

# Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies



ISSN: (Print) (Online) Journal homepage: https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/ribs20

# Aristocratic neo-Gothicism in fourteenth-century Iberia: the case of Count Pedro of Barcelos

Tiago João Queimada e Silva

**To cite this article:** Tiago João Queimada e Silva (2021): Aristocratic neo-Gothicism in fourteenth-century Iberia: the case of Count Pedro of Barcelos, Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies, DOI: 10.1080/17546559.2021.1957494

To link to this article: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/17546559.2021.1957494">https://doi.org/10.1080/17546559.2021.1957494</a>

9	© 2021 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group
	Published online: 10 Aug 2021.
	Submit your article to this journal 🗹
ılıl	Article views: 122
a a	View related articles 🗗
CrossMark	View Crossmark data ☑







# Aristocratic neo-Gothicism in fourteenth-century Iberia: the case of Count Pedro of Barcelos

Tiago João Queimada e Silva 🗅

Department of European and World History, University of Turku, Finland

#### **ABSTRACT**

One of the main arguments used to legitimise Christian military expansion in medieval Iberia was the location of the origin of the Christian Iberian kingdoms in the ancient Visigothic Kingdom of Toledo (507-711), which established a notion of political continuity between these entities. The legitimacy of the Visigothic Kingdom was reflected in the polities that emerged out of the process of Christian expansion, enabling military activity against Muslims to be portrayed as the restoration of Gothic Spain. In the present study, I refer to this view of the past, especially in thirteenth-century Castilian royal historiography, as the neo-Gothic myth. The neo-Gothic myth was an asset held by royalty in the cultural enactment of these social struggles. In this article, I inquire into the reaction of the seignorial aristocracy to the royalty's neo-Gothic claims, using the historiographical work by Count Pedro of Barcelos (c. 1285-1354). More specifically, I analyse how Count Pedro adapted the neo-Gothic myth to an aristocratic perspective.

#### ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 12 February 2021 Accepted 15 July 2021

#### **KEYWORDS**

Neo-Gothicism; Count Pedro of Barcelos; aristocracy; historiography; genealogy; social struggles; Visigoths

#### Introduction<sup>1</sup>

During the Middle Ages, there was an interpretation of history which saw the expansion of the northern Iberian Christian kingdoms into the southern Iberian Muslim lands after the Umayyad invasion of 711 as the restoration of the fallen Visigothic Kingdom of Toledo (507-711). This so-called neo-Gothic myth was first advanced in ninth-century Asturian chronicles to legitimate the Kingdom of Asturias, of relatively recent foundation and precursor to the Kingdom of León, which claimed continuity with the Visigothic monarchy.<sup>2</sup> The neo-Gothic myth would remain a constant topic in Iberian

CONTACT Tiago João Queimada e Silva 🔯 tiasil@utu.fi

I would like to extend my deepest gratitude for their most valuable comments to Filipe Alves Moreira, Kurt Villads Jensen, and the anonymous reviewers of this article's manuscript, as well as to Francisco Bautista for providing a copy of one of his works. The responsibility for all of the present article's possible shortcomings is, naturally, mine. I would also like to thank the Turku University Foundation and the Finnish Cultural Foundation without whose funding this research would not have been possible.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Bonnaz, Chroniques Asturiennes; Maravall, Concepto de España, 300–12; Díaz, "Godos como epopeya," and "Mito godo;" Rucquoi, "Wisigoths fondement;" Wolf, "Asturian Chronicler;" Linehan, History and the Historians, 95-127; Martin, "Un Récit," 35-42; Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 54-56; Tolan, Saracens, 98-100; Isla, "Monarchy and Neogothicism."

<sup>© 2021</sup> The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group

historiography for centuries, first in León and later in Castile.<sup>3</sup> The royalty and clergy of these kingdoms, which were definitively unified in 1230, continued to uphold this ideal during the thirteenth century as it served to legitimise the powers-that-be and justify military expansion over Muslim territories.<sup>4</sup>

This view was conveyed in thirteenth-century royal chronicles in the Castilian Kingdom. Castile was the hegemonic Christian polity in medieval Iberia and claimed the legacy of the ancient Visigothic Kingdom. The neo-Gothic claim was an historical-ideological expression of Castilian pan-Iberian ambitions. Wide sectors of the aristocracies of the kingdoms of Castile-León and Portugal, however, were in opposition to the programmes being undertaken by their respective royalties during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, and fiercely resisted royalist pretensions of political centralisation.<sup>5</sup> In this article, I analyse how the royal Castilian neo-Gothic myth was received in an aristocratic milieu of a peripheral kingdom like Portugal, namely that of the court of Count Pedro of Barcelos.<sup>6</sup>

If we take the neo-Gothic claim as an ideological expression of the political programme of the Castilian royalty, how was that ideal received by the peripheral and relatively weaker (in comparison with their Castilian counterparts) Portuguese aristocracy?<sup>7</sup> To answer this question, I first revisit the uses of the neo-Gothic myth by the Castilian crown and then analyse in this light the historiographical and genealogical production of Count Pedro of Barcelos, one of the most powerful Portuguese aristocrats during the first half of the fourteenth century and whose texts I interpret as testimonies of a specifically aristocratic historical culture in the western Iberian Peninsula.<sup>8</sup>

I argue that Count Pedro appropriated the neo-Gothic myth and adapted it to his own aristocratic perspective. He did so by refuting the Castilian-Leonese royalty's political continuity with the Visigothic Kingdom and establishing a genealogical continuity between the ancient Goths and the Iberian warrior aristocracy. My study complements Maria do Rosário Ferreira's observations on Count Pedro's "goticismo aristocrático."9 While Ferreira focused on Count Pedro's use of the Navarran genealogical work Liber Regum, whose oldest known version is dated 1194-1196, I will analyse the Count's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Maravall, Concepto de España, 312–26; Díaz, "Godos como epopeya," and "Mito godo." The Crónica Najerense (c. 1190) was the first Castilian chronicle where the neo-Gothic myth was adapted to serve the interests of Castilian royalty rather than the Leonese, see Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 63-64.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 69–77; Tolan, Saracens, 180–93.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>On the struggles between sectors of the upper aristocracy against royalty in Portugal over monarchical centralisation during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, see Mattoso, História de Portugal, 123-40, 221-40, and "Triunfo da monarquia;" Pizarro, "Coroa e a aristocracia," 141–71. For a synthesis of the contemporary Castilian reality, see González Mínguez, Poder Real.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>I limit my analysis to Portugal because in this kingdom we find specifically aristocratic historiographical production since the late thirteenth century, while in Castile, historiographical writing was under the firm hand of the royal court. See note 70 below.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>For a general characterisation of the aristocratic group in medieval Portugal and its relations with the monarchy, see Pizarro, "Coroa e a aristocracia."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>Although I interpret Count Pedro's texts as representative of an aristocratic notion of history, one must be aware that this social group was in no way homogenous and that Count Pedro's social position was somewhat ambivalent, as we shall see, being both a royal bastard and a manorial lord. Although one may reasonably assume that Count Pedro's views could represent those of a significant portion of the Portuguese aristocracy, it would be abusive to take them as representative of the aristocratic class as a whole. Below I address the different ideological setting of Portuguese genealogical production, prior to Count Pedro, concerning the neo-Gothic topic—or rather its absence—in the older Portuguese Livros de Linhagens.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Ferreira, "Liber regum," §§27–31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>Catalán and Jerez, "Rodericus" romanzado, 79–80, n.172–173, and 100. On the Liber Regum and its different versions, see Bautista, "Original, versiones."



historiographical work in his own genealogical compilation, the Livro de Linhagens, in relation with Alfonso X's historiography and royalist ideology. I begin this article with an introduction to my sources and methodology, followed by an inquiry into the use of the neo-Gothic myth in Castilian royal historiography, and finally I delve into the appropriation of the topic by Count Pedro of Barcelos.

## Aim, sources and methodology

The aim of this article is to contribute to our knowledge on how the Iberian aristocracy which faced a royalist offensive of political centralisation during the late thirteenth and fourteenth centuries — reacted to the neo-Gothic claims of the Castilian royalty. I will focus on the case of the Portuguese aristocracy in the mid-fourteenth century, using primarily two sources compiled by Count Pedro of Barcelos.

First, I use the chronicle known as Crónica de 1344, which was being compiled in 1344 and was finished in the following years but not before 1347. This chronicle is indebted to the Castilian-Leonese King Alfonso X's (r. 1252-1284) previous historiographical work, namely his Estoria de España. The main sources used by Count Pedro for Leonese and Castilian history were two texts derived from Alfonso X's chronicle: the Versión Amplificada de la Estoria de España, sponsored by Alfonso's son and successor Sancho IV (r. 1284-1295) in 1289, 12 and the Crónica de Castilla, written around 1300-1301 in a milieu close to Queen María de Molina, 13 Sancho IV's consort and regent during the minorities of her son Ferdinand IV (r. 1295-1312) and grandson Alfonso XI (r. 1312–1350).<sup>14</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344." See Cintra, *Crónica Geral*, I:XXXIX, for the date of composition of the chronicle. The *Crónica de* 1344 exists in two redactions, the original one sponsored by Count Pedro in 1344–1347 and a second redaction from around 1400. The original redaction of the Crónica was preserved only through the Castilian translation edited by Vindel, but lacks its ending folia, cutting the narrative short during the reign of Alfonso VII of Castile-León. During the preparation of my article, Bautista and Moreira, "Tradição textual," discovered two manuscripts conveying the final section of the first redaction in its original Galician-Portuguese language. These texts, however, were unavailable to me prior to the submission of this article. The second redaction was edited by Cintra, Crónica Geral, while Catalán and de Andrés, Crónica General, published a partial edition of the Castilian translation of the first redaction. I used the Castilian translation of the Crónica de 1344 as represented by the manuscript 2656 of the Biblioteca General Histórica of the University of Salamanca, which was edited by Vindel. For in-depth studies on this chronicle, see Cintra, Crónica Geral, vol. I; Catalán and de Andrés, Crónica General, XV-XXX; Catalán, De Alfonso X, 289-312.

<sup>12</sup> Catalán, De Alfonso X, 17–203, and Silva textual, 285–95; Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §§65–79, "Denotación de 'España'," 83-84, and "Versión (o Crónica);" Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," and Estoria de España.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup>Rochwert-Zuili, *Crónica de Castilla*. For the proposed date of composition, see Rochwert-Zuili's introduction, §30. <sup>14</sup>lt was Cintra, *Crónica Geral*, vol. I, who first identified the *Crónica de 1344* as being authored by Count Pedro of Barcelos. Vindel recently put Count Pedro's authorship in question in the introduction to her edition of the chronicle and suggested that Alfonso XI could be a possible author of the Crónica. While having the virtue of raising important questions, in my opinion Vindel's arguments are insufficient to disprove Cintra's thesis. Vindel highlights the pro-Castilian character of the Crónica de 1344, but one must note that Count Pedro's Livro de Linhagens also conveys a similar pro-Castilian bias. Count Pedro extols Castile, home to a very powerful nobility, a kingdom described in the Livro de Linhagens as, quoting Krus, Concepção nobiliárquica, 185–98, esp. 191, "um paraíso nobiliárquico." Count Pedro exalts in his Livro the powerful family of Lara as role model for the much more modest Portuguese aristocracy. Count Pedro was close to one of the members of the Laras, his contemporary Juan Núñez II of Lara, who died in 1315; see Cintra, Crónica Geral, I:CXLVIII-CXLIX; Oliveira, "Genealogista e as suas linhagens," §5. Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," 183, argues that the historical and politico-social data from the narratives concerning El Cid point towards a Castilian provenance. Still, the same exaltation of El Cid as a model of aristocratic virtue is equally conveyed in Count Pedro's Livro de Linhagens, see Krus, Concepção nobiliárguica, 188–90. The latter argument also applies to the inclusion of the legend of Los Siete Infantes de Lara, which Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," 205, also asserts to be evidence of the Castilian origin of the Crónica de 1344, although the legend is equally treated in Count Pedro's Livro de Linhagens. Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," 120-23, proposes that the mention of King Alfonso in the Crónica's prologue hints at Alfonso XI's authorship. However, first, one must note that the prologue was preserved only in the second redaction from around 1400, as the manuscript

Second, I use Count Pedro's Livro de Linhagens, a genealogical work compiled in the 1340s that purports to encompass the aristocratic families of the whole Iberian Peninsula, although it focuses particularly on the Galician-Portuguese aristocracy and the upper aristocracy of Castile.<sup>15</sup> The *Livro's* main purpose, as explicitly stated in the prologue, is to foment solidarity among aristocratic groups throughout the whole Peninsula. 16

Count Pedro of Barcelos, an illegitimate son of King Dinis of Portugal (r. 1279–1325) and the noble lady Gracia Anes Froiaz, was an active participant in the struggles between the Portuguese seignorial aristocracy and the king. These struggles led to open war in 1319–1324, which opposed Dinis to a wide section of the aristocracy led by the king's legitimate son and heir, Infante Afonso, who would take the throne in 1325 as Afonso IV of Portugal.<sup>17</sup> In the years that led up to the war, Count Pedro suffered the wrath of his father, who exiled him to Castile in 1317. After his return to Portugal in 1322, the count dedicated himself to the task of reconciling his half-brother Infante Afonso with their father Dinis. 18 Count Pedro's sensitivity towards the interests of the seignorial aristocracy is visible in his historiographical work. 19

I interpret the development of different forms of historiographical writing in late medieval Iberia as being conditioned by the confrontation between different social groups and their respective ways of understanding power and history. I focus particularly on the dissension between the royalist and aristocratic perspectives.<sup>20</sup> The conflict surrounding royalist attempts at limiting feudal prerogatives and imposing monarchical centralisation was arguably the main social struggle taking place in Iberian society during the late thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, so it was bound to affect historiographical writing.

of the first redaction (Ms. 2656, Biblioteca General Histórica, Universidad de Salamanca) lacks its starting and ending folia. Second, the prologue of the second redaction of the Crónica de 1344 is a copy of Alfonso X's prologue of the Estoria de España. I see no hint that the Alfonso in the proloque of the second redaction of the Crónica de 1344 is any other than Alfonso X, as originally acknowledged in the Estoria de España. Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," 123, herself admits that the fact that Alfonso X's prologue was transmitted in many different chronicles of the period meant that both Count Pedro and Alfonso XI could have used it in their own works. It is nonetheless worth noting that Vindel, in this instance, accepts the prologue of the second redaction as a testimony of the original but does not accept as such the narratives in the second redaction of the Crónica of events and persons related to Portuguese history and Count Pedro's lifetime, especially concerning the count's own actions. Cintra's main historical-ideological argument for Count Pedro's authorship was based on these narratives. Considering that the second redaction primarily reworked the initial sections of the Crónica, its ending sections, including the ones dealing with Portuguese history, are likely to be better testimonies of the original text; see note 114 below. In texts known to be composed under Alfonso XI's aegis after 1344, it is noted that Alfonso XI ordered their composition to fill the gap in the historiography of the time after the reign of Ferdinand III, i.e., after the end of the Estoria de España. Nowhere does it mention an ambitious historiographical project such as the Crónica de 1344, which not only expands the chronological scope of the Estoria de España but also reformulates it and adds numerous new sources and narrative material to the framework provided by Alfonso X; see Cintra, Crónica Geral, I:XLII-XLIV. This omission makes it highly unlikely that the Crónica de 1344 was composed at the behest of Alfonso XI. Cintra's thesis was recently confirmed by Bautista and Moreira, "Tradição textual," 204, in which it is shown that the newly discovered manuscripts not only encompass the already-known material related to Count Pedro's life, but even add more information about his actions.

<sup>15</sup>Mattoso, *Portugaliae Monumenta*. The Count's *Livro de Linhagens* was reformulated in 1360–1365 and again in 1380– 1383 in literary centres close to the Portuguese family of Pereira and the Knights Hospitaller. See Mattoso's introduction to his edition of the Livro de Linhagens for these matters.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup>Ferreira, "'Amor e amizade'."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>Pizarro, Dinis, 243–58; Sousa, Afonso IV, 39–75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>For a biographical account of Count Pedro of Barcelos, see Oliveira, "Genealogista e as suas linhagens."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>Besides his historiographical and genealogical work, Count Pedro's literary production also includes a compilation of troubadour songs, the Livro das Cantigas. See Miranda and Ferreira, "Projeto de escrita;" Cintra, Crónica Geral, I: CLXX-CLII.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Funes, "Dos versiones."

By analysing how Count Pedro worked the discursive material received from his sources and adapted it to his own sociological background and political interests, I inquire into how Count Pedro's historiographical production reflected the social struggles of his time. Beyond the mere reflection of the social tensions of the period, Count Pedro was aware of the functional and performative character of the texts he was writing and consciously attempted to spread his views of the past among both his aristocratic peers and the royalty.<sup>21</sup>

I am highly attentive to the idiosyncrasies of the sources, both in terms of how much original matter they contain as well as the idiosyncratic ways in which they appropriate their source matter. One of the specificities of Count Pedro's texts, upon which I focus in this article, is the way he adapted the neo-Gothic myth to an aristocratic perspective. I hope it will become clear from this analysis that, on the one hand, the neo-Gothic myth was an important asset in the cultural enactment of social struggles taking place during the mid-fourteenth century in Portugal and in the Iberian Peninsula; and, on the other, that the aristocracy also knew how to use that asset to their advantage.

# The neo-Gothic myth in Asturian-Leonese and Castilian historiography

The neo-Gothic myth was first advanced in late ninth-century chronicles written to legitimate the ruling Asturian King Alfonso III (r. 866-910). To achieve this aim, the chroniclers connected the small yet expanding monarchy led by Alfonso III to the once powerful Visigothic monarchy to which the 711 Muslim invasion had put an end.<sup>22</sup> In the so-called Ad Sebastianum version of Alfonso III's chronicle, for example, the Muslim invasion was caused by the sins of the last Visigothic monarchs. According to this source, most of the surviving Goths with royal blood found refuge in Asturias, where they elected Pelayo (r. 718-737) as their leader. The small group of mountain warriors would defeat a gigantic Muslim army in the famous Battle of Covadonga, where Pelayo's small army was aided by divine providence.<sup>23</sup> The main preoccupation of the Covadonga narrative is, quoting Peter Linehan, "to establish the Asturian kings as the legitimate descendants of their Visigothic predecessors and to launder the Visigothic past of everything about it that was unwholesome."24

Pelayo's royal blood is emphasised in the Ad Sebastianum. 25 In the so-called Rotensis version of Alfonso III's chronicle, however, Pelayo is a "spatarius," a member of the royal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>In the prologue of his book, the Count explains the rationale behind the composition of the *Livro de Linhagens*. The main objective of fomenting solidarity among the Iberian aristocracy is emphasised in the prologue from different perspectives. Besides that, the Livro is intended to elucidate for its aristocratic audience their own kinship and the virtues of their ancestors; to unite the nobility in the war against the Muslims; to avoid matrimonial consanguinity; to know one's properties and rights; and, in a passage (Mattoso, Portugaliae Monumenta, 57) of particular relevance to my argument, so that the kings would grant rewards ("mercees") to their contemporary aristocrats, whose ancestors had conquered Spain. These texts were also directed to the kings, who owed their kingdoms and their kingly status to the aristocracy. <sup>22</sup>Wolf, "Asturian Chronicler."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup>Bonnaz, Chroniques Asturiennes, Chronique d' Alphonse III (Versión Érudite) §6,1., 38b–§6,4., 44b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup>Linehan, History and the Historians, 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>Bonnaz, Chroniques, Chronique d' Alphonse III (Versión Érudite) §6,1., 38b. The Asturian royalty is also connected to the Visigothic royalty in this chronicle through Alfonso I who was a descendant of the Visigothic Kings Reccared I and Leovigild, see Bonnaz, Chroniques Asturiennes, Chronique d' Alphonse III (Versión Érudite) §8.1, 45a. In Castilian thirteenthcentury chronicles, Alfonso I is son of Duque Pedro of Cantabria, who in turn descends from King Reccared I, see Rodericus, Historia de Rebus, Book IV, Ch. V, 121, II. 12-13; Menéndez Pidal, Primera Crónica, Ch. 580, 330, col. b, II. It appears that chroniclers from Ad Sebastianum to Alfonso X attempted to link genealogically the Castilian-Leonese royalty to their Visigothic predecessors through Reccared I, the king who converted the Goths from Arianism to Catholicism,

guard of the last Visigothic kings.<sup>26</sup> Although the explicit genealogical connection to the Visigothic royalty had consequences in terms of political legitimation, 27 what matters here is that in both versions of Alfonso III's chronicle Pelayo originated from the heart of the Visigothic royal court and thus reflected its historical legitimacy upon the monarchy he founded.

The topic circulated in subsequent historiographical production from Leonese and Castilian centres, being later appropriated into Latin chronicles produced in scriptoria close to the royalty in the thirteenth century. I am referring to the Chronicon Mundi, written in 1238 by Bishop Lucas of Tuy at the request of Queen Berengaria of Castile; <sup>28</sup> and the Historia de Rebus Hispanie, written c. 1241–1242 by Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, Archbishop of Toledo and chancellor of King Ferdinand III of Castile-León (r. 1217–1252).<sup>29</sup>

Lucas's and Rodrigo's works were among the main sources of the Estoria de España, authored by Ferdinand III's successor, Alfonso X. Alfonso's historiographical work — in fact, its several versions — would be the cornerstone of most vernacular historiography in Iberia during the late Middle Ages, its influence reaching into the Early Modern period.<sup>30</sup> Alfonso X compiled the first version of his Estoria de España, the so-called Versión Primitiva, around 1270 using Archbishop Rodrigo's chronicle as the main source, systematically comparing it with the Chronicon Mundi and enriching the narrative with a variety of other secondary sources. Alfonso X took from his sources the neo-Gothic discourse concerning the Castilian-Leonese monarchies.<sup>31</sup>

Pelayo is presented in the Estoria de España as a "spatarius" in the royal Visigothic court, and his father is identified as Duke Fávila of Cantabria.<sup>32</sup> At the time of the Muslim invasion — which in the Estoria is also the incarnation of divine ire for Gothic sins—,<sup>33</sup> Pelayo, who was then in Cantabria, went to Asturias "con aquellos cristianos que fincaron,"<sup>34</sup> who elected him as king.<sup>35</sup> The *Estoria* then proceeds with the narrative of Pelavo's victory in the Battle of Covadonga.<sup>36</sup>

instead of Wittiza and Rodrigo, the last Visigothic monarchs, whose depravity and treachery caused the divine punishment of the Muslim invasion.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup>Bonnaz, Chroniques Asturiennes, Chronique d' Alphonse III, §6,1., 38a; Linehan, History and the Historians, 102, 104; Martin, "Un Récit," 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup>The *Rotensis* may have avoided linking Pelayo genealogically to the last Visigothic monarchs so that his lineage would remain untainted by the sins of Wittiza and Rodrigo. Thus, the primordial ancestor of Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian royalty is located at the centre of the Visigothic royal court, yet without connecting them by blood to the last Visigothic monarchs. This perspective would then be transferred to the chronicles of Lucas de Tuy, Rodrigo de Toledo, and Alfonso X, see Férnandez-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'." Note that the genealogical relationship of Alfonso I to Reccared I or Leovigild is absent from the Rotensis, see Bonnaz, Chroniques Asturiennes, Chronique d' Alphonse III, § 8,1., 45a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>Lucas, *Chronicon Mundi*; Jerez, "Tudense."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Rodericus, *Historia de Rebus*; Férnandez-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 73–77. 31 March 1243 is the date of composition given at the end of De Rebus Hispanie, but Fernández Valverde, "Introducción," 49-50, pointed out the incongruity of this date in relation to other chronological markers, arguing that the chronicle was most likely written in 1241 or 1242.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 83–84. For the Estoria de España, its sources, versions, manuscript tradition, and influence upon subsequent historiographical writing, see Catalán, De Alfonso X, and Silva textual; Fernández-Ordóñez, Las Estorias, "Historiografía alfonsí," "Variación en el modelo," and "Estoria de España;" Martin, Historia alfonsí; Bautista Crespo, "Estoria de España;" Campa Gutiérrez, "Versiones alfonsíes;" Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," and Estoria de España; Hijano Villegas, "Retorno a la selva."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 549, 304, col. a, Il. 44–45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, *Las Estorias*, 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 560, 314, col. b, ll. 16–19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 566, 321, col. a, ll. 24–28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 567–568, 322–24.

Alfonso X took the previous narrative from the preceding Latin historiography, thus integrating the neo-Gothic myth in his royalist political and ideological project.<sup>37</sup> Alfonso X's ideology of government naturalised and territorialised royal power, uniting every native from a given territory under the rule of a king.<sup>38</sup> The Learned King's time was marked by the growing influence of the principles of Roman and Canon Law, as well as the works of Aristotle.<sup>39</sup> The diffusion of Roman Law in the thirteenth century, a process taking place on a European scale, greatly contributed to the consolidation of royal rule in Castile-León. 40 These influences meant, at the political level, a tendency towards the centralisation of political power under a single centre where the monarch governs in plenitudo potestatis. 41 According to the principle of "señorio natural," all inhabitants of a given territory are connected directly to their "señor natural," a relationship that precedes all existing feudal bonds. 42 Alfonso X's extensive historiographical and legislative production largely functioned as a tool for the legitimation of his envisioned political order. 43 Alfonso X translated the Castilian neo-Gothic myth from the Latin into the vernacular, thus expanding its accessibility.44

The history of the Peninsula is seen in the *Estoria de España* as a succession of peoples ruling over the territory. It is first and foremost the history of the leaders and princes of those peoples, 45 in accordance with the organising principle of Alfonso's chronicle, the exertion of lordship over the land. 46 According to the Estoria's narrative, the Goths reattained definitive lordship over the Peninsula after the Muslim interregnum.

In the Estoria's introduction to the history of the Visigoths, the chronicler notes that they now cease dealing with the previous matter and begin to tell us about "los godos que fueron ende sennores depues aca todavía."47 After this critical juncture in Alfonso's conception of Iberian history, the Estoria de España continues with the history of the Goths back to their mythical origins in the North through their migrations in the East, their arrival in Spain, the establishment of their monarchy in Toledo, the loss of Spain to the Muslims, the rebirth of the Gothic monarchy in Asturias, and the centuries-long process of expansion towards the south of the Peninsula, which culminated with the conquest of Seville in 1248 by Ferdinand III. This event is seen in the Alfonsine textual tradition as the culmination of the restoration of Christian and Gothic Spain. This overarching narrative provided the ruling Castilian dynasty with political continuity back to the ancient Gothic monarchy, effectively integrating the former in a world history guided by divine providence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, Las Estorias, 20, 24–26, and "Denotación de 'España'," 79; Deyermond, "Death and Rebirth."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup>For Alfonso X's concept of royal power, see González Mínguez, *Poder Real*, 37–45; García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, "Alfonso X y los poderes," 11-22; O'Callaghan, Learned King, 17-30; Martin, "Le concept."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup>González Mínguez, *Poder Real*, 41.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>González Mínguez, *Poder Real*, 34, 36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>González Mínguez, *Poder Real*, 35–36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup>García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, "Alfonso X y los poderes," 13; González Mínguez, *Poder Real*, 43; O'Callaghan, Learned King, 17–30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup>Funes, "Dos versiones," 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup>Díaz, "Godos como epopeya," 35–36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 78–79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, *Las Estorias*, 19–45, and "Denotación de 'España'," 77–83; Martin, "Modelo historiografíco."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 385, 215, col. b, II. 42–43. Emphasis mine. See Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 79, n.94; Catalán, Silva textual, 36-37. Martin, "Modelo historiografíco," §47-49, argues that this reflects the Estoria's ethnic focus on the past, besides the territorial.

## The subversion of the neo-Gothic myth by Sancho IV

Alfonso X's neo-Gothicism was subverted by the Learned King's successor, Sancho IV, who carried out his own historiographical enterprise. Sancho IV promoted the composition of an amplified version of Alfonso X's chronicle, which Diego Catalán named the *Versión Amplificada de la Estoria de España*. This version is mostly known from manuscripts conveying its narrative after Ramiro I (r. 842–850), which were copied to a royal manuscript from Sancho IV's time that had significant influence on the *Estoria de España's* textual transmission.

Although the historical matter after Ramiro I had much more influence upon subsequent historiography in general, and more concretely upon Count Pedro's work, it should be noted that Sancho's original version of his chronicle included previous matter concerning Gothic and Asturian history. These sections, however, did not become part of the canon of Sancho's royal manuscript, but were conveyed, as Francisco Bautista demonstrated, in the texts known as *Versión enmendada después de 1274* and *Crónica carolingia.*<sup>50</sup>

Rather than being a mere amplification of the *Estoria de España*, the *Versión Amplificada* conveyed a new political and ideological discourse. Bautista has already analysed how Sancho IV's version of the *Estoria de España* in the narratives between Pelayo and Alfonso II of Asturias (r. 791–842) abandoned the neo-Gothicism of its predecessor. First, by making a distinction between the "estoria de los godos" before Pelayo and the "estoria de las Españas" after the Asturian insurrection. Second, by asserting unequivocally that, with their defeat at the hands of the Muslims, the Goths lost the territory and the kingdom ("perdieron la tierra e el reino"), as well as their fame and prestige ("el nombre"). Pelayo is a Gothic refugee aristocrat, by the is seemingly unrelated to Reccared.

Instead of basing the historical legitimacy of the Asturian kingdom upon a notion of political and dynastic continuity between the Gothic and Asturian royal courts, the *Versión Amplificada* emphasises the notion of a *translatio imperii* from Toledo to Oviedo that is based on the pious works of Alfonso II in his new royal city and in the translation of numerous relics from Toledo to Oviedo's recently built churches.<sup>57</sup>

Inés Fernández-Ordóñez, on the other hand, has noted the pro-aristocratic stance in Sancho IV's reworking of his father's chronicle, namely in the section after Ramiro I,<sup>58</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup>See note 12 above.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup>El Escorial, Manuscript X-I-4, usually named E<sup>2</sup>. See Catalán, *De Alfonso X*, 24–26, 56–59, and *Silva textual*, 285–95; Fernández-Ordóñez, "Versión (o Crónica)," 986; Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," 46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup>Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," and *Estoria de España*, 8–9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup>Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," 48–56, and Estoria de España, 57–84.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup>Bautista, *Estoria de España*, 57–67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>538</sup>Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," 39, and Estoria de España, 58–59. In manuscript T of the Versión Amplificada, the break is even more explicit, with the addition of the following epigraph introducing the chapter dealing with Pelayo's insurrection: "Aquí se comiença la estoria de los fechos de los reyes de España que fueron después de la destruición de los reyes godos, que pereçieron en tiempo del rey Rodrigo, que fue el su postrimero rey, segunt cuenta la estoria de los godos," Bautista, Estoria de España, 88, n.4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup>Bautista, Estoria de España, 59.

<sup>55</sup> According to the Versión Amplificada, Pelayo was "fijo del duc Fáfila de Cantabria," see Bautista, Estoria de España, 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup>See the edition of this chapter in Bautista, *Estoria de España*, 88–89; on Pelayo's election, 99.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup>Bautista, *Estoria de España*, 13–36. See the relevant chapters of the *Versión Amplificada* in Bautista, *Estoria de España*, 89–90, 92–94, 96–102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §§65–79.

calling attention to the fact that Sancho IV's reformulation affected the neo-Gothicism of its source. The subversion of the neo-Gothic myth in the post-Alfonso II section of the *Versión Amplificada* is visible in a well-known passage where the history of the Iberian Peninsula is presented as a succession of invasions by different peoples. After the defeat of the Goths, the reconquest of the territory is an enterprise undertaken by the "naturales" of the Peninsula. This reflects a different view, when compared to Alfonso X's, of the nature of the war against the Muslims, which is here an enterprise of the Iberian "naturales" instead of the neo-Gothic monarchs.

The formulation of the *Versión Amplificada* does imply that Castilian royalty (or the aristocracy, for that matter) are no longer treated as Goths. According to the source, after successive invasions of different peoples, the Peninsula "finco en los naturales" after the Gothic defeat. In the *Versión Amplificada*, both aristocracy and royalty are Iberian "naturales" instead of Goths. The expansionist work itself, the war against Islam — arguably the primeval *raison d'être* of both royalty and aristocracy — is attributed to the "naturales" of the kingdom.

This different ideological setting can be explained by the context of production of the *Versión Amplificada*, written in 1289, not long after Sancho IV's accession to the throne. This monarch rose to power through the support of a wide sector of the aristocracy in a rebellion against his father that lasted from 1282 until Alfonso X's death in 1284. The political context and the relation between the social forces obligated Sancho IV to deprive Alfonso's original text of some of its ideological bluntness. Thus, principles such as a centrist monarchical power and neo-Gothicism were subverted or watered down in the *Versión Amplificada*. On the other hand, the aristocracy gained a greater role in this narrative. Sancho IV was highly indebted to the Castilian aristocracy, and the historiographical discourse produced under his sponsorship had to adapt to this political reality.

Still, Sancho IV's politics consisted not only of concessions, but he simultaneously strived to reinforce the ideological and historical foundations of royal power. Both the subversion of the neo-Gothic myth as well as the ideology of the "naturales" could have served that purpose. Sancho IV's ideology of the "naturales" corresponds largely with Alfonso X's concepts of "naturaleza" and "señorio natural" and thus translates

<sup>60</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §§67–68, and "Denotación de 'España'," 83, n.105; Catalán, *De Alfonso X*, 152–58; Bautista, "Hacia una nueva," 42, and *Estoria de España*, 57–58.

<sup>64</sup>O'Callaghan, Learned King, 258–69; González Mínguez, Poder Real, 57–60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 633, 363, col. a, Il. 1–10, quoted in Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §67, and "Denotación de 'España'," 83, n.105: "Mas contra Espanna todas las yentes del mundo se atrouieran a uenirla guerrear et entrarla et asennorearla, et fizieron y todo lo que quisieron; pero a la cima todos se fallaron ende muy mal, fasta que se acabo en los godos. Et desi finco en los naturales que fueron despues ganandola de los moros esparziendo mucha de su sangre por ello, muriendo y muchos altos omnes et de gran guisa et de otros, et la an ganada dessos enemigos de la Cruz, et del mar de Sant Ander fastal mar de Cáliz, sinon poco que les finca ende ya; et es esto ye en el regnado del muy noble et muy alto rey don Sancho el quarto, en la era de mill et CCC et XXVII anos." This view passed on to the *Crónica de 1344*, Ch. CXXXVI, 190, Il. 7–15 of Vindel's edition. I shall return to this point below when analysing Count Pedro's chronicle.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §68, and "Denotación de 'España'," 83. See also Catalán, *Silva textual*, 298–99

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup>Catalán, De Alfonso X, 153–54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup>See Fernández-Ordóñez, "Variación en el modelo," §§65–79, for the *Versión Amplificada's* ideological setting within the Alfonsine and post-Alfonsine historiographical tradition. According to Linehan, *History and the Historians*, 463–83, the *Versión Amplificada* may have been composed in the Cathedral of Toledo under the tutelage of Archbishop Gonzalo Pérez Gudiel and Sancho IV.

into historiographical discourse what Alfonso X had written in his Siete Partidas. 66 It conveys the notion of a territorially and historically based community, whose members are united by their "naturaleza" directly to their monarch, with dynastic issues and feudo-vassalic relations being contingent on the former. 67 By exalting the "naturales" and expanding their historical agency, Sancho IV also exalted and legitimised the political bonds established between that historical community and their "señor natural."68 As Bautista put it: "[1]o que permite la destrucción de los godos, la ruptura de la continuidad gótica, es en suma la identificación entre el rey y la tierra, identificación por la cual todos los deberes hacia ésta lo son también hacia aquél."69

#### Count Pedro's aristocratic neo-Gothicism

Sancho IV's Versión Amplificada already gave us an example of how transformations in the political situation led to changes in the historiographical discourse. A monarch who rose to power supported by the aristocracy that opposed Alfonso X's royalist programme had to moderate considerably the views of his predecessor and subvert the neo-Gothicism of the preceding historiographical work, yet concomitantly strive to reinforce the ideological and historical foundations of the Castilian monarchy.

What about the aristocracy itself? How would an aristocratic historiographer of this period react to the Castilian-Leonese royal neo-Gothicism of preceding historiography? Despite the scarcity of sources, Count Pedro of Barcelos's historiographical work is useful for this inquiry, as it is one of the few testimonies of specifically aristocratic historiographical activity in the north-western and central Iberian regions during the fourteenth century. <sup>70</sup> More importantly, it is, to my knowledge, the only aristocratic historiographical work of the period that reworked the neo-Gothic myth according to aristocratic parameters.71

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup>Bautista, Estoria de España, 62-67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup>Bautista, Estoria de España, 62-65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup>Bautista, Estoria de España, 65-67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup>Bautista, *Estoria de España*, 65.

<sup>70</sup> Although Funes, "Historiografía nobiliaria castellana," and "Historiografía nobiliaria del período post-alfonsí," posited the existence of a specifically aristocratic current of historiographical production in Castile before the fourteenth century, the fact remains that the texts that Funes provided as examples are lost and only known through their inclusion in later (and thematically wider) compilations. There is an early translation of Archbishop Rodrigo's chronicle known as the Estoria de los Godos, probably from around 1253, which is a Romance translation of the De Rebus Hispanie, and whose promoters have been identified with the Navarran-Aragonese aristocratic family of Azagra, see Bautista, "Historiografía e invención," 81–83. On the Estoria de los Godos, see Catalán and Jerez, "Rodericus" romanzado, 23– 109. Ward, "Review," 208-09, has however called attention to the limitations of Catalán's and Jerez's arguments concerning the provenance of the Estoria de los Godos. The first trustworthy testimony of Castilian historiography of unmistakable aristocratic origin is the Crónica Abreviada, an abbreviation of the Estoria de España done in 1320–1325 by Don Juan Manuel, a nephew of Alfonso X. Juan Manuel left his rhetorical and ideological imprint in other sections of the chronicle than on the fall of the Visigothic Kingdom and the insurrection in Asturias. Thus, the neo-Gothic royal claim was accepted as such. One must note that Juan Manuel's social position was ambiguous, just like Count Pedro's: although he was a seignorial lord, Juan Manuel was also a legitimate descendant of Ferdinand III, a member of the royal family, and a nephew of Alfonso X, whom he extolls greatly in his Crónica Abreviada. This leads to a complex and somewhat ambivalent positioning in terms of the political questions of the time, namely the relations between the Crown and the aristocracy. For questions about Juan Manuel, his Crónica Abreviada, and the contextualisation of the latter within post-Alfonsine historiographical tradition, see Hijano Villegas, "Historia y poder;" Salgado Loureiro, "Crónica abreviada."

<sup>71</sup> Other aristocratically oriented reworkings of Alfonso X's historiographical production usually left the first sections of the Estoria de España largely untouched (Ancient, Roman, Visigothic, and Asturian histories) and focused more on reformulating Castilian-Leonese history, see Funes, "Dos versiones," 17–18.

Count Pedro's Livro de Linhagens has two recent precedents of the same historiographical genre: first, the Livro Velho de Linhagens, 72 possibly compiled around 1286-1290 in the Monastery of Santo Tirso under the patronage of Martim Gil de Riba de Vizela;<sup>73</sup> and second, the *Livro do Deão*,<sup>74</sup> whose oldest traceable copy was written in 1343 at the behest of an unnamed dean, possibly Martim Martins Zote, Dean of the Archbishopric of Braga. 75 We only know the former through a fragmentary version. In any case, it is apparent from what has been preserved of the text that the status and way of life of the aristocracy is generally based on military conquest, since the protagonists of the Livro Velho, as we are told in the prologue, are "os linhagens dos bons homens filhos d'algo do reino de Portugal (...) que andaram a la guerra a filhar o reino de Portugal."<sup>76</sup> The Livro do Deão, on the other hand, has a much more functional tone, emphasising the utility of the text for his aristocratic audience to know the properties and rights to which they are entitled, as well as to avoid encumbrances related to matrimony and consanguinity.<sup>77</sup> The neo-Gothic myth is absent from both sources and we have no reason to believe that the Portuguese aristocracy made use of the neo-Gothic myth in its legitimation discourses prior to Count Pedro.

Count Pedro was as much a chronicler as a genealogist and this is visible in the Crónica de 1344.78 To achieve the aim of composing a general Iberian chronicle, Count Pedro drew upon the wealth of historiographical matter being compiled in Castile in the aftermath of Alfonso X's work. It is very likely that Count Pedro had first-hand contact with this activity during his exile in Castile.<sup>79</sup> He used a set of sources that was particularly successful in the western Iberian Peninsula in the early fourteenth century: the Liber Regum, the Versión Amplificada, and the Crónica de Castilla.80

Count Pedro used the Versión Amplificada for the period between Ramiro I of Asturias and Ferdinand I of Castile-León (r. 1037-1065). Therefore, much of the content of Sancho IV's work was transferred to Count Pedro's chronicle: for example, Count Pedro integrates the above-mentioned passage of the Versión Amplificada where it is stated that "todas las gentes del mundo" dared to battle and invade Spain, all of them failing to produce everlasting consequences, including the Goths that were defeated in the Muslim invasion. The land "desí fincó en los naturales," who reconquered the part occupied by the Muslims until 1289, the year explicitly referred to as the date of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup>Piel and Mattoso, *Portugaliae Monumenta*, 23–60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup>Piel and Mattoso, *Portugaliae Monumenta*, 14. The *Livro Velho* was possibly redacted in two phases, an older version compiled around 1270 and the preserved version from the later 1280s, see Mattoso, "Transmissão," 271-72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup>Piel and Mattoso, *Portugaliae Monumenta*, 61–214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup>Mattoso, "Livros de Linhagens," 420.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup>Piel and Mattoso, *Portugaliae Monumenta*, 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup>Piel and Mattoso, *Portugaliae Monumenta*, 61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup>Catalán, *De Alfonso X*, 300: "en todo su comienzo vacila entre una concepción genealógica y una concepción cronística de la historia."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup>Cintra, *Crónica Geral*, I:CXLIX–CL.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup>The latter texts were also compiled in the manuscript 8817 of the Biblioteca Nacional de España, edited in Lorenzo, Traducción Gallega. It is a composite codex from around 1295–1312, comprised of Galician translations of the Versión Amplificada and the Crónica de Castilla, the latter being introduced by a summary based on the Liber Regum. See Cintra, Crónica Geral, vol. I, for Count Pedro's sources. On the Galician translations of the Versión Amplificada and the Crónica de Castilla, see Cintra, Crónica Geral, I:CCCXVII-CCCXXX; Catalán, De Alfonso X, 305-56; Lorenzo's introduction to his edition of the texts, and "Crónica Geral." See also Miranda, "Introdução à Versão."

composition, when all of Spain was under Christian rule, "sinon poco que les fincó ía [to the Muslims, that is, the enclave of Granada]."81

Thus, the historical perspective of the Versión Amplificada was transmitted to the Crónica de 1344. Just as the Gothic rule ended in defeat at the hands of the Muslims, the Muslim rule was put to an end by the "naturales" of the Peninsula. The warring "naturales" may be interpreted, naturally, as the Iberian aristocracy (including the kings) for whom military activity was their main social function, especially against Muslims. 82 Both the Versión Amplificada and the Crónica de 1344 attribute the enterprise of the military expansion and the restoration of Christian Spain to the Iberian aristocracy, the "naturales" of the Peninsula. It is a perspective also present in the Liber Regum.<sup>83</sup>

The Crónica de 1344's narrative of the fall of the Visigoths and the birth of the Asturian Kingdom is rather different from the Leonese-Castilian historiographical tradition. While the Estoria de España had a detailed account of the Asturian insurrection inherited from the previous Latin tradition, Count Pedro provides little detail about the story of Pelayo before the fall of the Gothic kingdom or the uprising in Asturias. For the history prior to Ramiro I, the Crónica de 1344 conveys a geographical description of the Peninsula, the genealogy of the Gothic kings, the story of the fall of the Gothic kingdom, and the history of Muslim al-Andalus. Most of this content comes from a Portuguese translation of an originally Arabic work, the *Crónica do Mouro Rasis*, <sup>84</sup> combined with other sources such as a version of the Liber Regum.<sup>85</sup>

No more than a few words are dedicated to Pelayo, which are basically of a genealogical nature. 86 While in the Versión Primitiva a genealogical connection between the ruling Castilian royalty and the old Visigothic kings is made through Alfonso I of Asturias

<sup>81&</sup>quot; Mas contra España todas las gentes del mundo se atrevían a venir a guerrearla, e entralla e aseñorearla; e fizieron todo lo que quisieron pero a la cima todos se fallaron ende mal fasta que se acabo en los godos. E desí fincó en los naturales que fueron después ganada la de los otros [i.e., "moros," as in the Versión Amplificada] e esparcieron mucha sangre por ello, moriendo hý muchos altos ombres e de gran guisa e de otros qui an ganada d'estos enemigos de la raz [i.e., "Cruz," as in the Versión Amplificada], desde el mar de Santander fasta en el mar de Cález sinon poco que les fincó ía, e esto es en el reinado del muy noble e muy alto rey don Sancho el cuarto que fue en la era de mil e trezientos e veinte e seis." Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXXVI, 190, II. 7–15. The date of the Crónica de 1344 is thus the Spanish era 1326, that is AD 1288. But the Versión Amplificada, from which this passage came, gives era 1327, or AD 1289, as the date of composition, see Menéndez Pidal, Primera Crónica, Ch. 633, 362, col. b, l.52–363, col. a, 1. 16. On the other hand, the fact that the chronicler did not update the date in the source may also indicate that no particular attention was paid to this passage in the chronicle, which perhaps still awaited further elaboration. In any case, the date also passed to the second redaction of the chronicle, see Cintra, Crónica Geral, Vol. II, Ch. CCLVII, 411, II. 11–19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup>That sectors of the Portuguese upper aristocracy based their identity as a social group on its alleged past military activity against Muslims can be seen, for instance, in the opening words of the Livro Velho: "Agora, amigos, se vos plaze vos contaremos os linhagens dos bons homens filhos d'algo do reino de Portugal dos que devem a armar e criar e que andaram a la guerra a filhar o reino de Portugal," Piel and Mattoso, Portugaliae, 23. This is to a great degree a case of manipulation of the past for political purposes, since the principal agents of Portuguese military expansion during the foundational period of the monarchy were mostly royalty, middle or lower echelons of the aristocracy, municipal militias, and religious military orders, as noted by Mattoso, "Nobreza medieval," 293, and Pizarro, "Participation of the Nobility." While some members of the traditional upper aristocracy participated in conquests when fulfilling duties related to offices in the royal court, the upper aristocratic group as a whole remained largely uninterested in the Portuguese expansion from the birth of the kingdom in the mid-twelfth century until the final conquest of the Algarve in 1249. In any case, that did not prevent them from claiming the victory laurels just a few decades after the latter conquest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 94. It should be noted that the *Liber Regum* refuted the neo-Gothic claims of the Castilian-Leonese kings by ending the lineage of Pelayo with Alfonso II, after whose death without heirs the text continues with the election of the judges of Castile, see Bautista, "Historiografía e invención," 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup>Cintra, *Crónica Geral*, I:LI–LXIV; Catalán and de Andrés, *Crónica del Moro*; Rei, *Memória de Espaços*, 69–85; Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 84-85.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup>Bautista, "Original, versiones." See Cintra, *Crónica Geral*, I:XXXII, for the structure and sources of the *Crónica de 1344*. <sup>86</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. XXV, 42, II. 9–11, and Ch. CXXVII, 174, II. 5–10.



(r. 739–757), a descendant of King Reccared I (r. 586–601), nothing is said about this in the *Crónica de 1344.*<sup>87</sup>

In Count Pedro's *Livro de Linhagens*, on the other hand, after the disappearance of Rodrigo, the last Gothic king, <sup>88</sup> we are told that the Moors conquered all the land up to the Asturian mountains, where "todalas gentes da terra" and "todolos cristãos" sought refuge. They then elected Pelayo as their king and fought many battles against the Muslims. <sup>89</sup> Mentioning that part of the retreating Gothic army found refuge in Asturias and was thus among the rebels that elected Pelayo as their king does establish a connection to the Gothic past but nowhere is Pelayo's Gothic ancestry mentioned. <sup>90</sup> In the *Livro de Linhagens*, just as in the *Crónica de 1344*, Pelayo's insurrection in Asturias is primarily work of the "gentes da terra" and "todolos cristãos que eram nas montanhas," not only Goths. <sup>91</sup> The old Gothic royalty, the descendants of Reccared I, are certainly not present here as they were — with the exception of the *Versión Amplificada* — in the Castilian accounts of the foundation of the Asturian Kingdom.

More importantly, although Count Pedro admitted a Gothic presence in Asturias through the refugees fleeing from the ill-fated Battle of Guadalete (711), the *Crónica de 1344* explicitly refutes any claims of political continuity of the Asturian royalty to the Gothic kings:

And the Christians that sought refuge in the mountains of Asturias at the time of King Don Rodrigo's defeat, seeing that the land was being lost, raised among them as King Don Pelayo (...). And he was raised as king in the caves of Asturias. And from this king onwards [the kings] were not called Goths.<sup>93</sup>

This chapter is of particular interest because its matter is unique to the *Crónica de 1344*. <sup>94</sup> Count Pedro therefore asserts that the royal house descended from Pelayo is not in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup>The same happens, as we saw above, in the *Versión Amplificada*. In the *Crónica de 1344* Alfonso I is also the son of Pedro of Cantabria but, unlike the *Estoria de España*, the latter has no explicit genealogical connection to the Visigothic royalty, see Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CCXXVIII, 176, II. 17–19. See note 25 above for Alfonso I's royal Visigothic origin. Still, one must note that the *Crónica de 1344* recognises a genealogical connection of the Castilian-Leonese royalty going back to the Goths (Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CCCLXII, 618, II. 10–11), where it is told that "los reyes d'España" came "de muy fuerte sangre de los godos." See Rochwert-Zuili, *Crónica de Castilla*, Part II: Sancho II, Ch. 1, §1. It seems that in the *Crónica de 1344* the royalty was connected to the Goths by their lineage, as well as by their aristocratic social status, as we shall see below.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup>LL3E1. The system of references to Count Pedro's *Livro de Linhagens* in the footnotes refers to the internal division of the texts in Mattoso's critical edition: the initials LL stand for the book's title, followed by chapter number (each chapter lists the descent of a particular individual), capital letter indicating a subdivision of the chapter (where each separate branch of that descent is listed), another number for each successive generation, and sentence number in superscript.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup>LL3E2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup>Ferreira, "Liber Regum," §29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup>Krus, Concepção nobiliárquica, 114 n.227 and 237 n.576, argued that the narrative is an attempt to link the ruling Iberian royalty to the Gothic past, and that Pelayo's link to the Gothic nobility is made not by his familial origins but rather by the Asturian rebels' origins in Toledo, the head of the Visigothic Kingdom.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup>See note 25 above.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup>"E los cristianos que se acogeron a las montañas de Asturias cuando fu el desbarato del rey don Rodrigo, veyendo que se perdía la tierra, alçaron por rey entre sí el rey don Pelayo (...). E fue alçado por rey en las cuevas de Esturias. E d'este rey en adelante non fueron llamados godos," see Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXVII, 174, II. 5–10.

<sup>94</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXVII, 173–75. It is an enumeration of the Castilian-Leonese kings according to the number of homonymous rulers. Although in the passage referenced above, Count Pedro demarcated a clear dividing line between the Gothic and the Castilian-Leonese monarchs, he simultaneously saw these dynasties (together with the Portuguese) as distinct political subjects of the same historical continuum. The *Crónica* first lists the Gothic and Castilian-Leonese monarchs separately, then adds them together, adding also the total number of Portuguese kings and mentioning in the end the date when this chapter was being composed, i.e., 21 January 1344, Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXVII, 175, II. 33–38.

same political continuum as that of the Gothic kings. It also makes a clear distinction in the royal lists between the Gothic kings until Rodrigo and the Asturian-Leonese-Castilian kings after Pelayo. 95 In the Crónica de 1344 there seemingly is no neo-Gothic symbolic authority sustaining Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian royal power.<sup>96</sup>

However, instead of suppressing the neo-Gothic myth in his text, Count Pedro tried to adapt it to an aristocratic viewpoint. This is visible when the *Crónica* informs us that "los más altos de los linajes de sangre que avía en Castilla de antigüedad e que fueron siempre más poderosos,"97 the families of Lara and of Carrión, "venían de los godos, de los mejores e de los más altos que hý avía."98 The Crónica delegitimates thereafter the Carrión family due to their greed and the dishonour they inflicted on El Cid's daughters, <sup>99</sup> a story that is narrated later during the reign of Alfonso VI of Castile-León. Thus, the immaculate blood of "los mejores e de los más altos" old Gothic aristocrats ran within the veins of the Lara family, one of the most powerful medieval Castilian aristocratic families. 100 It was a lineage to which Count Pedro was proximate, especially through his contemporary Juan Núñez II of Lara. 101 As in the previous case, the contents of this chapter are idiosyncratic to Count Pedro's work. Therefore, they are rather important in what they tell us about Count Pedro's personal perspective.

This perspective becomes clearer if we again resort to the Livro de Linhagens. The Count included in his book a clarification taken from a version of the Liber Regum that he used which states that the Goths "forom todos cavaleiros," 102 in effect exalting the Iberian aristocracy as the true heirs of the Goths. 103 The warrior aristocracy was thus in genealogical continuity with the ancient Goths as well as in a continuity of social status and a common way of life. 104 Count Pedro not only accepted from the Liber Regum the sameness in social status between ancient Goths and contemporary aristocracy but also chose to materialise this connection to the Gothic past by connecting the lineages of Lara and Carrión to it. The monarchs were also related to the Goths through

<sup>95</sup> See, for example, Vindel, "Crónica de 1344", Ch. XXVI, 41–42, II. 1–14, and Ch. CXXVII, 174, II. 24–25. See also note 94

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup>Fernández-Ordóñez, "Denotación de 'España'," 85, mentioned that Count Pedro's chronicle lacked any neo-Gothicism. As I argue below, this is not exactly true, since the neo-Gothic myth is present in the Crónica de 1344, although its subject is no longer the royalty, but rather the entire aristocracy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXVIII, 178, II. 94–95. <sup>98</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXVIII, 178, II. 97–98. According to the *Livro de Linhagens*, the Laras were related to the Gothic aristocracy by the anonymous wife of the family founder Mudarra Gonçalvez, see Mattoso, Portugaliae Monumenta, LL10A2<sup>6</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup>"su sobervia e por su mala ventura e por la desonra que fizieron a las fijas del Cid," Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CXXVIII, 178, II. 99-100.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup>Doubleday, Lara Family.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup>Cintra, Crónica Geral, I:CXLVIII–CXLIX.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup>LL3D1<sup>3</sup>. While the older versions of the *Liber Regum* said nothing about the Goths being knights, Count Pedro incorporated this feature in his chronicle, drawing from a version of the Liber Regum that circulated in western Iberia, since the same characterisation of the Goths as knights also appears in the summary of the Liber Regum that serves as introduction to the Galician translation of the Crónica de Castilla in the codex edited by Lorenzo, Traducción Gallega. See Bautista, "Original," §25; Ferreira, "D. Pedro de Barcelos," 101, and "Liber regum," §29; Miranda, "Introdução à Versão;" Krus, Concepção nobiliárquica, 114-15. See the edition of the fourteenth-century Galician summary of the Liber Regum in Catalán and de Andrés, Crónica General, 338-43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup>Ferreira, "Liber regum," §§27–31.

<sup>104</sup> Another example of Count Pedro's "aristocratisation" of the Gothic past is seen in Dona Toda when we are told of her marriage to Sancho I of Navarra, see Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CCXCVI, 495, Il. 27–28: while Toda is described here as "una dueña de linaje de los godos," in Count Pedro's source, the Versión Amplificada, she is "una duenna del linnage de los reys de los godos" (my emphasis), Menéndez Pidal, Primera Crónica, Ch. 784, 468, col. a, Il. 53-54. Archbishop Rodrigo mentioned the "regio semine" of Queen Toda but her Gothic heritage is absent from his text, Rodericus, Historia de Rebus, Book V, Ch. XXI, 170, II. 18-19.



this sameness of way of life and social status, as well as genealogically, 105 since kings were first and foremost "cavaleiros," warrior aristocrats. It is, therefore, the same territorial/ ethnic neo-Gothic identity present in the Estoria de España, 106 having removed the political element embodied by the Castilian royalty. The origin of Count Pedro's aristocratic group identity is thus located in ancient Visigothic times. 107

# Royal "juridical neo-Gothicism" and the principle of elective kingship in Count Pedro's texts

While refuting the Castilian royalty's political connection to the Gothic monarchy, Count Pedro simultaneously admitted that there was, for lack of a better designation, "juridical continuity" between the Leonese-Castilian kings and the old Gothic order, in the sense that those kings often implemented or confirmed laws of Gothic origin.

When narrating the first years of Bermudo II's reign (r. 962-999), the Crónica de 1344 notes that the Leonese king "confirmo las leyes de los godos, e fez guardar bien los establecimientos de los santos padres." <sup>108</sup> The passage points to the juridical and religious continuity between the Leonese monarchy and the old Gothic monarchy by underlining the continuation of Gothic legislative and religious norms. These laws were again confirmed by Bermudo's successor, Alfonso V (r. 999-1028), <sup>109</sup> and in both cases, the expressions were taken from the Versión Amplificada. 110 Later, Ferdinand I of Castile-León "confirmo las leis gótigas que los reyes godos dieron en España." 111 Again, the passage comes from Count Pedro's source, this time the Crónica de Castilla. 112

It may appear contradictory for Count Pedro to sever the political connection of the Castilian royalty to the Gothic kings while simultaneously recognising a continuity in terms of legislative and juridical authority. On the one hand, it is quite likely that Count Pedro retained these passages simply due to the fact that a legal code of remote Visigothic origin was indeed applied in Castile-León in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, namely the Fuero Juzgo. 113 On the other hand, the "juridical neo-Gothicism" that Count Pedro attributed to the royalty may be easier to grasp if properly framed within the Count's wider politico-cultural programme.

For Count Pedro, the king ruled as a *primus inter pares*, not as a monarch governing in plenitudo potestatis. Count Pedro espoused a pact-based, feudal view of royal power, as a political structure based upon bonds between lord and vassal. The king's power derived from the support or acquiescence of the warrior elite. This can be seen, for example, in the narrative of the first Portuguese monarch Afonso Henriques in the second redaction of Count Pedro's *Crónica de 1344*. This conception of royal power also predominated

```
<sup>105</sup>See note 87 above.
```

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup>Martin, "Modelo historiografíco," §48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup>Ferreira, "Liber Regum," §29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CCLVII, 429, II. 10–11. <sup>109</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CCLXXXVII, 477, I. 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup>Menéndez Pidal, *Primera Crónica*, Ch. 745, 443, col. b, Il. 6–9, and Ch. 776, 463, col. b, Il. 46–47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. CCCL, 595, Il. 10–11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup>Rochwert-Zuili, *Crónica de Castilla*, Part I: Fernando I el Magno, Ch. 23, §111.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup>Maintier-Vermorel, "Fuero Juzgo."

<sup>114</sup>Silva, "Metamorfoses de um guerreiro," 87–88. Krus, Concepção nobiliárquica, 88 n.127, identified the same feudal conception of royal power in the Livro do Deão. Since the first redaction of the Crónica de 1344 only survived in a truncated Castilian translation ending with the reign of Alfonso VII of Castile-León, we lacked until recently the original text for the

among the Castilian aristocracy during the time of Alfonso X and the following decades.115

In the prologue of his Livro de Linhagens, the count paraphrases Aristotle and argues that royal power, especially its judicial dimension, is a necessary burden that, at least ideally, could be rendered useless if only men — and by this Count Pedro chiefly means aristocrats — had true friendship among them: "Esto diz Aristotiles: que se homées houvessem antre si amizade verdadeira, nom haveriam mester reis nem justiças."116

Count Pedro is dialoguing here with his great-grandfather Alfonso X, since the passage is an adaptation of the Learned King's statutory code, namely the Fourth of his Siete Partidas: "Et por ende dixo Aristotiles que si los homes hobiesen entre sí verdadera amistad, non habrien meester justicia nin alcalles que los judgasen."117

While Alfonso X stated that if there were true friendship among men there would be no need for justice and officials (kings go unmentioned), Count Pedro questioned the timelessness and, employing Alfonsine terminology, the "naturaleza" of monarchic institutions. 118 It might appear too radical a conclusion to assume that a fourteenth-century Portuguese aristocrat could realistically conceive of a society devoid of political and judicial power. Yet, at the very least, Count Pedro does seem to attribute a social origin and a social character to royal institutions, of which we ideally might prescind if social conditions were fitting. His is quite a different view to Alfonso X's naturalisation of political power and the emphasis on its divine provenance.

It was an aristocratic "consciência de si" as a social group, using Krus's expression, or "conciencia de clase," if we prefer Funes's terms, that drove Count Pedro to compile his ambitious genealogical compilation in the first place. 119 Count Pedro explicitly mentions that his motive to compile the Livro de Linhagens was that of "meter amor e amizade antre os nobres fidalgos da Espanha." 120 Count Pedro wished to make the Iberian aristocracy aware of the bonds connecting them so that relations of "amor e amizade" were cemented and the necessity of royal and judicial institutions would wither away. His historiographical work was a tool in the enterprise of imposing this view upon society, or at least upon its ruling strata.

This feudal conception of kingship, and of the king as the aristocrat *primus inter pares*, is implied in the narrative of the birth of the Asturian monarchy in the Livro de Linhagens. 121 Here, the kings who deserve most prominence are Pelayo and Alfonso I, the former through his status as founder of the Asturian Kingdom and the latter through

history of the Portuguese kings. Cintra, Crónica Geral, I:XXXV-XXXVI, surmised that Count Pedro's original text would probably be similar to that preserved in the second redaction, which indeed seems to be the case, judging from the description in Bautista and Moreira's, "Tradição textual," concerning the recently discovered manuscripts with the original text of the chronicle (see notes 11 and 14 above).

<sup>115</sup> García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, "Alfonso X y los poderes," 11–19, 22–26; Funes, "Dos versiones," 22. The aristocratic notion of a pact-based royal power is also discernible in the Estoria de los Godos (c. 1253), the Romance translation of the De Rebus Hispanie, possibly promoted by the Navarran-Aragonese family of Azagra, see Bautista, "Historiografía e invención," 81-83. On the Estoria de los Godos, see Catalán and Jerez, "Rodericus" romanzado, 23-109.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup>LL, Prologue 4<sup>1–4</sup>. For a detailed analysis of the prologue of Count Pedro's *Livro de Linhagens* concerning the appropriation of Aristotelian postulates, see Ferreira, "'Amor e amizade'." <sup>117</sup>Quoted in Miranda and Ferreira, "Projeto de escrita," 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup>Ferreira, "'Amor e amizade'," 97–102; Miranda and Ferreira, "Projeto de escrita," 31–32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup>Krus, Concepção nobiliárquica, 310; Funes, "Historiografía nobiliaria castellana," 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup>LL, Prologue 2<sup>3</sup>. See Ferreira, "'Amor e amizade'."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup>LL3E2-5.

a list of his numerous conquests. 122 It is no coincidence, as Krus has already noted, 123 that in Count Pedro's text the main agents in the creation of the Asturian polity, i.e., the embryo from which Christian Iberia would be restored centuries later, are aristocrats elected as kings by their peers instead of monarchs that inherited the kingdom from their progenitors. Also, the *Livro* tells us, based on the *Liber Regum*, that "[q]uando forom os Godos entrados em Espanha, fezerom rei de seu linhagem,"<sup>124</sup> after which Count Pedro lists the Gothic kings until the fall of King Rodrigo.

There is a rather curious narrative concerning an elective procedure for the succession to the throne in the Crónica de 1344, located in the Visigothic past. Yet, it hardly fits the aristocratic ideology of kingship that I have been otherwise identifying in Count Pedro's work, I am referring to the Levenda de la Elección de Bamba, which deals with the divinely sanctioned election of the Visigothic King Wamba (r. 672-680). Drawing upon a version of the Liber Regum known as Libro de las Generaciones, composed in Navarra around 1256-1270, <sup>125</sup> Count Pedro recounted how, in a context of "muy gran discordia" caused by the vacancy in the royal throne, the Spaniards sent for the council of the pope concerning who should be king. 126 After fasting and praying, the pope was visited twice by Saints Peter and Paul who indicated that the future king must be "un omne bueno que avía nombre Bamba, que era labrador que arava con un buey blanco y con un asno."127 The messengers returned to Spain with this message and found Wamba, who was informed that he was meant to be king. 128 Incredulous, Wamba replied with sarcasm that he will be king the day the dry oaken stick he held in his hand blossoms with fruit; something which miraculously happened to everyone's amazement. 229 Wamba was elected king and "fue muy buen rey e fizo muy buenos fechos," the Crónica concludes. 130 It is a case of an elective procedure for the succession to the throne being conditioned and sanctioned by divine authority. 131

<sup>122</sup>LL3E2 and LL3E4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup>Krus, Concepção nobiliárquica, 114 n.227.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup>LL3D3<sup>1</sup>.

<sup>125</sup> Catalán, De Alfonso X, 357–60. See Catalán and Jerez, "Rodericus" romanzado, 108 n.232, for the chronology of production of the Libro de las Generaciones. On the legend of Wamba in the Libro de las Generaciones, see Bautista, "Historiografía e invención." On the legend of Wamba in late-medieval Portugal, see Dias, "Lenda do Rei."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. LXXIII, 87, II. 1–5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. LXXIII, 87, Il. 13–14. In the *Libro de las Generaciones* Wamba is a "villano," see Catalán, *De* Alfonso X. 358.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. LXXIII, 88, II. 25–34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. LXXIII, 88, II. 35-40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup>Vindel, "Crónica de 1344," Ch. LXXIII, 88, I. 44.

<sup>131</sup>The social provenance of Wamba as a "labrador," in the case of the Crónica de 1344, or a "villano," in the Libro de las Generaciones, are idiosyncratic to these texts and the narrative may seem somewhat puzzling in the context of Count Pedro's aristocratic mindset. Ward, "'Yo uno solo non ualo'," §9, noted the problematics of the ideological connotations in the construction of a royal model image around a "rey labrador." The legend of a lower-class Wamba already existed before the writing of Libro de las Generaciones, as the tradition is mentioned in the Estoria de los Godos, which refutes the attribution of a "uill natura" to Wamba, see Catalán and Jerez, "Rodericus" romanzado, 48-49, and Bautista, "Historiografía e invención," 81. In any case, one of the main features in the medieval tradition on King Wamba since the Historia Wambae is the idealisation of a humble king who, recalcitrant and hard-pressed, accepted the crown. It is precisely Wamba's disinterestedness (the motif of recusatio imperii) that made him even more adequate for the royal position, see Bautista, "Historiografía e invención," 78, 89. The legend's emphasis on Wamba's disinterestedness was probably the reasoning behind Count Pedro's preference for it, instead of reproducing, for example, the much shorter and simpler narrative of Wamba's election in the Livro de Linhagens, LL3D32<sup>5</sup>, where Wamba is apparently an aristocrat elected king. The topic of Wamba "labrador" appeared to be popular in western Iberia, as it is also mentioned in the summary of the Liber Regum that introduces the Galician translation of the Crónica de Castilla. In this text, Wamba is "hũ home boo que era laurador," in line with the description of the Crónica de 1344, see Catalán and de Andrés, Crónica General, 341, l. 17.

Yet, with the obvious exception of the "divinely sacralised peasant-king Wamba," whose inclusion in the Crónica might have derived from considerations other than the strictly ideological, <sup>132</sup> the view of royal power as an office that emerged out of the aristocracy, and that should be subordinate to it, is the ideological frame within which Count Pedro's writings must be viewed. He admitted a royal juridical connection to the Gothic past but only because kings were elected aristocrats performing necessary political and judicial functions. In other words, if kings were kings and therefore exerted ruling power, it was because they were first and foremost aristocrats or knights and, as such, they should answer before the social group from which they came. If they could drink from the well of symbolic capital provided by the memories of the Gothic past, then they must do so through their status as "cavaleiros" instead of their kingly status.

#### **Conclusions**

We can better understand from the analysis above how the neo-Gothic myth was an asset in a symbolic and cultural struggle between sectors of the seignorial aristocracy and royalty in fourteenth-century Iberia. The social struggles of the period were, in a way, enacted in historiography. Through his texts, Count Pedro refuted the Castilian royalty's claims of political continuity back to the Gothic past. He simultaneously posited a connection between his contemporary aristocracy and the ancient Goths. This connection is made both in genealogical terms and in terms of inherited social position. The royalty is connected to the Goths in genealogical terms, as well as through the royalty's status as knights.

Political neo-Gothicism, on the other hand, is absent from the text. There is a political break since the times of the Goths in Count Pedro's work but not a genealogical one. Count Pedro's aristocratic neo-Gothicism is informed by a pan-Iberian consciousness (in practice, mostly pro-Portuguese and pro-Castilian) which is, on the one hand, genealogical and, on the other, a social or class identity based on social status and way of life. Count Pedro's neo-Gothicism is not a political identity but rather a notion of social and genealogical belonging.

In Count Pedro's historiography, the Goths remain in the territory. But the old Gothic royalty and the Gothic kingdom died in 711, bathed in sins for which the restoration of Christian Spain was an expiation. The political entity born in Asturias just a few years after the Muslim invasion was a new entity, erected by the people of the land, the oppressed Christians who rose in arms, Goths and "naturales" alike. The Gothic historical subject lives on, incarnated in the Castilian and Galician-Portuguese aristocracies, who just a few years before the composition of the Crónica de 1344 and the Livro de Linhagens participated under the leadership of the royalty in the Battle of Río Salado (1340), a historical event of significant proportions that actualised both the ideal upon which the aristocracy's main social function was founded — the war against the Muslims — as well as the ideal of unity and concord between royalty and aristocracy, based upon the common endeavour of defeating the Muslims.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup>See note 131 above. Although I attribute a determinant character to the political functionality of the texts and emphasise the ideological nature of medieval historiography, Hijano Villegas, "Retorno a la selva," reminds us that there are many factors at play in medieval historiographical practice other than the ideological.

Kingship, on the other hand, and especially the supreme judicial function of the king that was central to the medieval concept of power, is for Count Pedro a necessary inconvenience that ideally could be discarded if there were strong bonds of friendship and love among the aristocracy.

By reworking preceding narrative material into a relatively coherent vision of the past according to the perspective of a sector of the Portuguese upper aristocracy, Count Pedro was participating in the social struggles of his time through his historiographical praxis. He intended through his works to generalise these views among his aristocratic peers. The struggles between the nobility and royalty — in which Count Pedro was a participant, especially in his younger days - were acted out in the cultural field. Count Pedro's vast historiographical production of the 1340s was an offensive on behalf of a sector of the Portuguese upper aristocracy in this symbolic struggle. It was an attempt at building symbolic capital and political legitimacy for an aristocratic social group upon an idealised past. Count Pedro's works were cultural resources in a social struggle that conditioned political relations between the aristocracy and royal power throughout the late Middle Ages in the Iberian Peninsula.

Count Pedro also contested the previous order of discourse from another point of view: vernacular chronicles in prose were a genre under the cultural hegemony of the royalty in the Peninsula, such was the weight of the Alfonsine tradition. Count Pedro was thus building his own conception of the past upon a "mined field," ideologically speaking. He had to ingeniously rework a discourse, which was originally designed for and by royalty, to disprove the most audacious royalist claims and to provide his audience with a comprehensive view of the past through aristocratic lenses.

As a result, he produced a work that not only represents the first incursion of the Portuguese aristocracy into this historiographical genre but also presents a discourse that differs from that of the preceding aristocratic historiographical works, namely the Livros de Linhagens. Count Pedro espoused a historiographical discourse that was informed by a pan-Iberian social identity, in the sense that the social group idealised in Count Pedro's work encompasses all Christian Iberian kingdoms instead of just the Portuguese or Galician-Portuguese, as in the previous Livros de Linhagens. Further, it established the origins of this idealised social group in a past much remoter than that of previous Portuguese aristocratic historiography, going as far back as Visigothic Spain.

#### **Disclosure statement**

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.

#### **Notes on contributor**

Tiago João Queimada e Silva is a PhD candidate at the University of Turku (Finland), where he is currently finishing his dissertation titled "The 'Good Noblemen' Who Conquered the Kingdom: Historiography and Aristocratic Legitimation in Late-Medieval Portugal (Late-Thirteenth and Fourteenth Centuries)." He holds a Master's degree in History of the Middle Ages from the University of Coimbra (Portugal). Recently he has been researching and writing about aristocratic



depictions of the past, focusing on representations of Christian-Muslim interactions and their uses for political legitimation.

#### **ORCID**

Tiago João Queimada e Silva http://orcid.org/0000-0002-5059-6565

#### **Works Cited**

### **Primary Sources**

Biblioteca General Histórica, Universidad de Salamanca, Ms. 2656.

Biblioteca Nacional de España, Ms. 8817 (Mss/8817).

Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de San Lorenzo de El Escorial, Ms. X-I-4.

Bonnaz, Yves. Chroniques Asturiennes (Fin IXe Siècle). Paris: Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1987.

Catalán, Diego, and María Soledad de Andrés. Crónica del Moro Rasis. Madrid: Seminario Menéndez Pidal/Gredos, 1975.

Catalán, Diego, and María Soledad de Andrés. Crónica General de España de 1344. Madrid: Seminario Menéndez Pidal/Gredos, 1970.

Cintra, Luís Filipe Lindley. In Crónica Geral de Espanha de 1344, 4 vols. 2nd ed. Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional-Casa da Moeda, 2009.

Lorenzo, Ramón. La Traducción Gallega de la Crónica General y de la Crónica de Castilla, vol. I. Orense: Instituto de Estudios Orensanos Padre Feijóo, 1975.

Lucas Tudensis. Chronicon Mundi. Edited by Emma Falque Rev. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003.

Mattoso, José. Portugaliae Monumenta Historica, vol. 2: Livro de Linhagens do Conde D. Pedro, 2 vols. Lisbon: Academia das Ciências, 1980.

Menéndez Pidal, Ramon. Primera Crónica General. Madrid: Bailly-Bailliere e Hijos, 1906.

Piel, Joseph, and José Mattoso. Portugaliae Monumenta Historica, vol. 1: Livros Velhos de Linhagens. Lisbon: Academia das Ciências, 1980.

Rochwert-Zuili, Patricia. Crónica de Castilla. Paris: SEMH-Sorbonne, 2010. https://books. openedition.org/esb/63.

Rodericus Ximenii de Rada. In Historia de Rebus Hispanie sive Historia Gothica, edited by Juan Fernández Valverde. Turnhout: Brepols, 1987.

Vindel, Ingrid. "Crónica de 1344, edición y estúdio." Ph.D. diss., Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, 2015.

# **Secondary Sources**

Bautista, Francisco. La Estoria de España en época de Sancho IV: sobre los reyes de Asturias. London: University of London, 2006.

Bautista, Francisco. "Hacia una nueva 'versión' de la Estoria de España: texto y forma de la Versión de Sancho IV." Incipit 23 (2003): 1-59.

Bautista, Francisco. "Historiografía e invención: Wamba en el 'Libro de las Generaciones'." Edad Media: Revista de Historia 12 (2011): 67-97.

Bautista, Francisco. "Original, versiones e influencia del Liber regum: estudio textual y propuesta de stemma." e-Spania 9 (2010). https://doi.org/10.4000/e-spania.19884.

Bautista, Francisco, and Filipe Alves Moreira. "Para a tradição textual da Crónica de 1344: dois manuscritos da versão original." Zeitschrift für Romanische Philologie 137, no. 1 (2021): 183-216.



- Bautista Crespo, Juan. "La Estoria de España y las crónicas generales." In Alfonso X el Sabio y las crónicas de España, edited by Inés Fernández-Ordóñez, 107-32. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 2001.
- Campa Gutiérrez, Mariano de la. "Las versiones alfonsíes de la Estoria de España." In Alfonso X el Sabio y las crónicas de España, edited by Inés Fernández-Ordóñez, 83-106. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 2001.
- Catalán, Diego. De Alfonso X al Conde de Barcelos. Cuatro estudios sobre el nacimiento de la historiografía romance en Castilla y Portugal. Madrid: Gredos, 1962.
- Catalán, Diego. De la silva textual al taller historiográfico alfonsí. Códices, crónicas, versiones y cuadernos de trabajo. Madrid: Fundación Ramón Menéndez Pidal/Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, 1997.
- Catalán, Diego, and Enrique Jerez. "Rodericus" romanzado en los reinos de Aragón, Castilla y Navarra. Madrid: Fundación Ramón Menéndez Pidal, 2005.
- Cintra, Luís Filipe Lindley. "D. Pedro, Conde de Barcelos, Gomes Lourenço de Beja e a autoria da Crónica Geral de Espanha de 1344." Boletim de Filologia 16 (1956): 137-39.
- Devermond, Alan. "The Death and Rebirth of Visigothic Spain in the Estoria de España." Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos 9, no. 3 (1985): 345-67.
- Dias, Isabel Rosa. "A Lenda do Rei Vamba." Estudos de Literatura Oral 9-10 (2003-2004): 111-28. Díaz, Pablo C. "Los godos como epopeya y la construcción de identidades en la historiografía española." Anales de Historia Antigua, Medieval y Moderna 40 (2008): 25-73.
- Díaz, Pablo C. "El mito godo en la construcción de Castilla." In El historiador y la sociedad: homenaje al profesor José Ma Mínguez, edited by Pablo C. Díaz, Fernando Luis Corral, and Iñaki Martín Viso, 53-65. Salamanca: Ediciones Universidad de Salamanca, 2013.
- Doubleday, Simon R. The Lara Family: Crown and Nobility in Medieval Spain. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Historical Studies, 2001.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. "La denotación de 'España' en la Edad Media. Perspectiva historiográfica (siglos VII-XIV)." In Actas del IX Congreso Internacional de Historia de la Lengua Española, edited by José María García, 49-105. Madrid/Frankfurt am Main: Iberoamericana/Vervuert, 2015.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. "Estoria de España." In Diccionario filológico de literatura medieval española: textos y transmisión, edited by Carlos Alvar and José Manuel Lucía Megías, 54-86. Madrid: Castalia, 2002.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. Las Estorias de Alfonso El Sábio. Madrid: Istmo, 1992.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. "La historiografía alfonsí y post-alfonsí en sus textos. Nuevo panorama." Cahiers de Linguistique Hispanique Médiévale 18-19 (1993): 101-32.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. "Variación en el modelo historiográfico alfonsí en el siglo XIII. Las versiones de la Estoria de España." In La historia alfonsí: el modelo y sus destinos (siglos XIII–XV), edited by Georges Martin, 41-74. Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2000. https://books.openedition. org/cvz/2175.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés. "Versión (o Crónica) amplificada de 1289." In Diccionario filológico de literatura medieval española: textos y transmisión, edited by Carlos Alvar and José Manuel Lucía Megías, 986–96. Madrid: Castalia, 2002.
- Fernández Valverde, Juan. "Introducción." In Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, Historia de los Hechos de España. Translated and edited by Juan Fernández Valverde, 13-52. Madrid: Alianza Editorial,
- Ferreira, Maria do Rosário. "Amor e amizade antre os fidalgos da Espanha." Apontamentos sobre o prólogo do Livro de Linhagens do Conde D. Pedro." Cahiers d'Études Hispaniques Médiévales 35 (2012): 93-122.
- Ferreira, Maria do Rosário. "D. Pedro de Barcelos e a representação do passado ibérico." In O contexto hispânico da historiografia portuguesa nos séculos XIII e XIV (homenagem a Diego Catalán), edited by Maria do Rosário Ferreira, 81-106. Coimbra: Imprensa da Universidade, 2010.
- Ferreira, Maria do Rosário. "Entre linhagens e imagens: a escrita do Conde de Barcelos." In Estudios sobre la Edad Media, el Renacimiento y la temprana modernidad, edited by



Francisco Bautista Pérez and Jimena Gamba Corradine, 159-67. San Millán de la Cogolla: SEMYR/Cilengua, 2010.

Ferreira, Maria do Rosário. "O Liber regum e a representação aristocrática da Espanha na obra do Conde D. Pedro de Barcelos." e-Spania 9 (2010). doi:10.4000/e-spania.19675.

Funes, Leonardo, "Dos versiones antagónicas de la historia y de la ley: una visión de la historiografía castellana de Alfonso X al Canciller Ayala." In Teoría y práctica de la historiografía hispánica medieval, edited by Aengus Ward, 8-31. Birmingham: University of Birmingham, 2000.

Funes, Leonardo. "Historiografía nobiliaria castellana del período post-alfonsí: un objeto en debate." La Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literatures, and Cultures 43, no. 1 (Fall 2014): 5-38.

Funes, Leonardo. "Historiografía nobiliaria del período post-alfonsí: un fenómeno histórico-literario en discusión." In Hispanismos del mundo. Diálogos y debates en (y desde) el sur, edited by Leonardo Funes, 77-86. Buenos Aires: Miño y Dávila, 2016.

García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, José Ángel. "Alfonso X y los poderes del reino." Alcanate 9 (2014-2015): 11-40.

González Mínguez, César. Poder Real y Poder Nobiliar en la Corona de Castilla (1252-1369). Bilbao: Universidad del País Vasco, 2012.

Hijano Villegas, Manuel. "Historia y poder simbólico en la obra de don Juan Manuel." Voz y Letra: Revista de Literatura 25, nos. 1–2 (2014): 71–110.

Hijano Villegas, Manuel. "Retorno a la selva textual: compiladores medievales y filólogos modernos." In La fractura historiográfica: las investigaciones de Edad Media y Renacimiento desde el Tercer Milenio, edited by Javier San José Lera, Francisco Javier Burguillo López, and Laura Mier Pérez, 353-63. Sociedad de Estudios Medievales y Renacentistas: Salamanca, 2008.

Isla, Amancio. "Monarchy and Neogothicism in the Astur Kingdom, 711-910." Francia. Forschungen zur westeuropäischen Geschichte 26, no. 1 (1999): 41–56.

Jerez, Enrique. "El Tudense en su siglo: transmisión y recepción del Chronicon mundi en el Doscientos." In El relato historiográfico: textos y tradiciones en la España medieval, edited by Francisco Bautista, 19-57. London: University of London, 2006.

Krus, Luis. A concepção nobiliárquica do espaço ibérico (1280-1380). Lisbon: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian/Junta Nacional de Investigação Científica e Tecnológica, 1994.

Linehan, Peter. History and the Historians of Medieval Spain. Oxford: Oxford University Press,

Lorenzo, Ramón. "Crónica Geral e Crónica de Castela." In Dicionário da literatura medieval galega e portuguesa, edited by Giulia Lanciani and Giuseppe Tavani, 190-92. Lisbon: Editorial Caminho, 1993.

Maintier-Vermorel, Estelle. "Fuero Juzgo: una traducción al servicio de la génesis del Estado Moderno." Medievalia Hispanica 14 (2010): 271-87.

Maravall, José Antonio. El Concepto de España en la Edad Media. 2nd ed. Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Políticos, 1964.

Martin, George. "Le concept de 'naturalité' (naturaleza) dans les Sept parties, d'Alphonse X le Sage." e-Spania 5 (June 2008). doi:10.4000/e-spania.10753.

Martin, George. La historia alfonsí: el modelo y sus destinos (siglos XIII-XV). Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2000. https://books.openedition.org/cvz/2166.

Martin, George. "El modelo historiografíco alfonsí y sus antecedentes." In La historia alfonsí: el modelo y sus destinos (siglos XIII-XV), edited by Georges Martin, 9-40. Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2000. https://books.openedition.org/cvz/2173.

Martin, George. "Un récit (La chute du royaume wisigothique d'Espagne dans l'historiographie chrétienne des VIIIe et IXe siècles)." Annexes des Cahiers de Linguistique Hispanique Médiévale 11 (1997): 11-42.

Mattoso, José. In *História de Portugal, vol. 2: A Monarquia Feudal.* Edited by José Mattoso. Lisbon: Editorial Estampa, 1997.

Mattoso, José. "Livros de Linhagens." In Dicionário da literatura medieval galega e portuguesa, edited by Giulia Lanciani and Giuseppe Tavani, 419-21. Lisbon: Editorial Caminho, 1993.



Mattoso, José. "A transmissão textual dos livros de linhagens," "A nobreza medieval portuguesa (séculos X a XIV)," and "O triunfo da monarquia portuguesa: 1258-1264. Ensaio de história política." In Naquele tempo. Ensaios de história medieval, edited by José Mattoso, 267-83, 287-310, 515-45. Lisbon: Círculo de Leitores/Temas e Debates, 2011.

Miranda, José Carlos, "A Introdução à Versão Galego-Portuguesa da Crónica de Castela (A2a): Fontes e Estratégias." In Seminário Medieval 2007-2008, edited by Maria do Rosário Ferreira, Ana Sofia Laranjinha, and José Carlos Miranda, 61-98. Porto: Estratégias Criativas, 2009.

Miranda, José Carlos, and Maria do Rosário Ferreira. "O projeto de escrita de Pedro de Barcelos." População e Sociedade 23 (2015): 25-43.

O'Callaghan, Joseph. The Learned King: The Reign of Alfonso X of Castile. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993.

Oliveira, António Resende de. "O genealogista e as suas linhagens: D. Pedro, Conde de Barcelos." e-Spania 11 (2011). doi:10.4000/e-spania.20374.

Pizarro, José Augusto de Sotto Mayor. "A Coroa e a Aristocracia em Portugal (sécs. XII-XV): Uma relação de serviço?" In Discurso, memoria y representación: la nobleza peninsular en la Baja Edad Media, 141-76. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2016.

Pizarro, José Augusto de Sotto Mayor. D. Dinis. 2nd ed. Lisbon: Temas e Debates, 2012.

Pizarro, José Augusto de Sotto Mayor. "The Participation of the Nobility in the Reconquest and in the Military Orders." e-Journal of Portuguese History 4, no. 1 (2006). https://www.brown.edu/ Departments/Portuguese Brazilian Studies/ejph/html/Summer06.html.

Rei, António. Memória de espaços e espaços de memória: de Al-Râzî a D. Pedro de Barcelos. Lisbon: Edições Colibri, 2008.

Rucquoi, Adeline. "Les Wisigoths fondement de la 'nation Espagne'." In L'Europe héritière de l'Espagne wisigothique, edited by Jacques Fontaine and Christine Pellistrandi, 342-52. Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 1992. http://books.openedition.org/cvz/2150.

Salgado Loureiro, José Ángel. "La Crónica abreviada de don Juan Manuel en la historiografía postalfonsí." Historiografías 18 (2019): 91-111.

Silva, Tiago João Queimada e. "Metamorfoses de um guerreiro: Afonso Henriques na cronística medieval." Master's thesis, Universidade de Coimbra, 2011.

Sousa, Bernardo Vasconcelos e. D. Afonso IV. Lisbon: Temas e Debates, 2009.

Tolan, John. Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination. New York: Columbia University Press, 2002.

Ward, Aengus. "Review of 'Rodericus' romanzado en los reinos de Aragón, Castilla y Navarra, by Diego Catalán and Enrique Jerez." eHumanista 7 (2006): 207-12.

Ward, Aengus. "Yo uno solo non ualo mas que otro omne: el rey Wamba en la historiografía de la Baja Edad Media." e-Spania 5 (June 2008). doi:10.4000/e-spania.11963.

Wolf, Kenneth Baxter. "An Asturian Chronicler and the Muslims." In Conquerors and Chroniclers of Early Medieval Spain, edited by Kenneth Baxter Wolf, 39-49. 2nd ed. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2011.