Valdesier und Katharer*, München, C.H. Beck'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1890, pp. 346–348. Döllinger's editions must be used with precaution, I have used the manuscripts Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek, M. ch. f. 51, fol. 30r–v; and Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 5338, fols. 240v–241r. On Jans von Pewg's sentence and the formulary, see Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 152–154, 158, 163, 191.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Ed. in Haupt, "Waldenserthum und Inquisition", pp. 404–405. Els Fewr later relapsed again and was finally sentenced to be burned at the stake, see ibid. pp. 407–408 and Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 150–153, 191.

priest fail, he himself faced the threat of inquisitor's actions. Such instructions have been preserved in Zwicker's formula for a mandate letter from a inquisitor to a parish priest. The penance described here is very much like the one ordered for Els, although the formula itself does not refer to a specific person. It is easy to imagine, that also Els and the two other convicted Waldensians carried similar letters when they returned to their parishes to complete the assigned penance. The formula and the sentences reveal that the public performance of a converted heretic's penance was not a one-time occasion completed in a *sermo generalis*: even the relatively minor punishments lasted for several weeks and involved the whole congregation. Pastoral education of heresy's dangers accompanied the visible acts of contrition, and parishioners themselves participated in the ritual as they trod the prostrated convert at the church door.

#### Conclusion: making examples clear

It seems that in Peters' case the disciplinary – and terrifying - severe punishments for the greater good of the Christian community ultimately prevailed over an individual's salvation.<sup>54</sup> The authenticity of her conversion does not appear to be under scrutiny, but the sentence by Zwicker stresses the various ways in which she had acted against the inquisition of heresy, misled the inquisitor, and despised her penance. Peters had been given a chance of salvific contrition, confession, absolution and penance. When she cast it away, she turned into an example.

The exemplary execution of a relapsed and contumacious heretic was, however, only the rare outcome on the broad spectrum of ways the inquisitors sought to instil their views about true faith and proper conduct, the correct *modus vivendi*, in the laity and lower clergy. The full impact of the ultimate punishment, the burning at the stake, as well as public penances, were only achieved with grassroots explication and education in local parishes. It was not enough for the laity to know that a relapsed or contumacious heretic was burned; the local congregation had to understand the errors and transgressions of faith that had led to the victims to the pyre – or more often – standing in front of the congregation in penitential crosses. They had to become aware of the potential of heresy in and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> St Florian, XI 234, fol. 90ra–rb. The formula has been transcribed and translated in Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany*, pp. 192–193, n. 91–92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Karen Sullivan has analysed this two-fold goal of inquisitor's punishments as a distinction between two aspects of love, *caritas* emphasising the compassion and will to save and convert, *zelus* representing the love that destroys the enemies of faith so that the rest do not perish, see Karen Sullivan, *The Inner Lives of Medieval Inquisitors*, Chicago; London, University of Chicago Press, 2011, esp. pp. 5–12.

amongst themselves. Inquisitors used the medieval Church's full arsenal of communication to raise this awareness: from sermons explicating faith to repeated citations read aloud in parish churches, from visual symbols like crosses and mocking hats to penitential psalms sung at absolution of a converted heretic. Especially the citations and public penance reached the level of parish churches and affected services for periods ranging from few weeks to several years, thus transforming the lands of heretics into a landscape of penance and contrition.

In a recent article, Christine Caldwell Ames stated that inquisitions of heresy "lost an explicit penitential sense by the 15th century", and inquisitors seemed to have stopped to evoke penitential language that was so prominent in the earlier years of heresy trials. <sup>55</sup> While this might be true for some parts of Europe, it certainly was not the case in late fourteenth and early fifteenth-century German-speaking Europe. The examples about Peter Zwicker's interaction with suspects of heresy and the surrounding community of clergy and laypeople have demonstrated that the main goal of his inquisitions was to lead heretics to conversion and penance and to involve whole communities in their penitential acts. Zwicker and his co-inquisitor Martin of Prague were extremely influential inquisitors. Their arm reached far and wide and their descriptions of heresy, question lists and formulas for inquisition even further. So far that it is justifiable to speak about pastoralization of heresy at the turn of the fifteenth century. In addition to the increased attention to penitential function of inquisitions on heresy, the pastoralization of heresy included the revival of doctrinal anti-heretical polemic in Zwicker's treatises, and the spillover of the anti-heretical message from inquisitors' texts to pastoral theological genres and to vernacular. <sup>56</sup>

This book is about laity and reform. Zwicker's attitude to Waldensian followers is the dark side of this phenomenon. With the laity's emancipation in matters of faith came also greater accountability for their thoughts. In many ways, Zwicker had high regard of his opponents. For citations, he crafted subtle messages encouraging conversion from heresy, spiced with threats of damnation he certainly thought his audience would understand. Although he was capable of invoking such language in his polemical works, as inquisitor he did not deem laypeople as simple-minded flock led astray by guile heresiarchs. He saw most suspects as persons able to understand the separating line between heresy and the Church's teaching. Zwicker's formularies demonstrate his great dedication in orchestrating converts' reintegration into the Christian community while assuring that the community was properly educated in the process. While his penitential emphasis might have meant that less people ended up to the pyre, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Ames, "The Spiritual Foundations", p. 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> For the definition of pastoralization of heresy, see Välimäki, *Heresy in Late Medieval Germany,* pp. 5–9.

other side of the coin was that such inquisitions were mentally very taxing to the towns and villages involved.