# KPOW, CHINK, SPLAT:
## Translations of Sound Effects
## in Seven Comics

Vilma Kokko
MA thesis
University of Turku
School of Languages
and Translation Studies
Department of English;
English Translation and Interpreting
May 2013

---

Tämä pro gradu -tutkielma käsittelee äänitehosteiden kääntämistä sarjakuvissa. Tutkimus perustuu seitsemän eri sarjakuvan äänitehosteiden ja niiden suomennoksien vertailuun. Tutkitut tehosteet on kerätty yhdeksi korpukseksi kolmesta *Aku Ankka* -tarinasta, *Tenavat-* ja *Lassi ja Leevi* -stripeistä sekä *Batman-* ja *Vartijat-* sarjakuvaromaaneista. Sarjakuvat edustavat osittain eri genrejä, jotta saadaan tietoa erityyppisten sarjakuvien mahdollisesti erilaisista käännöskonventioista. *Aku Ankka* -sarjakuvien määrää on painotettu, jotta olisi mahdollista saada tarkempi kuva yhdestä yksittäisestä sarjakuvasta, jossa oletetaan äänitehosteiden pääsääntöisesti olevan käännettyjä.

Äänitehosteita ja äänitehostekäännöksiä tutkitaan kahdesta eri näkökulmasta. Tutkielman ensimmäisessä osassa tarkastellaan äänitehosteissa käytettyjä käännösstrategioita ja etsitään seikkoja, jotka vaikuttavat eri käännösstrategioiden käyttöön ja tehosteiden kääntämiseen tai kääntämättä jättämiseen. Kaindlin (1999) esittelemää sarjakuvien käännösstrategiajaottelua verrataan Celottin (2008) kuvaan upotettuihin teksteihin soveltuviin käännösstrategioihin. Näiden pohjalta muokattua jaottelua käytetään käännösten analysointiin.

Korpuksessa yleisimmin käytetyt käännösstrategiat olivat alkutekstin siirtäminen sellaisenaan käännökseen ja kääntäminen suomalaiseksi ilmaisuksi. Jonkin verran esiintyi myös tehosteiden poistoja, siirtämisiä ja jopa lisäyksiä. Paljon muutoksia tapahtui myös esimerkiksi tehosteiden ulkoasussa. Sarjakuvan tyyppi vaikutti oletusten mukaisesti käännösstrategioihin; selvimmin aikuisille suunnatuissa sarjakuvissa paljon tehosteita oli jätetty kääntämättä, kun taas erityisesti *Aku Ankoissa* tehosteidenkin käännöksiin oli kiinnitetty huomiota. Myös tehosteen sijainti puhekuplassa, kuplan ulkopuolella tai kuvaan upotettuna vaikutti siihen, oliko tehoste käännetty vai ei.

Tutkimuksen toisessa osassa äänitehosteet jaotellaan semanttisen sisältönsä mukaan seuraaviin ryhmiin: iskut, rikkoutuminen, räjähdykset ja ampuminen, hankaus, ilmavirta, ruoka ja nesteet, pitkäkestoiset äänet sekä äänenkorkeudeltaan selvästi korkeat ja matalat äänet. Jaotteluperusteina toimivat äänten kuvaamat tapahtumat, äänen syntymiseen osallistuvat materiaalit tai äänitehosteiden itsensä ominaisuudet. Ryhmien esimerkeistä löytyi yhteisiä piirteitä, jotka selittynevät samanlaisten äänten samanlaisella äännesymboliikalla tai samankaltaisilla onomatopoeettisilla piirteillä.


Asiasanat: kääntäminen, sarjakuvat, äänitehosteet, äännesymboliikka, äänen matkiminen

# Table of contents

**List of abbreviations**

AA:     *Aku Ankka* magazine
DDB:   *The Secret of Atlantis* by Carl Barks
DDR1: *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never* by Don Rosa
DDR2: *The Cowboy Captain of the Cutty Sark* by Don Rosa
PEA:    *Peanuts* by Charles M. Schulz
C&H:   *Calvin and Hobbes* by Bill Watterson
BAT:    *Batman: Year One* by Frank Miller and David Mazzucchelli
WM:     *Watchmen* by Alan Moore and Dave Gibbons

**List of tables**

## 1 Introduction

Comics have established their place in the academic discourse as an interesting subject of study. They have been examined from different angles, with focus falling mostly on the comics themselves and their means of expression, their history, or on their role in society (Herkman, 1996). Research on the sound effects of comics in the Finnish academic discussion is scarce, however, and the translation of comics deserves further attention in Finland because a great number of foreign comics are read in the country.

This thesis attempts to fill this gap in the Finnish research on comics through a case study of the sound effects of seven different comics and their Finnish translations. The study deals with a sample of comics from different genres, and it includes three different *Donald Duck* stories, strips from *Calvin and Hobbes* and *Peanuts*, and parts of the longer stories of *Batman* and *Watchmen*. The sound effects were gathered into a corpus which was subsequently examined from two different angles. Firstly, the overall translation strategies applied to the sound effects are analysed using a modified version of Kaindl's (1999) typology of translation procedures in comics, with the relevant strategies being here '*repetitio*', '*deletio*', '*adiectio*', '*substitutio*', '*transmutatio*', and 'translation'. The effects of the genre of a comic and the location of a sound effect inside or outside speech balloons on how and if they are translated are examined and discussed. Secondly, individual sound effects from the corpus are categorised based on their semantic content and examined from the point of view of sound symbolism. Based on similar features shared by several effects in a category, possible ways of expressing certain meanings through the use of certain sounds and combinations of sounds are suggested.

In order to establish the subject of this study properly, comics are first introduced, defined, and examined in some detail. Examining comics is necessary in order to recognise any characteristics which may have implications for the translation of comics. After this introduction into comics, the implications of the characteristics are discussed in closer detail specifically from the point of view of translation. Comics-specific translation problems and strategies are introduced, and I formulate my own typology of translation strategies in comics for the purposes of this study. Because comics' sound

effects are the more narrow focus of this study, they are introduced and examined next. The aspects of onomatopoeia and sound symbolism are examined in the context of sound effects, and the exact definition of 'sound effect' in this study is specified. The discussion on comics, the translation of comics, and sound effects serves as a basis for the empirical case study, which is presented once the theoretical foundations are established.

## 2 Comics

### 2.1 Definition

Comics are published in many different forms; there are comics in newspapers, magazines, albums, and on the Internet, for instance. Their uses range from entertaining and advertising to informing and teaching. Thus, comics are an everyday phenomenon, and everyone knows what they are. Some features are recognised as the most integral parts of comics, and, if asked, most people would probably mention at least the use of both pictures and text to tell a story or a joke. Further details could include, for example, panels, speech balloons, a stereotypical cast of characters, and various kinds of conventional symbols to indicate such aspects as movement and emotions. Some of the elements mentioned above can be an important part of most comics, while others are optional. Even a comic without text can tell a story. Some more experimental comics, on the other hand, have reduced graphics to almost a minimum – with only punctuation marks as the illustration – giving the texts a much more important role in the entirety. Because of the variety of means that comics have for expressing themselves, it is important to first establish what can be classified as comics and what cannot. However, as the more experimental and imaginative of comics constantly remind us, it proves difficult to give an exact, comprehensive definition to comics, even though they are generally easily recognisable. Some definitions are discussed below in order to give an idea of what features are typically recognised as the defining elements of comics.

Because of its nature, semiotics (defined by the Oxford Dictionary of English (2005) as "[t]he science of communication studied through the interpretation of signs and symbols as they operate in various fields, esp. language") is interested in the topic of comics.

Gubern's description of comics in the Encyclopedia of Semiotics (2008) could be summarised as follows: "Spatial sequences formed by graphically separated but structurally related static images." In addition, comics "may integrate written messages in order to specify descriptive or narrative information and dialogues." These two quotes emphasise the importance of sequential images and regard text as an addition to picture, though Gubern's article as a whole recognises the important role of text in comics. In short, comics contain two or more connected, sequential pictures forming a whole which can be complemented by text. This coexistence of words and pictures is not only of interest to semioticians but is one of the main themes of research in the area.

Another description of comics is provided by Kaindl in his article on the translation of comics. He proposes the following working definition for the purposes of studying the translation of comics:

> Comics are narrative forms in which the story is told in a series of at least two separate pictures. The individual pictures provide context for one another, thus distinguishing comics from single-frame cartoons. Comics involve linguistic, typographic and pictorial signs and combinations of signs as well as a number of specific components such as speech-bubbles, speed lines, onomatopoeia etc., which serve particular functions. The form and use of these elements are subject to culture-specific conventions.
> (Kaindl, 1999: 264)

This definition certainly seems to serve its purposes, but it is not very short or concise. It provides a somewhat more comprehensive picture of the typical characteristics of comics and into what comics can express and how than the short quotes from Gubern. The number of pictures or panels is, again, important in distinguishing between comics and cartoons – and, indeed, almost any other pictures. It can be assumed that the concept of context is emphasized in the definition for the purposes of translation, but it is important to note nonetheless. A single comic strip can take for granted that readers know what happens in the strip in question, but it may also refer to previous events, characters, and repeated jokes in other strips of the same comic. Similarly, the reference to culture-specific conventions is probably included because of the translator's perspective, but while these culture-specific conventions exist, they are not crucial to defining comics. The definition also refers to several elements peculiar to comics, such as speed lines and speech balloons (here referred to as speech-bubbles). These means of expression are very important in comics and well worth mentioning, as comics use expressive devices rarely found in other forms of narration.

In addition to the two definitions mentioned above, another definition for comics well worth mentioning has been formed by the comics artist Scott McCloud (1993: 9), who has also studied comics from a theoretical point of view. He presents the following definition for comics: "Juxtaposed pictorial and other images in deliberate sequence, intended to convey information and/or to produce an aesthetic response in the viewer." Here, the previously mentioned elements of pictorial and written content, sequence and the conveying of information are present, and a possible aesthetic response is added to the definition.

The definitions discussed above indicate that a short definition that would be sufficiently accurate while being exclusive enough to include only the type of narration generally accepted as comics is rather difficult to form, even if McCloud appears to have quite efficiently condensed the important elements mentioned by most scholars studying the subject. Nonetheless, attempts to define the art form provide a basis for the discussion on what which elements are mandatory in comics and which are optional. Based on the discussion above, among the defining elements of comics is pictorial content, perhaps presented together with text and specific symbols or other iconic material. The pictorial elements form some type of sequence and must be linked somehow. Unlike for instance in films or animations, all of the pictures are simultaneously accessible and occupy a space of their own. Thus, the layout of the pictures must provide adequate information on the correct reading order, and the time taken to read the pictures may vary. Simultaneously, the connected pictures serve as context for each other, as mentioned above. The function of comics, on the other hand, is to convey a story or a mood. For the purposes of this thesis, the following synthesis based on the definitions introduced above could be used as a working definition: *comics are graphic narratives comprised of several separate, sequential images, which may use text and conventionalised symbols in completing the message of the images or replacing images. The layout and sequence of the pictures functions like metatext, guiding the reader's attention.* This should not be understood as a definitive or final definition, however, as comics come in various forms and experimental comics can break even the standards outlined above. In addition, webcomics may complicate matters further by making use of such devices as sound and animation, previously inaccessible to comics. In this thesis, however, the examined comics all come in printed form so the definition is sufficient in this context.

In addition to listing the central characteristics of comics, it is important to establish their place in the literary field, or to discuss their location between the two traditionally well-established mediums of fine arts and literature. This type of information does not necessarily form part of the definition, but it is necessary in forming a complete picture of what comics essentially are. Because art and literature have existed long before the modern comic, their statuses as separate forms of "high art" have been established long ago (see Manninen, 1996: 45-47). This may lead to problematic attitudes and approaches to comics, which integrate both, as sometimes the elements of text and picture are examined separately and judged individually rather than together. Obviously, ignoring their complex interplay may result in both appearing somehow defective and insufficient. This kind of an approach to comics has, for example, led to fears for children's language skills if comics are perceived to provide a "defective" example of language. In comics, however, words and pictures interact to create a new form of narration that should be analysed not only by the same means as images or texts but also from the viewpoint of the interaction between them. This is also why calling comics a literary genre is avoided in this thesis – it would be much more appropriate to speak of different genres within the comics medium: humorous, superhero, graphic novel, and so on.

It is also necessary to state that there seems to be no particular reason not to regard comics as a form of art but their role as entertainment cannot be questioned, either, so both terms are used in this paper without intending to take a stand on the value or status of comics. Unfortunately, the lack of respect for comics has, in some cases, led to comics being disregarded as an art form or a type of narrative. Not even all comics artists and writers hold their work in very high regard. The English term 'comics' has not been seen as very helpful in establishing the credibility of comics, either, and the term 'graphic novel' has sprung into being in order to shake the connotations of humour from this form of story-telling (Herkman, 1996 :17). Graphic novels, such as Neil Gaiman's *Sandman* series or Art Spiegelman's *Maus*, are intended to be more serious, respectable reading. They could be considered a kind of genre within comics – though it could justifiably be claimed that there are different genres even within the array of graphic novels – perhaps intended to be perceived as being nearer to the field of literature than the average comics. However, some people shun the term and see it as somehow artificial and forced.

## 2.2 The anatomy of comics

In order to combine the elements of picture and text comprehensibly, comics function according to certain rules. The pictorial content takes a noticeable role and is most commonly arranged to occupy the space by the means of 'panels' (also called 'boxes' or 'frames') (Eisner, 1990: 157). The outlines of the panels are typically called 'borders', and the empty spaces between panels are referred to as 'gutters' (*ibid*.). Dialogue, if any, is traditionally enclosed in 'balloons', or 'locugrams' in semiotic terms (Gubern, 2008), with different types of balloons for different kinds of sounds or dialogues, such as shouts, whispers or thoughts. Other textual components besides dialogue, such as narration, can be separated from the images in several different ways. Specific symbols are common and are used to express various meanings otherwise difficult to depict on paper, and even a blank space can bear an important function. The different elements clarify the composition of a comic but, more importantly, are also their means of expression, as they all serve their own purposes. While it is often difficult to strictly separate the different constituents that usually work seamlessly together, the different translation-relevant elements are grouped below as clearly as possible, keeping in mind the fact that they constantly overlap. Sound effects are among the components that combine elements from several of the categories introduced below. Pictures, texts and their combinations are discussed below in brief in order to give an idea of what kinds of elements a translator works with when translating comics. Layout and its components, such as panels, borders, balloons and gutters, are another essential element of comics, but they are relevant in this context only to the extent that some aspects of them affect sound effects and their translation. Balloons, for example, are relevant in the context of sound effects because effects may be enclosed within spaces very similar to balloons.

## 2.2.1 Layout and its components: from grids to balloons

The main components of layout are introduced here in brief. The grid of a comic indicates the reading order of its panels, and it can be manipulated in order to create different kinds of effects. Panels, gutters, balloons, and even the design of a whole page can manipulate the comic in several ways: for example, longer panels and wider gutters can extent the time events take; a binocular-shaped panel shows that a scene is viewed

6

from a distance through binoculars; cloudlike, wavy-edged or scalloped panels can be used in such unreal scenarios as dreams and flashbacks; bursts of emotion can be presented in panels with jagged outlines; and black-and-white or coloured pictures can be used to create different moods – or be used by different publications or publishers in different countries (Eisner, 1990: 25-36; McCloud, 1993 & 2006; Rota, 2008: 82). Differences in, for example, colouring and the size of the publication in different countries affect the translation process, with the effects also manifesting themselves in the context of sound effects. For example, the translations of *Calvin and Hobbes* vary in whether or not they are coloured instead of plain black-and-white, which appears to have had some impact on the translation of the sound effects (see section 5.2.1.2).

The components of layout can convey a lot of information in comics, but in this context, especially the balloons within the panels are of most relevance because they may contain sound effects. Speech balloons can come in several forms, and sometimes the shapes can indicate their reading order: several balloons containing dialogue of one speaker can be linked together in correct order in order to avoid having to add a tail to each of them separately, and such balloons can interact with other balloons to simulate discussion. Balloons have more functions than to merely serve as containers for text, however, and especially the lines delimiting them, called 'perigrams' by semioticians (Gubern, 2008), can be very expressive. A tone of voice can be presented with the help of the perigram; perigrams can present coldness of a voice with the help of icicles or flattery with dripping honey, for example. The system lends much character to a person's lines and reveals emotions better than plain text, and some information about volume is also visible in the perigram. These functions partly overlap with those of typography.

Different types of balloons show what types of sounds or dialogues they contain. Cloud-like thought and dream balloons, 'psychopictograms', can represent unvoiced text or inner dialogue (*ibid.*), while jagged perigrams often mean electronically conveyed or produced sound (Eisner, 1990: 27). These functions of a perigram make it highly useful for illustrating different types of effects, and onomatopoeia and other sound effects can sometimes be enclosed in different types of balloons, perhaps mimicking the sound in question or depicting the process that created them.

**2.2.2 Text**

As text and picture co-operate in comics, they can occur in several different combinations, and it is sometimes difficult, if not impossible, to distinguish between text and picture. A case in point is typography, which refers to the graphic form of a text – and is, consequently, separated into its own section in this chapter, along with some other borderline cases. Sound effects frequently balance on the border between picture and text because of their potentially close integration with the picture and their very visual presentation. Nonetheless, much of the text in comics is easy enough to differentiate from pictures, and much of it is separated from pictures with the help of different boxes and perigrams.

The following types of texts can be found in comics, according to Celotti (2008: 38-39): text inside balloons ('spoken language'), 'captions', 'titles' and 'linguistic paratext'. Kaindl's (1999: 273-274) list also includes 'onomatopoeia', and uses slightly different terms than Celotti, namely 'dialogue texts' for 'spoken language', 'narrations' for 'captions', and 'inscriptions' for 'linguistic paratext'. Despite the different terms, the main ideas behind the different concepts remain the same for both researchers. As the reference to balloons suggests, dialogue texts are usually enclosed in locugrams of some type or perhaps placed under the picture, while narrations or captions are often contained in boxes. They may indicate changes in time and place, make comments, or add to the message of the picture. Titles, as Kaindl (*ibid*.) says (citing Nord, 1993: 87) have a "distinctive function", and, in short, they serve the purposes of identification and quick reference. Linguistic paratexts or inscriptions are texts that form a part of a picture – for example, a picture of an open book can contain words, or a road sign can state place names. The corresponding terms are used synonymously in this thesis. 'Onomatopoeia' generally refers to imitative expressions and is discussed below in more detail in section 4.1.

Kaindl distinguishes between three types of onomatopoeia – "interjections, derivations of nouns or verbs and invented words, which are formed from vowels and consonants for their specific auditive quality" – without explaining them much further (1999: 274). The concept of onomatopoeia is not in line with his other types of linguistic signs in comics, however, as the others refer to quite specific types of texts with specific

8

locations and functions in a comic. In this context, I would prefer to replace Kaindl's 'onomatopoeia' with the non-verbal noises of a comic, excluding dialogue or narration, and call it by the umbrella term 'sound effect', which encompasses not only onomatopoeic expressions but also other types of sounds. Sound effects are discussed and examined in further detail in section 4.

As their name indicates, dialogue texts represent dialogue of some sort. Along with sound effects and narrations, they express sound and function like a sound track of a film. Besides indicating changes in time and place, narration has the power to describe moods or a person's otherwise inaccessible thoughts in a very packed form (Celotti, 2008: 38). Onomatopoeia and sound effects represent background noise and can provide the reader with information that is relevant to the story or helps create a certain atmosphere. A title, on the other hand, is the opening of a story.

Text's expressiveness in comics partially arises from its co-operation with pictures, so it is justified to study the relationships between the two elements more closely, especially when considering translation. The complicated relationship between pictures and words in comics has been described in several ways, two of which are introduced here. I would suggest that being aware of these connections helps a translator especially in cases where the translations are not obvious and the co-operation between text and picture makes the translating difficult due to cultural or language-specific conventions.

According to McCloud (2006: 130), text and pictures co-exist in the following types of combinations: word-specific, picture-specific, duo-specific, intersecting (previously called 'additive' by McCloud), interdependent, parallel and montage. In the first combination, words are illustrated by pictures and bear the information; in the second, informative pictures are accentuated by words; in the third, both deliver roughly the same message; and in the fourth, words and pictures work together while providing their own pieces of information. In an interdependent combination, the parts convey an idea together. A parallel combination, on the other hand, conveys two different messages simultaneously, while in a montage, words and pictures are combined pictorially. However, as Mikkonen points out, a panel can contain several types of combinations and the combinations work on different levels of abstraction (1996: 84). McCloud admits that they can occur simultaneously, but Mikkonen develops the

thought further by calling the intersecting and interdependent types general descriptions that can exist simultaneously and describe the other categories. He also emphasises the likely overlapping of the word-specific and picture-specific qualities of comics and mentions that parallel combinations are relatively rare exceptions.

Another attempt at clarifying the functions of text and picture in comics was made by Barthes in 1964 (cited in Celotti, 2008: 43). The division seems somewhat simpler than that of McCloud's, and Barthes uses just the French terms '*ancrage*' and '*relais*' to describe the functions of text in relation to picture. As Celotti explains, text can 'anchor' or determine the meaning of a polysemous image. While anchoring text helps interpret the meaning of an image, 'relaying' text and images are in a complementary relationship and contribute to the narration as a whole. According to Mikkonen (1996: 87), Barthes, too, accepts the fact that these functions can be fulfilled simultaneously. Other ways of describing the interaction between picture and word have been suggested by at least Fresnault-Deruelle (1972) and Tisseron (1987) (cited in *ibid*.), but they contain ideas somewhat similar to the previously introduced ones.

As a conclusion to the discussion on the interaction of picture and text, it could be stated that the relationship is complicated. It can be described in several ways, but in reality, panels are constantly mixing the different types of combinations. This is, therefore, one of the factors that grant comics a great freedom to narrate a story or a joke. Translators are also affected by this variety, being either bound or aided by the different means of expression. Much can be expressed through different emphases, and the choice of combination can affect the mood, emphasis, pace, concreteness, immediacy, familiarity and other aspects of the story (McCloud, 2006: 130-141).

### 2.2.3 Pictures and icons

Pictorial content could be argued to be the most important means of expression in comics. Pictures have the power to express meanings and convey moods. The choices of tools, techniques, styles and genres affect the entire comic, and choices on the amount of details, cast of characters, backgrounds, different perspectives and levels of abstraction are important in all drawing and visual arts.

Other forms of visual art have been in the centre of attention for much longer than comics, and the wealth of research on visual arts will not be discussed here. It suffices to say that the function of representational art, as opposed to abstract or symbolical art, is to depict and show something. Simply put, in comics, too, pictures mostly show while words tell. Here, I will focus on one of the pictorial devices very typically used in comics: iconic material.

Iconic or symbolic material functions on different levels of abstraction, and pictures or icons can represent objects and concepts without having to look like them – on condition that people are familiar with them. Icons are common in comics. They are also one of the essential elements of comics, and many of the icons used in comics are not regularly used outside the medium. They can capture many aspects of a situation, such as speed, movement, feelings, states and sensory information. Movement and its direction and other qualities are depicted through such means as speed lines (McCloud, 1993: 110-113). A movement's impact on its environment, too, can be expressed with the help of clouds of dust, jagged lines at the point of impact or other similar devices (Eisner, 1990: 150). Even different kinds of sensory information can be surprisingly well conveyed merely through the sense of sight. Symbols and icons can also provide a glimpse into a person's internal world, and a number of symbols have been developed for expressing emotions. Different states of mind, such as confusion or intoxication, can be indicated with certain symbols, such as hearts, stars, birds or planets revolving around a person's head or popping bubbles rising from a character (McCloud, 1993: 127-128). In short, symbols are highly expressive when the knowledge of their meaning is shared by the artist and the reader. They help stretch the limits of what moods and stories comics can convey to include at least the physical and mental states of characters as well as some movement and dynamism, and they affect the metaphorical dimensions of comics. Interestingly, similar silent states of mind can be expressed with the help of sound effects especially in Japanese *manga*. Those not familiar with these conventions usually require an explanation from the translator to understand the message.

## 2.2.4 Between pictures and text: typography and borderline cases

In comics, there are numerous cases where it is difficult to distinguish between text and picture and more examples still of elements that arguably are neither, such as detached punctuation marks and grawlixes (see below). Some elements, such as typography, are most appropriately studied as a group of their own. Typography involves visual and textual elements in such a way that it is impossible to classify typography into either of the two categories.

Distinctive typography can be found especially in sound effects, but dialogue can also benefit greatly from it. Its functions are, as already stated, partly similar to those of perigrams. The size and font of the lettering or the lines with which they are printed or drawn can describe the quality of a voice. For example, loudness is easily indicated by size, boldness and tilt of the text in addition to exclamation marks (McCloud, 2006: 147). Timbre, or the quality of a sound, for example its roughness, waviness, sharpness or fuzziness, can be indicated through the typography. In addition, McCloud mentions the variable of association, which can be evoked through "font styles and shapes that refer to or mimic the source of the sound" (*ibid*.). Kaindl (1999: 274) mentions that movement, directionality and speed can be indicated through the lettering. Emotion and mood, too, can be evoked through typography (*e.g.* Eisner, 1990: 12). Bold lettering in dialogue, on the other hand, is often used for emphasis, especially in American comics (*e.g. ibid.*: 152). In a further example, different fonts have been used in *Astérix* comics to indicate languages, nationalities or origins, with Germanic fonts for Gothic speakers, hieroglyphs for Egyptians and so forth (Kaindl, 1999:274). In such a case, the font contributes to the speaker's character and allows the reader to identify individual characters as members of a single group without any further explanation. Sadly, the typographical possibilities can sometimes be almost completely ignored. In Germany in the 1950s, for example, attempts to increase the status of comics led to texts being written in typescript, not handlettering (Kaindl, 1999: 272).

As already emphasised, typography is not the only element of comics where it is difficult to separate picture from text. Profanities are one such case, too. In many comics, swear words are replaced with a string of hand-drawn or printed symbols, for example #$&@. Unofficially known as 'grawlixes' (*World Wide Words* website, 2008),

these institutionalised symbols represent swear words in text, and they can function in the same way as text or letters in this context. They are, however, not letters in the traditional sense as they do not represent sounds and resemble other icons in comics considerably. They are a part of the language of comics – and difficult to classify as text or icons. Another example of borderline cases is the use of the punctuation marks ! and ? (McCloud, 1993: 134). They can be placed either directly into pictures or speech balloons, often around or near a person's head, for example, to indicate puzzlement or realisation. In addition, sleeping is often indicated by a series of Zs and a row of full stops can represent a meaningful silence. These and all the previous elements are a part of comics' expressiveness, but they can mean more work for the translator.

## 2.3 Previous research

Much of the research on comics takes a multidisciplinary approach to the subject, and comics have been studied within many different disciplines, such as sociology and translation studies. According to Herkman (1996: 24-25), the following three aspects of comics have been of most interest to researchers: the history of comics, comics in society, and the means of expression of comics. Several of these topics and aspects may be used in a single study, and they are by no means separate – nor do they rule each other out. My main focus here is on the means of expression, sound effects in particular. The translation of comics in general can be related to the role of comics in society when considering, for instance, what is translated and why or how much it is altered and in what ways. The different points of view and disciplines involved in the different types of studies are briefly introduced below, together with information on what the different fields of study typically focus on.

### 2.3.1 History of comics

According to Herkman (*ibid.*), studies on the history of comics are perhaps the most common type of comics research and they may focus on a particular series, artist or genre or on comics in general. History, however, is always written from some point of view and is never completely neutral, which can easily be seen from the studies on comics as well. For instance, it is surprisingly easy to find contradictory statements on

various subjects on the history of comics, such as which the first comics were and when they were made. McCloud (1993: 17), for example, cites Rodolphe Töpffer as the creator of the first modern comics but also describes considerably older works, such as a pre-Columbian picture manuscript from the 16<sup>th</sup> century and the Bayeux tapestry depicting the Norman conquest of the 11<sup>th</sup> century (*ibid*.: 10-13), both showing actions by the means of sequential pictures, as comics. This is natural considering his definition of comics. Eisner (1990: 7), however, simply states that the first comics were published around 1934. A common suggestion is that the first comic published was *Yellow Kid* by Richard Outcault from 1896 (see *e.g.* Herkman, 1996: 13). There are numerous other suggestions as well, which reflects the ambiguity of this type of research.

It is understandable, then, that Herkman (*ibid*.: 27) raises some criticism concerning the research conducted in this field. One problem he highlights is that the research centres around the United States, though he states that it is natural for the American comics industry to be so well represented as it is one of the most visible ones. It is unfortunate, however, that comics from other countries that are influential in the field of comics do not receive an equal amount of attention. Some European countries and Japan, for example, have their own comics traditions that are worthy of attention. The Japanese *manga* and the typical Western comics are admittedly fairly different in both their form and their development, so it is understandable that they are not always dealt with in the same research. This thesis, too, examines only Western comics, translated from English into Finnish. In general, however, it is should be kept in mind that there are several different types of comics besides the traditional Western comics and that all of these deserve recognition.

Another problem Herkman sees in this type of research is a tendency to ignore women working in the field of comics (*ibid*.: 25-27). Whereas comics themselves can be filled with both very stereotypical men and very stereotypical women, the histories written about them seem to have focused on male artists to a much greater extent. Apparently, even the basic works on comics focus mostly on the men in the industry, despite the fact that women have also been prolific creators of comics. In short, there appears to be a tendency to concentrate on American comics and on male creators of comics in this type of research.

## 2.3.2 Role of comics in society

Herkman (*ibid*.: 24 & 28) lists psychology, sociology, pedagogics, economics and political science as the main disciplines studying comics as a societal phenomenon. The focus has been on the social and psychological effects of comics, and examples of this type of research are easy to find. Like most – if not all – new phenomena in popular culture directed at relatively young audiences, comics sparked off a lively debate in the 1950s on whether or not they had dangerous effects on their readers or on the surrounding society (Kauranen, 2008: 15). At first, it was believed that reading comics would result in defective linguistic skills, ethically dubious behavioural patterns, moral decay, and disregard for societal structures in the readers, mostly children, as well as negative foreign influences being introduced into a country (*ibid*.: 26).

The first quasi-scientific works written on the alleged dangers of the new form of narration were, as Kauranen (*ibid*.: 439) mentions, a beginning for more serious research on comics. They cannot, however, be regarded as real comics research for a rather simple reason: instead of using scientific methods to scrutinize comics or their relationship with their environment, the so-called research often simply made assumptions on the effects of comics on the young and the impressionable. *Seduction of the Innocent* by Fredric Wertham from 1953 is one of the works on comics' alleged effects on society and its members given as an example by Herkman (1996: 28-29). Another well-known example, also mentioned by Herkman, is *Para Leer al Pato Donald* (How to Read Donald Duck) from 1971. This Chilean statement is clearly Marxist, and its main goal was to uncover and explore the societal and economic ideologies behind Disney comics from its own point of view (*ibid*.).

The first studies affected the comics industry considerably. In the US, the discussion raised by the critical commentaries, especially by the work *Seduction of the Innocent*, led to the creation of the Comics Code, which dictated what kinds of topics comics were allowed to depict and what was considered improper and not to be printed. The original code from 1954 included, for instance, guidelines for how to represent criminals and police officers, and such instructions as "in every instance good shall triumph over evil" (*Lambiek* website 1). The restrictions even prohibited or discouraged using the words 'crime', 'horror' and 'terror' in the titles of comics magazines. Similarly, comics were

15

not allowed to show, for example, crime in too much detail or depict it in an understanding or admiring light, nor contain such scary elements as torture, vampires, cannibalism and 'werewolfism'. Sexually explicit – or implicit – content and, in general, almost any behaviour then considered immoral or abnormal was also prohibited. Publishers let their comics publications be inspected by the Comics Magazine Association of America's (CMAA) Comics Code Authority (CCA). This was, however, theoretically voluntary as the CCA had no legal authority to enforce the Comics Code. Similarly, Finnish publishers, among others, performed some "quality control" themselves but escaped having to conform to official restrictions (Kauranen, 2008: 442). In other words, self-censorship emerged from the discussion and affected a large part of the comics industry. Small underground publishers rebelled, however, ignoring the restrictions and developing their own styles, and comics, in fact, continued evolving even under the restrictions (Herkman, 1996: 28).

The strict regulations from over fifty years ago serve as a reminder of the fears and attitudes surrounding comics at the time. However, the attitudes towards comics and the amount of respect for them have changed considerably since the 1950s. Comics are gaining more prestige as an art form, a form of entertainment, and a research subject even in America, and with such new factors as graphic novels and *manga* in the comics field, there is now variation and selection in the market. In some countries, comics have been quite respected for long before – in France, for example, they are called *le neuvième art*, 'the ninth art'. Thus, on the whole, comics enjoy a rather good status and have established their place among the other, more traditional media and art forms. The new research on the societal effects of comics, too, now focuses more on the positive effects of this form of popular culture, with a more scientific approach than its predecessors. In short, the newly found respect for comics has led to changes in the motivation and approaches of comics research.

### 2.3.3 Means of expression in comics

Unlike the other two main trends in the research of comics, the third one introduced here focuses mainly on comics themselves. Different means of expression peculiar to comics are used to deliver a message, and these means are a fairly popular subject of

study. The previously described co-existence of words and pictures has led to comics using their own, distinctive language. As mentioned, semiotics is one of the disciplines that have successfully applied its methods to studying this aspect of comics. Different disciplines examining the relation of text and pictures in general can be applied to comics, and translation studies, for example, can certainly benefit from such research. My research on the sound effects of comics and their translation mainly falls into this category.

Even though semiotics itself does not focus solely on comics, it has spawned studies concerning only them. Comics are an ideal subject for semiotic studies as, without going into further detail, the main idea of the discipline is to study different phenomena from the point of view of signs and sign systems (Barthes, 1988: 9, 95). Herkman (1996: 30-31) presents the following well-known examples of some of the first semiotic studies on comics: Umberto Eco's studies of different comics from the 1960s, *La bande dessinée. L'univers et les techniques de quelques "comics" d'expression française* by Pierre Fresnault-Deruelle from 1972, and *Comics lesen. Untersuchungen zur Textualität von Comics* by Ulrich Krafft from 1978. While the study on comics' means of expression already began in the 1960s in Europe, the first comics-centred works written in English were published in the 1980s and were not yet on the same level of sophistication as some of the earlier studies (*ibid*.). As semioticians became interested in the topic, serious research on comics became more common and scholars began contributing to the particular research area.

Will Eisner and Scott McCloud are perhaps the best-known contributors to comics research in English. Eisner's *Comics and Sequential Art* from 1985, drawing from the author's experience as an artist and a teacher in the field of comics (Eisner, 1990: 5-6), is a well-known and much-read book that has provided inspiration for later research. Scott McCloud, among others, was acquainted with the work before creating his own analysis on comics, published under the title *Understanding Comics. The Invisible Art* in 1993. As another comics professional, McCloud developed some of the Eisner's ideas further and presented fresh ideas that would, in turn, often be quoted and discussed (Herkman, 1996: 31). Many of the ideas are still considered to hold their ground and serve as a basis for much of the current research, including parts of this thesis.

Despite semioticians' efforts to understand and study comics, Herkman (*ibid:* 32) mentions that the current semiotic studies have been criticised for looking at the subject from too narrow a perspective. He points out that post-structuralists have found it to be a considerable weakness that the studies focus on the expressiveness of comics but tend to forget the reader's role in interpreting the message. The idea of Barthes, for example, is that the text means nothing in itself if it is not read and that the relationship between the reader and the text should thus be studied properly as well (*ibid.*). It appears, however, that research that takes into account the different aspects related to publishing and audience is still scarce (*ibid.*). Translation studies, however, deal with these topics frequently.

## *3 Comics in translation*

Whether or not comics are considered a 'genre' of literature, as Kaindl (1999: 264) suggests, or an art form of their own, they are undoubtedly a unique combination of word and picture. This means that they also require the translator to acknowledge the aspects discussed above in section 2.2 in order to make the combination of different elements function properly in the foreign language version of a comic as well.

The translation of comics involves not only transferring written material into another language but also negotiating pictorial content and all other material with the new environment of the target culture. As such, the translation of comics can be viewed from two angles: a linguistic point of view and a more holistic perspective. The linguistic aspect is focused on more in the later chapters of this thesis, which discuss sound effects in comics, but a more holistic perspective is also applied when examining what factors affect the choice of leaving a sound effect untranslated. The role of the different yet intertwined components of comics is crucial in the translation process because the non-linguistic content is as important as, if not even more important than, the textual elements in comics. This is why the non-linguistic aspects of adjusting and transferring a comic into the new target culture are examined before proceeding into the actual translation problems in comics.

Before a translator starts working on a comic, some general decisions must be made not

only on which comics are translated but also on how and to what degree the comic is adjusted to the target culture. It is up to the publisher or translator to decide for each comic what has to be omitted or changed to comply with target culture norms and standards, company policies, and financial factors. Factors that may lead to changes are, for example, a need for political correctness, an aversion to paying royalties, and strong local conventions on what comics are expected to look like. Examples of the changes brought about by the aforementioned factors are Lucky Luke's cigarette being turned into a blade of grass in the Swedish version of the comic in order to make it more "proper", the name of Groucho Marx being switched to Felix coupled with the deletion of the characteristic moustache in the fear of violating copyrights in the American version of *Dylan Dog*, and the adaptation of foreign comics into the typical publishing format of the French comic tradition (Celotti, 2008: 36). Each country's tradition not only determines what kind of comics translations are produced in and brought into the country in question but also affects what kind of adjustments are deemed necessary in the translation process.

As can be seen from the examples above, changes take place on several levels. A radical change takes place when a comic is moulded into a different shape to suit a different format of publishing, with the division of panels into pages being disrupted, among other alterations. A notable change on a more local level is when the imagery of a comic is retouched, a change which can, as the aforementioned omission of the cigarette, have a significant effect on the overall tone of the comic. Finally, changes can take place on a textual level. Such changes are hardly a surprise, and they do not always need to be as radical as the example of completely erasing a clear reference to a well-known person and changing the identity of the character in the comic.

Clearly, many aspects must be considered when introducing a comic into a new market. Because of the complexity of the process and the many changes involved, it is necessary to consider the translation of comics as a more holistic process of editing and adjusting than simply transferring the text sections into another language. Since several factors not related to translation come into play, the translation of comics could be in some ways be compared to the process of 'localisation' in the field of IT (see *e.g.* Dunne, 2006, for more on localisation). Even though the term 'localisation' is primarily used in the context of IT, in software localisation for example, and the definition involves the

aspect of digital content, the list of what localisation involves resembles what is done in comics, as well. It involves "(a) translation of textual content into the language and textual conventions of the target locale; and (b) adaptation of non-textual content (from colors, icons and bitmaps, to packaging, form factors, etc.)" (Dunne, 2006: 4). Colours, icons and packaging of an IT product could be equated with the colours, the pictorial content – for example symbolic material and typography – and the publication format of a comic.

There are other parallels between the processes, too. Dunne explains that localisation involves numerous different factors ranging from marketing and management to various sales strategies and corporate legal counsel (2006: 2). Some of these are applicable to the process of transferring a comic into a new market: First of all, there are often sales to consider – a comic is unlikely to be translated if nobody is going to buy it in the target culture, while a comic considered to be good for business may be hurried into the market for quick profit and without much adjustment, which may leave the new version somewhat unfinished. Secondly, marketing might require a product to be adjusted to the tastes of the target audience, and, finally, copyrights should not be infringed. Some problems in the process of localisation can also be shared by the process of transferring comics into another culture. For instance, different actors may be unaware of the importance or impact of factors outside their own domain, for example when "[e]xecutives as well as sales and marketing personnel are often unaware of the ways in which linguistic, legal, and cultural issues can impact on a product's usability, image, and even legality" (*ibid.*) or when translators are not aware of the sales aspects or the motives of the localisation process.

Even though Finnish publishers remain relatively faithful to the original work, for example publishing most comic albums in their original shape and size, many types of changes commonly take place in the process of bringing a comic into a different market. Thus, because 'translation', while by no means being a simple task, is generally understood as the translation of text, it can sometimes prove to be too narrow a term for describing the whole process which takes place before a comic is published in a new market for a new target audience – involving not only the translation of the text but also for example changing the publication's size and retouching the pictures. For the purposes of this thesis, when it is necessary to make a distinction between the transfer of

text and everything that is involved in the transfer of the the entire product into a new culture, the terms 'translation' and 'localisation' are used respectively. This thesis focuses, nonetheless, more on the translation process than on the localisation process because textual elements are taken under scrutiny. Localisation also includes, however, many processes that originate from outside the (visual) text of the product itself. The "translation" of pictures is more closely associated with the translation of text than with the production process. This is why the word 'editing' is sometimes more appropriate when referring to changing pictorial and other non-textual material.

## 3.1 The combination of word and picture

One of the factors making it hard to distinguish the translation of text from a more extensive editing of the comic is the previously mentioned close connection between picture and text in comics, manifesting itself in such aspects as typeface and sound effects. For example, pictures interfere with writing in the case of highly visual sound effects and text with picture in the case of linguistic paratext. Ideally, then, the translation process of a comic would involve extracting all textual material, even from the pictures and sound effects, translating it in the spirit of the original, and re-inserting it into the picture in a similar graphic form.

While visual elements can combine with text, language may invade pictures even in other forms besides sound effects. A good example of this can be found in *Astérix*. The French expression "*voir trente-six chandelles*" ("to see 36 candles") refers to something quite familiar from the world of comics: the state of confusion and pain caused by a blow to the head (Robert, 2007: 392). Its English counterpart 'to see stars' is fairly similar to the French expression, but the difference can be crucial: in comics from the Anglo-American tradition stars are drawn around a person's head, but in *Obélix et Compagnie* (Goscinny & Uderzo, 1976: 11), candles take the place of stars. In this case, a linguistic expression has affected the drawing on a more complex level than simply being embedded in the picture, as sound effects commonly are. It does not necessarily have to affect a translator's task, but it might be necessary to add an explanatory footnote to the comic. Otherwise, in this type of a situation, altering the relevant graphics might be in order.

The interplay between visual and textual language has received due attention in scholarly debate. There are several alternative approaches to the matter, however. Many sources name the translation of comics as a form of 'constrained translation' (*e.g.* Grun & Dollerup, 2003; Valero Garcés, 2000). The concept of constrained translation refers to situations in which spatial factors affect the translation process. Introduced by Titford (1983) and further discussed by, among others, Mayoral, Kelly and Gallardo (1988), constrained translation theory takes non-linguistic aspects of translation much more into account than traditional text-centred approaches, which makes it highly applicable in the context of comics and many forms of audio-visual translation.

Valero Garcés points out that both quantitative and qualitative constraints are present in comics (2000: 77). On one hand, the space available is limited. On the other hand, the pictures and other non-linguistic elements restrict how far the text can deviate from the original text or, rather, how much it can deviate from the meaning conveyed by the other, non-linguistic content. Again, the complicated interplay of picture and text is apparent. Stretching the definition of constrained translation, Grun and Dollerup add into the equation the aspect of comics as serving a specific objective (2003: 198). In other words, requirements originating from outside the comic's 2D form can also be limiting factors in the translation process. These requirements are imposed by the conventions of a particular genre or expectations of a publisher, for example. However, Grun and Dollerup only mention the requirement of humour or, possibly, light entertainment as one of these external factors, as does Valero Garcés. In the case of such ambitious and serious graphic novels as *Watchmen* by Moore and Gibbons or *Maus* by Spiegelman, the references to humour are incorrect and a wider range of external requirements must be recognised.

A very theoretical and complicated view into constrained translation is introduced by Mayoral, Kelly and Gallardo (1988: 359). The terminology used reflects the jargon used in transmitting signals, with message being equated with signal, and includes such terms as 'noise', 'redundancy' (terms dating back to a 1948 mathematical model of communication by Shannon and Weaver) and several types of 'synchrony'. To keep the explanation relatively short and understandable, only the concept of synchrony is examined further as it is of most relevance here. Synchrony, or "the agreement between signals emitted for the purpose of communicating the same message" (*ibid*.), exists in

its various forms as defined by Mayoral, Kelly and Gallardo:

> *synchrony of time*: agreement in time of different signals which communicate a unit of information,
> *spatial synchrony*: the signal [*sic*] occupy either more or less space than that which corresponds to them,
> *content synchrony*: the meanings transmitted by different signals contradict neither each other the whole message [*sic*],
> *phonetic synchrony*: synchrony of sound signals of spoken dialogue with the visible speech movements on the screen,
> *character synchrony*: the harmony between the image of the character and his or her voice and words.
> (Mayoral, Kelly & Gallardo, 1988: 359)

Except for phonetic synchrony and to some extent synchrony of time, all of the above are arguably relevant to comics. The different types of synchrony show what aspects must be taken into consideration in the translation of comics, too. In order to achieve synchrony, the translated text must be in line with other visual information and in its correct place, take only as much space as is available, and be in line with how its source – human or non-human – would articulate it. The concept of content synchrony is connected to what Valero Garcés mentions about qualitative constraints – text is limited in how much it can deviate from the original meaning because it must not contradict other messages. Synchrony of time and spatial synchrony are similar to Valero Garcés' quantitative constraints. Simply put, the constrained translation approach asserts that the text that is translated in a comic must not contradict the images and other non-textual content of the comic.

Even though the constrained translation approach appears valid and has frequently been adopted in the context of comics, it also has its critics. The problem mainly lies in the restraining and, in general, complicating role attributed to the non-verbal elements – an aspect very centrally visible even in the choice of the term '*constrained* translation'.

According to Zanettin (2009: 39), words are usually seen and treated as subordinate to images in the academic discussion on comics. Simultaneously, the discussion mainly appears to centre around text. The focus shifts to non-verbal elements only when they complicate the translation of textual content. This is seen as a problem, and Zanettin (*ibid.*) warns against this kind of an approach that assumes pictures as a constraint or a hindrance, a point also reflected in the work of several other researchers. Celotti, for example, describes a positive step that has been taken "away from the constrained

translation approach" towards a more positive thinking in which the visual message is
"'read" together with the verbal language in order to grasp the globality of meanings'
(Celotti, 2008: 34). In general, pictures are a resource rather than a constraint as they
support and enrich the text and serve their part in carrying the storyline. More strongly
put, the text and its message are not complete without the pictures and other non-
linguistic content.

Zanettin's warnings against seeing pictures as a mere hindrance are also backed up by
the technical fact that pictorial content is by no means untouchable but, instead,
frequently modified, with the modifications ranging from omitting whole pages to
redrawing panels (2009: 39). In short, the need for strict adherence to the various types
of synchrony in comics is not as straightforward as it may first seem. In a difficult
situation, it is also possible to change the visual content, not just text. The fact that
pictures in comics can be retouched, as displayed with more examples below, finally
refutes the idea that textual content is restrained by the other content of comics in
translation.

In practice, however, it is very natural that the research on the translation of comics
becomes text-centred and problem-oriented. The translator is, after all, primarily
assumed to work with text, and research on translations is traditionally about text, with
text being the focus of translation. The warnings against forgetting pictorial content or,
on the other hand, seeing it only as a problematic companion to text are quite justified.
In the translations in my corpus, for example, there are several justified omissions of
sound effects which would not be possible without the presence and support of the
visual content. Completely ignoring the difficulties stemming from the importance of
non-linguistic elements in comics, however, is not justifiable, either. If mainly – or only
– text is translated, the other, non-linguistic components of the message remain
relatively unaltered but are still closely attached. In such a situation, some mismatch is
only to be expected.

The strategies used to cope with such a complicated situation are, naturally, numerous.
The images can be retouched in several ways for different reasons in addition to the text
being altered. The changes can be fairly subtle but potentially essential to the success of
the translation. Some of them hardly have anything to do with the translation of the text

but are modifications deemed necessary for other reasons, perhaps to adapt a comic to the target culture conditions. Grun and Dollerup provide an analysis of the visual changes made into a single page of a 1950 and a 1969 Danish translation of Carl Barks' *Donald Duck* story (2003: 205-209). Even a brief look into such a limited material reveals different changes and motives behind the changes.

To summarise what can be seen from the changes that Grun and Dollerup have identified in the finished localisation of the comic, there appear to be various reasons for altering the comic: Firstly, the opening panel contains many changes probably because of the title which takes up a lot space in the panel – changing the title is bound to affect its environment, too. This is an example of how the "oppression" of the picture has been overcome in a rather straightforward way, by changing the picture. Secondly, an apparently conscious choice of transferring the comic to a different season (from a mild American winter to a Nordic autumn) has affected the colouring of the whole comic and is emphasised by specifically mentioning September in the lines of a character. Here, the foreign setting has been domesticated and turned into a more local setting that does not confuse the reader and draw their attention away from the story. Thirdly, a "mistake" has been spotted in one panel and corrected in the localisation, as a horizon that ends in the middle of a panel in the original comic continues all the way through it in the Danish version. Lastly, some changes have been made without any apparent reason. For example, speech balloons have been re-drawn but do not really fit the translation, and some parts of the picture have been altered or left out entirely.

As can be seen from the discussion above, the localisation of a comic involves a lot more than just translating text, which also shows how the translation of comics is not so constrained, after all. However, major changes may not always be possible in comics, and all translation has its problems.

## 3.2 Problems of translating comics

Because the translation of text in comics shares many of its features with translation in general, only the translation problems highly characteristic of comics in particular are discussed in this section. Many types of problems are addressed in the academic

discussion on translating comics. There have been, first of all, purely technical issues involved in the process. Zanettin (2009: 39) explains that technical factors were a real hindrance at least in the time before computers – back then, removing and replacing text was a labour-intensive task consisting of scraping off content from the original pictures and replacing them by hand. He points out that more work would have meant a more expensive comic, and changing graphics such as sound effects would perhaps have been perceived as much too costly. Nowadays, retouching pictures in computer files is both much easier and much cheaper, which makes more comprehensive adjustment much easier, as becomes evident from the discussion in the previous section.

Other possible issues that arise from outside the translated text are brought up by Valero Garcés (2000: 77). Firstly, the translator may only work with and make changes to the text, not the surrounding picture. Secondly, the translator may only have access to the text of the comic without seeing the context, though Valero Garcés does not mention how common this method is and when it is used. There may be differences between methods not only in different countries but also in different publishing houses, for instance.

The text of a comic is what the translator ultimately works with, however. It is where the problems are realised, even if they stem from reasons beyond the text. The translation problems can be viewed from several angles, one of which has already been discussed above in more detail: as explained, the constrained translation approach sees the constraints of relevance and space as a problem to be solved by the translator. Similar constraints of space to some extent also apply to creating the original comics, however. While the artist obviously has great freedom in placing, shaping and sizing the spaces reserved for text, the comics format sets some boundaries to the artist's work: a comic cannot comprise only text because it is not a novel, nor can it contain too much text in proportion to pictures without affecting the legibility and format of the comic to a distracting degree. Therefore, the constraint of space is not strictly unique to the translation process. The constraint of relevance, on the other hand, does not affect the creator and the translator of a comic in the same way. For the translator, the constraints are obviously stricter. The "restricting" elements also set different requirements for the translation: empty speech balloons, for example, would not be acceptable in a translation, except for some valid reason.

More general textual issues can also be discussed in this context. Valero Garcés classifies problems as arising from the type of comic and the language used, from the influence of frames and similar restricting elements, and from difficulties of the reproducing or translating of iconic language such as onomatopoeia, sounds and noises (2000: 78). The restrictions were already discussed above, but the two other points have not yet received much attention. The type of comic, in other words the genre of the comic, affects the way in which the comic is translated. Among others, funny comics have to be translated in a funny style and graphic novels with due seriousness. However, this challenge is present in other forms of translation as well. There hardly is a need to discuss this otherwise important issue in the specific context of comics, and such issues as re-creating the spirit of different characters or dealing with culture-specific references are perhaps better discussed in other works on translation.

On the other hand, the aforementioned onomatopoeia, sounds and noises are comics-specific features that deserve further attention, and some of them have been studied before (see *e.g.* Sierra Soriano, 1999, for a case study of the translation of interjections in *Tintin* comics). Sound effects are sometimes difficult to translate because they require knowledge about the conventions on writing sounds in both languages, and even with the knowledge it may, at times, be difficult to decipher what a particular sound effect means in a particular context. The appearance and location of a sound effect in a panel may not provide sufficient clues as to its meaning. Ambiguity in the original effect obviously makes it difficult to recreate the sound in the target language. English uses lexicalised words as sound effects quite effortlessly, and English sound effects have had a strong influence on those in other languages because American comics are widespread. The influence is so substantial that even comics written in other languages borrow some well-established English effects. Because the English effects are so familiar even outside English-language cultures, finding an established, native way of describing a sound can be difficult, though this leaves room for the translator's creativity. In translations, there appears to be some reluctance to alter well-established sound effects even when it would be relatively easy to modify their transcriptions. For example, the transcriptions of "BANG" and "SMASH" would be easy to make look more Finnish ("BÄNG" and "SMÄSH"), but no such changes were found in my corpus.

The translation of sound effects is examined in detail in my case study involving sound

effects and their translations. Before moving on to the study, however, I will discuss the translation strategies to show the range of possibilities of dealing with different problems arising in the translation of comics.

## 3.3 Strategies of translating comics

Grun and Dollerup's observations, discussed in section 3.1, provide a glimpse into the various kinds of changes that can take place in the translation of comics. However, a more comprehensive and systematic analysis and typology of translation procedures in comics – including the localisation and "translation" of pictures – is offered by Kaindl, who bases his division on Delabastita's (1989) work on film translation. Delabastita's typology is tailored to audio-visual translation because it takes into account both pictures and words. It functions mostly on a local level, and several strategies may be used within a single panel. Kaindl's typology of translation strategies for comics is introduced below, compared to other theories on the translation of comics, and used to examine the translated sound effects of my corpus in chapter 5.

Translation strategies are divided into six categories, originally named by Delabastita and referred to by Kaindl: '*repetitio*', '*deletio*', '*detractio*', '*adiectio*', '*transmutatio*', and '*substitutio*' (1999: 275). *Repetitio* refers to a strategy whereby the source text material is transferred to the target text as it is, whether it be language, picture or typography. Kaindl mentions that transferring pictures from the original comic in an identical form is very rare for reasons of publishing, making true repetition of the original pictures equally rare. Clinging to minor changes in the size, shade and other aspects of visual elements (for example sound effects) that are otherwise unchanged narrows down the meaning of *repetitio* unduly, however, and may even render the term practically useless in this study. Thus, *repetitio* here refers to sound effects that have not experienced any editing during the translation process, even if they are not exactly identical to the original in size and shade.

*Deletio* refers to removing text or pictures. Its meaning is close to that of *detractio*, a strategy in which "parts of linguistic/pictorial/typographic elements are cut in the translation" (*ibid*.: 277). In *detractio*, such visual material as violence can be cut out for

reasons of censorship, for instance. The difference between between *deletio* and *detractio* seems slightly obscure, at least in Kaindl's description, but since it is not relevant for the purposes of this thesis, the term *deletio* is used to cover all instances where something has been removed.

*Adiectio*, on the other hand, is the opposite of *deletio* and *detractio*: elements not found in the original version are added into the translation, and they supplement the source material or replace parts of it. Many changes fall under this category. Kaindl presents a string of examples of *adiectio*. A good example is colouring black-and-white comics for the new target audience. A rather drastic example comes from a Dutch *Donald Duck*, where the character Ludwig von Drake is replaced with Donald Duck, an obvious favourite of the Dutch audience (*ibid*.: 279). This example resembles the previously mentioned case of Groucho Marx described in Celotti (2008), though its motive was financial and it did not involve re-drawing a whole character in every single picture. Further, images can be replaced with text, a practice also familiar from Finnish *Donald Duck* magazines in the form of texts summarising previous events of the story. Such a strategy and its opposite of replacing text with picture are listed by Kaindl as forms of *adiectio*. Yet another modification that, according to Kaindl, falls into this category is found in a highly modified German version of *Astérix et les Goths*. In the original French version, the typography of different peoples' speech is determined by nationality, whereas the German version uses the colour of the fonts to indicate a character's political orientation.

The meaning of *adiectio* appears to overlap with what Kaindl terms *substitutio*. According to Kaindl, *substitutio* involves replacing the original material, whether it be linguistic, typographical or pictorial, with other similar material. An example is again found in a German translation of *Astérix*: the original Gaulish village has been transferred to Germany and the comic even shows the country's division into East and West Germany on a symbolic level by the means of a wall dividing the village into two (1999: 283). However, it is difficult to see how this example differs from the examples illustrating the second meaning of *adiectio*, with *adiectio* involving not only additions but changes. Therefore, I would suggest that *adiectio* is best defined as additions, while *substitutio* covers all substitutions.

Lastly, *transmutatio* involves changing the order or location of the different elements of the original material in the localised comic (*ibid.*: 281). Texts about items for sale and their prices, for example, can be placed in different parts of a panel. *Manga*, too, provides good examples of the *transmutatio* strategy. Because Japanese is read from right to left, the comics are sometimes transferred to the western target cultures in a reversed form. The panels are not individually reordered but the whole page is mirrored, resulting in left-handed people becoming right-handed and vice versa, for example. The way sound effects are placed in the pictures is also changed sometimes; unlike *manga*, the western tradition does not routinely enclose sounds originating from inanimate objects inside speech balloons.

These categories partially overlap with other descriptions of translation strategies in comics. Celotti mentions the following six strategies for translating linguistic paratext (*i.e.* text as a part of a picture, see section 2.2): translation, translation and insertion of a footnote in the gutter, cultural adaptation, leaving untranslated, deletion, and a mix of (some of) the above (2008: 39). These strategies are perhaps best examined through a comparison with Kaindl's typology because there are notable parallels between the two, as shown in Table 1.

| Kaindl's translation procedures | Celotti's strategies of translation |
|---|---|
| *repetitio* | leaving untranslated |
| *deletio* | deletion |
| *detractio* | ≈ deletion |
| *adiectio* | - <br><br> translation and insertion of a footnote in the gutter |
| *transmutatio* | - |
| *substitutio* | - <br><br> ≈ cultural adaptation |
| - | translation |
| - | mix of (some of) the above |

**Table 1:** Comparison of Kaindl's and Celotti's translation strategies for comics

Kaindl's *repetitio,* or repeating source text material in its original form, clearly corresponds with Celotti's idea of leaving the linguistic material untranslated. Likewise, *deletio* is the more or less direct equivalent of deletion (as is *detractio* with its rather similar meaning). With *substitio,* however, the comparison becomes slightly more difficult. If the original material is substituted with something from the target culture, as in the *Astérix* example above, it involves cultural adaptation. Because Kaindl's division does not include a separate category for simply "translating", it is possible to argue that on a solely linguistic level *substitutio* could sometimes mean translation, or, in other words, replacing linguistic material with somewhat equivalent linguistic material in a different language. The term best left for other purposes, however. *Substitio* refers to many more different types of changes than any of Celotti's categories partially overlapping with it.

As can be seen from Table 1, *adiectio* is harder to equate with Celotti's strategies of translation. As *substitutio,* it covers a range of changes on both linguistic and pictorial levels. Because of this, some of the changes cannot be described with Celotti's translation strategies for linguistic paratext ('inscriptions' in Kaindl's terminology). For example, replacing pictures with words or the other way round is hardly possible with linguistic paratext – except for a few hypothetical cases such as replacing swear words with grawlixes or vice versa. While it does not cover the whole range of changes, the strategy of translating and adding explanatory footnotes does fall into this category.

*Transmutatio* does not have an equivalent in Celotti's division. With Celotti's division applied only to linguistic paratext, in other words to linguistic material outside speech balloons, and in practice only to some words at a time, *transmutatio* lacks a corresponding category. Some examples of *transmutatio* can be applied to a series of pieces of linguistic paratext, but as *transmutatio* is about changing the order of various parts of the material, it cannot be applied to single, isolated occurrences of linguistic paratext. A category corresponding to *transmutatio* could be added to the list only if Celotti's strategies of translating linguistic paratext were meant to be applied to several occurrences of paratext at a time.

Celotti's strategy of 'translation' and the 'mix' of strategies are left without equivalent in Kaindl's description. Kaindl does mention that translated or localised comics use a mix

of the strategies in his list, and the difference really is more about whether or not the mixing of strategies is considered a translation strategy in its own right. While both state the same fact, further analysis is hardly necessary. Celotti's strategy of 'translation', however, may be more problematic. It is such a comprehensive term that it is hard to separate from other strategies applied on a linguistic level – it could even cover most of the other categories, except for *repetitio*. The 'translation' and 'mix' strategies need not be problematised any further, however.

Celotti's list is applicable to many forms of translation in general. Valero Garcés, among others, also talks about strategies in the translation of text in comics. Concerning problems arising from the type of comic and the treatment of language in it, she mentions such strategies as domesticating and adapting certain details to the new sociocultural environment and omitting details of the source culture, such as names of places and people, when they are not familiar to the target audience (2000: 79-80). These strategies are, of course, common to all translation, and even though they are as central in the translation of comics as in any other type of translation, a more detailed discussion on them is not necessary in this context.

## *4 Sound effects*

After describing the basic features of comics and their translation, the third major theme of this thesis, sound effects, is discussed. Because they are examined in the case study of sound effects in seven comics from two angles – when and how they are translated, what kinds of similarities can be found in effects of similar meaning, and, further, if the certain similar structures found carry certain meanings in sound effects – it is necessary to elaborate on the concept of sound effects. Firstly, some factors affecting the appearance of sound effects are examined, and secondly, sound effects are discussed more generally.

### 4.1 Onomatopoeia and sound symbolism

Onomatopoeia is a phenomenon that is often associated with comics and is indeed quite visibly present in a great amount of them. Simply put, onomatopoeia is "the formation

of words whose sound is imitative of the sound of the noise or action designated, such as *hiss*, *buzz*, and *bang*" or "the use of such words for poetic or rhetorical effect" (MOT Collins English Dictionary 2.0, 2006). While webcomics can express themselves through means inaccessible to the traditional comic, such as hyperlinks, animation and even audible sound effects, the traditional comics format is solely based on static visual imagery and writing. Onomatopoeia provides comics with a way of expressing unarticulated sounds of the surrounding world in writing and widens the range of means of expression in comics. A related term is 'sound symbolism', whereby certain sounds in the phonetic system of a language symbolise and denote certain sounds and actions of the natural world.

There are several ways to classify onomatopoeia. A difference can be made between lexical and non-lexical onomatopoeia, as suggested by Attridge (2004). Lexical onomatopoeia refers to more or less established words that have sound-imitating characteristics, for example "hiss" and "bang", while non-lexical onomatopoeia creates more temporary constructions using the sounds that the human vocal tract is able to produce and the letters that a language has to offer to imitate non-human sounds as closely as possible, for instance "skee skee" for the sound of bats and "pfft" for a gun with a suppressor. Both types of onomatopoeia are present in comics and treated as onomatopoeia in the material analysed in this thesis.

A further division is suggested by Bredin (1996). The division is unnecessarily detailed for the purposes of this study, but it provides more insight into how onomatopoeia and sound effects work and how they are created. Bredin divides onomatopoeia into three categories: direct onomatopoeia, associative onomatopoeia and exemplary onomatopoeia (*ibid*.: 558-564). Direct onomatopoeia encompasses the most obvious kinds of onomatopoeia, namely those words which attempt to imitate the sounds they are denoting. This category contains such words as 'hiss', 'zoom', 'buzz' and 'bang'. However, on closer scrutiny, they may not always match exactly with the sounds they are denoting. Bredin points out that even despite their relative similarity, they are a matter of linguistic convention and their onomatopoeic quality is more a matter of perception. The variety of ways in which the same sound can be imitated in different languages throughout the globe also goes to show that even the formulation of onomatopoeic words is a matter of convention, although great similarities are possible.

In Finnish, the hissing sound '*suhina*' and the groaning sound '*ähinä*' serve as examples of direct onomatopoeia.

In associative onomatopoeia, the onomatopoeic word is not directly conveying the sound that it refers to but, instead, depicts a sound closely associated with the denotation. Examples of this include 'cuckoo' and 'whip', neither of which sounds like the object itself. 'Cuckoo' mimics birdsong, and 'whip' is the noise made by an inanimate object when moved in a certain manner. These, as many words that display direct onomatopoeia, can be lexical onomatopoeia in the English language. Finnish examples are '*huuhkaja*' ('eagle-owl') and *pörriäinen*' (a type of buzzing insect).

Exemplary onomatopoeia is slightly more abstract. Exemplary expressions are onomatopoeic through the way they are articulated. The way the face muscles work during pronunciation and the types of sounds produced affect the impression that the word gives. Stopped consonants add speed and sharpness to the word, while other words can be pronounced more sluggishly because of their less aggressive phonetic formulation. These different traits are exemplified by 'dart' and 'sluggish', respectively. In Finnish, '*kiitää*' and '*lyllertää*' depict certain kinds of fast and slow movement. This group can also be found in comics in prominent roles. To some extent, it also serves as background for sound symbolism.

For example, the sharp and speedy stopped consonants mentioned by Bredin (*ibid*.) are partially the types of sound qualities that have been studied in the context of sound symbolism. 'Sound symbolism' or 'phonosemantics' is another concept within which particular sounds or phonemes are associated with particular traits, but unlike in onomatopoeia, the words do not have to be imitative. The idea of sound symbolism involves the argument that word formation is not arbitrary but, instead, at least partly controlled by certain, universally appearing associations. Biologist V. S. Ramachandran (2004) describes a clear example of universal sound symbolism. An experiment which yields consistent results regardless of culture, language and literacy involves connecting, among others, the made-up words 'kiki' and 'bouba' with a jagged or a bulbous, amoeboid shape. Almost every test subject connects 'kiki' with the jagged shape and 'bouba' with a bulbous shape. Ramachandran argues that this phenomenon,

namely sound symbolism, is essentially a form of synaesthesia: the brain creates a link between the separate senses and separate systems based on a perceived common feature of jaggedness or undulation, and the reason for the phenomenon stems from a neurological basis. Interestingly, balloons and typography, discussed above in section 2.2, seem to make use of the very same synaesthetic mechanism.

Sound symbolism probably plays a considerable role in the formation of sound effects. Table 2 and Table 3 below show some sounds or combinations of letters and the associations they can carry in English, though they do not necessarily always do so (Bloomfield, 1933, with examples added, cited in Abelin 1999: 32; and Rhodes, 1994: 276-278). The lists are by no means exhaustive and represent only a sample of the original collections of symbols. They have not been compiled from sound effects in particular but show how certain characteristics of words in general can carry certain meanings. The lists in Tables 2 and 3 have here been abridged to include only the aspects potentially relevant to sound effects.

| Sound | Association | Example |
|---|---|---|
| skr- | grating impact or sound | screech |
| sn- | breath-noise<br>quick separation or movement<br>creep | snigger<br>snatch<br>sneak |
| kr- | noisy impact | crash |
| b- | dull impact | bump |
| dʒ- | movement up and down | jump |
| fl- | movement in air | fly |

**Table 2:** Some sound symbols in English according to Bloomfield (1933) (cited in Abelin 1999:32) (examples added by me)

| Sound | Association (type of action, sound etc.) | Example |
|-------|------------------------------------------|---------|
| dr-/tr- | liquid | drink, drain, trickle, trough |
| tr-/dr- | simple | track, trip, drive, drag |
| p-/b- | "anchored" | push, pop, bump, bounce |
| j-/tʃ- | short | jerk, jiggle, jagged, chop |
| w- | back and forth | wag, wiggle, wobble |
| p- | abrupt onset | pop, ping, peep |
| b- | abrupt, loud onset | boom, bang, beep |
| bl- | loud, air-induced sound | blat, blast, blab |
| kl- | abrupt onset | clank, click, clip, clop |
| r- | irregular onset | rip, roar, roll |
| y- | loud, vocal tract noise | yell, yap, yak |
| θ- | low pitch, slow onset | thump, thud |
| pl- | abrupt onset | plink, plop, plunk |
| kr- | abrupt onset | creak, crack, crunch |
| tʃ- | irregular onset | chirp, cheep, chatter |
| w- | poorly resolvable onset | whiz, whack, wham |
| z- | poorly resolvable onset | zip, zing, zap, zoom |
| dr- | liquid | drip, drain, drop, drizzle |
| sl- | liquid | slop, slush |
| fl- | liquid | flow, flush, flood |
| m- | liquid | mud, mush, mire, marsh |

**Table 3:** Some sound symbols in English according to Rhodes (1994: 276-278)

Many of the findings in Table 3 can be summarised as follows: words associated with liquids often contain one of the sounds [dr-], [tr-], [sl-], [fl-] and [m-]; actions with an abrupt onset often contain [p-], [b-], [kl-], [pl-] or [kr-]; and words of actions with more difficultly defined onset can contain [r-], [tʃ-], [w-] or [z]. Oswalt (1994: 297) observes that with consonants, the distributional patterns of obstruents (stops, affricatives and fricatives) and resonants (nasals, liquids and glides) are very different. He also notes that stops represent short, abrupt sounds because of their phonetic properties, while fricatives are often involved in meanings which involve abrasion and air, which is also visible in Rhodes' list of sound symbols in English. Further, more detailed studies have been made on sound symbols, but only these distinct sounds and combinations of sounds as sound symbols are compared with the sound effects of my corpus. The sound

symbols above have been studied as the initial sounds of a word, but I am examining even their distribution in other locations within the sound effects of my corpus to see if their meaning can remain the same in different locations.

Similar sound symbolism and sound symbols exist in Finnish. Leskinen (1991: 355) writes that [r] and [h] are especially expressive sounds in Finnish, too. The sound [r] is good for depicting tremor and interrupted sound, while [h] is well suited for sounds involving friction. Nasal consonants and [l] are popular in the beginning and in the middle of imitative words. According to Leskinen (*ibid*.), front vowels usually denote high-pitched sounds and back vowels low. Closed vowels are apparently often considered to be quieter than open ones, while labial vowels are used for strong, dark sounds.

These sets of sounds, in a way, compare to morphemes ("minimal meaning carrying unit[s]" (Abelin, 1999: 5)). While "thump", for instance, might be analysed as a single morpheme, it is possible to separate the sound [θ] (carrying the meaning of "low pitch, slow onset") as a 'phonestheme', a phoneme or group of phonemes shared by words associated with each other in meaning but not necessarily in etymology (*ibid*.: 4). The reasons for not calling phonesthemes morphemes include the fact that phonesthemes cannot occur alone and that they leave behind incomplete morphemes ('restmorphs') when extracted from the words they are a part of – contrasted with removing the plural -s from 'cats', for example (*ibid*.: 4-6). In addition, phonesthemes probably are not known and understood as thoroughly and there remains too much fuzziness about the concept.

The reason why onomatopoeia and sound symbolism are examined here in such detail in conjunction with comics is that they play an important role in the formation of sound effects and serve as a part of the written soundtrack of comics. Sound effects resort to onomatopoeia for obvious reasons: ordinary words may not be enough for expressing sounds that the human vocal tract is unable to reproduce, and the writing system lacks the means of putting the sounds into writing without processing them through a language's sound system first. To summarise, onomatopoeic expressions can be well-

established and generally known or invented solely for the purposes of a particular sound in a particular context. Whether or not the different onomatopoeia and sound effects are permanent expressions or temporary constructions, there appear to be some regularities in how the sound effects are formed, with their formation relying partially on the use of phonesthemes and sound symbols.

## 4.2 Sound effects

English is quite a productive language when it comes to sound effects. The same words can function as verbs, nouns and sound effects if they denote certain kinds of happenings and actions. Consider, for example, the word 'thump', for which the MOT Collins English Dictionary 3.0 (2009) gives the following:

> **thump (θʌmp)**
> ▷ n
> 1 the sound of a heavy solid body hitting or pounding a comparatively soft surface
> 2 a heavy blow with the hand: he gave me a thump on the back
> ▷ vb
> 3 (tr) to strike or beat heavily; pound
> 4 (intr) to throb, beat, or pound violently: his heart thumped with excitement
> > 'thumper n
> ● ETYMOLOGY C16: related to Icelandic, Swedish dialect dumpa to thump; see THUD, BUMP

Another dictionary, MOT Collins Compact Thesaurus (1999), provides the following entry, focusing on synonyms:

> ■ **thump noun**
> 1 = thud, bang, clunk, crash, thwack
> 2 = blow, clout (informal), knock, punch, rap, smack, swipe, wallop (informal), whack
> ■ **verb**
> 3 = thud, bang, crash, thwack
> 4 = strike, batter, beat, belabour, clobber (slang), clout (informal), hit, knock, pound, punch, rap, smack, swipe, thrash, wallop (informal), whack
> 5 = throb, beat

Firstly, the entries show that the word exists both as a verb and a noun and that the other meaning of the noun 'thump' is a very specific, identifiable "sound" (that of "a heavy solid body hitting or pounding a comparatively soft surface"), effectively leading to the fact that it is used as a sound effect. Secondly, a great number of synonyms share similar properties, in other words, are flexibly used as verbs, nouns or sound effects. Table 4

shows some of the synonyms, all of which can be used as nouns, verbs or sound effects. Many of the words are cited as having an "imitative origin", according to The Concise Oxford Dictionary of English Etymology (1996) – in other words, they are onomatopoeic to a degree.

| Word | Meaning (relevant meanings, according to MOT Collins English Dictionary 3.0, 2009) |
|---|---|
| thud | ▷ *n*<br>**1** a dull heavy sound: *the book fell to the ground with a thud*<br>**2** a blow or fall that causes such a sound<br>▷ *vb,* **thuds, thudding, thudded**<br>**3** to make or cause to make such a sound |
| bang | ▷ *n*<br>**1** a short loud explosive noise, as of the bursting of a balloon or the report of a gun<br>**2** a hard blow or knock, esp a noisy one; thump: *he gave the ball a bang*<br>**3** *informal* a startling or sudden effect: *he realized with a bang that he was late*<br>▷ *vb*<br>**8** to hit or knock, esp with a loud noise; bump: *to bang one's head*<br>**9** to move noisily or clumsily: *to bang about the house*<br>**10** to close (a door, window, etc) or (of a door, etc) be closed noisily; slam<br>**11** (*tr*) to cause to move by hitting vigorously: *he banged the ball over the fence*<br>**12** to make or cause to make a loud noise, as of an explosion<br>▷ *adv*<br>**19** with a sudden impact or effect: *bang went his hopes of winning; the car drove bang into a lamp-post* |
| clunk | ▷ *n*<br>**1** a blow or the sound of a blow<br>**2** a dull metallic sound<br>▷ *vb*<br>**5** to make or cause to make such a sound |
| crash | ▷ *vb*<br>**1** to make or cause to make a loud noise as of solid objects smashing or clattering<br>**2** to fall or cause to fall with force, breaking in pieces with a loud noise as of solid objects smashing<br>**3** (*intr*) to break or smash in pieces with a loud noise<br>**4** (*intr*) to collapse or fail suddenly: *this business is sure to crash*<br>▷ *n*<br>**12** an act or instance of breaking and falling to pieces<br>**13** a sudden loud noise: *the crash of thunder*<br>**14** a collision, as between vehicles |
| thwack | ▷ *vb*<br>**1** to beat, hit, or flog, esp with something flat<br>▷ *n*<br>**2** [**a**] a blow with something flat [**b**] the sound made by it<br>▷ *interj*<br>**3** an exclamation imitative of this sound |

**Table 4:** Synonyms of 'thump'

As demonstrated above, even a brief look into the word 'thump' shows that it is a flexible word that crosses the boundaries between different word classes and that many of the words associated with it share similar properties. The numerous synonyms of 'thump' show that words exhibiting this type of productivity may tend to form clusters with words of similar meanings and properties. It is likely that clusters are formed around specific types of meanings and actions, such as more or less solid objects colliding or hitting each other or actions involving water or other wet materials or objects, in other words, actions with distinctive sounds.

Because drawing a line between onomatopoeic expressions and other types of sound effects can be difficult, this study focuses on sound effects in general, considering even elements that, while perhaps including some sound symbolism, are not strictly speaking onomatopoeic because they do not attempt to describe an actual sound. Again, for the purposes of narrowing down the subject of this study, sound effects within speech balloons containing both dialogue and sound effects are excluded from the analysis because they may be used as parts of the dialogue, for example when a character is deliberately disguising their words as a cough. Sound effects enclosed within their own balloons, on the other hand, are treated in the same way as sound effects outside perigrams since they are clearly separated from the rest of the text.

The exact definition of a 'sound effect' can be debated, too. While such sound effects as "BOOM" or "BLAM" are clearly onomatopoeic and imitate sound, other written effects can comprise elements only explaining or dramatising an action. Examples of these include "LEAP!" and "POING (of doom)", the first of which, interestingly, includes an exclamation mark even though it is not a "sound" as such, and the second of which uses smaller, lower-case letters in parenthesis to specify the mood of the action of jumping (examples from the *Sluggy Freelance* websites 1 (2004) & 2 (2003)). At least non-academic sources have noted this difference, using, for example, the term 'unsound effect' to describe the phenomenon (*TV Tropes* website). The very use of the term 'unsound effect' shows the close connection between these explanatory elements and actual sound effects. Similarly, because of sound symbolism, the use of effects derived from such verbs as 'kick' may create an impression of onomatopoeia even if it has not been the original intention of the author of the comic.

For the purposes of this thesis, it is not necessary to define the term 'sound effect' in its strictest sense. The boundary between an effect mimicking sound and an effect specifying an action is hazy at best – most likely based on hunch or personal preference rather than absolute, measurable attributes – and the different types of effects would perhaps best be described through the notion of continuum rather than that of polarisation. In one sense, it makes little difference to a translator where a particular effect is located on the sound–explanation continuum: it is text and a decision on if and how it is to be translated has to be made individually in each case. To avoid confusion and problems of definition, even unsound effects are here treated as sound effects as long as they are in writing. In this thesis, the potentially problematic grawlixes are treated as dialogue, and possible differences between the original and the translated versions are not examined in this context.

## 5 A case study of seven comics and their translations

### 5.1 Material, methods and hypothesis

The corpus used in this study comprises a collection of sound effects in individual stories or strips from seven different comics. The comics included in this study are chosen from different genres in order to gain a better insight into what kinds of trends and differences are visible in the translation of sound effects in different comics. The assumption is that different genres have their own conventions which have been formed for various reasons, such as financial issues, different schedules, differences in audiences, quality control, and the degree of integration of the sound effects with the visual content. As the comics included in the corpus vary significantly in length, only a relevant amount of sound effects from each comic is analysed to avoid unnecessary repetition. Though the corpus covers several genres, humorous comics comprise most of it in order to gain a more comprehensive view of the particular genre and uncover possible differences within it.

The corpus comprises sound effects from two *Donald Duck* stories by Don Rosa, one *Duck* story and its two translations from Carl Barks, a random sample of *Peanuts* strips by Charles M. Schulz, a collection of *Calvin and Hobbes* strips and several of their

translations from Bill Watterson, a part of an album of *Batman* by Frank Miller and David Mazzucchelli, and a part of a longer story *Watchmen* by Alan Moore and Dave Gibbons. For the sake of clarity, these comics and their albums, publishers, and creators are collected into Table 5 and the corresponding facts about the translations are gathered into Table 6. Several translations of some of the comics have been examined, in which case all the relevant details are included. The publishers and dates are based on the edition I have used as material in this corpus, not on the first publication, which explains why some of the translations appear to be older than the English comics. With *Peanuts*, no publisher or year is given for the English comic because the material used here is not from the original album.

| Comic or story | Album | Publisher, year of publishing | Artist(s) |
|---|---|---|---|
| *The Secret of Atlantis* | *Walt Disney's Uncle $crooge Adventures 5: The Secret of Atlantis* | Gladstone, 1996 | Carl Barks |
| *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never* | *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck: Volume Two* | BOOM! Studios, 2010 | Don Rosa |
| *The Cowboy Captain of the Cutty Sark* | *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck Companion* | Gemstone Publishing, 2006 | Don Rosa |
| *Peanuts* | *The Complete Peanuts 1950-1952* | | Charles M. Schulz |
| *Calvin and Hobbes* | *The Days Are Just Packed* | Time Warner Paperbacks, 2004 | Bill Watterson |
| *Batman* | *Batman: Year One* | DC Comics, 2005 | Frank Miller (writer), David Mazzucchelli (illustrator) |
| *Watchmen* | *Watchmen* | DC Comics, 2008 | Alan Moore (writer), Dave Gibbons (illustrator) |

**Table 5:** English-language source texts in the corpus

| Original | Translation | Album or magazine | Publisher, year of publishing | Translator |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| *The Secret of Atlantis* | *Atlantiksen arvoitus* | *Aku Ankan juhlasarjat 5* | Helsinki Media Company Oy, 1995 | Markku Saarinen |
| | | *Aku Ankka* | Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy, 2012 | unknown |
| *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never* | *Uniajan urho* | *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot* | Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy, 2005 | Markku Saarinen |
| *The Cowboy Captain of the Cutty Sark* | *Cutty Sarkin cowboykapteeni* | *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot 2: Kaikki lisäseikkailut* | Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy, 2007 | Jukka Lindfors |
| *Peanuts* | *Tenavat* | *Täydelliset Tenavat 1950–1952* | Egmont Kustannus, 2007 | Juhani Tolvanen |
| *Calvin and Hobbes* | *Lassi ja Leevi* | *Lassi ja Leevi: Juhlakirja 5.* | Kustannus Oy Semic, 1996 | Juhani Valli |
| | *Lassi ja Leevi* | *Lassi ja Leevi: Kovaa ja korkealta* | Kustannus Oy Semic, 1995 | Juhani Valli |
| | *Lassi ja Leevi* | *Lassi ja Leevi: Valon nopeudella* | Kustannus Oy Semic, 1995 | Juhani Valli |
| *Batman* | *Batman* | *Batman: Ensimmäinen vuosi* | Egmont Kustannus, 2007 | Riku Perälä |
| *Watchmen* | *Vartijat* | *Vartijat* | Egmont Kustannus, 2009 | Jouko Ruokosen-mäki |

**Table 6:** Finnish translations in the corpus

The creators and their stories deserve to be introduced in more detail that can fit a table, however. The *Donald Duck* comics from Carl Barks and Don Rosa were chosen for this corpus because of the special status they have established among Finnish audiences. Older audiences have grown up with the comics of the former *Duck* creator, while Rosa's comics appeal to a younger audience, but both are equally established even among the casual Finnish readers of comics. They represent a popular and wide-spread comic which has been considered so important that it has become the subject of exceptionally conscientious translation. In addition, they differ from many of the other humorous comics in that they have not originally been published nor been meant to be published as newspaper strips.

Carl Barks (March 27, 1901 – August 25, 2000) was a prolific maker of Donald Duck comics responsible for creating the fictional city of Duckburg (*Ankkalinna*) and many of its residents, including the central figures of Scrooge McDuck (*Roope Ankka*), Gladstone Gander (*Hannu Hanhi*) and Gyro Gearloose (*Pelle Peloton*), among others. The American started working for Disney Studios in 1936 and wrote his first Duck stories some time after that, but one of his first big hits, *Christmas on Bear Mountain* (*Joulu Karhuvuorella)* – introducing the character of Scrooge McDuck – was published in 1947 (*Lambiek* website 2, 2012). After this story, longer and more popular stories followed. The artist behind the comics was, however, kept anonymous at the time, and readers recognising Barks' style started referring to him as "the Good Duck Artist". The anonymity was eventually lifted in 1970 through some detective work, and Barks began receiving the recognition he deserved (*ibid.*). Barks continued with Ducks even after his retirement in late 1960s, writing scripts for comics and doing Duck-themed oil paintings (*ibid.*).

The story chosen for analysis from Carl Barks is the classic *The Secret of Atlantis* (*Atlantiksen arvoitus*) from 1954, henceforth referred to as DDB. Sound effects are not very numerous in this particular story, but two different Finnish translations are examined: a translation by Markku Saarinen published in the collection *Aku Ankan juhlasarjat 5* in 1995 (eds. Kivekäs & Perälä), and a later version published in the weekly magazine *Aku Ankka* (or "AA" for short) in 2012 (No. 1). The two versions of the story represent different forms of publication. The story is an old classic, however, which means that there may be other translations of it, too. They can be assumed to owe something to the previous translations, and similarities are likely to occur. One noteworthy fact about the translations is that, in the album, the translator is mentioned but no translator is named in the weekly AA. *Aku Ankka* (2013: 2) sheds some light on how AA is translated and explains why no names are given. Practically all of the translation is done by a group of about ten freelance translators, and the group varies depending on how each translator is available at a particular time. The translation process does not end with the translators' contribution, however. The translations are reworked by the editors, who harmonise the texts of up to four translators per magazine and process them to create a coherent style for the finished magazine. Creating and finalising the texts takes weeks, and there are so many people involved at different stages that the magazine prefers not to attribute the Finnish text – no longer strictly even

a translation, according to the editorial staff – to a single person.

Don Rosa (born Keno Don Hugo Rosa, June 29, 1951 –), another American *Duck* artist, started drawing and writing *Duck* stories for Disney in 1987, beginning with the story *The Son of the Sun*. He is often characterised as the successor of Carl Barks' work. Not only is the quality of his work high both visually and story-wise, but, having grown up with Carl Barks' comics, he also consciously continues in Carl Barks' footsteps, setting his stories in the same era as Barks, using Barks' characters in his stories (with some exceptions such as Arpin Lusène/*Le Chevalier Noir* (*Musta ritari*)), writing sequels to Barks' stories, and paying him homage by hiding the acronym D.U.C.K. ("Dedicated to Uncle Carl from Keno") into the opening panels and covers of stories (Rosa, 2005: 6).

The stories by Rosa chosen into this corpus are from the compilations *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* (*Roope Ankan elämä ja teot*) and *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck Companion* (*Roope Ankan elämä ja teot  2: Kaikki lisäseikkailut*), which, as the names implies, are mainly about the character Scrooge McDuck and his exploits in varying settings around the world during his youth. While Don Rosa is popular in Europe and extremely popular in Finland, his works are not as easy to find in their original language in Finland. These particular sets of stories, however, have gained popularity in the United States as well and were easier to find as English versions, which is why they were included in the corpus. The first story examined here is *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never* (*Uniajan urho*) from *The Life and Times*, referred to as DDR1 in this thesis. The second story is from *The Life and Times Companion*, a story called *The Cowboy Captain of the Cutty Sark* (*Cutty Sarkin cowboykapteeni*). The second Rosa story is referred to as DDR2.

The English version of  DDR1 was originally published in 1995. The Finnish *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot* used in this thesis is the third edition, printed in 2005, and the story *Uniajan urho* is a translation by Markku Saarinen (though, interestingly enough, all the other comics in the album have been translated by Jukka Lindfors). In other words, both *Atlantiksen arvoitus* and *Uniajan urho* are made by the same translator. *Cutty Sarkin cowboykapteeni*, on the other hand, is translated by Jukka Lindfors, who regularly translates Rosa's comics.

*Peanuts* (*Tenavat*), another popular comic examined in this thesis, was created by Charles Monroe Schulz (November 26, 1922 – February 12, 2000). The long-lived strip comic ran for fifty years from 1950 onwards and is still frequently reprinted. The last Sunday strip of the *Peanuts* comic famously came out one day after the artist's death. The comic has featured such familiar characters as Charlie Brown (*Jaska Jokunen*) and Snoopy (*Ressu*) right from the beginning, though the cast of characters has changed and developed somewhat during the series. *Peanuts* is later abbreviated as PEA.

Like the *Duck* comics, *Peanuts* has been a very popular comic, but the popularity is more evenly distributed than that of the Duck: audiences around the globe probably appreciate *Peanuts* more and more evenly than the *Ducks*, which are very popular in Finland and, in general, more popular in Europe than in America. Another difference is the fact that *Peanuts* was originally published as strips which were collected into albums later. Strictly speaking, the stories in *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck* and *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck Companion* have been collected into albums after first having been published as individual stories in separate magazines, but the *Duck* stories are considerably longer and have more continuity in that sense. Nonetheless, *Peanuts* represents a popular, internationally acclaimed humorous strip comic which was originally published in newspapers.

The strips examined here are a random sample from 1950-1952, the very first years of the *Peanuts*. The Finnish album from 2007 is *Täydelliset Tenavat 1950–1952*, translated by Juhani Tolvanen. It is a translation of a book belonging to the series called *The Complete Peanuts*. The series of albums contains all *Peanuts* strips in chronological order, but only the first two albums were ever published in Finnish. However, due to a very limited availability of the English originals in Finnish libraries, the English strips are collected from various sites around the Internet (*Peanuts* websites 1 & 2; it is not known if the sites have permission to use the copyrighted comics). The English-language strips are used as the starting point of the analysis of PEA.

Like *Peanuts*, the *Calvin and Hobbes* comic, later abbreviated as C&H, represents a popular strip comic. Created by William Boyd Watterson II (July 5, 1958 –), or more familiarly Bill Watterson, the series was not as long-running but has remained popular long after its first appearance in 1985 and continues being re-printed today. The comic

47

was discontinued by Watterson in 1995 in order to keep it from becoming repetitive and wearing out its ideas. Some of the escapades of a boy and his toy tiger are introduced in the album *The Days Are Just Packed* from 1993, a collection of regular and Sunday strips. The album has been translated as *Lassi ja Leevi: Juhlakirja 5* which is included in my corpus. A further comparison is made with the albums *Lassi ja Leevi: Kovaa ja korkealta* and *Lassi ja Leevi: Valon nopeudella*. The former contains only Sunday strips, which are bigger in size, while the latter contains the single-row strips that were originally published on weekdays. In practice, this means that three different versions of each strip are examined. All of the albums have been translated by the same person, Juhani Valli. Though the compilation album is longer, only pages 7-110 of the album *The Days Are Just Packed* are included in the corpus of this thesis in order to keep the amount of sound effects from this comic reasonable. The corresponding parts of the albums *Lassi ja Leevi: Kovaa ja korkealta* (pp. 17-42) and *Lassi ja Leevi: Valon nopeudella* (pp. 13-46) are included. With four albums to compare, this corpus contains more sound effects from *Calvin and Hobbes* than from the other comics.

Differing greatly from humorous comics, the superhero genre deserves attention in the context of sound effects. After the creation and popular approval of *Superman* in 1938, the genre began to spawn such well-known superhero characters as *Spider-Man* and *Batman*, with the publishers Marvel Comics and DC Comics behind most of the successful superheroes. Because superhero comics contain a lot of action, they need a lot of sound effects, which is why they are especially interesting to examine. The comic chosen to represent the genre here is *Batman*, abbreviated BAT, more specifically *Batman: Year One* (2005), created by Frank Miller (writer) and David Mazzucchelli (illustrator). The examined comic is a compilation because the original comic first came out as several smaller comic books 1986-1987, and the Finnish version is its translation, *Batman: Ensimmäinen vuosi*. The album's translator is Riku Perälä. Again, to avoid unnecessary repetition, only the first 62 pages are included in the corpus.

Finally, a sample representing more serious type of comics from the domain of graphic novels is included in the corpus. *Watchmen* (*Vartijat*) (or WM for short) was written by Alan Moore, an eccentric but renowned British writer, and drawn by Dave Gibbons, also known for his contribution to the comic *Green Lantern*. *Watchmen*, which also originally came out 1986-1987 in twelve separate books, is known as one of the most

iconic graphic novels ever published. The story was later collected into a single novel and also spawned a film by the same name, released in 2009. The Finnish translation *Vartijat* is by Jouko Ruokosenmäki, and the translation used as the source here is the second edition printed in 2009.

The novel is mainly set in the period of the Cold War but depicts an alternative history. *Watchmen* is considered a deconstruction of superhero comics. In the comic, different not-so-exemplary pasts and motives of a collection of former vigilantes, most of them lacking super powers but in general interested in the business of fighting crime, are introduced and critically examined while simultaneously analysing the nature of man. While the comic reflects societal issues of its time, the superhero-like characters in appropriate costume create a parallel to the superhero genre. From the point of view of this research, this makes the comic an interesting subject of study: the comic has similarities with the superhero genre while having been created in an an more serious vein and possibly for a different type of audience than the traditional superhero comic. The focus is not primarily on graphic, entertaining violence or action.

The corpus contains the sound effects, their translations, and information on whether they are contained within a perigram or not. In addition, a difference is made between two types of texts located outside balloons: those which are simply hanging against a background of a solid wall of colour and those which are overlapping with pictures in such a way that translating them would have involved re-drawing, covering or changing parts of the picture. As already mentioned, the concept of 'sound effect' is here understood to include everything from clearly onomatopoeic sound effects to 'unsound effects'. Sound effects in the middle of dialogue are not included in the corpus because they may be fused with other text quite seamlessly and, thus, be difficult to extract from other textual material. Effects within their own balloons, however, are included.

The sound effects are analysed from two angles. Firstly, sound effects, their use, and their translations are compared to find out what kinds of strategies are used in the translation of different comics and different genres. A modified version of Kaindl's typology of translation procedures is used to group the findings: *repetitio*, *deletio*, *adiectio*, *transmutatio*, *substitutio*, and straightforward translation (introduced in section 3.3). The effects of a sound effect's location on its translation or non-translation are also

examined. Sound effects that are heavily embedded in picture are called 'embedded' sound effects, and effects outside perigrams but not integrated into the picture are termed 'loose' sound effects. After examining the individual comics, all of the findings are summarised and analysed.

Secondly, individual sound effects are examined from the point of view of sound symbolism. In section 5.3, sound effects from the corpus are categorised and analysed based on their semantic content and their characteristics are compared mostly with Bloomfield's (1933) and Rhodes' (1994) examples of sound symbolism (introduced above in section 4.1) in order to identify phonesthemes in the effects. Bloomfield and Rhodes describe their sound symbols through such aspects as the direction of an action or a sound's onset, but the categories in this study arise from repeatedly occurring themes and events in the sound effects of the corpus.

Bloomfield and Rhodes focus on lexical words. As far as I know, no similar study has been conducted on sound effects before. It can be assumed that sound effects have more freedom to break the rules of English spelling because their form can be less solidified. Consequently, sound effects could be assumed to contain more sound symbolism to capture the essence of a sound without being bound by orthographic conventions. However, since many traditional sound effects are identical to a noun and a verb referring to the same action, the assumption is not as straightforward. I compare my corpus to the sound symbols that Bloomfield and Rhodes have described and suggest some additional symbols based on findings from this particular corpus. There are few Finnish sound symbols with which to compare the sounds and combinations of sounds in the translated effects of my corpus, so I examine the Finnish effects by comparing them to the English effects and sound symbols. A comparison with the sound symbols in English is justified because of the relative universality of sound symbols, while a comparison between the Finnish and English effects reveals what sounds have been used in Finnish without interference from the source text.

In this study, the following recurring themes were identified and used as categories: impact, friction, air current, liquid and food, breakage, explosions and gunshots, duration, and pitch. Impact, friction, breakage, and explosions and gunshots are themes that involve a specific type of an action or an event. Air current and liquid sounds are

chosen on the basis of the materials involved in the creation of the sound. Duration and pitch differ from the other categories because they are qualities of the sounds themselves, but they are nonetheless recurring features in the sounds of the corpus. There would be various other ways of categorising sound effects, but the categories that are used here are relevant specifically to the corpus of this study.

The comics examined in this study are aimed at different audiences, have been published and translated at different times, and are not equally widely-read or established in Finland and among Finnish readers. These differences are likely to be reflected on the results of the analysis of the different translation strategies used in the corpus' translations.

My initial assumption is that there are significant differences in the translation strategies used in different comics. For instance, one of the stereotypical genres of comics, the superhero genre, is a potential source of sound effects even in other languages. The nature of superhero comics affects the way sound effects are used in them: action sequences traditionally need plenty of loud and showy sound effects. Accordingly, the visual representation of the sounds may involve large effects that are highly embedded in the pictures. The initial assumption is, therefore, that sound effects are often not translated at all because it would be difficult to extract them from the pictorial content of the comics and place the translations into the picture. Omissions are considered unlikely. Sound effects specifically placed inside speech balloons, on the other hand, are more likely to be translated. Today, computers make editing easier, which may result in older translations retaining more sound effects in their original English form than more recent translations. However, some genre-specific conventions may have been established earlier and be adhered to regardless of the improved editing facilities. In addition, the intended audiences may be credited with enough language skills or experience in reading comics to understand such foreign-language elements as English sound effects.

Some assumptions are also made about the translations of the *Donald Duck* comics. The popularity of *Donald Duck* comics has turned them into a kind of an institution in Finland, especially so in the case of stories created by Carl Barks and Don Rosa. The Finnish *Duck* magazine *Aku Ankka* has cherished the fluency of language throughout its

printing history (*Aku Ankka,* 2013: 2) and has even received recognition for this work. In 2001, its editorial staff received from the Finnish department of the University of Helsinki the annual price *Kielihelmi,* awarded for creative and individual use of the Finnish language (University of Helsinki website, 2001). Since *Aku Ankka* values the quality of language, the comics of the two especially beloved *Duck* creators can be expected to have been translated with the greatest amount of care and attention possible. Therefore, it is expected that the Finnish sound effects exhibit a greater variety of translation strategies and contain relatively few Anglicisms or traces of the original language or language form. Again, omissions are considered to be unlikely. The *Donald Duck* comics are numerous in the corpus because they are expected to contain more variation in translation strategies, making them more interesting to study.

Besides the *Duck* comics, two other humorous comics are represented in the corpus: *Calvin and Hobbes* and *Peanuts.* It is interesting to see how these comics compare to the *Duck* comics, but it is hard to make any assumptions about what similarities and differences there might be. On the other end of the spectrum is *Watchmen,* the translation strategies of which are hard speculate on.

## 5.2 Findings and discussion

### 5.2.1 Applied translation strategies and factors affecting their usage

This section gives an overview of how sound effects are used in the examined comics and what general trends are visible in the original versions and their translations. The humorous comics are introduced first, and the traditional superhero comic *Batman* is examined before *Watchmen,* a comic also viewed as a critique of the superhero genre. In the following sections, sound effects are compared and contrasted with their translations. The findings are examined using a modified version of Kaindl's typology of translation procedures involving *repetitio*, *deletio*, *adiectio*, *transmutatio*, and *substitutio* (see further discussion in section 3.3). The original division lacks a term for "simply translating", and the straightforward term 'translation' is used to fill this gap. *Transmutatio* is specifically pointed out only when the location of the translated sound

effect differs significantly from the original location. The use of *transmutatio* may, for example, be motivated by size differences between the effects in the two languages. Interestingly, the spelling of some sound effects has not been altered in any way but the sound effects have, nonetheless, been rewritten. This practice has no term in Kaindl's typology of translation procedures, but for the purposes of this thesis, this type of reproduction of an expression with a different lettering is regarded as *repetitio*. Such cases are specially pointed out, however, as the motivation behind this strategy is not always clear.

The effects a sound effect's location in a panel on the choice of translation strategy are also examined. Three locations in which sound effects can occur are identified: inside speech balloons, outside speech balloons but not in pictures, and in pictures. As mentioned above, the sound effects that are heavily embedded in picture are here termed 'embedded' sound effects and effects outside balloons but not integrated into the picture are called 'loose' sound effects. This division is adopted because effects in different locations are not equally easy to replace with their translations.

For the sake of clarity, examples from the corpus are presented in CAPITAL letters, and whenever several versions of the same effect are introduced simultaneously, they are presented in the order ENGLISH EFFECT/FINNISH TRANSLATION/SECOND FINNISH TRANSLATION. Whenever the effects are not presented in this way, their language is indicated separately.

### 5.2.1.1 *Peanuts*

*Peanuts* is the oldest comic of the corpus, with the original strips examined dating back to 1952. As already mentioned, the corpus contains a random sample of *Peanuts* strips from 1952 and the comic has the lowest number of examples analysed because of the limited availability of the original English album. The strips are among the earliest in the long-lived series, and the vast majority of the sound effects are lexical onomatopoeia and other well-established sound effects. Examples include HIC!/HIK!, AHCHOO!/AATSHII!, SLAM!/SLAM!, RING!/RING! (for a doorbell), QUACK/KVAAK (for a toy duck), CHOMP CHOMP/MUMPS MUMPS (for eating),

and *GULP*/*GULP* (for swallowing). Because the comic is presented in strip form, the themes vary, but the topics and sound effects are often related to children's lives. The topics are fairly traditional and related to such everyday actions as eating or bouncing a ball. In this small sample, there are no obvious unsound effects.

PEA follows certain patterns of marking its sound effects and dialogue texts, typical of this comic in particular. In the English dialogue, full stops are not used, while exclamation marks, question marks, and the series of three full stops are common. In the translation, full stops are added. This may have implications on sound effects as well, as sound effects within locugrams without a full stop or other punctuation would perhaps have it added into the Finnish translations, but in this limited sample, all sound effects within perigrams end with a punctuation mark. Without further samples, it is not possible to conclude whether this applies to other strips of the album. Capital letters are used in both language versions in all text. *Asterisks* are sometimes used to mark sound effects within perigrams both in the original and in the translation.

In the relatively small sample of sound effects from PEA, the strategies of *repetitio*, *deletio* and translation are used, but there are no clear cases of *transmutatio* and no cases of *adiectio*. *Repetitio* is relatively common, though it is sometimes hard to tell whether the effects are identical to the original or rewritten with the same orthography. Sound effects inside speech balloons have been translated more often than not, but most of the loose sound effects have not been translated. No significant cases of embedded sound effects were found. On the whole, the translations are fairly traditional and not very surprising Finnish equivalents of the English effects.

One special case where the translation may have a significant impact on the interpretation of a comic strip was found in this corpus. It involves *deletio* or, more specifically, leaving out a sound effect from the translation. In one Sunday strip, Lucy is bouncing a ball to break a record, which annoys Charlie Brown greatly because she has already been "going all week." The annoying effect is strengthened in the English version by using repetitive and pervasive sound effects in all panels where Lucy is bouncing the ball. After all, the continuous sound PAT PAT BUMPETY-BUMP / BUMPETY-BUMPETY-BUMP-BUMP / BUMPETY-BUMP! BUMPETY-BUMP! / BUMPETY-BUMPETY-BUMP! / BUMPETY-BUMP (the slash signifies a panel break)

most likely is what makes the bouncing so annoying. Charlie Brown throws a basketful of balls at Lucy to confuse her bouncing and counting and to make her stop, but sound effects are used only when Lucy is bouncing the ball. However, in the translation, all the sound effects have been omitted, which leads to losing the annoying effect of the original. The original sound effects are located in the picture, but they are hanging in empty air, which means that they would have been easy to replace with Finnish translations with no need for further editing. The absence of the numerous sound effects may render the strip incomprehensible to a Finnish reader.

In another case, sound and sound effects are crucial to the joke of the strip. The translations of both dialogue and sound affect the outcome of how, and if, the joke is understood. Charlie Brown offers some candy to Lucy and says "When you're ready for another piece, just holler." When Lucy has finished eating the piece she got, she literally hollers: "YAGHH!" The joke is of course that Lucy takes Charlie's comment more literally than it was meant to be. The Finnish translation of Charlie's line is "Kerro sitten, kun tahdot uuden" (which translates as "Tell me when you want another"), and the holler is "IÄÄÄHH!" in Finnish. Since the Finnish '*kerro*' ('tell') does not indicate why Lucy is shouting as it contains no reference to loudness or shouting, the original explanation of Lucy's literal interpretation is lost. The strip changes character, and Lucy could perhaps be regarded as impatient, greedy or annoying in the Finnish version instead of literal as in the original strip. A better choice of a verb could have been, for example, '*hihkaista*', a word better suited to the situation and with a connotation of high-pitched yelling.

### 5.2.1.2 *Calvin and Hobbes*

The topics in *Calvin and Hobbes* range from daily routines and philosophical discussions to tiger attacks and dinosaurs, or topics concerning the life of a rather extraordinary six-year-old with a more-dangerous-than-average toy tiger. Similarly to *Peanuts*, the fact that the comics came out as separate strips means that the topics can vary quite significantly, as opposed to longer stories which usually contain longer, more coherent stories. The sound effects reflect boyish topics, such as playing with food, playing in the mud, being ambushed by a tiger, and going sledging. Calvin's reactions of

disappointments or fear are especially prominent among the effects. In general, there is more variation in the sound effects in these comic strips than in PEA, which may be explained by the fact that C&H has the most sound effects in this particular corpus. C&H also contains the clearest instance of an unsound effect also translated as such: SHOVE/TYÖNTÖ.

The collection *Lassi ja Leevi: Juhlakirja 5* contains exactly the same comics as the English album *The Days Are Just Packed* – even the page numbers match. The size of the albums is almost exactly the same. Both are printed in colour, but the shades differ slightly, probably for reasons of printing. As already mentioned, the relevant sound effects are regarded as exactly matching or identical in the two versions of the album when they are copied from the original version instead of having been redrawn. From my translation-oriented point of view, slight differences in shade or size are irrelevant and are ignored in this context.

*Repetitio* is slightly more common in *Juhlakirja* than in the other *Lassi ja Leevi* albums. No *deletio* or *adiectio* takes place in *Juhlakirja*. In other words, the sound effect translations are rather faithful to the original in the sense that they do not alter the original layout and distribution of the sound effects very much. Instead, they rather straightforwardly either copy or translate the effects. When looking at the distribution of the different strategies, most of the *repetitio* takes place inside the pictures, not in the texts of the balloons. In speech balloons, there is one RRRRGH!! of anger and frustration which has not been translated in *Juhlakirja*, otherwise all effects within perigrams have been translated into Finnish. As the particular effect works quite well in both languages, this case of *repetitio* leads to no confusion (thought the solution GRRR!! in *Kovaa ja korkealta* is perhaps more idiomatic). In text outside balloons, *repetitio* is divided almost equally between embedded and loose sound effects. There are more cases of *repetitio* in loose effects than in embedded ones, but loose sound effects also occur much more frequently in the comic and are notably more often translated than not. In fact, none of the highly embedded sound effects have been translated. None of the very visual and highly embedded sound effects are translated in the smaller albums, either.

One case may be interpreted as either *substitutio* or *transmutatio* in C&H. In one strip, a

burp lasts for two panels in all versions of the comic. There are differences in how this has been presented in the original and the translations, however. In English, the effect starts in the first panel and ends in the second, while in Finnish, the effect ends in the first panel and is repeated from the beginning in the second. One interpretation is that the effect has been relocated, which would make it a case of *transmutatio*. Nonetheless, I think it is more appropriate to call the strategy *substitutio* because it involves replacing the original effect with somewhat but not "identical" material.

The smaller albums *Lassi ja Leevi: Valon nopeudella* and *Lassi ja Leevi: Kovaa ja korkealta* contain some of the same comic strips as *The Days Are Just Packed*, and the relevant comics are examined here. The size difference between the English version and the two Finnish localisations is considerable: the comics in the two separate albums are smaller, which, in practice, means that the texts differ slightly from the bigger album not only in content but also in size and layout. The size difference appears to have had some effect on the translation of sound effects.

As mentioned previously, the album *Valon nopeudella* contains some of the single-row comic strips that appear in the collection *Lassi ja Leevi: Juhlakirja 5*. The non-Sunday strips are originally drawn in black-and-white so there are no changes in the colouring of the smaller translated album. However, the Sunday strip album *Kovaa ja korkealta* is in black-and-white unlike the original coloured Sunday strips, which appears to have had some influence on the translation of sound effects. With the colours removed, more sound effects are translated into Finnish than in *Juhlakirja*, most of them loose sound effects. This may be because it is easier to change them when there is no need to re-colour the pictures. Even in dialogue and narration, the translations are different in the big collection and the smaller albums.

In the non-Sunday strips of *Valon nopeudella*, all sound effects in locugrams are translated and loose effects are translated as often as in *Juhlakirja*. In the Sunday strips of *Kovaa ja korkealta*, where the coloured comics have been turned black-and-white, large sound effects in pictures have been both left as they are and translated. Sometimes, the strategies of *repetitio* and *substitutio* are used even within the same panel. Sound effects in locugrams are translated without exception, and the translation of sound effects is consistent in the middle of dialogue. Outside dialogue, strategies of both

translation and non-translation occur, which may imply that there is some conscious decision-making behind the different choices.

### 5.2.1.3 *The Secret of Atlantis*

As the name implies, *The Secret of Atlantis* is a story taking place partially in an underwater environment, and because Scrooge McDuck is involved, it has largely to do with money. From the point of view of sound effects, some splashing, a lot of clicking of coins, and a great deal of splashing sounds of a pie fight are involved. There are also some sounds coming from a radio, but speech and music originating from the radio are not considered sound effects. Instead, they are comparable to a comic's dialogue and a part of the overall sound track. Besides these instances, the use of sound effects in DDB is quite limited. Only 11 of the total of 31 pages contain stand-alone sound effects, and there are no animal sounds among them (words uttered by the anthropomorphic protagonists excepted).

As expected, no sound effects have been copied from the original version as a part of the picture in either *Juhlasarjat 5* or AA, but, surprisingly, some of them have not been translated. The differences in typography show that all of them have been rewritten, but the English effect may be used if it is acceptable in Finnish. The sound effects, nonetheless, conform fairly well to Finnish conventions and mostly look like Finnish even when they have been repeated from the original: TINK!/TINK (in *Juhlasarjat*), PLINK!/PLINK (in AA), PLONK!/PLONK/PLONK, RIP!/RIP (in *Juhlasarjat*), and PLINK!/PLINK/PLINK are all loose sound effects which repeat the English effect and its spelling. The identical content is enough in this context to justify calling this practice *repetitio*. Otherwise, all other loose sound effects as well as all embedded sound effects and effects within perigrams have been translated. Nothing has been removed or added, but there are a few cases of *transmutatio*: some sound effects originally embedded have become loose sound effects in the translation. Examples of the translations are collected into Table 7 to show the type of language otherwise used in the Finnish versions.

| Depicted action | English | Finnish (*Juhlasarjat 5*) | Finnish (AA) |
|---|---|---|---|
| panting | GASP! GULP! PANT! | LÄÄH! KLUPS! PHUU! | Lääh! Klups! Phuu! |
| trident piercing coin bag | CHUNK! | TSUNK | TSUNK |
| jumping into water | SPLASH! | MOLSKIS | MOLSK |
| coin falling through hat | RIP! | RRITS | RIP |
| pie fight | SPLAT! SPLOK! SMACK! | SPLÄTS SPLOTSH KLÄTS | PLÄTS SPLÄT SKLÄT |
| sobbing | SOB! | NYYH! | Nyyh! |

**Table 7:** Examples of sound effects and their translations in *The Secret of Atlantis*

The two Finnish versions of the story were published 17 years apart, and the older one has apparently served as a reference point when the updated translation was created. This is evident in the dialogue, which contains some identical wordings. The same is possibly visible in the sound effects, but it is hard to tell whether the similarities are coincidences resulting from, for example, onomatopoeia or whether they are purposeful reproductions of an earlier translation in the more recent version.

In *Juhlasarjat 5*, all sound effects are printed in black regardless of their original colour, whereas in AA, colours are used in the sound effects regularly, with the texts sporting a black outline as in the English version. There are other systematic differences in the general typographical conventions, too. In the original comic, all texts are written in capitals regardless of whether they are inside perigrams or not. The Finnish versions use two different strategies: in *Juhlasarjat,* both dialogue and sound effects are printed in capitals which resemble text written by hand, while AA uses a uniform font with lower case letters in dialogue but hand-written upper case letters in sound effects.

A convention in the English comic which has not been transferred into either of the translations is the excessive use of exclamation marks in both dialogue and sound effects. Each sound effect is followed by an exclamation mark in the original story, emphasizing the loudness of the sounds even if the sound effect itself is loud and bold in appearance. Exclamation marks are absent from the translations. The regular dialogue inside balloons uses a whole range of punctuation marks available even in the

translations, but they are less likely to use exclamation marks for emphasis as often as the original. Within perigrams, the Finnish comic always uses some punctuation, however, which means that even the sound effects in balloons must use punctuation. Indeed, in this corpus, all sound effects within balloons in DDB end with an exclamation mark. In general, it appears that even when text inside balloons contains incomplete sentences, an effort is made to create more complete expressions. Simultaneously, all texts inside perigrams are translated.

An interesting phenomenon in this comic is that the few sound effects inside balloons resembling dialogue, namely reactions expressing surprise and similar sounds interpreted as potentially involuntary utterances, have been translated into Finnish as more "proper" words than the original ones, especially in AA. Examples of this are HUH? and UH-ULP! in the original comic, translated respectively as MITÄH? (in AA)/TÄÄH? (in *Juhlasarjat*), and TUOTA... HUH! (in AA)/ÖH, KLUP! (in *Juhlasarjat*). In the first pair of translations, MITÄH?/TÄÄH? are both versions of the interrogative pronoun '*mitä*' ('what'), the former used with the addition of -h for more emphasis and the latter in an elliptical, emphatic form. In the translation of the second effect, a whole word has been added to AA. This translation strategy could have been chosen because the balloons in the Finnish Duck comics appear to strive for more complete expressions inside the perigrams, reserving them more clearly for dialogue. "SOB!" and "HIC!", however, are clearly not dialogue, and they are translated as sound effects instead of being turned into dialogue even inside balloons or thought balloons.

Some sound effects in DDB refer to previous dialogue in the comic. Scrooge is talking about a coin and the sound it makes: "I love to [...] hear it tinkle!" Some panels later, the coin falls and bounces on the pavement and on some barrels with the sound effect TINK! TINKLE! In the Finnish dialogue, Scrooge refers to "kilinä" in dialogue but the sound effects are TINK PLINK (in AA) and PLINK KLINK (in *Juhlasarjat*), neither of which is identical to the word in the dialogue, unlike in the original. Unlike in the *Peanuts* example above (see 5.2.1.1), however, this translation does not have much effect on how the story moves forward and how it is interpreted. "Kilin kilin" would nonetheless be a possible translation that would retain the original similarity, but the translation would perhaps become slightly repetitive.

### 5.2.1.4 *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never*

In *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never*, Scrooge McDuck is out prospecting in an Australian desert and has to deal with a threatening highwayman, various types of native animals, and a flash flood. Accordingly, the sound effects involve different tools, animals, water and other relevant topics. The sound effects show a lot of variation, perhaps because of the genre which allows for quite surprising events, sounds and exclamations for humoristic purposes.

In many respects, the translation of the 2005 version of *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot* by Markku Saarinen meets the expectations listed in the hypothesis section, and the individual translations are perhaps the most consistent in their adherence to natural-sounding Finnish language. Firstly, not a single sound effect has been left in its original English form. This makes the translation exceptional in this corpus since the other translations use *repetitio* at least a few times. Secondly, there appears to be little English interference in the translations. Thirdly, various strategies have been applied to the translation. An absence of interference is exemplified by the following sound effects and their translations, which show little similarity: WAAOOGH!/BUUU-UAAH (the sound of a didgeridoo), WHEW!/PHUH! (relief), RUMBLE!/JYRINÄÄ (an approaching mob of kangaroos), >SNIFF< >SNIFF</NUUH NUUH? (sniffing), ZOW!/VIUUH (departing at fast speed), ROAR!/KOSSH (water flooding a cave in the ground), ROAR!/KOHINAA (water sweeping across the desert in a distance), and CHINK!/NARSK (digging with a pickaxe). Four Finnish effects are rather similar to the English original sounds, but even these have been orthographically adjusted: KPOW!/PAUU (sound of a shotgun), CRSSHH!/KRÄSSHH (sound of sand pouring into a cave), FLOP!/VOPS (lassoing), and SWOOP!/SVUPSIS (jumping to hang supported by axe).

There are some surprises, however: contrary to expectations, sound effects have been omitted even more often than in any of the other comics. No speech balloons have been left empty, though. Whether or not the removed sound effect would have been difficult to replace with a translation does not seem to have had any effect on what has been removed; both loose and embedded effects have been omitted. The choices appear to have been made based on the relevance of the sound effect for the plot, ignoring

61

potential technical difficulties involved. Ominous, thunderous waves threatening to wipe away the main characters, and an emu with a role in the plot have retained their sounds, while sounds coming from minor actions such as dropping down a backpack (THUD!) or picking up something in a hurry (GLOM!) have been been left out. Though *deletio* was unexpected in this comic, it has been used only where appropriate.

Even more interestingly, however, one sound effect has been added into a panel, perhaps to compensate for a removed one in an adjacent panel. In this particular case, the omitted sound effect THUD! depicts how Scrooge's backpack is dropped from the back of his camel by a highwayman of questionable morals after breaking his promise to help Scrooge up from a cave in the ground. Instead of translating the original sound THUD!, the translator has added to the previous panel the sound of a rope dropping into the same cave (HUMPS). In this case, the sound effect has been moved to a more acutely relevant detail of the story; the falling rope prevents Scrooge from escaping the cave he is trapped in, but dropping the backpack does not affect the plot in such a significant way. Even though a sound effect has been added elsewhere, this example is not a case of *transmutatio*: a sound effect is not relocated, but one is removed and another with a different meaning is added. Therefore, the addition of HUMPS and the omission of THUD! represent two separate translation procedures, *deletio* and *adiectio*.

The location of a sound effect appears to have had no impact on how well it has been translated, as suggested above. If the original sound effect overlaps with a picture, the sound effect has been erased, the picture has been filled in wherever necessary, and a translated sound effect has been reinserted into the picture. The translated sound effects have, however, often been moved so that they do not interfere with the picture and are placed in a less crowded part of the panel. This is a clear case of *transmutatio*. In many other comics examined the original location of the text and the way the it overlaps with the picture have played a much greater role in whether or not the effect has been translated, even when the other comics were in black-and-white and would have required less adjustment.

There are several differences in the conventions that the English and Finnish versions of DDR1 follow, and they are not unlike the respective conventions of DDB. In the original version, many sound effects are coloured and outlined with black. In the

translation, no sound effects have colour but the effect has been compensated for by a greater variety in the orthography, for instance using shaky, rumbling characters instead of a massive multicoloured font. There are also further, systematic differences in the use of upper and lower case letters when it comes to depicting the "dialogue" or thoughts of an animal. The original version uses lower case letters to differentiate between some wild animal sounds and other sounds – for example, between the anthropomorphic characters' utterances and exclamations, natural sounds, and sounds originating from man-made objects. Most sounds use capital letters consistently, but animal sounds do not even begin with a capital, though this type of usage in not systematic in the English comic. The Finnish version is entirely written in capitals. The systematic changes could be considered cases of *substitutio* because the orthography is altered quite significantly.

The use of exclamation marks is another aspect which reveals notable differences between the different language versions and, on the other hand, great similarity to DDB's translation. The dialogue in many of the humorous English-language comics, including this one, uses an overwhelming amount of exclamation marks compared to the Finnish translations, where they are used more sparingly. Similarly, sound effects outside speech balloons often have exclamation marks after them in the English original of the story. In the translation, they are always left out if the sound effect is not enclosed in a perigram – a partial *deletio*. Inside a balloon, an exclamation mark is possible. Again, balloons clearly strive for more complete sentences, if not in sentence structure then at least in punctuation. Like in DDB, the translation relies more on the typography to show that a sound is loud and does not add an exclamation mark after the effect to emphasize the loudness that should be clear from the visual and narrative context.

### 5.2.1.5 *The Cowboy Captain of Cutty Sark*

Because the life of Scrooge McDuck is an epic one, the story *Cowboy Captain of Cutty Sark* (*Cutty Sarkin cowboykapteeni*) combines rather different events in a small number of pages. The themes and, therefore, sound effects involve such diverse phenomena, inventions and entities as sailing, cattle, wild animals, a massive volcanic eruption, and an early prototype of the car. In the story, Scrooge is sailing the shores of Indonesia on the ship *Cutty Sark* when the infamous explosion of the island of Krakatoa takes place.

During the story, he witnesses the invention of the very first car powered by volcanic energy, sells cattle, and saves the ship from various devastating effects of the eruption, among other feats.

The story contains plenty of both mechanical and natural sounds; it is 23 pages long, and 19 of them contain sound effects that are not in the middle of dialogue. In DDR2, many sound effects are not set in balloons but are nonetheless enclosed in spaces that function like balloons (see section 2.2.1). For instance, the VROOM sounds from a car are written inside motion lines behind the machine and the sound of panicking animals is shown in a cloud of dust. The translations of these sounds are located in the same areas as the originals.

There are a few differences to the translation of the other Rosa story. Unlike in the previous story, some sound effects have been copied from the original English version: BONK!, VROOM!, TAP!, ROAR!, SPLASH, WAP, POW, SMASH, SPLOOSH!, CRUNCH and SLAP! all retain their English form. *Repetitio* takes place especially when the sound effects are coloured and highly visual in some other way. Texts in plain black have been replaced with translations in black – except for one loose sound effect which is removed altogether. Some translations have been moved from a prominent place to a smaller area in the panel, again an instance of *transmutatio* and, to some extent, *substitio* with regard to the changed font. For instance, an approaching flood wave makes an ominous, overwhelming ROOOAR! through a whole panel in the original but the Finnish JYMIN has been given a more modest visual form in a less central position of the panel, undoubtedly an easier effect to recreate. There are a few instances where an effect crossing an entire panel or an otherwise prominent sound has been made smaller.

The translated sound effects mostly adhere to Finnish expressions and make rather frequent use of the letters *ä* and *ö* and the sound [y], none of which exist in English. The English version has apparently affected some of the translations, though, as many effects contain same letters and sounds as the originals, for example FWEET!/FIIII!, V-VRROOM!/VROUM, SQUIRT!/PRUITS, WHOOOOOOOOOOOSHHH!/ VVVUUUSSHHH and WUH-OH!/O-OU! Then again, sound symbolism and onomatopoeia might account for some of the similarities. Another example is the sound

of a steamboat, CHUG CHUG CHUG, which looks so foreign that it has been translated into TSUK TSUK TSUK. This is an example where the Finnish sound is somewhat like the English one but differs notably in orthography. Very different sounds also appear, for instance FUP!/TÖMS, BUMMMMMM/JYRIN and the frustrated MOAAAN!/ÄHH! Some sound effects have been left untranslated, which did not happen in the other Rosa translation and is contrary to the expectations. The sounds not translated include such previously mentioned examples as ROAR! and WAP, some of which can look very foreign in Finnish. Readers who have acquainted themselves with comics are probably able to recognize and interpret most of them based on previous experience and the current context. Nonetheless, at least the sound effects SPLASH and SMASH could have been made more Finnish by replacing the letter *a* with *ä* with little effort. This strategy has not been exploited in any of the effects.

Sound effects have not only been translated but also added in DDR2; there are a total of seven cases of *adiectio* in this comic, more than in any of the others. In addition, in some panels, sound effects have been moved from one place to another relatively freely, as in *transmutatio*. This strategy appears to be more common in this comic than in the others. The removed elements are compensated for by similar elements, but the motivation behind the changes is not always immediately visible in this story since there usually is plenty of room for the new effect in the place of the old one.

In one panel, however, an interesting change has taken place when a small text has been omitted and a different, bigger one has been added to a different place, similarly to the cases of *deletio* and *adiectio* in DDR1 discussed above. In the English version, a piece of an exploding Krakatoa hits the ship Scrooge is on with exactly the same sound as in a previous panel (WAP). Instead of translating the sound effect WAP with, for example, a sound previously used for the same English sound (KLOP), the sound has been removed and a different one (MOKS) has been added next to another piece hitting Scrooge's top hat. Conveniently, this particular story shows how Scrooge gets acquainted with the top hat, an accessory which later becomes a familiar characteristic of Scrooge McDuck. It is possible that the translator has made a conscious choice to direct the reader's attention to the future trademark of the character from a ship which only makes one appearance and is in that sense quite insignificant.

### 5.2.1.6 *Batman*

*Batman: Year One* by DC Comics represents a typical superhero comic in this study, even if Batman is not strictly speaking a superhero in the traditional sense because he lacks super powers. The setting of the story is Gotham City, a dark and corrupt place, which the main characters of this album, Bruce Wayne and Jim Gordon, set out to clean. Unsurprisingly, many of the sound effects depict cars braking, guns firing, fists flying, and people grunting. The amount of sound effects in total, however, is smaller than might be expected: out of 62 pages only 24 pages contain stand-alone sound effects in writing, even though action, such as fighting or shooting, appears much more frequently. Some action scenes are perhaps considered to need more emphasis than others.

Some observations of the use of sound effects can be made based on a general analysis of the whole album. Police cars, other cars and gunfire figure prominently in the comic, and they always seem to be accompanied by sound effects. Choppers, grenades, bombs, collapsing staircases, and other inanimate objects make sounds that are regularly signified by sound effects in the comic. Cats' meows and a baby's cry are also marked, and they usually are an important part of the story in terms of emphasis, mood or future plot lines of the story. The fight scenes, however, are not always accompanied by a sound track. It appears that fights in which the main character Wayne/Batman or another good character, Gordon, take part are not illustrated with sound effects, whereas violent scenes with all other characters often do contain sound effects. For example, Bruce Wayne practising his martial arts skills by breaking bricks and kicking apart trees has not been supplied with sound effects, while scenes of corrupt policemen using excessive force are accompanied by loud effects. Batman's fights have no sound effects originating from other sources than guns and other inanimate objects. In other words, the distribution of sound effects may have been used as a means of emphasizing or downplaying the seriousness of the violence or violent action depending on the character.

The initial assumption was that embedded sound effects are not translated at all in BAT because of conventions within the genre. This expectation was found to be in line with how the translation had been made: no effort had been put into changing the sound

effects in the pictures. Only factors related to printing have affected the look of the colourful sound effects embedded in the imagery; the shades, colours and quality of the print have changed slightly, though even the size of the album and its images remains the same. This may either be seen as a sign of reluctance to take up the cumbersome and potentially costly task of changing the pictures or, alternatively, suggest that the translator or the publisher thinks that the sound effects are such an integral element of the visual contents that tampering with them might be considered a violation of the artwork and the original artist's intention. In the highly visual sound effects, *repetitio* could indicate respect for the comic as a dynamic piece of art.

Some sound effects in speech balloons have not been altered except for rewriting the text in its original form, though one text (a universally understandable AAAA) has been copied directly from the original picture, resulting in a poorer quality of print. Some sound effects, on the other hand, have been translated inside speech balloons, unlike in the pictures.

As in some of the other comics, sound effects inside balloons are marked with asterisks or by marks which resemble half an asterisk (marked here with the 'greater than' and 'less than' marks > <). The > < marks are absent from the translation, and effects are, instead, marked with a bold font. In the original comic, as in the *Duck* comics, bolding is used more often as emphasis in the dialogue than in the Finnish version, so bolding is reserved for this specific function in Finnish.

With few translations and many cases of *repetitio*, all translated sound effects are most conveniently presented in a single table (Table 8 below). All the seven translations are from inside speech balloons.

| Depicted action | English sound effect | Finnish sound effect |
|---|---|---|
| disapproval | WHFF | HUH. |
| being hit | **NGGG** | **AGGGH!** |
| awoken by cat | nffmgmm | MMMMMH |
| waking up, woken up by a cat | mmfgg | MMMMMH |
| waking-up, grunting, hearing bad news | ggnf | MMH |
| hit by a dart | **HHKKK** | **AGGGH!** |
| cough | >KOFF< | **KÖH!** |

**Table 8:** Sound effects and their translations in *Batman*

The table shows that the use of capitals is more consistent in the Finnish version, even when the depicted sound is muffled and drowsy. This can be seen either as a positive sign, all sound effects being indicated in a consistent way, or a loss, limiting the available means of expression of the typography. On the other hand, punctuation has been added to some of the sound effects, which is in line with the assumption that more complete sentences are preferred in the speech balloons, as already observed in some of the other comics. In >KOFF</KÖH!, the > < markings have been removed, a change possible to interpret as a kind of a loss or, more likely, a difference in conventions. In any case, it is a type of *substitutio*. In general, the few sound effect translations are consistent with other sounds of similar themes: injuries result in AGGGH!, while waking up involves a lot of MMH. Considering the small amount of texts changed, however, the most common strategy for sound effects is not translating them at all. No *adiectio*, *deletio* or *transmutatio* takes place, which is no surprise when mainly the strategy of *repetitio* is employed.

### 5.2.1.7 *Watchmen*

One striking feature of *Watchmen* is that it has few or no embedded or loose sound effects, as if implying that the reader knows what kinds of sounds accompany the events. Some sound effects are present inside speech balloons to depict sounds originating from human sources, however, which shifts the focus from action to people or, alternatively, lets the pictures speak for themselves. Brash and showy sound effects are missing entirely. Because sound effects are relatively sparse in the comic, the

empirical study encompasses a larger section of the comic compared to the other comics of the corpus – in other words, the first two chapters.

Because *Watchmen* is mainly a more or less disillusioned representative of the superhero genre and because the sound effects are restricted to text in balloons, the sound effects are mostly various grunts of pain and similar involuntary sounds. Quite often, too, grunts originate from one of the vigilantes, a darker character called Rorschach, who also happens to wear a mask. He makes plenty of HURM sounds, which may be caused either by the mask or his general attitude – it is hard to tell which.

The dialogues are written in capital letters, and so are the sound effects. Many of the sound effects end with a full stop. Those without a full stop are often sounds from the more primal end of the spectrum, such as sounds of pain. The translation mostly follows the same pattern as the English effects, but as before, the sound effects are not always marked in the same way. The English-language version uses the >marking style< familiar from *Batman*, but Finnish uses at least two different ways of marking the same effects, as in >HUHH</-HUHH- and >BURRUP</RRÖYYHH.

All of the sound effects appear to have been rewritten, but few of them have been changed into a more Finnish expression. In fact, in only three instances the sound effects have been changed, and two of them are related to eating. Some sound effects have lost or gained a few letters but remain practically unchanged in the two language versions. English-language messy eating of beans CHLOP. THLUP. SHORP. LEP. has become SLURP. SHLUP. SHLOP. LUP. in the Finnish translation, and the translation has some similarities with the original. It is possible that the English sound effects have caused some interference in the translation or that onomatopoeia or universals of sound symbolism account for the similarities in the different versions of the effects. The influence of the original sound effects on the translation are clearest in the last pair LEP./LUP., where the difference is minimal. LUP. is not a very typical Finnish sound of eating (*cf. e.g.* "SLURP", "MAISKIS" or "MUSSUN MUSSUN"), whereas a more common Finnish sound is the translation of >BURRUP< into RRÖYYHH. A surprising translation is PAHH in English becoming PFAA in Finnish. In this particular context, the sound is most likely to represent a feeling that might be expressed by BAH or PAH/PLÄÄH in a less serious genre. The translation retains the sharp stop [p] of the

original effect but introduces a sound more foreign to Finnish than the ones in the original sound effect, namely [f]. In short, the few translated sound effects are dealt with in different ways but no further conclusions can be drawn on this basis. *Repetitio* is again the most frequently used strategy, with no instances of *adiectio*, *deletio*, *transmutatio* or *substitio* (except for a few changes in how sound effects are marked).

The translation *Vartijat* in some ways resembles *Batman: Ensimmäinen vuosi*. Both rely on the reader's understanding of what each English effect means. However, the translations cannot be compared directly because the sound effects are distributed in different ways. The texts left untranslated in BAT are in pictures whereas some balloons are translated – a common trend in almost all of the comics – but this is not the case in *Vartijat*. However, some similarity is found when other aspects are considered: *Vartijat* containa a lot of inscriptions, or text as a part of picture, and many of them are left untranslated. As a whole, sound effects are much less frequently translated inside balloons in this comic.

### 5.2.2 Discussion on the translation strategies

Considering the whole corpus, a number of translation strategies are present: *repetitio*, *deletio*, *adiectio*, *substitutio*, *transmutatio* and translation have been applied to the sound effects of this corpus. The different strategies are not evenly distributed among the different comics, however, and certain genres prefer certain strategies. Some of the observations are in line with the initial hypothesis, while others exhibit a greater variety of strategies than expected. In the case of *Watchmen*, the original use of sound effects is also surprising because they appear only in balloons. The use of different translation strategies varies considerably depending on the comic and its genre. Some general trends are discernible, however.

*Repetitio* takes place very frequently in the serious comics *Batman* and *Watchmen* and is much more common in them than the translation of the effects. Most of their sound effects are directly transferred from the original, though the text inside balloons may be rewritten. By contrast, in the humorous comics, most of the sound effects are translated but *repetitio* also occurs. The use of *repetitio* in humorous comics can be affected by the

location, typography and colour of the sound effect. For instance, if a sound effect extents over several panels, it is more likely that it has been left in its English form. Effects with showy or colourful typography are more likely to be left as they are in the original, and as expected, embedded sound effects are more often transferred in their original form than loose sound effects. There are exceptions, though, and for example in *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never*, all sound effects are translated regardless of their location in balloons or outside them. Some cases of *repetitio* appear to be motivated by the sounds themselves: some sound effects transferred from the original are understood quite well in Finnish, too.

*Deletio* is rare in the corpus. Most cases of *deletio* were found in *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never*, which used this strategy on three occasions. One omission was found in *The Cowboy Captain of the Cutty Sark* and in the sample of *Peanuts* strips. Only in PEA, however, is the omitted effect relevant to the understanding of the joke or the story. The *deletio* in DDR1 and DDR2 might be the result of more deliberate processing of the meaning of the effect because the removed effects are compensated for or illustrate such minor actions or events that their omission does not remove anything crucial from the comic. Minor changes that could be regarded as partial *deletio* occur frequently when exclamation marks are removed from sound effects outside perigrams. The fact that omissions are possible without rendering the comic incomprehensible is interesting from the point of view of constrained translation. Pictures do not always complicate the translation process but can also make it easier.

*Adiectio* appears to appear in conjunction with *deletio*, though not always when something is removed (the *Peanuts* strips in the corpus do not contain any additions but one crucial case of removal was found). Only the two comics by Rosa contain some cases of *adiectio*. The same translations also contain more *deletio* and *transmutatio* than any of the other comics. This suggests that a comic that resorts to more complicated strategies than straightforward *repetitio* or "simple" translation is more likely to use a wider range of different complicated strategies than the other comics. *Transmutatio* is used in some of the humorous comics. It is applied especially to sound effects in the picture and appears to be particularly popular for turning embedded sound effects into loose sound effects by relocating them to an emptier area of a panel. This is undoubtedly done to reduce the need for editing the picture.

*Substitutio* was found only in rather small details, such as dividing a sound effect differently between panels, using different fonts or font colours, or using different ways of marking animal sounds. In addition, replacing hand-written lettering with printed letters and variation between upper case and lower case letters also appeared rather frequently. Other cases of *substitutio* included turning the contents of speech balloons into more complete words and giving them punctuation. Some of these changes are probably motivated by different conventions of different publications. In short, *substitutio* is common but concerns mostly minor extralinguistic details.

The different strategies of translation can be mixed freely and can occur even within a single panel. One large sound effect in a picture can be translated, while the next, very visual sound effect in the same panel keeps its original form. This shows that the choice of strategy can and should be weighed individually for each effect, taking into consideration both the linguistic and technical aspects of the particular translation.

Even when *repetitio* is applied in humorous comics, most of the effects in the translated comics convey all the necessary information. The effects that are transferred are often sufficiently familiar for the Finnish audience to understand. In only a few cases, the translation of a comic's sound effect detracts from its interpretation: one *deletio* makes the interpretation of a joke more difficult (even *repetitio* would have made the joke more clear), and in another case, a translation in dialogue does not match the sound effect and therefore fails to convey a joke (both examples are from PEA). Other minor omissions or changes, such as those found in the *Duck* comics, do not lower the information value of the comic in any significant way. The foreignness resulting from *repetitio* may affect the reading experience for some Finns, while the use of the other strategies probably rarely results in confusion.

In the two serious graphic novels, BAT and WM, the high degree of *repetitio* is more challenging to the reader. In BAT, an attempt is made to adapt the sound effects within perigrams to the requirements of the Finnish reader, but in WM, this is unusual. In short, the translations of the sound effects in BAT and WM are more difficult and probably require more knowledge of English from the reader. However, the audiences of these comics are probably expected to be quite different than those of the humorous comics.

As expected, the location of the sound effect plays an important role in translation. There is, again, variation between the strategies of different comics, but the majority of texts inside balloons is translated. WM and BAT are more likely to have their balloon texts left untranslated than the other comics, but even in BAT they are more often translated than the other effects. Embedded sound effects are most often kept in their original form. Some of the comics have few or no embedded effects at all. Loose sound effects fall somewhere between the two types mentioned above, but the strategies applied to them vary significantly from straightforward translation to *repetitio* and *deletio*. Since loose sound effects do not overlap with pictures, they should be easier to replace than embedded ones and, in that sense, resemble the text in balloons. Because the two are not as often translated despite the similarity, they are perhaps perceived differently, with sound effects in balloons resembling dialogue and effects outside balloons equated more with pictorial content.

The role of colours also becomes clear in the sound effect translations. At least in Calvin and Hobbes, originally colourful sound effects were more often translated in the black-and-white Finnish album than in the album which uses colour. In the localisation of a comic using colours, the translation of a sound effect probably requires more work. Somewhat similarly, a colourful sound effect may be translated in black instead of in colour. No clear generalisations can be made on this trait, however, because the policies differ in different comics to some extent.

## 5.2.3 Sound effects by source

In this section, sound effects are categorised by their source and properties and analysed from the point of view of sound symbolism. Because sound effects also depict sounds that do not necessarily have established ways of describing them in writing, it could be expected that they make frequent use of sound symbolism. By examining the groups of sound effects, categorised by their semantic content, I am hoping to uncover new potential sound symbols for the properties that the sounds of the groups share. I also compare the effects in my corpus with the sound symbols that have been previously introduced in section 4.1 of this thesis and suggested by Bloomfield (1933, cited in Abelin 1999:32), Rhodes (1994: 276-278), Oswalt (1994: 297) and Leskinen (1991:

355). Because few Finnish sound symbols have already been identified, I am extracting them from my corpus through comparing the Finnish sounds with the English sound symbols and potential sound symbols, and identifying which traits occur in the Finnish sound effects without interference from the English originals. However, since only the corpus scrutinised is limited, I can only suggest potential sound symbols, which have to be confirmed or rejected by further research based on broader linguistic material.

Some of the categories overlap, and a single sound effect can belong to several of them. In such cases, the effect is grouped under all of the appropriate categories. Some sound effects depict an action that contains almost opposite elements, for example being of both a sudden and a slightly more gradual nature. For example, CHUNK/TSUNK/TSUNK is the sound of a trident sinking into a bag of coins in Barks' *Secret of Atlantis*. The sound effect could refer to different phases of this action or their combination: the trident making its way through water, ripping through the fabric of the bag, sinking into the coins, or, finally, stopping suddenly at impact. Some of these possible meanings of the effect are sudden, others take slightly longer, and still others depict impact or breakage. Categorising the effects based on only their semantic content is somewhat difficult. Rhodes' (1994: 276-278) identification of [tʃ-] as a short sound or a sound with irregular onset, however, would help to categorise this as an abrupt sound, but the division in this section is based on the information content of the sound effects rather than their appearance.

The following categories are identified: impact, friction, air current, liquid and food, breakage, explosions and gunshots, long-lasting sounds, and pitch. The categories depict an action or an event, the materials involved, or the quality of the sound effect itself, as already explained in section 5.1. The duration and the pitch of a sound are examined in the same way as the sound effects grouped by their source, but they differ from the others as they are properties of the sounds themselves. This is why they are examined in their own section after the thematically divided effects.

The following sections deal with the different aspects and contain effects from all of the comics but avoid unnecessary repetition when the sound effects are identical or differing slightly only in the amount of letters. When a sound effect is too difficult to interpret accurately, it is excluded from the list. As previously, the abbreviations DDB,

DDR1, DDR2, C&H, BAT, PEA, and WM refer to Barks' *The Secret of Atlantis*, Rosa's *Dreamtime Duck of the Never-Never*, Rosa's *The Cowboy Captain of Cutty Sark*, *Calvin and Hobbes*, *Batman*, *Peanuts* and *Watchmen*, respectively.

Because a new approach is used in this analysis, there is no established way of marking the different aspects of the sound effects. The system adopted for marking the examples, letters of the alphabet, and sounds is based on phonetic conventions and on what I consider the clearest way of differentiating between the several different aspects discussed in the same context. As in the section above, examples from the corpus are written in CAPITAL LETTERS without quotation marks. The order of sound effect and its translation or translations is the same as above, namely ENGLISH EFFECT/FINNISH TRANSLATION/SECOND FINNISH TRANSLATION. Letters of the alphabet are written in *italics*, while sounds from both English and Finnish are placed within [square brackets]. The location of certain sounds or combinations of sounds inside an effect may be important, which is why hyphens are used within the square brackets to indicate the sounds' place in a word.

### 5.2.3.1 Impact

Sounds of "impact" depict sounds originating from the collision of two (or several) objects. The sound varies depending on how soft or hard the different objects are, how fast the object or objects are moving, and on whether and how either side yields at impact. There is a significant difference between, for example, a pillow landing on a bed, a bullet hitting and breaking glass, and an object falling into water. Despite variation, these types of sound effects are easy to distinguish as a distinct group of their own on the basis of the action they originate from. Sound effects for impact found in my corpus are presented in Table 9, subdivided on the basis of the types of materials involved in the impact.

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Second Finnish translation | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| ***Hard and hard*** | | | | |
| bullet against wall | SPAKK | SPAKK | | BAT |
| baseball bat against furniture | SMASH | PAM | PAM | C&H |
| pieces of lamp against floor | PING PING PING | PING PING PING | PING PING PING | C&H |
| pieces of lamp against floor | KRITCH KRUNCH | RITS RATS | RITS RATS | C&H |
| door against door frame | SLAM! | SLAM! | | PEA |
| receiver against phone | *CLICK* | *KLIK* | *KLIK* | C&H |
| volcanic rock against camera | CRUNCH! | CRUNCH! | | DDR2 |
| volcanic rock against boat | POW | POW | | DDR2 |
| volcanic rock against boat | POW | PAM | | DDR2 |
| volcanic rock against boat | BAM | POK | | DDR2 |
| volcanic rock against boat | WAP | KLOP | | DDR2 |
| hooves against deck | STOMPITY | JYTIN | | DDR2 |
| hooves against deck | STOMP | JYTIN | | DDR2 |
| pickaxe against ground | CHINK! | NARSK | | DDR1 |
| pickaxe against ground | CHINK! | ROUSK | | DDR1 |
| coin against machine | CLINK! | KLINK | KLINK | DDB |
| coin against ground | TINK! | TINK | PLINK | DDB |
| coin against ground | TINKLE! | PLINK | KLINK | DDB |
| coin against pan | PLINK! | TLINK | PLINK | DDB |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| coin against ground | PLINK! | PLINK | PLINK | DDB |
| trident against coin bag | CHUNK! | TSUNK | TSUNK | DDB |
| head against pole | BONK! | BONK! | | DDR2 |
| ***Hard and soft*** | | | | |
| volcanic rock against top hat | | MOKS | | DDR2 |
| photo against coins | SLAP! | SLAP! | | DDR2 |
| head against wall | THUD! | TUNKS | KLONK | DDB |
| boomerang against hand | WHAK! | MOKS | | DDR1 |
| hoof against head | PAT | TAP | | DDR2 |
| snowball against person | POW POW POW POW | POW POW POW POW | LÄTS LÄTS LÄTS LÄTS | C&H |
| person against ceiling | THOOM | THOOM | | BAT |
| fist against face | WHUKK | WHUKK | | BAT |
| foot against head | THWOKK | THWOKK | | BAT |
| person against ground | WHOMP | WHOMP | | PEA |
| person against football | THUMP | THUMP | | PEA |
| ball against ground | PAT | | | PEA |
| ball against ground | BUMPETY-BUMP | | | PEA |
| ball against ground | BUMPETY-BUMPETY-BUMP | | | PEA |
| ball against ground | BUMP-BUMP | | | PEA |
| ball against ground | BUMP | | | PEA |
| ***Soft and soft*** | | | | |
| rope against sand | | HUMPS | | DDR1 |
| lasso against person | FLOP! | VOPS | | DDR1 |
| animal against person | FUP! | TÖMS | | DDR2 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| tiger against person | KAPOW! | KAPOW! | KAPOW! | C&H |
| tiger against person | WUMP! | WUMP! | TUMPS! | C&H |
| person against person | SHOVE | TYÖNTÖ | TYÖNTÖ | C&H |
| finger against finger | | NAPS | | DDR2 |
| finger against shoulder | TAP! | TAP! | | DDR2 |
| people against snow | SPLOOP | SPLOOP | SUIHH | C&H |
| *Liquid and soft* | | | | |
| pie against person | SPLAT! | PLÄTS | SPLÄTS | DDB |
| pie against person | SPLOK! | SPLÄT | SPLOTSH | DDB |
| pies against head | SMACK! | SKLÄT | KLÄTS | DDB |
| person against water | SPLASH! | MOLSK | MOLSKIS | DDB |
| paint against hand | SPLUT! | | | DDR1 |
| water against person | SQUIRT! | RUITS | | DDR2 |
| water against person | SQUIRT! | PRUITS | | DDR2 |
| *Liquid and hard* | | | | |
| coin against pie | PLONK! | PLONK | PLONK | DDB |
| water against boat | SLAP! | LOISKIS | | DDR2 |
| huge rock against water | SMASH | SMASH | | DDR2 |
| water against earth | WHAP! | VVAPS | | DDR2 |
| boat against water | SPLOOSH! | POLSKIS | | DDR2 |
| volcanic rock against water | SPLASH | SPLASH | | DDR2 |

**Table 9:** Sound effects for impact

In this heterogeneous group of sound effects, the following combinations of sounds are present: [-ŋk], [pl-], [spl-], [sm-], [kl-], [-tʃ], [tʃ-], [wh-], [st-], [sk-], [ps-], [-mp], [sl-], [kr-], [-ntʃ], [sp-] and [θ-]. Out of these, Bloomfield has identified [kr-] as a sign of noisy impact. He also says that [b-] indicates dull impact, and that is the function of [b-] in the above examples, too. Rhodes makes several relevant observations: [p-], [b-], [bl-], [kl-], [pl-] and [kr-], found in the sound effects of the corpus, are mostly described as sounds having to do with "abrupt onset", as is fitting for sounds of impact, and [tʃ-] indicates a short sound or irregular onset. [-ts] appears to be used in a similar function in Finnish. Based on the sound effects in my material, I suggest that [-ŋk] is also a sound symbol for impact and a sound with "abrupt onset" in both languages. In English, [sm-] from SMACK and SMASH could also tentatively be added to the list of sounds with "abrupt onset", and [θ-] and [-mp] are probably involved in "dull impact".

It appears that the stop sounds, especially [p] and [k], are dominant in sounds representing impact since they can occur independently, in combination with other sounds, and both as the initial and final consonant of an effect. On the whole, they are very often present in this type of sound effect since only four of the 57 English effects in Table 9 do not contain a single stop sound. I suggest that the stops are symbols for abrupt sounds and sounds of impact in Finnish, too, because of their frequency in the translations. This phenomenon, as discussed above, could be explained by the abruptness and certain hardness of the stop sounds themselves. The voiced stops [b] and [d], however, are used in sounds representing dull impact in Table 9. Though PING PING PING uses the letter *g*, it does not contain the sound [g], there are no examples of the voiced stop [g] to analyse. I suggest that the nasal sounds [n] and [m] and, at times, the use of voiced stops [b] and [d] instead of the voiceless [p] and [t] gives a sound effect a lower-pitch, more booming quality based on the way they are used in the effects of Table 9.

Stop sounds and [-ŋk] and [-ts] appear in the Finnish sounds of impact as they do in English, but other potential sound symbols are also visible in the Finnish sound effects. For example, the combination [-ks] appears in the Finnish TUNKS and twice in MOKS from different comics. It is not frequent but occurs only in Finnish without any prompt from the original English effects in three different comics and contains the stop [k], with stops previously identified as abrupt sounds (by *e.g.* Bredin & Oswalt). The similar

combination of stop and sibilant [-ps] would appear to serve as an abrupt sound in Finnish, too, for example in HUMPS. [kl-], on the other hand, is not absent from the English sound effects, but occurs more often in the Finnish effects (in KLINK, KLONK, SKLÄT, KLÄTS, *KLIK*, and KLOP). [pl-] is common, too, though it occurs so frequently especially in sounds depicting wetness that it can also have other functions besides indicating impact.

## 5.2.3.2 Friction

Sounds of friction serve as a contrast to sounds of impact in the sense that they depict a prolonged contact with a surface. Table 10 below collects them together. As with sounds of impact, it would be possible to divide the sounds of friction based on the materials involved, but the relatively small amount of these sounds in my corpus does not call for a further division.

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|
| water against ground | ROAR! | JYMIN | DDR1 |
| water against ground | ROAR! | JYRIN | DDR1 |
| water against ground | ROAR! | KOHINAA | DDR1 |
| water against ground | ROAR! | JYRINÄÄ | DDR1 |
| water against ground (flooding downwards) | ROAR! | KOSSH | DDR1 |
| sand against ground | CRSSHH! | KRÄSSHH | DDR1 |
| sand against ground | CRUNCH | HRUMPS! | DDR1 |
| wheels against ground | SCREEECHH | SCREEECHH | BAT |
| wheels against ground | SKREEECHH | SKREEECHH | BAT |
| wheels against ground | SKREEEEEE | SKREEEEEE | BAT |
| hooves against deck | | NARSK | DDR2 |
| person against rope | | VIUP | DDR2 |
| ship against air | SWISSSSHHHHH | HHHHHSSSSSSSS | DDR2 |
| air against suppressor | PFFT | PFFT | BAT |

**Table 10:** Sound effects for friction

Four effects differ from the others slightly in terms of content. Most of the sounds depict something moving over a surface without constrictions, but CRSSHH/KRÄSSHH, ROAR/KOSSH and CRUNCH/HRUMPS depict the action of something pouring into a confined space, and PFFT/PFFT is the sound of air rapidly moving through a confined space. The two former effects depict a more gradual movement, while the latter two sounds involve a sudden movement, namely that of sand abruptly collapsing downwards into a cave and air pressing through a gun's suppressor. The first two effects have similar traits in Finnish as both of them contain the combination of consonants *sh*, which can be stretched to prolong the sound. CRUNCH/HRUMPS contains the abrupt [-tʃ] in English and [-ps] in Finnish, perhaps to end the slowly beginning sound abruptly.

As mentioned previously, Leskinen identifies [h] as a sound involving friction and Oswalt mentions that fricatives involve abrasion and air. The letter *h* is indeed quite frequent in these sound effects especially in Finnish. There is only one case of the fricative [f] in the sound effects in English, but sibilant fricatives figure prominently in the effects. In short, fricatives are common in these effects. Another relevant sound symbol suggested by Bloomfield is [skr-], symbolising a grating impact or sound. An example of this is SKREEEEEE as a sound of a car braking. This type of sound appears frequently in BAT with several alternative spellings. Besides the numerous fricatives, extracting any other specific symbols from these particular effects is difficult.

### 5.2.3.3 Air current

This category includes sounds involving air current or sounds made by objects moving swiftly through air. The sound of rapid movement is included in this category because it is interpreted as the sound of something swishing through the air. In Table 11, the sounds are subdivided into two groups based on whether they depict movement in air or movement of air. For the sake of clarity, sounds originating from musical instruments, animals or people are not included in this category, except for some relevant sounds of whistling, sighing or similar.

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|
| ***Something moving through air*** | | | |
| sails flapping | FLAP! | LÄPS | DDR2 |
| helicopter rotor | WHUP WHUP WHUP | WHUP WHUP WHUP | BAT |
| boomerang flying through air | ZING! | SVIUH | DDR1 |
| rope moving through air | | HUMPS | DDR1 |
| ship flying through air | SWISSSSHHHHH | HHHHHSSSSSSSS | DDR2 |
| person moving through air | SWOOP! | SVUPSIS | DDR1 |
| person moving through air | | VIUP | DDR2 |
| camel moving fast | ZOW! | VIUUH | DDR1 |
| ***Air moving*** | | | |
| pyroclastic flow | WHOOOOOOOOOOSHHH! | VVVUUUSSHHH | DDR2 |
| sigh of relief | WHEW! | PHUH! | DDR1 |
| sigh | SIGHHH | HUOKAUUUS | C&H |
| sigh | SIGH | UUH | PEA |
| hush | SHH | SHH | PEA |
| sneeze | AHCHOO | AATSHII | PEA |
| whistle | FWEET! | FIIII! | DDR2 |
| shooting with suppressor | PFFT | PFFT | BAT |
| gas grenade | FSSS | FSSS | BAT |
| gas grenade | SSSSS | SSSSS | BAT |

**Table 11:** Sound effects for air current

The approximants [v] in Finnish and [w] in English are common in the sounds of air current. According to Rhodes, [w-] signifies poorly resolvable onset. Many effects with [w-] could fit that criterion. Again, Rhodes' [tʃ-] appears in AHCHOO/AATSHII. In this case, however, the sound effect as a whole is not "short" or with "irregular onset", but the short [tʃ-] is surrounded by several vowels.

Especially in sounds involving air stream moving through constricted spaces and

possessing a more hissing quality, sibilants and the fricative [h] and, to some extent, [f] are rather frequent. The shushing SHH and the SSSSS of a gas grenade are good examples of this. This is in line with Oswalt's observation that fricatives are often involved with abrasion and air. In fact, all of the English effects here contain fricatives. The same is found in Finnish. In Finnish, the combination [-viu-] appears several times in two different comics without being influenced by English: *SVIUH*, *VIUUH* and *VIUP*. I suggest that it is a Finnish sound symbol for air current. Two cases of the rather similar [-vu-] are found, but they may be influenced by the original English sounds. Whether or not it is a Finnish sound symbol would need further examination. [v-] could be another sound symbol, but its distribution in the translations is not as clear as that of [-viu-]: it appears both with and without prompt from the English effect. Again, further research is necessary to confirm or reject it as a Finnish sound symbol. In short, fricatives, especially [f], [h] and [s], are systematically involved with streaming air. The tendency to contain fricatives is also found in sounds of friction.

### 5.2.3.4 Sounds involving liquid and food

These sounds are gathered together on the basis that they involve to some extent fluid or wet materials as opposed to solid objects. In Table 12, they are grouped together based on whether the material is flowing or wet. Human actions involving these materials are also gathered into a separate subgroup.

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Second Finnish translation | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| *Actions* | | | | |
| sobbing | SOB! | Nyyh! | NYYH! | DDB |
| sneezing | AHCHOO! | AATSHII! | | PEA |
| gulping | *GULP* | *GULP* | | PEA |
| drinking | NK NK NK | NK NK NK | | WM |
| eating | MUNCH | MUMS | MUMS | C&H |
| eating | CHOMP | MUMPS | | PEA |
| messy eating | CHLOP. | SLURP. | | WM |
| messy eating | THLUP. | SHLUP. | | WM |
| messy eating | SHORP. | SHLOP. | | WM |

| | LEP. | LUP. | | WM |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| messy eating | LEP. | LUP. | | WM |
| **Wet materials** | | | | |
| coin landing in pie | PLONK! | PLONK | PLONK | DDB |
| pie fight | SPLAT! | PLÄTS | SPLÄTS | DDB |
| pie fight | SPLOK! | SPLÄT | SPLOTSH | DDB |
| pie fight | SMACK! | SKLÄT | KLÄTS | DDB |
| playing with food | BLUCK | LITS | LITS | C&H |
| playing with food | SCHLOOP | LÄTS | LÄTS | C&H |
| playing with food | BLIP | SLURP | SLURP | C&H |
| playing with food | BLORK | LÄTS | LÄTS | C&H |
| poking at mud | SCHLOOP | BLUP | BLUB | C&H |
| poking at mud | PLITCH | SPLUT | SPLUT | C&H |
| poking at mud | BLOP | SPLURT | SPLURT | C&H |
| poking at mud | PLIP | LITS | LITS | C&H |
| poking at mud | PLOOP | LÄTS | LÄTS | C&H |
| poking at mud | PLOP | PLUTS | PLUTS | C&H |
| walking in mud | PLUBLIPTHH | BLUUURB | BLUUURB | C&H |
| walking in mud | THWIPP | PLUUTS | PLUUTS | C&H |
| walking in mud | PLUP | PLUP | PLUP | C&H |
| **Fluid materials** | | | | |
| moving masses of water | ROAR! | JYMIN | | DDR1 |
| moving masses of water | ROAR! | JYRIN | | DDR1 |
| moving masses of water | ROAR! | KOHINAA | | DDR1 |
| moving masses of water | ROAR! | JYRINÄÄ | | DDR1 |
| moving masses of water | BUMMMMM | JYRIN | | DDR2 |
| water flooding a cave in ground | ROAR! | KOSSH | | DDR1 |
| water sucked into a cave | GURGLE! | KLURRRPS | | DDR1 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| water against boat | SLAP! | LOISKIS | | DDR2 |
| boat landing in water | SPLOOSH! | POLSKIS | | DDR2 |
| rock falling into water | SPLASH | SPLASH | | DDR2 |
| falling into water | SPLASH! | MOLSK | MOLSKIS | DDB |
| spraying colour on hand | SPLUT! | | | DDR1 |
| spraying water into flames | SQUIRT! | RUITS | | DDR2 |
| spraying water into flames | SQUIRT! | PRUITS | | DDR2 |
| imitation of water | SPLISH SPLASH | LITS LÄTS | LITS LÄTS | C&H |
| imitation of water | DRIP DRIP | TIP TIP | TIP TIP | C&H |
| imitation of water | FWOOOSH SPLOOSH | LOISKIS LÄISKIS | LOISKIS LÄISKIS | C&H |
| imitation of water | FWISHH SPLISH | LITSIS LÄTSIS | LITSIS LÄTSIS | C&H |
| imitation of water | SPLASH SPLASH | LÄTS LÄTS | LÄTS LÄTS | C&H |

**Table 12:** Sound effects involving liquid and food

In English, a majority of the sounds of fluid material contain a sibilant. Out of all English effects in Table 12, most contain either a sibilant or [p]. Of the exceptions, GURGLE and GULP apparently use [gu-] to depict watery sounds, while the roaring sounds depict such huge masses of water that they apparently focus on the looming, roaring threat of water rather than its wetness. NK NK NK depicts drinking (swallowing), so it not necessarily linked with the liquid itself but with the action of drinking. Rhodes identifies [dr-], [tr-], [sl-], [fl-] and [m-] as depicting liquid sounds. Rhodes' [dr-] occurs once in my corpus, in DRIP, and [sl-] once in SLAP (which could also be used as a sound effect for impact). [m-] is used initially only in MUNCH. In addition, the sound is present in SMACK, BUMMMMM and CHOMP, but the content of these sound effects involves roaring masses of water, pie, and noisy eating rather than flowing water. It may be that [m] is especially involved in eating and food instead of flowing forms of liquid. [tr-] and [fl-] are absent in these sound effects. I would

tentatively add [gu-] to the list of sounds related to liquids, especially as the sound of liquid moving through constricted spaces, since GURGLE is the sound of water flowing into a cave and GULP refers to the sound of swallowing. [pl-] and [spl-] also occur frequently both in English and Finnish, and [-ʃ] occurs several times especially in the final position.

In the Finnish translations, the letter *ä* is used slightly more often than in other types of effects. The traditional sounds LÄISKIS, LÄTS and their variations – PLÄTS, SPLÄTS, PLÄT, SKLÄT, KLÄTS and LÄTSIS – are frequent in the Finnish sounds. Interestingly, the order of some of the letters in these water-related sound effects appears to be of little importance: the medial [-læt-] stays the same, but the elements around it change and switch places without altering the meaning of the sound much. I therefore suggest that [-læt-] indicates a wet sound in Finnish, especially when combined with [s], [p] or [k].

The combinations [-ts-] and [-sk-] occur in the Finnish effects several times, but are almost absent in English, with [sk-] present only once in SQUIRT. This indicates that their presence is not explained by interference from the source language and that they are typical of Finnish. I suggest that these are Finnish sound symbols for liquid, at least in some contexts. The rather frequent [-ʃ], [pl-] and [spl-], present both with and without English influence, could be added to the list of potential sound symbols. Sometimes, however, [spl-] in particular occurs in sounds depicting impact with liquid involved, so its meaning could be extended to cover both.

### 5.2.3.5 Breakage

The sounds of breaking objects are easy to gather from the corpus, but they are relatively few in number, even in the representative of the superhero genre. Because of this, they are not divided into more specific groups in Table 13.

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Second Finnish translation | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| coin ripping through hat | RIP! | RIP | RRITS | DDB |
| trident piercing bag | CHUNK! | TSUNK | TSUNK | DDB |
| pickaxe digging ground | CHINK! | NARSK | | DDR1 |
| pickaxe digging ground | CHINK! | ROUSK | | DDR1 |
| rock breaking camera | CRUNCH! | CRUNCH! | | DDR2 |
| baseball bat breaking furniture | SMASH | PAM | PAM | C&H |
| breaking lamp | KRITCH KRUNCH | RITS RATS | RITS RATS | C&H |
| bullet damaging wall | SPAKK | SPAKK | | BAT |
| breaking handcuffs | CHINKK | CHINKK | | BAT |
| breaking branch | *SNAP* | *NAPS* | *NAPS* | C&H |
| pillar breaking in half | KKRAAAKKK | KKRAAAKKK | | BAT |
| chewing pastille | >CRONCH. CRONCH< | KRUNTS. KRUNTS. | | WM |

**Table 13:** Sound effects for breakage

As mentioned above, Rhodes identifies [tʃ-] as a short type of sound. Not unexpectedly, many sounds depicting the abrupt action of breakage contain this sound in English and the corresponding [-ts] in Finnish. In this relatively small sample, a similar sound is used in both languages at least in the context of something breaking. In the Finnish RRITS, it is present in a sound effect with an original that contains no such sound, which suggests that it is acceptable to use [-ts] for breakage in Finnish.

[kr-] also appears in both languages, but less so in Finnish: CRUNCH, KKRAAAKKK and KRUNTS KRUNTS are the only examples, which are either identical to or heavily influenced by the original sound effects. At least in this small sample, [kr-] as a sound of breakage is not as common in Finnish as in English. Bloomfield identifies [kr-] as a

noisy impact, while Rhodes mentions the element of abrupt onset. As for noisy impact, [kr-] regularly appears in noisy words, such as "crash" and "crack", but CRUNCH as a sound of chewing something crunchy is not necessarily noisy compared. Rhodes' idea of abrupt onset is, in this context, more accurate, but I suggest that [kr-] could also be given a narrower meaning of breakage in addition to the more general characterisation. The contrasting descriptions are explained by the fact that with only a relatively limited number of combinations that a language typically accepts as pronounceable, certain sounds and combinations of sounds serve several purposes. Nonetheless, certain similarities exist.

Rhodes' idea of [p-] signifying a sound with abrupt onset is also supported by sound effects containing [p-] in this group. Interestingly, especially the first sound in Table 13, RIP!/RIP/RRITS, resulting from a coin ripping through fabric, supports the view that [p] is brief even in Finnish: the English and the first Finnish translations have single letters and are quite brief even in writing, but the second translation with a double *r* changes the [p] into a [-ts]. [r-] is characterised as denoting irregular onset, which is compatible with some examples of breakage in this corpus. Because [r] appears independently and in rather many sounds of breakage in English and in Finnish, I suggest that [r] refers to breakage in both languages. In English, it also appears in the previously mentioned combination [kr-].

### 5.2.3.6 Explosions and gunshots

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|
| gun with suppressor | PFFT | PFFT | BAT |
| gunshot | KBLAMMM | KBLAMMM | BAT |
| gunshot | KBLAM | KBLAM | BAT |
| gunshot | KBLAMM | KBLAMM | BAT |
| machine gun | BRAKABRAKABR | BRAKABRAKABR | BAT |
| machine gun | BRAKA | BRAKA | BAT |
| machine gun | BRAKK | BRAKK | BAT |
| shotgun | KPOW! | PAUU | DDR1 |
| hand grenade | POOMM | POOMM | BAT |
| imitating cannon | BANG | BANG | PEA |
| volcanic activity mistaken for cannon | BUMMMMMM | JYRIN | DDR2 |
| volcanic activity mistaken for cannon | BUMMM | JYMIN | DDR2 |

**Table 14:** Sound effects for explosions and gunshots

The sound effects for explosions and gunshots, collected into Table 14, seem rather uniform and are perhaps the most homogeneous group among all the effects. In English, all of them have [p] or [b] in the beginning of the word, either initially or preceded by [k]; as such, all begin with a stop sound. [p] and [b] are identified by Rhodes as involving abrupt onset, and I would suggest that [k] also depicts abrupt onset in some situations. Intuitively, it seems possible that two stop sounds together depict a double onset of the sound they are in.

None of the sounds contain [i], except for a few booming sound effects in Finnish, and [æ] is very frequent. BUMMMMMM/JYRIN, BUMMM/JYMIN, and POOMM/POOMM depict sounds resembling an explosion rather than a gunshot, hence the lack of [æ]. The Finnish translations JYRIN and JYMIN do not conform to the rest of these types of sound effects very well, but this can be caused by several factors. Firstly, few of the other sound effects are translated at all, and these translations contain the sound [y], which does not exist in English. Secondly, the sound effects' meaning differs slightly from the others because they are the rumbling of volcanic activity but are

mistaken as a cannon by the characters of the story. Because the interpretation of the sounds can vary, there is also room for variation in how they are depicted. Thirdly, the sound is prolonged instead of abrupt. Fourthly, the effects are based on the existing Finnish words '*jyrinä*' and '*jyminä*', which refer to rumbling or roaring.

PFFT stands out among the effects as the only one with no vowels. The difference can be explained by what PFFT depicts, however. It is a sound of a gunshot as are most of the others, but the crucial difference is that this particular gun has a suppressor on. The effects of the silencer on the sound effect are interesting: the initial [p-] is typical of abrupt sounds, but the sound is muffled by the absence of vowels and the presence of the fricative [f]. The abrupt [t] brings the sound to a sudden end. KPOW/PAUU, then again, indicates how the sound of a gunshot ricochets in a confined area through lengthening the vowel. Vowel sounds are characterised by the airflow moving without constriction, and apparently eliminating and replacing them with other sounds makes a sound more constricted.

There are few actual Finnish translations among the examples since most of the sound effects of this group come from BAT in which embedded sound effects are not translated at all. The English rules might apply to some extent, but the few Finnish effects do not provide enough material to draw conclusions on what kinds of sound effects Finnish uses for gunshots and explosions. The effect BANG/BANG, together with further examples scattered throughout the corpus, however, perhaps shows that well-established sound effects tend to be kept in their original form; the sound [æ] in BANG could be written with its own letter *ä* in Finnish, but it has been rewritten with the original *a* instead. This points to the fact that some English sound effects are so established even among Finnish readers that they can be used even in their foreign orthography.

## 5.2.4 Sound effects by property

## 5.2.4.1 Sounds with long duration

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Second Finnish translation | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| *Natural* | | | | |
| thunder | BOOMM! | BOOMM! | BOOMM! | C&H |
| volcanic activity | BUMMMMM | JYRIN | | DDR2 |
| volcanic activity | BUMMMMMMMMMM | JYMIN | | DDR2 |
| pyroclastic flow | WHOOOOOOOOOOSHHH! | VVVUUUSSHHH | | DDR2 |
| sand pouring into cave | CRSSHH! | | | DDR1 |
| water flooding cave | ROAR! | KOSSH | | DDR1 |
| mob of kangaroos | RUMBLE! | JYRINÄÄ | | DDR1 |
| mob of kangaroos | RUMBLE! | JYMINÄÄ | | DDR1 |
| mob of kangaroos | RUMBLE! | JYRIN | | DDR1 |
| roaring water | ROAR! | JYMIN | | DDR1 |
| roaring water | ROAR! | KOHINAA | | DDR1 |
| tsunami | RRROOAARRRR! | VRRRUMMMM | | DDR2 |
| wave | ROAR! | ROAR! | | DDR2 |
| temperature change; cooling down | HSSSSS! | PSSHHHH | | DDR2 |
| *Mechanical* | | | | |
| imitating car | RRRUMRUMM | BRUUUMM BRUUUMM | BRUUUMM BRUUUMM | C&H |
| imitating car | RRRRR | BRUUM | BRUUM | C&H |
| imitating car | RRUMMM | BRRRR | BRRRR | C&H |
| prototype of car | RURRURRURRR | RURRURRURRUR | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | VUH-ROOOM! | VA-ROUUMM | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | VROOM! | VROOM! | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | V-VRROOM! | VROUM | | DDR2 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| prototype of car | VROOM! | VRUUM | | DDR2 |
| imitating car horn | BEEP BEEP | TÖÖT TÖÖT | TÖÖT TÖÖT | C&H |
| car brakes | SCREEECHH | SCREEECHH | | BAT |
| car brakes | SKREEEEEEE | SKREEEEEEE | | BAT |
| imitating siren | OOOOOEEE | OOOOOEEE | OOOOOEEE | C&H |
| imitating siren | EEBOOEE | PIIPAA PII- | PIIPAA PII- | C&H |
| imitating siren | BOOEEBOO | PAA PIIPAA | PAA PIIPAA | C&H |
| imitating siren | WAHHHOOOOOO | UUIIIUUUUIII II | UUIIIUUUUIII III | C&H |
| siren | EEEEEE | EEEEEE | | BAT |
| phone | RINNGG! | RINNGG! | RINNGG! | C&H |
| *Human and animal* | | | | |
| whistle | FWEET! | FIIII! | | DDR2 |
| burp | BUH-URRRRRRRRRRP | RÖÖÖÖYYHH | RÖÖÖÖYYH H | C&H |
| hush | SHH... | SHH... | | PEA |
| beginning to sneeze | AH? | AA? | | PEA |
| sneeze | AHCHOO! | AATSHII! | | PEA |
| emu | WAAOOGH! | BUUU-UAAH | | DDR1 |
| disgust | EWWW. | YÄÄÄH. | YÄÄÄH. | C&H |
| *Miscellaneous* | | | | |
| stairs creaking | KREEE | KREEE | | BAT |
| gas grenade | SSSSS | SSSSS | | BAT |
| boat surfacing | SPLOOSH! | SPLOOSH! | | DDR2 |
| sinking into snow | SPLOOP | SPLOOP | SUIHH | C&H |
| sliding down rope | | VIUP | | DDR2 |

**Table 15:** Sound effects with long duration

This category serves as a contrast to the abrupt sounds of impact and explosion. Continuous or otherwise longer-lasting sounds are numerous in the corpus, but they are sometimes difficult to categorise. The same sound effect could be interpreted as depicting, for instance, both a fall and the impact the fall ends with. Nonetheless, sound effects that last for a long time are as numerous as they are varied, which is why they have been loosely divided into subgroups in Table 15.

Some similarities are found even in this heterogeneous group of sound effects, however. Stop sounds, previously identified as short, abrupt sounds, are rarer in these effects than in many of the others. This can be explained by the fact that stops cannot be prolonged, a property which makes them unsuited to sound effects that are supposed to take a long time. In a similar vein, the most obvious common denominator between a majority of the sound effects in this category is that repeating a letter makes a sound longer. This need not always be the case, however, as in the case of ROAR/JYMIN: in the English-language effect, a diphthong is long enough. There is no repetition in the Finnish sound either, but it has several syllables. RUMBLE/JYRINÄÄ does not contain even a diphthong. I suggest that [r] and the nasals [m] and [n] give this sound a longer quality. The sound [m] seems to be a device for prolonging a sound in both languages as the sound that can be prolonged. Vowels and [r] share the quality of being easily prolonged, making them common in longer sound effects.

**5.2.4.2 Pitch**

Besides differences between different kinds of actions, there is some difference between how loud, low-pitched sounds and high-pitched sounds are portrayed in comics. I suggest that the role of vowels is more significant in determining the pitch or loudness of a sound than in determining other aspects of the sound, such as those in section 5.2.3.

Grouping a comic's sounds as high or low in order to find similarities within the group is somewhat problematic, however. The problem lies in determining which sound is high and which is low because preconceptions of what high sounds and low sounds look like may determine the division. For example, an *e* in an English effect or an *i* in a Finnish one tend to point to a high-pitched sound, while *o,* among others, refers to lower sounds, as can be seen from the tendencies in Table 16 and Table 17 below. Therefore, grouping them following intuitive clues may lead to results reflecting certain preconceptions. Because of this, each sound effect's meaning and context must be scrutinised even more closely to determine whether or not they belong to the category 'high-pitched' or 'low-pitched'. Even this is difficult because, for example, the mechanism behind a high-pitch whistle and a low-pitch fog horn differs only slightly.

Because a much more detailed phonetic or acoustic analysis would be necessary in determining a sound's perceived pitch in sound effects, this section can only speculate what the conventions for depicting pitch in comics might be. Such factors as a vowel's roundness, backness or other aspects of its articulation may affect its perceived pitch, but examining these aspects is beyond the scope of this thesis. My examination is more focused on my corpus and the distribution of letters and sounds in my material. For this purpose, sound effects interpreted as high-pitched are listed in Table 16 and those interpreted as low-pitched are collected into Table 17. Sounds from some actions may not necessarily even be perceived as particularly high or low before they are presented in the visual form of comics where the transcription might point in either direction. This makes distinguishing between high and low sounds difficult at times, and some effects do not fit either category.

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Second Finnish translation | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| hanging up a telephone | *CLICK* | *KLIK* | *KLIK* | C&H |
| tinkle of coin | TINK! | TINK | PLINK | DDB |
| tinkle of coin | TINKLE! | PLINK | KLINK | DDB |
| tinkle of coin | PLINK! | TLINK | PLINK | DDB |
| creaking stairs | KREEE | KREEE | | BAT |
| pieces of lamp falling | PING PING PING | PING PING PING | PING PING PING | C&H |
| lamp breaking | KRITCH KRUNCH | RITS RATS | RITS RATS | C&H |
| disgust | EWWW. | YÄÄÄH. | YÄÄÄH. | C&H |
| gas grenade | SSSSS | SSSSS | | BAT |
| hushing | SHH... | SHH... | | PEA |
| hiccup | HIC! | HIK! | | PEA |
| whistle | FWEET! | FIIII! | | DDR2 |
| imitating siren | OOOOOEEE | OOOOOEEE | OOOOOEEE | C&H |
| imitating siren | EEBOOEE | PIIPAA PII- | PIIPAA PII- | C&H |
| imitating siren | BOOEEBOO | PAA PIIPAA | PAA PIIPAA | C&H |
| imitating siren | WAHHHOOOOOO | UUIIIUUUUI | UUIIIUUUUI | C&H |
| siren | EEEEEEEEEE | EEEEEEEEEE | | BAT |
| doorbell | DING DONG | DING DONG | DING DONG | C&H |
| phone ringing | RINGG | RINGG | RINGG | C&H |
| imitating car horn | BEEP BEEP | TÖÖT TÖÖT | TÖÖT TÖÖT | C&H |
| car brakes | SCHREEECHH | SCHREEECHH | | BAT |
| car brakes | SKREEEEEEE | SKREEEEEEE | | BAT |
| bats | SKEE | SKEE | | BAT |

**Table 16:** High-pitched sound effects

| Source of sound | English | Finnish | Second Finnish translation | Comic |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| head hitting wall | THUD! | TUNKS | KLONK | DDB |
| hitting pole | BONK! | BONK! | | DDR2 |
| thudding onto ground | WHOMP | WHOMP | | PEA |
| thud | THUMP | THUMP | | PEA |
| thud | THOOM | THOOM | | BAT |
| bouncing ball | BUMPETY-BUMP | | | PEA |
| kick | THWOKK | THWOKK | | BAT |
| door slamming | SLAM! | SLAM! | | PEA |
| tiger attack | WUMP! | WUMP! | TUMPS! | C&H |
| eating | CHOMP | MUMPS | | PEA |
| happiness | HMMMMMMM | HMMMMMMM | HMMMMMMM | C&H |
| burp | BUH-URRRRRRRRRRP | RÖÖÖÖYYHH | RÖÖÖÖYYHH | C&H |
| groaning | NNGG | NNGG | | BAT |
| grunting | NNNNNN | NNNNNN | | BAT |
| coughing | >KOFF< | KÖH! | | BAT |
| disgust | EWWW. | YÄÄÄH. | YÄÄÄH. | C&H |
| didgeridoo | TWOOOAAUUT! | TUUU-OOO | | DDR1 |
| emu | WAAOOGH! | BUUU-UAAH | | DDR1 |
| cattle | WAAHH! | MMÖÖHH! | | DDR2 |
| rhino | SNORT | HÖRK! | | DDR2 |
| mob of kangaroos | RUMBLE! | JYRINÄÄ | | DDR1 |
| mob of kangaroos | RUMBLE! | JYMINÄÄ | | DDR1 |
| mob of kangaroos | RUMBLE! | JYRIN | | DDR1 |
| stampeding cattle | STOMPITY | JYTIN | | DDR2 |
| stampeding cattle | STOMP | JYTIN | | DDR2 |
| masses of water | ROAR! | JYMIN | | DDR1 |
| masses of water | ROAR! | JYRIN | | DDR1 |
| masses of water | ROAR! | KOHINAA | | DDR1 |
| masses of water | ROAR! | JYRINÄÄ | | DDR1 |
| tsunami | RRROOAARRRR! | VRRUMMMM | | DDR2 |
| wave | ROAR! | ROAR! | | DDR2 |

| volcanic activity | BUMMMMM | JYRIN | | DDR2 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| pyroclastic flow | WHOOOOOOOOOOSHHH! | VVVUUUSSHHH | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | RURRURRURRR | RURRURRURRUR | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | VUH-ROOOM! | VA-ROUUMM | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | VROOM! | VROOM | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | VROOM! | VROUM | | DDR2 |
| prototype of car | VROOM! | VRUUM | | DDR2 |
| imitating car | RRRUMRUMM | BRUUUMM BRUUUMM | BRUUUMM BRUUUMM | C&H |
| imitating car horn | BEEP BEEP | TÖÖT TÖÖT | TÖÖT TÖÖT | C&H |
| steamboat | CHUG CHUG CHUG | TSUK TSUK TSUK | | DDR2 |
| helicopter | WHUP WHUP WHUP | WHUP WHUP WHUP | | BAT |
| hand grenade | POOMM | POOMM | | BAT |
| gunshot | KBLAMM | KBLAMM | | BAT |
| machine gun | BRAKABRAKA | BRAKABRAKA | | BAT |
| imitating cannon | BANG | BANG | | PEA |
| boat surfacing | SPLOOSH! | SPLOOSH! | | DDR2 |
| sinking into snow | SPLOOP | SPLOOP | | C&H |

**Table 17:** Low-pitched sound effects

Some sound effects are included in both of the tables. This is because they either alternate between different pitches or are perceived as high-pitched sounds in one language and low-pitched sounds in the other. These types of sound effects may prove useful in determining which vowels are perceived as high-pitched or low-pitched at least in this context. The sound effects OOOOOEEE, EEBOOEE, BOOEEBOO, WAHHHOOOOOO (in English) and OOOOOEEE, PIIPAA PII-, PAA PIIPAA, UUIIIUUUUI (in Finnish) can be taken up in this context as interesting examples. They indicate the sound Calvin makes through several panels, which he calls it his siren, informing people of his whereabouts. Obviously, it imitates the siren of an emergency vehicle. The sound fits the lists of both high-pitched and low-pitched sounds because the siren, in a sense, alternates between pitches. This is a good example of what can be achieved through changing the vowel of the "same" sound effect: in English, *o*

alternates with *e*, and in Finnish, *o*, *a*, and *u* alternate with *i*. In English, a repeated *e* is, in practice, pronounced the same way as the letter *i* in Finnish, and the sound is essentially the same, [i]. Based on this sound effect alone, [i] is a high vowel sound while [o], [a], and the Finnish [u] are lower-pitched vowel sounds. DING DONG reflects similar alteration between high and low, as does KRITCH KRUNCH/RITS RATS. The pairs EWWW./YÄÄÄH. and BEEP BEEP/TÖÖT TÖÖT represent a case in which the original sound effect is considerably higher than the translation, which follows the conventional Finnish transcription of similar sounds.

Besides the above examples, which alternate between high and low, the rest of the listing suggests that the sound [i], represented by a long *e* in English and *i* in Finnish, probably means high pitch. Its combination with different consonants determines the kind of action taking place. A more detailed phonetic and acoustic might help to define the other vowel sounds in terms of high or low pitch, at least in relation to each other.

## 5.2.5 Discussion on the sound effects

It is not always easy to categorise sound effects because their semantic content and functions are not always clear. This fuzziness in interpretation is also bound to complicate the translation process, especially in comics in which the aim is to translate most of the effects. Determining the meaning of a sound effect is difficult because even a single phoneme can represent several different aspects of a sound. This means that a single sound effect combines elements from the different categories above.

For example, the Finnish sound effect SKLÄT depicts a sound emanating from a pie fight, with pies splashing onto people. Based on this description, it is categorised as both a wet sound and a sound of impact. I suggested that [-læt-] symbolises water or wetness, but also noted that [kl-] is present in several sounds of impact, while [s] is quite frequent in water-related sounds. The first two suggestions contain [l] in different contexts, and this combination results in a package of a wet sound of impact, where the wetness is further emphasised by the initial [s]. Not all sound effects are distinct combinations of identifiable features, however, and this effect probably is an exception. First of all, the meaning of this particular sound effect is very clear. Secondly, the

translation of the comic contains little interference from the source-language sound effects and mostly uses established Finnish effects. Thirdly, the effect refers to rather common themes and distinct sources of sound that are likely to have well-established rules for how they are depicted in sound effects.

A closer examination of the individual sound effects reveals that there is variation even in how a single sound effect in English can be translated into Finnish in several ways, depending on its meaning. Similar meanings are conveyed through similar means, however, and some of the findings match the sound symbols introduced before. This is probably accounted for by onomatopoeia or sound symbolism. I am suggesting some additional English sound symbols in Table 18 below. The suggested sound symbols may be more specific than the ones introduced by Bloomfield (1933) and Rhodes (1994) (discussed in section 4.1), and sounds of impact and breakage may probably also be characterised as abrupt, for example. However, such an assumption cannot necessarily be made based on my corpus alone.

| Sound or feature | Association | Example |
| --- | --- | --- |
| -ŋk | impact | PLONK, CHINK |
| f | friction | PFFT |
| s, h | hissing of air | SHH |
| pl- | liquid | SPLAT |
| spl- | liquid (+ impact) | SPLUT |
| gu- | liquid | GULP |
| -ʃ | liquid | SPLASH |
| -m- | food/eating | CHOMP |
| kr- | breakage | CRUNCH |
| r | breakage | RIP |
| k- | abrupt onset | SPAKK |
| -æ- | gunshot | KBLAM |
| m | long-lasting | BOOMM |
| lack of vowels | constricted | PFFT |
| repeated letters | long-lasting | HSSSSS |

**Table 18:** Suggested English sound symbols

There were few Finnish sound symbols to compare the effects of the corpus with, so my candidates for Finnish sound symbols were extracted mostly by comparing the Finnish effects with the English effects of the corpus and the English sound symbols. The potential Finnish sound symbols identified in this study are presented in Table 19.

| Sound or feature | Association | Example |
|---|---|---|
| p, k, t | impact | PLINK<br>MOKS<br>TUMPS |
| -ŋk | impact | TUNKS |
| -ts | impact | PLÄTS |
| -ks | impact | MOKS |
| kl- | impact | KLINK |
| pl- | impact | PLINK |
| -ps | abrupt | HUMPS |
| fricative (esp. sibilants and [h]) | friction | HHHHHSSSSSSSS |
| (-)viu- | air current | SVIUH |
| s, h | air stream | SHH |
| fricative (esp. sibilants and [h]) | air stream | HHHHHSSSSSSSS |
| v- | air current | VIUP |
| -ts- | liquid | PLÄTS |
| -sk- | liquid | MOLSK |
| pl- | liquid | PLÄTS |
| spl- | liquid (+ impact) | SPLÄT |
| sk- | liquid | MOLSK |
| -ʃ | liquid | KOSSH |
| -læt- (esp. with s/p/k) | liquid | LÄTSIS |
| -ts | breakage | RITS |
| p | short | RIP |
| r | breakage | RRITS |
| m | long-lasting | JYMINÄÄ |
| n | long-lasting | JYMIN |
| repeated letters | long-lasting | BRRRR |

**Table 19:** Suggested Finnish sound symbols

Again, further research is necessary to determine if these sounds are used in a similar way outside my corpus. Because consonants and consonant clusters are so frequent in the descriptions of what certain actions sound like, the role of vowels in sound symbolism would deserve further examination. Based on my limited analysis of the sounds with different pitches, I suggest that consonants determine the type of action while vowels seem to focus more on altering the pitch of the sound. The relative homogeneity within some of the categories discussed above suggests that the effects have not been created randomly but follow some common rules.

## 6 Conclusion

The corpus comprised sound effects and their translations from seven different comics: two *Donald Duck* stories by Don Rosa, one *Duck* story from Carl Barks, *Peanuts* strips by Charles M. Schulz, *Calvin and Hobbes* strips by Bill Watterson, part of an album of *Batman* by Frank Miller and David Mazzucchelli, and part of *Watchmen* by Alan Moore and Dave Gibbons. The first part of the study examined translation strategies and factors affecting their use in these comics. The initial assumptions on what aspects of the sound effects affect their translation mostly proved correct: their location in the comic, their embeddedness in pictures, and the genre they appear in were all found to influence their translation. Sound effects in balloons were translated more often than sound effects that were located outside perigrams. Sound effects placed against a simple background exhibited some variety in how often and how they were translated in the different comics but, on the whole, were translated more often than sound effects that had become a part of the imagery of a panel and would require the image to be retouched more if translated. Genre differences manifested themselves especially in how much was left untranslated: effects in the humorous comics were translated more often than the sound effects in *Batman* and *Watchmen*. Of the humorous comics, the *Duck* stories, in particular, were translated with care, and little was left in its English form in the translations. *Uniajan urho* was the only comic that retained no English effects in their original form, however.

It was found that different translation strategies had been used in the comics of this case study. *Repetitio* of the original English form of the sound effect and straightforward

translation were the most common strategies, but *substitutio* also occurred rather frequently in the form of minor adjustments in typography, for example. *Adiectio* appears to have been used in conjunction with *deletio*, as some translations tended to use a wider variety of translation strategies than the others. *Deletio* also occurred once in a situation where retaining the sound effect might have been necessary, however. *Transmutatio* appears to have taken place especially when embedded sound effects were translated, for example, but it was relatively rare.

Further research could be conducted on similar comics to find out if the findings in this thesis are in line with the conventions followed by other comics. More extensive and systematic examination of comics of any particular type could confirm and uncover possible genre conventions. In general, however, it would be more fruitful to examine comics in which most of the effects have been translated instead of ones in which most of the effects remain the same in the translation.

The second part of the study focused on sound symbolism by examining the sound effects of the corpus, because sound effects are to some extent free from some of the restrictions a language poses on its ordinary words. The individual sound effects were categorised on the basis of the depicted actions, the materials involved, and the qualities of the sounds themselves. The following categories were examined in this thesis: impact, friction, air current, liquid and food, breakage, explosions and gunshots, duration, and pitch. Some potential Finnish and English sound symbols were extracted from the material in the corpus, and further research could be put into studying if they are used in other contexts and in ordinary words. Even though the effects were compared to previously identified sound symbols, the potential new sound symbols listed represent only this corpus. Further research on different material is needed to confirm these findings. Other interesting categories and themes could involve the source of the sound (human, animal, natural, mechanical) and the effects of such variables as size, speed, and softness or solidity of objects involved in the action. Some individual cases of changes in temperature and other rarer sounds were found in the corpus but were not numerous enough to be examined, so such aspects could later be studied, too, with more suitable material.

The variation in the use of translation strategies in this corpus hopefully serves as a

reminder that numerous different strategies can be used even on such a small detail as sound effects. The choice of translation strategy is affected by several factors, but the choice is important because the reader's experience of a comic is affected even by its sound effects.

# References

**Primary sources**

*Aku Ankka*. 2012. N.o 1. Helsinki: Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy.
Barks, C. 1996. *Walt Disney's Uncle Scrooge adventures 5: The secret of Atlantis*.
　　　　Prescott, Arizona: Gladstone.
Kivekäs, M. & Perälä, R. 1995 (eds.). *Aku Ankan Juhlasarjat 5*. Transl. Saarinen, M.
　　　　Helsinki: Helsinki Media Company Oy.
Miller, F. & Mazzucchelli, D. 2005. *Batman: Year One*. New York: DC Comics.
— 2007. *Batman: Ensimmäinen vuosi*. Transl. Perälä, R. Tampere: Egmont Kustannus.
Moore, A. & Gibbons, D. 2008. *Watchmen*. New York: DC Comics.
— 2009. *Vartijat*. Transl. Ruokosenmäki, J. Tampere: Egmont Kustannus.
*Peanuts* website 1. 2010. Retrieved 28 September 2011 from http://jezebel.com/comic-
　　　　strips/.
*Peanuts* website 2. 2009. Retrieved 28 September 2011 from
　　　　http://peanutsroasted.blogspot.fi/2010_05_01_archive.html.
Rosa, D. 2005. *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot*. Transl. Saarinen, M. Helsinki: Sanoma
　　　　Magazines Finland Oy.
— 2006. *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck Companion*. Timonium, Maryland:
　　　　Gemstone Publishing.
— 2007. *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot 2: Kaikki lisäseikkailut*. Transl. Lindfors, J.
　　　　Helsinki: Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy.
— 2010. *The Life and Times of Scrooge McDuck: Volume Two*. Los Angeles: BOOM!
　　　　Studios.
Schulz, C. M. 2007. *Täydelliset Tenavat: 1950-1952*. Transl. Tolvanen, J. Tampere:
　　　　Egmont Kustannus.
Watterson, B. 1995 a. *Lassi ja Leevi: Kovaa ja korkealta*. Transl. Valli, J. Tampere:
　　　　Kustannus Oy Semic.
— 1995 b. *Lassi ja Leevi: Valon nopeudella*. Transl. Valli, J. Tampere: Kustannus Oy
　　　　Semic.
— 1996. *Lassi ja Leevi: Juhlakirja 5*. Transl. Valli, J. Tampere: Kustannus Oy Semic.
— 2004. *The Days Are Just Packed*. London: Time Warner Paperbacks.

**Secondary sources**

Abelin, Å. 1999. *Studies in Sound Symbolism*. Göteborg: Göteborg University.
*Aku Ankka*. 2013. N.o 12. Helsinki: Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy.
Attridge, D. 2004. Sound, Style and onomatopoeia. In Simpson (ed.), 168-175.
Baker, M. & Saldanha G. (eds.). 2009. *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies*.
　　　　Retrieved 30 October 2011 from http://books.google.fi/books?
　　　　id=eXsDckV5GuMC&printsec=frontcover&hl=fi#v=onepage&q&f=false
Barthes, R. 1964. Rhétorique de l'image. *Communications n°4*.
— 1988. *Elements of Semiology*. New York: The Noonday Press
Bloomfield, L. 1993. *Language*. New York: Henry Holt.
Bouissac, P. (ed.). 2008. *Encyclopedia of Semiotics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Retrieved 24 October 2009 from
http://www.oxfordreference.com/views/ENTRY.html?
subview=Main&entry=t249.e59.

Bredin, H. 1996. Onomatopoeia as a Figure and a Linguistic Principle. *New Literary History* Vol. 27, No. 3: 555-569.

Celotti, N. 2008. *The Translator of Comics as a Semiotic Investigator.* In Zanettin (ed.), 33-47.

*Concise Oxford Dictionary of English Etymology.* 1996. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Retrieved 18 March 2012 from http://www.oxfordreference.com.ezproxy.utu.fi:2048/views/BOOK_SEARCH. html?book=t27.

Delabastita, D. 1989. Translation and Mass-Communication: Film and T.V. Translation as Evidence of Cultural Dynamics. *Babel* 35:4. 193-218.

Dunne, K. (ed.). 2006. *Perspectives on localization*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Eisner, W. 1990. *Comics & Sequential Art*. Tamarac, FL: Poorhouse Press.

Fresnault-Deruelle, P. 1972. *La bande dessinée: essai d'analyse sémiotique. L'univers et les techniques de quelques 'comics' d'expression française*. Paris: Librairies Hachette.

Goscinny, R. & Uderzo, A. 1976. *Obélix et Compagnie*. Paris: Hachette Livre.

Grun, M. & Dollerup, C. 2003. 'Loss' and 'Gain' in Comics. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology* Vol. 11, No. 3. 197-216.

Gubern, R. 2008. *Comics.* In Bouissac, P. (ed.).

Herkman, J. 1996. Miten sarjakuvista tuli yliopistokelpoisia? In Herkman, J. (ed.), 9-42.

Herkman, J. (ed.). 1996. *Ruutujen välissä: näkökulmia sarjakuvaan*. Tampere: Tampere University Press.

Hinton, L, Nichols, J. & Ohala J.J. (eds.). 1994. *Sound Symbolism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kaindl, C. 1999. Thump, Whizz, Poom: A Framework for the Study of Comics under Translation. *Target* 11:2, 263-288.

Kauranen, R. 2008. *Seriedebatt i 1950-talets Finland*. Turku: Åbo Akademis förlag.

*Lambiek* website 1. The Comics Code. Retrieved 9 November 2009 from http://lambiek.net/comics/code_text.htm.

*Lambiek* website 2. 2012. Carl Barks. Retrieved 21 April 2013 from http://www.lambiek.net/artists/b/barks.htm.

Leskinen, H. 1991. Vieläkö nuoret nurisevat? – Huomioita onomatopoeettisten sanojen tuntemuksesta ja tulkinnasta. *Virittäjä*, 355-370.

Manninen, P. A. 1996. Whammo! Sarjakuvan kieli ja sarjakuvajulkaisut länsimaisessa kulttuurissa. In Herkman, J. (ed.), 45-60.

Mayoral, R., Kelly, D. & Gallardo, N. 1988. Concept of Constrained Translation. Non-Linguistic Perspectives of Translation. *Meta*, 356-367.

McCloud, S. 1993. *Understanding Comics – The Invisible Art*. New York: Harper Paperbacks.

⸺ 2006. *Making Comics – Storytelling Secrets of Comics, Manga and Graphic Novels*. New York: HarperCollins.

Mikkonen, K. 1996. Kuvan ja sanan vuorovaikutus ja sarjakuva psykoanalyysin viitekehyksessä. In Herkman, J. (ed.), 81-117.

MOT Collins English Dictionary 2.0. 2006. *Onomatopoeia*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers.

MOT Collins English Dictionary 3.0. 2009. *Thump*. New York: HarperCollins

Publishers.

MOT Collins Compact Thesaurus. 1999. *Thump*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers.

Nord, C. 1993. *Einführung in das funktionale Übersetzen: Am Beispiel von Titeln und Überschriften*. Tübingen/Basel: Francke.

Oswalt, R.L. 1994. Inanimate imitatives in English. In Hinton, L, Nichols, J. & Ohala J.J. (eds.), 293-308.

Oxford Dictionary of English. 2005. *Semiotics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Ramachandran, V. S. 2004. *Purple Numbers and Sharp Cheese*. Retrieved 7th March 2013 from http://www.bbc.co.uk/radio4/reith2003/lecture4.shtml.

Rhodes, R. 1994. Aural images. In Hinton, L, Nichols, J. & Ohala J.J. (eds.), 276-292.

Robert, P. 2007. *Le nouveau Petit Robert : dictionnaire alphabétique et analogique de la langue française*. Paris: Dictionnaires le Robert.

Rosa, D. 2005. *Roope Ankan elämä ja teot*. Transl. Saarinen, M. Helsinki: Sanoma Magazines Finland Oy.

Rota, V. 2008. Aspects of Adaptation: The Translation of Comics Formats. In Zanettin, F. (ed.), 79-98.

Shannon, C. & Weaver, W. 1948. *The Mathematical Theory of Communication*. Illinois: University of Illinois Press.

Sierra Soriano, A. 1999. L'interjection dans le BD: réflexions sur sa traduction. *Meta*, XLIV, 4, 582-603.

Simpson, P. (ed.). 2004. *Stylistics: a resource book for students*. London: Routledge.

*Sluggy Freelance* website 1. 2004. Retrieved 18 October 2011 from http://www.sluggy.com/comics/archives/daily/20040704.

*Sluggy Freelance* website 2. 2003. Retrieved 18 October 2011 from http://www.sluggy.com/comics/archives/daily/20051010.

Tisseron, S. 1987. *Psychoanalyse de la bande dessinée*. Paris: PU de France.

Titford, C. 1983. Sub-titling – Constrained Translation. *Lebende Sprachen*, III, 113-116.

*TV Tropes* website. *Unsound Effect*. Retrieved 18 October 2011 from http://tvtropes.org/pmwiki/pmwiki.php/Main/UnsoundEffect.

University of Helsinki website. 2001. *Aku Ankan kieli vuoden 2001 kielihelmeksi*. Retrieved 24 March 2013 from http://www.helsinki.fi/hum/skl/helmi2001.htm.

Valero Garcés, C. 2000. La tradución del cómic: retos, estrategias y resultados. *TRANS*. No. 4, 75-88.

*World Wide Words* website. 2008. Grawlix. Retrieved 28 November 2009 from http://www.worldwidewords.org/weirdwords/ww-gra1.htm.

Zanettin, F. (ed.). 2008. *Comics in Translation*. Manchester: St. Jerome.

── 2009. Comics. In Baker, M. & Saldanha G. (eds.), 37–40.

## *Suomenkielinen lyhennelmä*

Tässä pro gradu -tutkielmassa tarkastellaan sarjakuvien äänitehosteiden kääntämistä tapaustutkimuksen kautta. Englanninkieliset tehosteet ja niiden suomenkieliset käännökset kerättiin seitsemästä eri sarjakuvasta yhteen korpukseen, jonka perusteella tutkittiin äänitehosteiden kääntämistapoja sekä niiden kääntämiseen tai kääntämättä jättämiseen mahdollisesti vaikuttavia tekijöitä. Lisäksi yksittäisiä äänitehosteita tarkasteltiin ja jaoteltiin sisältönsä perusteella.

### Teoreettiset lähtökohdat

Sarjakuvien äänitehosteiden kääntämistä ei Suomessa ole liiemmin tutkittu, mutta esimerkiksi ranska–espanja-kieliparilla tehtyä tutkimusta on olemassa (ks. Sierra Soriano, 1999). Tämän tutkielman toinen osa keskittyy kuitenkin äänitehosteisiin äännesymboliikan näkökannalta, mikä on uusi lähestymistapa, sillä äänitehosteita ei tietääkseni ole ennen tutkittu tällä tavalla. Tämä tutkielma sisältää siis osittain pioneeritutkimusta, ja käytetyt metodit ovat jossain määrin itse kehittelemiäni, vaikkakin ne pohjautuvat aiempaan sarjakuvan, sarjakuvan kääntämisen, äänten matkimisen ja äännesymboliikan tutkimukseen. Joitain tärkeimmistä viitatuista tutkimuksista esitellään alla.

Kaindl (1999) ja Celotti (2008) ovat jaotelleet sarjakuvissa esiintyviä tekstejä: tekstiä voi olla tunnisteena otsikoissa, kertovana ääniraitana laatikoissa, dialogina puhekuplissa, osana kuvia ja onomatopoeioissa. Kaindlin mukaan ottama 'onomatopoeia' eli äänten matkiminen jää merkitykseltään hieman erilliseksi muista sarjakuvien tekstityypeistä, joten tässä tutkielmassa hänen tarkoittamansa ilmiö määriteltiin laajemmin äänitehosteiksi, joiden merkitys ja käyttö on selkeämmin rajattu sarjakuvissa – ja jotka ovat tämän tutkielman tutkimuskohde.

Tekstin erottaminen kuvista ei kuitenkaan aina ole yksinkertaista, ja sarjakuvien tekstuaalisetkin elementit voivat olla hyvin visuaalisesti esitettyjä. Esimerkiksi äänitehoste voi olla lähes erottamaton osa kuvaa tai kirjoitettu koristeellisella tai muuten erikoisella fontilla. Muutenkin kuvan ja tekstin saumaton yhteistyö sarjakuvissa voi

vaikeuttaa kääntäjän työtä, sillä se tarkoittaa, että kuvan ja tekstin täytyy myös käännöksessä täydentää toisiaan olematta ristiriidassa keskenään (esim. Valero Garcés, 2000). Kuvan ja tekstin vuorovaikutus voi kuitenkin olla myös voimavara (Zanettin, 2009), mikä ilmeni myös tässä tutkimuksessa, jonka korpuksessa kuvat mahdollistivat myös äänitehosteiden poistamisen joissain tilanteissa.

Kuvan ja tekstin yhteistyön takia sarjakuvien kääntämisessä hyödynnetään hieman erilaisia strategioita kuin pelkkää tekstiä sisältävien lähdetekstien kääntämisessä. Kaindl (1999) on tuonut Delabastitan (1989) audiovisuaaliseen kääntämiseen soveltuvat käännösstrategiat sarjakuvien yhteyteen. Strategioiden jaottelua analysoitiin ja verrattiin tässä tutkielmassa Celottin (2008) listaan kuvaan upotettuihin teksteihin soveltuvista käännösstrategioista, ja seuraavat strategiat todettiin tämän tutkimuksen äänitehostekäännösten kannalta relevanteiksi: '*repetitio*', '*deletio*', '*adiectio*', '*substitutio*', '*transmutatio*' ja 'kääntäminen'. Toisin sanoen äänitehoste voidaan toistaa käännöksessä lähdekielisessä muodossaan, poistaa, lisätä, korvata, siirtää tai kääntää kohdekieliseksi ilmaisuksi. Tutkimuksen ensimmäisessä osassa korpuksessa esiintyviä äänitehosteita tutkittiin tämän jaottelun pohjalta.

Tutkimuksen toisessa osassa keskityttiin äänitehosteisiin ääntä matkivien onomatopoeettisten ilmauksien ja äännesymboliikan näkökulmasta. Tätä varten esiteltiin onomatopoeiaa, äännesymboliikkaa ja esimerkiksi Bloomfieldin (1933) ja Rhodesin (1994) kuvaamia äännesymboliikkaa sisältäviä äänteitä tai äänneyhdistelmiä englannin kielessä, ja toisen osan tutkimustuloksia verrattiin jo kuvattuihin äännesymboleihin. Äännesymbolit ovat tiettyjä äänteitä, jotka liittyvät joihinkin määrättyihin piirteisiin, joita symboleita sisältävän sanan tarkoitteella on. Koska kielillä kuitenkin on käytössään rajallinen määrä äänteitä, nämä äännesymbolit pätevät joissain konteksteissa, mutta samat äänteet eivät poikkeuksetta tarkoita jotain tiettyä asiaa. Mahdollisia aiemmin listaamattomia, tiettyjä merkityksiä kantavia äänteitä etsittiin vertailemalla samantyyppisiä äänitehosteita toisiinsa. Esimerkiksi Rhodes on kuitenkin käyttänyt erilaisia jaotteluperusteita kuin tässä tutkimuksessa käytettiin. Rhodesin äännesymbolit liittyvät muun muassa äänen alkamistapaan tai ääneen liittyvään liikkeeseen, kun taas tässä tutkimuksessa jaottelu lähti käytetyn korpuksen äänitehosteiden merkityksestä ja sisällöstä sekä niiden yleisyydestä.

## Tapaustutkimuksen materiaali ja metodit

Korpuksen sisältämät sarjakuvat edustivat erityyppisiä sarjakuvia, mutta huumorisarjakuvia oli tutkimuksessa enemmän. Tutkielmassa tarkasteltiin yhtä Carl Barksin *Aku Ankka* -tarinaa, kahta Don Rosan *Aku Ankka* -tarinaa, joitakin strippejä Charles M. Schulzin *Tenavat*-sarjakuvaa ja Bill Wattersonin *Lassi ja Leevi* -sarjakuvaa, osaa Frank Millerin ja David Mazzucchellin *Batman: Ensimmäinen vuosi* -albumista ja osaa Alan Mooren ja Dave Gibbonsin *Vartijat*-albumista. Joidenkin sarjakuvien käännöksistä tutkittiin useampia versiota. Valinnat oli tehty sillä perusteella, että sarjakuvat edustaisivat mahdollisimman erityyppisiä sarjakuvia, jotta genren vaikutusta käännösratkaisuihin voisi tutkia. *Aku Ankka* -sarjakuvien painottaminen perustuu siihen, että tämän suomalaisille kovin tärkeän sarjakuvan käännöksissä oletettiin olevan enemmän vaihtelua kuin esimerkiksi supersankarisarjakuvien tehosteissa.

Korpukseen kelpuutettiin äänitehosteiksi kaikki tehosteet, jotka täyttivät tutkielmassa äänitehosteille asetetut suhteellisen väljät kriteerit: erilaiset ääntä jäljittelevät, onomatopoeettiset ilmaisut – olivat ne sitten leksikaalistuneita tai tilapäisiä ilmaisuja – sekä sanat, jotka eivät ole onomatopoeettisia mutta toimivat käytännössä täysin äänitehosteiden kaltaisesti (esim. TYÖNTÖ). Ei-onomatopoeettisia ilmaisuja ei rajattu korpuksen ulkopuolelle esimerkiksi siitä syystä, että niitä on erittäin vaikeaa erotella ääntä jäljittelevistä ilmaisuista. Korpuksen ulkopuolelle rajattiin kuitenkin äänitehosteet, jotka esiintyvät keskellä dialogia. Tämä rajaus perustuu siihen, että äänitehosteen erottaminen dialogista voi joskus olla lähes mahdotonta, jos sana esimerkiksi muuttuu kesken kaiken spontaaniksi huudoksi (esim. repliikki "OLEN KOTONAUUHH!" tutkitussa *Lassi ja Leevi* -albumissa). Omissa puhekuplissaan esiintyvät äänitehosteet sen sijaan otettiin mukaan korpukseen.

Oletus oli, että sarjakuvien äänitehosteiden kääntämiseen vaikuttaisi genren lisäksi äänitehosteen sijainti ruudussa, eli käytännössä se, kuinka paljon äänitehosteen kääntämiseen liittyisi kuvan muokkaamista. Puhekuplaan sijoitettu äänitehoste olisi todennäköisimmin käännetty, koska se vertautuu jossain määrin dialogiin ja sijaitsee käännettävän dialogin joukossa. Äänitehoste voi kuitenkin sijaita myös kuvassa, jolloin sitä ei jonkin verran todennäköisemmin olisi käännetty. Tehoste voi kuitenkin puhekuplien ulkopuolellakin sijaita erilaisissa paikoissa: se voi olla joko upotettu

suoraan osaksi kuvaa tai sijaita kohdassa, jossa se ei osu varsinaisen kuvituksen päälle (esimerkiksi pelkkää sinistä taivasta tai tyhjää seinää vasten). Koska kuvan osana toimivan äänitehosteen muokkaaminen on hankalampaa kuin puhekuplassa tai esimerkiksi yksiväristä taustaa vasten olevan äänitehosteen, lähtöoletus oli, että kuvaan upotetut äänitehosteet on suhteellisen usein tuotu käännökseen sellaisenaan.

Oletuksena oli myös, että supersankarisarjakuvia edustavan *Batmanin* äänitehosteita ei olisi kovinkaan usein käännetty, sillä äänitehosteiden odotettiin useimmiten sijaitsevan upotettuina kuviin. *Aku Ankan* äänitehosteiden sen sijaan oletettiin olevan idiomaattisesti käännettyjä, onhan *Aku Ankka* -lehti paitsi saavuttanut vankan aseman suomalaisten lukijoiden keskuudessa, myös saanut tunnustusta hyvästä suomen kielen käytöstään, ja sille on jopa myönnetty Helsingin yliopiston suomen kielen laitoksen kielihelmi-palkinto vuonna 2001. Oletuksena oli lisäksi, että *Aku Ankassa* äänitehosteita ei olisi jätetty pois ja että lähes kaikki äänitehosteet olisi käännetty.

Tutkimuksen toisessa osassa korpuksen äänitehosteet jaoteltiin semanttisen sisältönsä mukaan ryhmiin. Ryhmät koostuivat äänitehosteita, jotka liittyivät iskuihin, rikkoutumiseen, räjähdyksiin ja ampumiseen, hankaukseen, ilmavirtaan tai ruokaan ja nesteisiin, tai olivat kestoltaan pitkiä tai äänenkorkeudeltaan selvästi korkeita tai matalia. Ryhmät edustivat äänten kuvaamia tapahtumia, niiden syntymiseen vaikuttavia materiaaleja tai äänten itsensä ominaisuuksia. Muulla, laajemmalla materiaalilla voisi tutkia lisäksi muun muassa äänen lähteen (ihminen, eläin, muu luontoääni, kone), äänen aiheuttavan esineen koon ja kovuuden sekä harvinaisempien lämpötilan vaihteluiden vaikutuksia äänitehosteen laatuun ja ulkonäköön. Luokiteltujen äänitehosteiden kielellisiä ominaisuuksia verrattiin muista tutkimuksista koottuihin äännesymboleihin, ja yksittäisten ryhmien tehosteiden toistuvia ominaisuuksia analysoitiin, jotta saataisiin tietoa siitä, miten englanti ja suomi kuvaavat kyseisten ryhmien kuvaamia tapahtumia tai ominaisuuksia ääntein ja kirjaimin.

**Tutkimustulokset**

Äänitehosteiden sijoittelu ruudun sisällä vaikutti odotetusti niiden kääntämistapaan ja kääntämiseen tai kääntämättä jättämiseen monessa sarjakuvassa, joskaan ei kaikissa. Puhekuplien sisältämiä tehosteita oli muokattu eniten. Odotetusti vähiten oli muutettu

kuviin upotettuja äänitehosteita, ja esimerkiksi *Lassi ja Leevi*-käännöksissä ne saivat lähes järjestään jäädä kuviin sellaisenaan. Puhekuplien ulkopuolella sijaitsevia mutta käytännössä helposti muokattavia tehosteita oli käännetty vaihtelevasti, mutta niissä käännettyjen tehosteiden määrä sijoittui pääasiassa kahden edellä mainitun tehostetyypin välimaastoon.

Eniten käytettyjä käännösstrategioita olivat *repetitio* ja kääntäminen. *Deletio* oli harvinaista, mutta poistoja esiintyi muutamassa sarjakuvassa. Kuitenkin vain yhdessä *Tenavat*-stripissä äänitehosteiden poistaminen hankaloitti vitsin ymmärtämistä. Pienimuotoista tai osittaista *deletiota* edustaa sekin muutos, että alkuperäisissä tehosteissa paikoitellen ylenpalttisesti käytettyjä huutomerkkejä oli poistettu monen sarjakuvan käännöksessä. *Adiectiota* esiintyi vain *Aku Ankka* -sarjakuvissa, joissa joitain tehosteita oli lisätty kokonaan uusiin paikkoihin. *Transmutatiota* eli tehosteiden siirtämistä käytettiin erityisesti silloin, kun kuvaan upotettuja äänitehosteita käännettiin, sillä niitä oli toisinaan siirretty tyhjempään kohtaan kuvaa ja ruutua. *Substitutiota* tulkittiin esiintyneen lähinnä tapauksissa, joissa äänitehosteen ulkonäköä tai esimerkiksi eläinten äänten merkintätapaa oli muutettu merkittävästi. Tällaisten tapausten yhteydessä havaittiin, että genren ja tehosteen sijainnin lisäksi tehosteen ulkoasu on saattanut vaikuttaa sen käännökseen; erittäin visuaaliset tehosteet on saatettu jättää alkuperäiseen asuunsa tai esittää pelkistetymmällä kirjasinlajilla käännöksessä.

Kuten oletettua, *Aku Ankan* eri tarinat ja versiot olivat hyvinkin huolella käännettyjä: ensimmäisessä Rosa-tarinassa jopa kaikki äänitehosteet oli käännetty niiden sijainnista riippumatta. Yllätyksiäkin kuitenkin oli. Tehosteita on paitsi käännetty hyvin usein myös lisätty ja poistettu visuaalisen kontekstin niin salliessa (*deletio*- ja *adiectio*-käännösstrategiat). Jotkin tällaiset muutokset vaikuttivat tarkkaan harkituilta valinnoilta ja mahdollisesti toivat yksittäisille yksityiskohdille jonkin verran lisäarvoa. Käytännössä eritoten Rosan tarinoissa käytettiin laajinta valikoimaa mahdollisia strategioita *repetition* jäätyä vähemmälle kuin muissa sarjakuvissa.

Toiseen ääripäähän sijoittuivat odotetusti *Vartijat*- ja *Batman*-sarjakuvat. Alkuperäisessä *Watchmen*-sarjakuvassa äänitehosteita ei ylipäätään ollut käytetty muualla kuin puhekuplissa, ja äänitehosteiden käännöksetkin jäivät vähäisiksi. Alkuperäisessä *Batman*-albumissa puolestaan äänitehosteita oli käytetty paljon osana kuvia, ja yhtäkään

näistä upotetuista tehosteista ei ollut käännetty. *Repetitio* oli siis molemmissa tummansävyisissä sarjakuvissa suosittu strategia. Puhekuplissa äänitehosteita sen sijaan oli käännetty, mutta ei mittavissa määrin. Kiinnostavaa kyllä kuplien äänitehosteet oli harvoin kopioitu suoraan kuvana alkuperäisestä sarjakuvasta, vaan ne oli usein tekstattu kuplaan uudestaan muuttamatta tekstin sisältöä. Tällainen toimintatapa on kuitenkin tulkittu *repetitioksi* tutkielmassa, sillä tehosteen kirjoitusasu oli muuttumaton.

Vertailevan korpustutkimuksen toisessa osassa äänitehosteet siis jaoteltiin kuvaamansa sisällön perusteella, ja jaotteluperusteina toimivat äänten kuvaamat tapahtumat, äänen syntymiseen osallistuvat materiaalit tai äänitehosteiden itsensä ominaisuudet. Äänitehosteita tutkittiin äännesymboliikan näkökulmasta, ja joidenkin ryhmien sisällä oli joka tapauksessa huomattavissa hyvin paljon yhteneväisyyksiä, mikä kertoo siitä, että äännesymboliikka ja äänten matkiminen ovat todennäköisesti vaikuttaneet äänitehosteiden muodostukseen ainakin jossain määrin. Äänitehosteiden oletettiin olevan tämäntyyppiseen tutkimukseen erityisen sopivia juuri siksi, että äänitehosteiden voisi olettaa olevan vapaampia kielen oikeinkirjoitussäännöistä kuin vakiintuneiden sanojen ja sisältävän enemmän äännesymboliikkaa. Eritoten monet englanninkieliset äänitehosteet toimivat kuitenkin kielessä myös verbeinä ja substantiiveina tai perustuvat olemassa oleviin sanoihin, joten asia ei ole niin yksiselitteinen. Verratessa saman ryhmän tehosteiden tyypillisiä piirteitä keskenään löytyi kuitenkin englanniksikin mahdollisia uusia merkitystä kantavia äänteitä tai äänneyhdistelmiä. Esimerkiksi [m] voi kuvata syömisen ääntä, kun taas [-ʃ] voi liittyä veden tai nesteen liikkeeseen. Vaikka näiden löydöksien pätevyyttä on syytä vielä tutkia laajemmalla aineistolla, tämän tutkimuksen korpuksen pohjalta niitä voidaan pitää mahdollisina äännesymboleina. Mahdollisia suomenkielisiä äännesymboleita etsittiin vertaamalla paitsi tietyn ryhmän suomennettuja äänitehosteita toisiinsa ja englannissa esiintyviin äännesymboleihin, myös etsimällä erityisesti äänteitä, joita ei alkuperäisissä tehosteissa ollut ja jotka siten eivät voineet johtua ainakaan lähdetekstin interferenssistä. Esimerkkejä mahdollisista suomalaisista äännesymboleista ovat [-læt-], joka esiintyi usein veteen liittyvissä äänissä, joissa ei ollut interferenssiä englannista, [-ps], joka kuvasi yhtäkkisiä ääniä, ja sibilantit, jotka kuvasivat ilmavirtaa ja hankausta. Myös näiden kohdalla lisätutkimus olisi tarpeen sen selvittämiseksi, onko äänteitä käytetty vastaavasti myös tämän tutkimuksen korpuksen ulkopuolella.

Tutkimustulokset muistuttivat siitä, että pienetkin yksityiskohdat voivat olla tärkeitä sujuvan ja miellyttävän lukukokemuksen takaamiseksi ja että äänitehosteidenkin käännökset vaikuttavat sarjakuvasta saatavaan mielikuvaan. Joskus äänitehosteen harkittu poistaminen ei häiritse tarinaa lainkaan, kun taas olennaisen tehosteen jättäminen pois käännöksestä voi pahimmassa tapauksessa haitata esimerkiksi vitsin ymmärtämistä. Käännökseen voi jopa lisätä äänitehosteita, jotka voivat tuoda lisäarvoa esimerkiksi kyseisen ruudun sanomaan. Vaikka sarjakuvissa kuva väistämättä ohjaa myös käännöstä, kuva ei ole kokonaan muokkaamattomissa, eikä se saisi olla ainoa käännösstrategiaan vaikuttava tekijä.